

**CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL
PRINCIPAL BENCH: NEW DELHI**



**O.A No. 855/2019 In
M.A No. 3878/2019, M.A No. 952/2019,
M.A No. 953/2019 and
M.A No. 3794/2019**

This the 16th day of December, 2019

**Hon'ble Mr. Justice L. Narasimha Reddy, Chairman
Hon'ble Ms. Aradhana Johri, Member (A)**

1. Mona Dalal, Age-29 years
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/o Sh. Balwan Singh Dalal
R/o- H.No-24, Ward No-18,
Sonapat, Haryana.
2. Harish Kumar, Age-28 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
S/o Sh. Yudhveer,
R/o-347/1, Bidhal, Bidhal,
Gohana, Sonipat,
Haryana-131301.
3. Avinash Khatri, Age-25 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
S/o Sh. Niranjana Singh,
R/o-295, Katewara,
Sad Panna, Katewara,
Delhi-39.
4. Kirti, Age-28 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Rajbir Singh,
R/o-H.No-132, Village-Tatesar,
PO-Jaunti, Delhi-81.
5. Jyoti Kumari, Age-29 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
w/o Sh. Rajesh Saroha,
R/o- 1/5050, Gali No-2,
Balbir Nagar Extension,
Shahdara, Delhi-32.
6. Ramkesh Meena, Age-33 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)

S/o Sh. Laxman Meena,
R/o-251, A-5 Shriram Nagar,
Shahadara, GT Marg,
Shahdara, Delhi-32.



7. Komal Jain, Age-30 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher(Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Vinod Jain,
R/o-506, Pahar Ganj,
Central Delhi-55.
8. Himanshu Dagar, Age-22 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher(Primary)
S/o sh. Rambir Dagar,
R/o-H.No-19, village-Samaspur,
Najafgarh, South West Delhi, Delhi-73.
9. Pooja, Age-26 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher(Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Sube Singh,
R/o-H.No-55, H Block,
Najafgarh, Dharam Pura,
South West Delhi, Delhi-43.
10. Aruna Verma, Age-26 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher(Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Babu Lal Verma,
R/o-1304, Sunaro Wali Gali,
Pana Paposian, Narela, Delhi-110040.
11. Nisha Tyagi, Age-22 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher(Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Sunil Tyagi,
R/o-New-T-14, Shukra Bazar,
Near DMS Booth, Uttam Nagar, Delhi-59.
12. Hansraj Rathi, Age-28 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
S/o Sh. Nawal Singh Rathi,
R/o-H.No-115, Gali No-2,
D-Block Prem Nagar,
Najafgarh, Delhi-43.
13. Anil Kumar, Age-28 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Surajmal,
R/o-Munda Khera(78),
Jhajjar, Haryana-124105.

14. Pooja, Age-23 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Om Prakash,
R/o-138, Rasoolpur, Nangloi,
Rani Khera, North West Delhi,
Delhi-110081.
15. Pooja, Age-22 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Jai Bhagwan,
R/o-668, Chopal Wali Gali,
Udan Panna, Village Kanjhawal, Delhi.
16. Sarita Kanchap, Age-31 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/o Sh. Krishan Kumar Kanchap,
R/o- H.No-8, Sadha Panna,
Near Bus Stop, Katewara, Delhi-39.
17. Soniya, Age-27 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Satbir,
R/o-Gaorad (52-R), Gorar,
Sonipat, Haryana-131408.
18. Brijesh Kumar Meena, Age-28 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
S/o Sh. Ram Ratan Singh,
R/o-C-377, Gali No-8,
Brijpuri, Dayalpur, North East, Delhi-94.
19. Hardeep Singh, Age-30 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher(Primary)
S/o Sh. Ranbir Singh,
R/o-Khanpur Kalan, Sonapat, Haryana-131305.
20. Surender, Age-26 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
s/o Sh. Harbir,
R/o-H.No-186, Village-Nangal Kalan,
Tehsil-Sonipat, Distt. Sonapat, Haryana.
21. Pradeep Antil, Age-25 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
S/o Sh. Jai Bhagwan,
R/o.-H. No-DJ 178,
Gali No-2, Jeevan Vihar Colony,
Near Aggarsen Chowk,
Sonapat, Haryana-131001.



