

CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL CALCUTTA BENCH

Original Application No.350/00972/2019 & MA.524/2019 With

Original Application No.350/00975/2019 & MA 525/2019 With

Original Application No.350/00976/2019 & MA.526/2019

Date of Order: This, 27th day of September, 2019

THE HON'BLE SMT. MANJULA DAS, JUDICIAL MEMBER

THE HON'BLE MR NEKKHOMANG NEIHSIAL, ADMINISTRATIVE MEMBER

- 1. Azad Mandal, son of Ram Mandal, aged about 42 years, residing at village Gandhipur, Post Office Bariyarpur, District Münger, Pincode 81,121,1
- 2. Jogendra Prasad, son of Gangotri Mondal, residing at village Mahsouni, Post Office – Kajra, Police Station – Riribazar, District – Lakhisarai, Pin code – 811309
- 3. Subash Mandal, son of Thembu Mandal, residing at village Fridpur, Post Office Jamalpur, Police Station Jamalpur, District Munger, Pin code 811214.
- Kailash Kumar, son of Bhikhari Ram, residing at village Sultanpur, Post Office – Pararia, Police Station – Nokha, District – Sasaram, Pin code –802217.



- Balmiki Mandal, son of Guneshwar Roy, residing at village Dih (Harichak), Post Office – Saidpur, Police Station – Sahpurkamal, District – Begusarai, Pin code – 851211.
- 6. Abinash Yadav, son of Akshayalal Yadav, residing at village Kathani, Post Office – Bichichanchar, Police Station – Habeli Kharagpur, District – Munger, Pin code – 813221.
- 7. Ashutosh Kumar Singh, son of Abhay Kumar Singh, residing at village Shastrinagar Road No. 1.
 Post Office Munger, Police Station Kasim Bazar, District Munger, Pin code 81 1 201.
- 8. Amardip Yadav, son of Bishnudao Yadav, residing at Sadipur (College Road), Post Office – Munger, Police Station – Kotwali, District – Munger, Pin code – 81 1201
- 9. Vijay Kumar, son of Biswannath Mahato, residing at village Shastrinagar Road No. 1, Post Office – Munger, Police Station – Kasim Bazar, District Munger, Pin code – 811201.
- 10. Naresh Kumar, son of Ganesh Paswan, residing at village Ghorghar, Post Office Ghorghat, Police station Bariyarpur, District Munger, Pin code 811201.
- Bijay Kumar Singh, son of Jamindar Singh, residing at village Dhangahi, Post Office – Dhangahi, Police



Station – Bikramganj, District – Rohtas, Pin code – 802213.

....Applicants in OA.972/2019

-Vs-

- 1. Union of India, service through the secretary, Ministry of Railways, Rail Bhawan, Raisina Road, New Delhi, Pin code 110001.
- 2. The General Manager, Eastern Railways, having its office at Eastern Railway Headquarters, Fairlie Place, 17, Netaji Subhas Road, Kolkata 700001.
- 3. The Principal Chief Personnel Office (Human Resource) Eastern Railways, having its office at Eastern Railways Headquarters, Fairlie Place, 17 Netaji Subhas Road, Kolkata 700001.
- 4. The Chief Personnel Officer, Eastern Railways, having its office at Eastern Railway. Headquarters, Fairlie Place, 17, Netaji Subhas Road, Kolkata 700001:
- 5. The Divisional Railway Manager, Eastern Railways, Malda Town, Malda, Pin code – 732101.
- 6. The Divisional Personnel Officer, Eastern Railways, Malda Town, Malda, Pin code – 7332101.

... Respondents in OA.972/2019

 Ramchandra Singh, son of Chatrabhuj Roy, residing at village Shivkund , Police station – Shiv



Kund, Districrt – Munger, Pin code – 811202.

