

CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL,
ERNAKULAM BENCH

Original Application Nos. 180/00149/2018
& 180/00150/18

Wednesday, this the 30th day of October, 2019

CORAM:

Hon'ble Mr. E.K. Bharat Bhushan, Administrative Member
Hon'ble Mr. Ashish Kalia, Judicial Member

O.A 180/149/2018

Sri.M.Venugopalan
 S/o.T.Govindan Nair, aged 56 years
 Deputy Conservator of Forests
 (Non-Cadre) (Retired)
 Manchery House, Rail Bridge Road
 Chalakudy – 680 307
 Thrissur District

..... **Applicant**

(By Advocate : Mr.P.K.Madhusoodanan)

V e r s u s

1. Union of India
 represented by the Secretary
 Ministry of Environment
 Forest & Climate Change
 Indira Paryavaran Bhavan
 6th Floor, Prithvi Block
 Jorbag Road, Aligarg
 New Delhi – 110 001
2. State of Kerala
 Represented by Chief Secretary
 Government of Kerala
 Thiruvananthapuram – 695 001
3. Union Public Service Commission
 represented by its Secretary
 Shajahan Road, New Delhi – 110 001
4. Selection Committee
 For Selection to Indian Forest Service
 Constituted under Regulation 3 of IFS (Appointment by promotion)
 Regulation, 1966, represented by its Chairman

Union Public Service Commission
Shajahan Road, New Delhi – 110 001

5. The Principal Chief Conservator of Forests &
Head of Forest Forces, Kerala,
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 014 **Respondents**
- (By Advocate : Mr.S.R.K.Prathap for R1, Mr.M.Rajeev,G.P for R-2 and R-5 & Mr.Thomas Mathew Nellimoottil for R-3 and R-4)**

O.A 180/00150/18

Sri.S.Sreekumar
S/o.late Sreedharan Potti, aged 56 years
Pattamana Madam
Mannancherry (P.O)
Alappuzha – 688 538 **Applicant**

(By Advocate : Mr.P.K.Madhusoodanan)

V e r s u s

1. Union of India
represented by the Secretary
Ministry of Environment
Forest & Climate Change
Indira Paryavaran Bhavan
6th Floor, Prithvi Block
Jorbag Road, Aligarg
New Delhi – 110 001
2. State of Kerala
Represented by Chief Secretary
Government of Kerala
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 001
3. Union Public Service Commission
represented by its Secretary
Shajahan Road, New Delhi – 110 001
4. Selection Committee
For Selection to Indian Forest Service
Constituted under Regulation 3 of IFS (Appointment by promotion)
Regulation, 1966, represented by its Chairman
Union Public Service Commission
Shajahan Road, New Delhi – 110 001
5. The Principal Chief Conservator of Forests &

Head of Forest Forces, Kerala,
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 014 **Respondents**

(By Advocate : Mr.S.R.K.Prathap for R1, Mr.M.Rajeev,G.P for R-2 and R-5 & Mr.Thomas Mathew Nellimoottil for R-3 and R-4)

These applications having been heard on 30.10.2019 the Tribunal on the same day delivered the following:

ORDER (ORAL)

By Hon'ble Mr. E.K.Bharat Bhushan, Administrative Member

It is submitted by Shri.Thomas Mathew Nellimoottil, learned Nodal Counsel for Union Public Service Commission that the Selection Committee Meetings for the years 2016 and 2017 have been held on 4.10.2019 and the Minutes had been sent for endorsement of respondent nos. 2 and 5, the State Government representatives. The learned State Government Pleader Mr.M.Rajeev submits that after due endorsement, these have been returned. All that remains in the case is for the presidential notification to be issued. Having stated this, we see that the relief sought for in these Original Applications, which is to convene Selection Committee Meeting for the years 2016 and 2017, has been duly complied with. Hence these Original Applications are closed. No costs.

**(ASHISH KALIA)
JUDICIAL MEMBER
sv**

**(E.K.BHARAT BHUSHAN)
ADMINISTRATIVE MEMBER**

List of Annexures

O.A 180/00149/18

Annexure A1 - True copy of the relevant extract of Note dated 26.4.2017 issued by the Additional Principal Chief Conservator of Forests (Administration) obtained under RTI Act.