22. Renu, Age-26 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Ram Karan,
R/o-210, Mahalana Sonapat, Haryana-131001.
23. Ritu Malik, Age-22 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Ashok Kumar,
R/o-H.No-B-15/1,
Lal bagh, Loni, Loni Dehat,
Ghaziabad, UP-201102.
24. Meena, Age-29 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Hawa Singh,
R/o-533, Main Ghevra Road,
Teen Pana, Kanjawala, Delhi-81.
25. Amit, Age-25 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
S/o Sh. Sanjay Kumar,
R/o-121, Ishwar Colony,
Village-Bawana, NW Delhi, Delhi-110039.
26. Sunita Nandal, Age-28 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh.Yashpal,
R/o-22-A, Shiv Enclave,
Main Dichaon Road,
Najafgarh, South West Delhi, Delhi-43.
27. Anita Kumari, Age-22 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Krishan Pal,
R/o-276 B, Pocket N,
Sarita Vihar, Janta Flat,
Aali, South Delhi-76.
28. Omwati Meena, Age-27 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh.Raju Ram Meena,
R/o-RZF-581, Gali No-21,
Sadh Nagar, Delhi.
29. Manish Kumar, Age-28 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Ramesh Chander,
R/o-Moi (144), Sonapat,
Haryana-131102.



30. Archana Rani, Age-31 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
W/o Ronnie Bansal,
R/o-Flat No.113, Delhi govt. Flats,
Rohini Sector-11,
Narela North West Delhi-110085.
31. Akshay Kumar, Age-28 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
S/o Surender Kumar,
R/o-D-1096, Gali No.06,
Gautam Colony,
Safiabad Road, Opp. Hero Honda show room,
Narela, Delhi-110040.
32. Neeraj Sehrawat, Age-30 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher(Primary)
S/o Sh. Satyvir Singh,
R/o-H.No-1176, New Syndicate Bank,
Bawana, Delhi-39.
33. Priyanka, Age-24 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/o Sh. Raj Singh,
R/o-Sangi (83), Rohtak,
Haryana-124303.
34. Komal, Age-25 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh.Karambir,
R/o-H.No-2425, New HBC Sector-15,
Sonipat, Haryana-131001.
35. Sneha, Age-26 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Nikku Rao,
R/o-H.No-316, village-Bahalgarh,
The-Sonipat, District-Sonipat.
36. Aruna, Age-25 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Janeshwar,
R/o-Village-Liwaspur, Lawanspur (74)
Police Chowki-Bahalgarh, Sonapat,
Haryana-131021.
37. Nisha, Age-33 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher(Primary)
D/w/o Sh.Ishwar Singh,
R/o-VPO-Salahpur, Majra Dabas,



Salah Pur Majra,
Saraswati Vihar, Delhi-110081.



38. Pawan Kumar Lamba, Age-32 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Ishwar Singh Lamba,
R/o-Plot No-165-A, Gali No-5,
Block-D, Bharat Vihar,
Kakrola, Delhi-78.
39. Uma, Age-25 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh.Jagmohan Singh,
R/o-38, Naya Bazar,
A&B Block, Naya Bazar,
Najafgarh, Delhi.
40. Seema Devi, Age-31 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher(Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Rama Nand,
R/o-187-188A, D 2-Block,
Jeevan Park, Pankha Road,
Jeevan Park, Delhi-59.
41. Priyanka Yadav, Age-26 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Daulat Ram,
R/o-Near Old Chopal,
Paprawat, South West Delhi-43.
42. Swati Tyagi, Age-28 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh.Anil Kumar Tyagi,
R/o-D-57, Sudharshan Park, Ramesh Nagar,
Delhi-15.
43. Ashwani Yadav, Age-27 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
S/o Sh. Ajit Singh,
R/o-H.No-50, VPO Surehra,
Najafgarh, Delhi-43.
44. Mohit Lochav, Age-24 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
S/o Sh.Phool Kanwar,
R/o-H.No-660, VPO-Auchandi, Delhi-39.
45. Urvashi Jain, Age-27 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)

D/w/o Sh. Mukesh Jain,
R/o-D-38, Overseas Apartment,
Plot No-22, Sector-9,
Rohini, Delhi-85.