- 2. Bishwajit Kumar, son of Birendra Prasad Singh, residing at village Azad Kutir (Shastri Chowk), Post Office – Munger, Police Station – Kotwali, District – Munger, Pin code –811201.
- 3. Mahendra Kumar, son of Ragunandan Paswan, residing at village Katgharh, Post Office – Munger, Police Station – Kotwali, District – Munger, Pin code – 811201.
- 4. Mahesh Prasad, son of Chandrika Prasad, residing at village Subhas Nagar, Post Office – Munger Police Station – Kotwali, District — Munger, District – 81 J 201.
- 5. Ajay Kumar, son of Ram Mandal, residing at village Gandhipur, Post NOffice Bariyarpur, Police Station Bariyarpur, District Munger, Pin code 811211.
- Dilip Kumar Singh, son of Ram Khelawan Mandal, residing at village Kasturba Water, Post Office

 Munger, Police Station – Kotwali,
 District – Munger, Pin code –

 811201.
- 7. Tuntun Prasad, son of Rajendra Prasad Yadav, residing at village Jaffar Nagar, Police station – Mufasil, District – Munger, Pin code –811201.



- Dinesh Prasad Yadav, son of Suresh Prasad Yadav, residing at village Baidhpur, Post Office – Baidhpur, Police Station – Shambhuganj, District – Banka, Pin code – 813221.
- Saroj Kumar, son of Gago Yadav, residing at village Sadipur (Yadavtola), Post Office – Munger, Police Station – Kotwali, District – Munger, Pin code – 811201.
- 10. Sashi Kumar, son of Ramji Singh, residing at village Singheswartola (Nawagarhi), Post Office Nawagarhi, Police station Naya Ram Nagar, District Munger, Pincode 811201.
- 11. Dipak Kumar, son of Bhadai Ram, residing at Village Sultanpur, Post.
 Office Pararia, Rolice Station
 Nokha, District Sasaram, Pin code
 802217.
- Sajan Mahto, son of Narsingh Roy, residing at village Jaffarnagar NH –
 31, Post Office Pachbir, Police
 Station Sahpurkamal, District –
 Begusarai, Pin code 851211.
- 13. Dinesh Kumar, son of Bhuneshwarsah, residing at village Shivnagar, Post Office Herudiyara, Police Station Kasim Bazar, District Munger, Pin code 811201.
- 14. Sharda Devi, son of Singho Kora, residing at village Bangali Bandh (Karantola), Post Office Piri Bazar, Police Station Piri Bazar, District Lakhisarai, Pin code 811112.



... Applicants of OA.975/2019

-Vs-

- 1. Union of India, service through the secretary, Ministry of Railways, Rail Bhawan, Raisina Road, New Delhi, Pin code 110001.
- 2. The General Manager, Eastern Railways, having its office at Eastern Railway Headquarters, Fairlie Place, 17, Netaji Subhas Road, Kolkata 700001.
- 3. The Principal Chief Personnel Office
 (Human Resource) Eastern
 Railways, having its office at
 Eastern Railways Headquarters,
 Fairlie Place; 17, Netaji Subhas
 Road, Kolkata 700001
- 4. The Chief Personnel Officer Eastern
 Railways, having its office at
 Eastern Railway Headquarters,
 Fairlie Place, 17, Netaji Subhas
 Road, Kolkata 700001
- 5. The Divisional Railway Manager, Eastern Railways, Malda Town, Malda, Pin code – 732101.
- 6. The Divisional Personnel Officer, Eastern Railways, Malda Town, Malda, Pin code – 7332101.

... Respondents in OA.975/2019

1. Ramadhar Paswan, son of Dhuran Paswan, residing at village Mahsouni, Post Office – Kajra, Police Station – Piri Bazar, District – Lakhisarai, Pincode – 811209.



- Upendra Paswan, son of Mahabir Paswan, residing at village Gorghat, Post Office – Gorghat, Police Station – Bariyarpur, District – Munger, Pin code - 811211.
- 3. Naresh Mahto, son of Parmeshwar Mahto, residing at village Mahsouni, Post Office Kajra, Police Station Piri Bazar, District Lakhisarai, Pin Code 811209.
- 4. Om Prakash, son of Mahabir Prasad, residing at village Mahsouni, Post Office – Kajra, Police Station – Piri Bažar, District – Lakhisarai, Pin code – 811209.
- 5. Krishndeo Yadav, son of Ram Bilash Yadav, residing at village Laldarwaza (Mirchi Talab), Post Office – Laldarwaza, Police Station – Kotwali, District – Munger, Pin code – 81 1201.
- 6. Rabi Shaw, son of Lakhan Sah, residing at village Abjuganh, Post Office Abjuganj, Police Station Sultanganj, District Bhagalpur, Pin code 813231.
- 7. Pradip Chandra Singh, son of Shivnandan Singh, residing at village Kesopur Idgah Road, Post Office Jamalpur, Police Station Jamalpur, District Munger, Pin code 811214.
- 8. Sudhir Prasad, son of Khakhanu Prasad Yadav, residing at village Lohchi, Police Station – Habeli



- Kharagpur, District Munger, Pin code 811211.
- Sanjiv Kumar, son of Bishnu Prasad, residing at village Mogal Bazar, Post Office – Basudeopur, Police Station – Basudeopur, District – Munger, Pin code – 811201.