Annexure A2 - True copy of the relevant extract of the final seniority list of ACF as on 1/1/2016

Annexure A3 - True copy of the list of ACF officers in the zone of consideration for inclusion in the select list for the year 2016

Annexure A4 - True copy of the final order dated 25/7/2017 in O.A No.180/00594/2017 passed by this Hon'ble Tribunal

Annexure A5 - True copy of the notification dated 17.1.2018 issued by the 1st respondent

Annexure A6 - True copy of the notification dated 14/2/2017 issued by the 1st respondent

Annexure A7 - True copy of the notification dated 30/8/2017 issued by the 1st respondent

Annexure R2(A) - Letter No.1185102/SPL-CI/2017/GAD dated 6.2.2018

Annexure R2(B) - Letter No.2144811/Spl-CI/2018/GAD dated 6.3.2018

Annexure R1 - True copy of the letter No.1185102/SP1-CI/2017/GAD dated 26.8.2017 issued by the 2nd respondent to the 1st respondent

Annexure R2 - True copy of the Letter No.17013/25/2016-IFS-II dated 6.9.2017 issued by this answering respondent no.1 to the 2nd respondent and copy to the 3rd respondent (Union Public Service Commission)

Annexure R3 - True copy of the Order No.17013/25/2016-IFS-II dated 21/11/2017 issued by this answering respondent

Annexure R4 - True copy of notification No.17013/25/2016-IFS-II dated 17/01/2018 issued by this answering respondent

Annexure R5 - True copy of Letter No.1185102/Spl
Ci/2017/GAD dated 6/2/2018 respondent no.2

Annexure R6 - True copy of Letter No.17013/21/2017-IFS-II
dated 13/6/2018

Annexure R7 - True copy of letter No.2144811/Spl.CI/2018
dated 6.3.2018 issued by respondent no.2.

Annexure M.A1 - True copy of the order dated 10.8.2018 in O.A
No.180/149 of 2018 passed by this Hon'ble Central Administrative
Tribunal, Ernakulam Bench

Annexure MA2 - True copy of the letter No.1 Letter
No.17013/21/2017-IFS-II dated 13/6/2018

Annexure MA 3 - True copy of the letter No.1185102/AIS-
C1/2017/GAD dated 7.11.2018

Annexure R3(a) - True copy of e-mail dated 16.1.2019 regarding
the procedure for drawing up of the eligibility list

Annexure R2(C) - Do Letter No.1185102/Spl-CI/2017/GAD dated
22.9.2018

Annexure R2(D) - Letter F.No.17013/21/2017-IFS-II dated
6.12.2018

Annexure R2(E) - Letter No.3589/AIS-CI/2016/GAD dated
4.3.2019

Annexure R2(F) - Letter No.2144811/AIS-CI/2018/GAD 7.3.2019

Annexure R2(G) - Letter No.2213408/AIS-CI/2018/GAD dated
6.6.2019

Annexure R3(b) - True copy of D.O letter bearing number D.O
1185102/SPL-CI/2017-GAD dated 22.9.2018

Annexure MA4 - True copy of the Order dated 25.7.2019 in O.A
No.180/00149 of 2018 passed by the C.A.T, Ernakulam Bench

Annexure MA5 - True copy of the letter F.no.17013/21/2017-
IFS.II dated 25.7.2019 from the Ministry of Environment, Forest &
Climate Change

Annexure MA6 - True copy of the Order No.17013/25/2016-IFS.II dated 21.11.2017 from the Ministry of Environment, Forest & Climate Change

Annexure MA7 - True copy of State Government Letter No.2144811/AIS-CI/2018/GAD dated 3.8.2019

Annexure R8 - A true copy of this Ministry letter No.17013/21/2017-IFS-II dated 13/6/2018

Annexure R9 - A true copy of this Ministry letter No.17013/21/2017-IFS-II dated 25.7.2019

Annexure R10 - A true copy of MA sent to Government Counsel vide letter No.22012/27/2018-IFS-II dated 2.8.2019 for filing

Annexure R11 - A true copy of State Government of Kerala letter no.2144811/AIS-CI/2018/GAD dated 3.8.2019 is annexed

Annexure R12 - A true copy of this Ministry letter no.17013/21/2017-IFS-II dated 8.8.2019 sent to State Government of Kerala

Annexure R13 - A true copy of DoP&T's letter no.14015/33/2019-AIS-I dated 8.2.2019

Annexure R2(H) - True copy of the Letter F.No.17013/21/2017-IFS-II dated 8/8/2019 from the Ministry of Environment, Forest & Climate Change

Annexure R2(J) - True copy of the letter No.2144811/AIS-CI/2018/GAD dated 8.8.2019 addressed to Secretary, Union Public Service Commission

Annexure R2(K) - True copy of the letter no.2144811/AIS-CI/2018/GAD dated 14.8.2019 addressed to Secretary, Union Public Service Commission.

O.A 180/00150/2018

Annexure A1 - True copy of the relevant extract of Note dated 26.4.2017 issued by the Additional Principal Chief Conservator of Forests (Administration) obtained under RTI Act.