46. Deepak, Age-34 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
S/o Sh. Rajvir,
R/o-151, Jatav Moholla,
Asola Fatehpur Beri, Delhi-74.
47. Neha, Age-34 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Bhim Pal Singh,
R/o-HNo-5, Type-II,
Police Colony, Vasant Kunj, Delhi-70.
48. Bharti, Age-26 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Kaptan Singh,
R/o-170, Mundka Village, Nangloi, Delhi.
49. Pooja Sharma, Age-28 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Umesh Kumar,
R/o- 205, Bhagavanpur Chattavan,
Tehsil-Meerut, Distt-Meerut, U.P-250001.
50. Kinni, Age-25 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Shiv Kumar,
R/o-26, Lodia Mohalla, Shikarpur Village,
Delhi.
51. Rashmi, Age-26 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Kaptan Singh,
R/o-Gangarwa(69), Bahadurgarh,
Jhajjar, Haryana-124507.
52. Mohika, Age-23 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. T.S. Banga,
R/o-WZ-65C-5, Block-WZ,
Mukharjee Park,
Tilak Nagar, Delhi.
53. Varsha Rani, Age-31 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)

D/w/o Sh. Pratap Singh,
R/o-C-27 A. Jeewan Park,
Uttam Nagar, Delhi-59.



54. Ritu, Age-23 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Mohar Singh,
R/o-Dobheta(145), Sonipat,
Moi Majri, Haryana-131102.
55. Preeti, Age-27 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
W/o Sh. Chand Singh,
R/o- 989/9, Azad Garh, Rohtak,
Haryana-124001.
56. Neeraj, Age-25 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
S/o Sh. Balwan Singh,
R/o-H.No-336, Bazar Panna, Karala,
North West Delhi, Delhi-110081.
57. Sarita, Age-24 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Satbir,
R/o-Gali-Bhoot, Sisana-2,
Sisana(26-R)
Garhi Sisana Ed., Sonipat,
Haryana-131408.
58. Ankit, Age-21 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
S/o Sh. Rajinder Singh,
R/o-79, Near Farm House,
Shahpur Garhi, North West Delhi,
Delhi-110040.
59. Chhavi Chaudhary, Age-24 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Surender Singh,
R/o-C-2/237, C2 Block,
Yamuna Vihar, Delhi.
60. Sonia, Age-32 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Parmanand,
R/o-C-60, Roshan Vihar,
Shiv Mandir Gali,
Najafgarh, Delhi-43.

61. Rekha, Age-30 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Bhopal Singh,
R/o C-60, Roshan Vihar,
Shiv Mandir Gali,
Najafgarh, Delhi-43.
62. Narender Kumar, Age-34 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
S/o Sh. Sh. Sri Niwas,
R/o-RZ-C-60, Roshan Vihar,
Shiv Mandir Gali, Najafgarh,
Delhi-43.
63. Narender Yadav, Age-27 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
S/o Sh. Jagdish Chander,
R/o-RZ-211, Nanda Enclave,
Gopal Nagar, Najafgarh, Delhi-43.
64. Veena, Age-34 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
w/o Sh. Praveen Kumar,
R/o-H.No-66, Kumharo,
Nangal Thakran, Delhi-39.
65. Shruti Sharma, Age-29 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Anand Kumar,
R/o-B-41A, Manhey Park,
B-Block, Matiala, Delhi-59.
66. Pooja Dalal, Age-27 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Gulab Singh,
R/o-Daboda Kalan, Jhajjar,
Haryana-124507.
67. Sarita, Age-31 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Rajbir Singh Rana,
R/o-H.No-105, Near Chaupal,
Nangli Poona,
North West Delhi, Delhi-36.
68. Suresh Kumar, Age-35 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
S/o Sh. Randhir,
R/o-170/8, Block-B,
Yadav Nagar, NW Delhi, Delhi-42.



69. Rakhee, Age-22 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Ashok Kumar,
R/o-H.No-177/1,
Baland(106), Rohtak,
Haryana-124001.