Applicants in OA.976/2019

-VS-

- 1. Union of India, service through the Secretary, Ministry of Railways, Rail Bhawan, Raisina Road, New Delhi, Pin code 110001.
- 2. The General Manager, Eastern Railways, having its office at Eastern Railway Headquarters, Fairlie Place 17 Netaji Subhas Road, Kolkata 700001.
- 3. The Principal Chief Personnel Officer (Human Resource), Eastern Railways, having its office at Eastern Railway Headquarters, Fairlie Place 17, Netaji Subhas Road, Kolkata 700001.
- 4. The Chief Personnel Officer, Eastern Railways, having its office at Eastern Railway Headquarters, Fairlie Place 17, Netaji Subhas Road, Kolkata 700001.
- 5. The Divisional Railway Manager, Eastern Railways, Malda Town, Malda, Pin code – 792101.



6. The Divisional Personnel Officer, Eastern Railways, Malda Town, Malda, Pin code – 732101.

... Respondents in OA.976/2019

For applicants (Adv):

Sri S.K.Mal & Sri S P Chattopadhyay

For respondents (Adv):

Sri D N Bandopadhyay

ORDER (ORAL)

MANJULA DAS, MEMBER (J):

Since the relief(s) sought for in all the 3 OAs are same, all the three OAs are taken up together and being disposed of by this common order.

- 2. MA Nos. 524/2019, 525/2019 and 526/2019 have been preferred by the applicants for joining together in OA.972/2019, 975/2019 and 976/2019 respectively. Having regards to the facts and circumstances all the 3 MAs praying for joining together are allowed under Rule 4(5)(a) of the CAT (Procedure) Rules, 1987.
- 3. In all the 3 OAs, the applicants have made the following same prayers:-
 - "8.i) Leave be granted by this Hon'ble Tribunal to the applicants herein to file this present application jointly in consideration of the fact that the cause and the nature of relief as prayed for hereunder are similar and



that the applicants have a common interest in the present matter.

- ii) The respondents herein be directed to consider the representation dated 20.10.2018 served before it;
- iii) The respondents herein be directed to implement the memo being reference no. E/T&C/C/Cell/MLD(Loose) dated 12.01.2018;
- iv) The respondents herein be directed to absorb the applicants as casual hot weather staff in terms of the memo being reference no. E/T&C/C/Cell/MLD(Loose) dated 12.01.2018;
- v) The respondents herein be directed to disburse all manner of benefits along with arrear benefits which the applicants are entitled to fill date;
- vi) Costs of this application;
- vii) Any other reliefs which this Hon'ble Tribunal deems fit and proper.
- 4. At the outset of the arguments, learned counsel for the applicants fairly submitted that they will be satisfied if the OA is treated as comprehensive representation and the respondents are directed to consider the same judiciously keeping in mind the notification dated 12.01.2018 and the representation/lawyers notice dated 20.12.2018. By accepting the prayer made by the applicants' side, we direct the applicants to produce the copy of the OA before the respondent no.4 within a period of one month from the date of receipt of this order. On receipt of the same, the



respondent no.4 shall judiciously consider and dispose of the same by giving personal hearing to them or through legal representatives and thereafter pass a reasoned and speaking order keeping in mind the notification dated 12.01.2018 and the lawyers notice dated 20.12.2018 within three months thereafter. Decision to be arrived at by the respondent no.4 shall be communicated to the applicants.

- 5. However, learned counsel for the respondents vehemently objected in sending the matter to the respondents for consideration. We have not been able to accept the submission made by the learned counsel for the respondents as we have not entered into the merits of the matter and only directed the department to consider who is the best authority to decide the matter.
- 6. The OAs are disposed of as above. There shall be no order as to costs.

(NEKKHOMANG NEIHSIAL)

ADMINISTRATIVE MEMBER

(MANJULA DAS) JUDICAIL MEMBER

/BB/