

**CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL  
CHENNAI BENCH**

**OA/310/00105/2019**

**Dated Monday the 4<sup>th</sup> day of February Two Thousand Nineteen**

**CORAM: HON'BLE MR. R. RAMANUJAM, Member (A)  
HON'BLE MR. P. MADHAVAN, Member (J)**

Mrs. U.Eswari,  
W/o. S.Umapathy,  
No.6, Gul Mahal Street,  
Poonga Nagar,  
Thiruvallur 602001.

....Applicant

By Advocate M/s. T.S.N.Prabhakaran

Vs

1.The Chief General Manager,  
Chennai Telephones District,  
Office of C.GM.,  
No. 10, Millers Road, Chennai 600010.

2.The Assistant General Manager (Estt),  
BSNL Chennai Telephones,  
No. 10, Millers Road,  
Chennai 600010.

....Respondents

**ORAL ORDER**

**(Pronounced by Hon'ble Mr. R. Ramanujam, Member(A))**

Heard. The applicant has filed this OA seeking the following relief :

"To call for records pertaining to the order dated 13.04.2018 in proceedings No.Lr.No.ASR/CGA/CHTD/1530/2016/5 dated 13.04.2018 and quash the same, consequently, direct the respondents 1 & 2 herein to give employment to the applicant on compassionate grounds and thus render justice."

2. The applicant is aggrieved by Annexure A7 communication dt. 13.04.2018 by which her application for compassionate appointment to a dependent family member was turned down on the ground that the family was "less indigent as per relative weightage points" and "keeping in view the assets/liabilities of the family of the deceased official, support arrangement, constitution of family and overall assessment of the condition of the family, the Circle High Power Committee did not agree to recommend compassionate ground appointment and rejected the request under the Rule provisions of the scheme." No objective reasoning has been recorded for the decision and it is not clear on what basis the respondents arrived at the conclusion that the applicant's family was "less indigent" as per relative weightage points. Accordingly, the applicant would be satisfied if the competent authority is directed to communicate the detailed assessment made with regard to the applicant and how she was found to be less indigent than the last selected candidate under the compassionate appointment scheme in the relevant year.

3. As the impugned communication is silent on the details of the assessment, keeping in view the submission and without going into the substantive merits of

the case, we deem it appropriate to direct the competent authority to pass a reasoned and speaking order conveying the different criteria under which the applicant was assessed, the relative merit points given under each, the aggregate merit points of the last selected candidate, etc to the applicant within a period of two months from the date of receipt of a copy of this order. The applicant shall be at liberty to challenge the order thereafter if still aggrieved and if so advised.

4. OA is disposed of at the admission stage.

**(P. Madhavan)**  
**Member(J)**

**(R. Ramanujam)**  
**Member(A)**

**04.02.2019**

SKSI