70. Deepak Devi, Age-34 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
W/o Sh. Sanjay,
R/o-1421, Harijan Basti,
Near Choupal Bijwasan, Delhi.

71. Asha, Age-25 years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Om Singh,
R/o-Koua(15), Mahendragarh,
Haryana-123027.

72. Karuna Sagar, Age- Years,
Group-B Appointment : Teacher (Primary)
D/w/o Sh. Roshan Lal
R/o-K-13, FF, Gali No-1,
Kanhaiya Vihar, Johari Pur Extn.,
Gokal Pur, Delhi-94.

....Applicants

(By Advocate : Mr. Sachin Chauhan)

Versus

1. Govt. of NCTD
Through the Chief Secretary
Govt. of NCTD,
Nava Sachivalya IP Estate, New Delhi.
2. The Secretary
DSSSB
FC-18, Institutional Area,
Karkardooma,
(Near Railway Reservation Centre)
New Delhi-110092.
3. North Delhi Municipal Corporation,
Through its Commissioner,
4th Floor, Civic Centre,
S.P. Mukherjee Building, New Delhi.
4. South Delhi Municipal Corporation,
Through its Commissioner,



9th Floor, Civic Centre,
Shyama Prasad Mukherjee Building,
New Delhi.

5. East Delhi Municipal Corporation (Hq.),
Through its Commissioner,
Udyog Sadan, 1st Floor,
Patparganj Industrial Area,
New Delhi.

..... Respondents

(By Advocate : Mr. Anuj Kumar Sharma, Mr. Amit Sinha for
R-3 and Mr. R. K. Jain for R-4)

O R D E R (ORAL)

Justice L. Narasimha Reddy, Chairman :

The 1st Respondent initiated steps for selection/appointment of Teachers of different categories and entrusted the matter to the 2nd Respondent i.e. Delhi Subordinate Services Selection Board (DSSSB). Advertisement No. 02/17, dated 07.08.2017 was issued. The applicants herein responded to notification issued by the DSSSB for the post of Primary Teachers. Since large number of candidates appeared, the examination was conducted in 04 phases i.e. on 30th September, 2018 and 13th, 14th and 28th, October, 2018. The applicants contend that there was repetition of some questions in the examination conducted at phases 02, 03 and 04 and without taking the same into account, the results were declared. By stating these and some other reasons, they prayed for cancellation of those examinations and for conducting them in accordance with law.



2. Respondents filed counter affidavit opposing the OA. Various contentions of the applicants as regards the repetition of the questions are denied and it is stated that the selection have already been made.


3. We heard Mr. Sachin Chauhan, learned counsel for the applicants and Mr. Anuj Kumar Sharma, Mr. Amit Sinha for R-3 and Mr. R. K. Jain for R-4, learned counsel for the respondents.

4. In respect of the very examination referred to above, O.A No. 612/2019 was filed. The grievance there was that 2nd Respondent issued notice dated 01.02.2019 stating that the certain questions from each of the phases are deleted and that the same is contrary to law.

5. The OA was disposed of on merits on 14.10.2019. The impugned notice dated 01.02.2019 was set aside. It was left open to the respondents to evolve a mechanism which is objective, lawful and logical, and then to declare the results of the candidates.

6. The subject matter of this OA is substantially covered in the Order in OA No. 612/2019. Though the nature of relief claimed is somewhat different, once the notice 01.02.2019 was set aside and an objective, lawful and logical exercise was required to be undertaken by the





respondents, the relief claimed by the applicant stands covered by it. Another development is that a Writ Petition No. 11249/2019 filed by the respondents against the order in O.A No. 612/2019 is pending adjudication before the Hon'ble High Court and it is stated that several interim orders were also passed therein. It is needless to mention that the applicant shall also abide by the orders in the Writ Petition.

7. Therefore, we dispose of the OA, leaving it open to the applicants to urge all the grounds, in case it becomes permissible for the respondents to undertake the exercise as indicated in OA No. 612/2019. MAs, if any, stands disposed of. There shall be no order as to costs.

(Aradhana Johri)
Member (A)

(Justice L. Narasimha Reddy)
Chairman

/Mbt/