

CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL
CALCUTTA BENCH, KOLKATA

LIBRARY

O.A. 1575 of 2015

Dated : 17.09.2019

Coram : Hon'ble Ms. Bidisha Banerjee, Judicial Member
Hon'ble Dr. N. Chatterjee, Administrative Member

1. Smt. Arati Murmu,
Wife of Late Laxmi Kanta Murmu,
Aged about 59 years,
By profession housewife.
2. Sri Shyama Pada Murmu,
Son of Late Laxmi Kanta Murmu,
Aged about 27 years
By profession unemployed both of them
Residing at Village - Siyartola Dumurgaria,
Post - Ramgarh,
P.S. Lalgah,
Dist. Paschim Medinipur,
Pin - 721128.

Applicants.

Versus

1. Union of India
Service through the Director General,
Prasar Bharati,
New Delhi - 110 001.
2. The Additional Directors
General Doordarshan Kendra,
Doordarshan Bhawan,
Golf Green,
Kolkata - 700 095.
3. The Station Director,
AIR Doordarshan,
Akashvani Bhavan,
Eden Gardens,
Kolkata - 700 001.
4. The Deputy Director Engineering,
Prasar Bharati,
Doordarshan Maintenance Centre,
Fagupur Bardhaman,

Bardhaman – 713101.

..... Respondents.

For the applicant : Mr. S.R. Das, Counsel

For the respondents : Mr. M.S. Banerjee, Counsel

ORDER (Oral)**Per : Bidisha Banerjee, Judicial Member**

This application has been preferred to seek the following reliefs:

"8.i) Leave may kindly be granted to file the application jointly in terms of Section 4(5)(a) of CAT (Procedure) Rules, 1986.

ii) An order directing the respondents to allow compassionate appointment to the applicant no. 2 on immediate basis to save the family.

iii) An order directing the respondents to act on the recommendations made on 13.01.2015 by the Assistant Engineer or Deputy Director Engineering to offer compassionate appointment in favour of applicant no. 2 on immediate basis.

iv) An order directing the respondents to place all the necessary relevant papers before the Hon'ble Bench for conscionable justice.

v) Any other order/orders, further order/orders as to the Hon'ble Tribunal seems fit and proper."

2. At hearing it transpired that the applicant's prayer for employment assistance, met with the following order, as evident from the supplementary affidavit,

"PRASAR BHARATI
(INDIA'S PUBLIC SERVICE BROADCASTER)
DIRECTORATE GENERAL: DOORDARSHAN
DOORDARSHAN BHAWAN: NEW DELHI

File No. 3/33/2015-S.II(A)(Pt.)/333-334

Date 23.02.2016

OFFICE MEMORANDUM

Subject: - Compassionate appointment of Sh. Shyampada Murmu S/o Late Sh. Laxmi Kanta Murmu, Ex-Security Guard, DMC Bardhaman.

Reference to DMC Bardhaman's letter No.5(LKM)/2015-A/MC/BDN/826 dated 23.12.2015 on the subject cited above.

2. Request of Sh. Shyampada Murmu S/o Late Sh. Laxmi Kanta Murmu, Ex-Security Guard, DMC Bardhaman was placed before compassionate appointment Committee (CAC) 2014 in its meeting on 13th, 14th & 15th January, 2016. The CAC considered the request of Sh. Shyampada Murmu alongwith other applicants for appointment to the post of Gr. C(LDC/MTS) following laid down DOP&T's guidelines as amended from time to time and SOP devised by Prasar Bharati.

3. The case of Sh. Shyampada Murmu was considered but was not recommended for appointment by CAC.

4. This issues with the approval of Competent Authority.

Sd/-

(SUBODH VERMA)

Section Officer (S. IIA)

Tel. # 23381541

Fax. # 23386919"

3. It evident from the comparative assessment particulars furnished by way of affidavit, that the position of the applicant is 64, and his score against various attributes, are as under:

Relative Merit Points Obtains by applicant of DOKs in CAC for the year 2015																
S.N o.	Name of the applicant	Death year	Applied for the post	Family pension	terminal Benefit (DCRG, GPF, CGEGIS, Leave encashm ent)	Monthly income of earning members and Income from property	immova ble or movable property	No. of depende nts	Unmarri ed daughte rs	No. of minor children	left over servi ce	Grace point			Period after death of the official	Total
												Both parent expired	If applican t is wife	Differenti yabled depende nts		
1	Kumari Balakynitew Mary Kharkongor	2009	MTS	20	8	5	10	15	15	15	8	0	0	0	5	101
2	Smt. Dewali Boro	2014	MTS	18	0	5	10	15	10	10	6	0	15	0	10	99
3	Smt. Jagrutiben Marishgiri Goswami	2014	MTS	18	0	5	10	15	5	10	8	0	15	0	10	96
4	Smt. Jay Moti Das	2013	MTS	18	0	5	10	15	5	10	6	0	15	0	10	94
5	Smt. Jagnyaseni Bholi	2013	MTS	18	0	3	10	15	5	10	6	0	15	0	10	92
6	Smt. Surekha Chhatra	2013	MTS	16	0	5	10	15	10	5	4	0	15	0	10	90
7	Sh. Sanjay Lal	2013	MTS	16	3	5	10	15	10	10	4	0	0	5	10	88
8	Smt. M.V. Sarada Bai	2014	MTS	14	0	5	8	15	10	5	6	0	15	0	10	88
9	Smt. Tejkanwar	2001	MTS	18	10	5	6	15	5	0	10	0	15	0	3	87
10	Smt. P. Gaiשמ Kabuli	2014	MTS	16	0	5	3	15	5	10	8	0	15	0	10	87
11	Smt. K. Praseetha	2002	MTS	20	5	5	10	15	5	0	8	0	15	0	3	86
12	Smt. Minakshi Murmu	2013	MTS	8	0	5	10	15	5	10	6	0	15	0	10	84
13	Smt. Munni Basfore	2013	MTS	18	0	5	10	10	5	5	6	0	15	0	10	84

Xxx

xxx

xxx

63	Sh. Hamid Qureshi	2013	MTS	16	0	5	0	10	5	0	2	0	0	0	10	48
64	Shri Shyampada Murmu	2013	MTS	20	0	4	6	5	0	0	2	0	0	0	10	47
65	Shri Harkesh Singh Gurjar	2009	MTS	20	1	5	8	5	0	0	2	0	0	0	5	46

The applicant has not challenged the score or allotment of marks against various attributes as unfair, or against the rules.

4. In view of above, as irrefutably the applicant is way down in the list, but his case has not yet been closed, the O.A. is disposed of with a direction upon the respondents to keep the matter of consideration open, so long it is permissible in law, and issue appropriate orders in accordance with law.

5. O.A. accordingly stands disposed of. No costs.

(Dr. N. Chatterjee)
Administrative Member

(Bidisha Baherjee)
Judicial Member

drh