Annexure A2 - True copy of the relevant extract of the final seniority list of ACF as on 1/1/2016

Annexure A3 - True copy of the list of ACF officers in the zone of consideration for inclusion in the select list for the year 2016

Annexure A4 - True copy of the final order dated 24/7/2017 in O.A No.180/00589/2017 passed by this Hon'ble Tribunal

Annexure A5 - True copy of the notification dated 17.1.2018 issued by the 1st respondent

Annexure A6 - True copy of the notification dated 14/2/2017 issued by the 1st respondent

Annexure A7 - True copy of the notification dated 30/8/2017 issued by the 1st respondent

Annexure R2(A) - Letter No.1185102/SPL-CI/2017/GAD dated 6.2.2018

Annexure R2(B) - Letter No.2144811/Spl-CI/2018/GAD dated 6.3.2018

Annexure R1 - True copy of the letter No.1185102/SP1-CI/2017/GAD dated 26.8.2017 issued by the 2nd respondent to the 1st respondent

Annexure R2 - True copy of the Letter No.17013/25/2016-IFS-II dated 6.9.2017 issued by this answering respondent no.1 to the 2nd respondent and copy to the 3rd respondent (Union Public Service Commission)

Annexure R3 - True copy of the Order No.17013/25/2016-IFS-II dated 21/11/2017 issued by this answering respondent

Annexure R4 - True copy of notification No.17013/25/2016-IFS-II dated 17/01/2018 issued by this answering respondent

Annexure R5 - True copy of Letter No.1185102/Spl CI/2017/GAD dated 6/2/2018 respondent no.2

Annexure R6 - True copy of Letter No.17013/21/2017-IFS-II dated 13/6/2018

Annexure R7 - True copy of letter No.2144811/Spl.CI/2018 dated 6.3.2018 issued by respondent no.2.

Annexure M.A1 - True copy of the order dated 10.8.2018 in O.A No.180/150 of 2018 passed by this Hon'ble Central Administrative Tribunal, Ernakulam Bench

Annexure MA2 - True copy of the letter No.1 Letter No.17013/21/2017-IFS-II dated 13/6/2018

Annexure MA 3 - True copy of the letter No.1185102/AIS-C1/2017/GAD dated 7.11.2018

Annexure R3(a) - True copy of e-mail dated 16.1.2019 regarding the procedure for drawing up of the eligibility list

Annexure R2(C) - Do Letter No.1185102/Spl-CI/2017/GAD dated 22.9.2018

Annexure R2(D) - Letter F.No.17013/21/2017-IFS-II dated 6.12.2018

Annexure R2(E) - Letter No.3589/AIS-CI/2016/GAD dated 4.3.2019

Annexure R2(F) - Letter No.2144811/AIS-CI/2018/GAD 7.3.2019

Annexure R2(G) - Letter No.2213408/AIS-CI/2018/GAD dated 6.6.2019

Annexure R3(b) - True copy of D.O letter bearing number D.O 1185102/SPL-CI/2017-GAD dated 22.9.2018

Annexure MA4 - True copy of the Order dated 25.7.2019 in O.A No.180/00150 of 2018 passed by the C.A.T, Ernakulam Bench

Annexure MA5 - True copy of the letter F.no.17013/21/2017-IFS.II dated 25.7.2019 from the Ministry of Environment, Forest & Climate Change

Annexure MA6 - True copy of the Order No.17013/25/2016-IFS.II dated 21.11.2017 from the Ministry of Environment, Forest & Climate Change

Annexure MA7 - True copy of State Government Letter No.2144811/AIS-CI/2018/GAD dated 3.8.2019

Annexure R8 - A true copy of this Ministry letter No.17013/21/2017-IFS-II dated 13/6/2018

Annexure R9 - A true copy of this Ministry letter No.17013/21/2017-IFS-II dated 25.7.2019

Annexure R10 - A true copy of MA sent to Government Counsel vide letter No.22012/27/2018-IFS-II dated 2.8.2019 for filing

Annexure R11 - A true copy of State Government of Kerala letter no.2144811/AIS-CI/2018/GAD dated 3.8.2019 is annexed

Annexure R12 - A true copy of this Ministry letter no.17013/21/2017-IFS-II dated 8.8.2019 sent to State Government of Kerala

Annexure R13 - A true copy of DoP&T's letter no.14015/33/2019-AIS-I dated 8.2.2019

Annexure R2(H) - True copy of the Letter F.No.17013/21/2017-IFS-II dated 8/8/2019 from the Ministry of Environment, Forest & Climate Change

Annexure R2(I) - True copy of the Letter No.2144811/AIS-CI/2018/GAD dated 8.8.2019 addressed to Secretary, Union Public Service Commission

Annexure R2(J) - True copy of the letter No.2144811/AIS-CI/2018/GAD dated 14.8.2019 addressed to Secretary, Union Public Service Commission

-X-X-X-X-X-X-X-