

**CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL  
PRINCIPAL BENCH: NEW DELHI**

C.P. 390/2017 In  
O.A. No. 3394/2016

With

CP No.384/2017 in  
OA No.4019/2016

CP No. 386/2017 In  
OA No.4017/2016

C.P. No.388/2017 In  
O.A. No.3411/2016

Order reserved on: 11.01.2019

Order pronounced on: 18.01.2019

**HON'BLE MR. V. AJAY KUMAR, MEMBER (J)**  
**HON'BLE MS. ARADHANA JOHRI, MEMBER (A)**

**CP No. 390/2017**

01. Sh. Hoobraj Singh Thakur,  
S/o Sh. Shyamle Singh Thakur,  
D.O.B. 28/05/1968,  
Date of Joining 18/09/1990,  
Working as helper,  
AIR, Jabalpur (M.P.).

02. Sh. Tara Singh Daberao,  
S/o Sh. Babu Singh Daberao,  
DOB-20/08/1963,  
DOJ 23/07/1992  
LPT: Khamgaon DMC: Bhusawal.

03. Sh. Jiwan Das Kumare,  
S/o Sh. Mukinda Kumare,  
DOB : 21/04/1964  
DOJ: 27/12/1990  
LPT: Pandhar Kawada  
DMC: Chandrapur.

04. Sh. Dhanraj Ukey,  
s/o Sh. Shivcharan Ukey,  
ODB: 18/08/1966

DOJ: 11/03/1991,  
LPT : Bramhapuri,  
DMC: Chandrapur.

05. Sh. Naval Sinh Jadeja,  
s/o Sh. Surubha Jadeja,  
DOB: 12/07/1965,  
DOJ: 25/02/1990  
LPT: Jamnagar DMC: Rajkot.

06. Sh. Tushar Bhai Patel,  
S/o Sh. Prabhubhai Patel,  
DOB: 05/05/1966  
DOJ: 13/09/1990  
LPT: Umargaon DMC: Nasik.

07. Sh. Suresh Raja Bhau Pande,  
S/o Sh. Raju Bhau Pande,  
DOB: 05/04/1964,  
DOJ: 22/12/1991,  
LPT: Akola DMC: Akola.

08. Sh. Narendra Bhai Mahyavansi,  
S/o Sh. Chhana Bhai Mahyavansi,  
DOB: 28/10/1961  
DOJ: 18/06/1988  
LPT: Daman DMC: Surat.

09. Sh. Piyush Bhai Majoor,  
S/o Sh. Dayal Bhai Majoor,  
DOB: 15/12/1960  
DOJ: 01/07/1990HPT: Surat.

10. Sh. Mahendra Patel,  
S/o Sh. Soma Patel,  
DOB: 02/10/1966,  
DOJ:07/10/1989,  
HPT: Surat.

11. Sh. Chintu Bhai Choudhary,  
S/o Sh. Kahsiram Choudhary,  
DOB: 01/06/1965,  
DOJ: 14/02/1990,  
LPT: Ahwa DMC: Surat.

12. Sh. Dinesh Bhai Patel,  
S/o Sh. Lalji Patel,  
DOB: 10/07/1966

DOJ: 18/07/1990  
LPT: Valsad DMC: Surat.

13. Sh. Kirat Jadav,  
s/o Sh. Amar Sinh  
DOB: 10/09/1965  
DOJ:20/04/1990  
Air Rajkot.

14. Sh. Rajendra Vekaria,  
S/o Sh. Gunvant Rai,  
DOB: 18/06/1967  
DOJ:24/04/1990  
LPT: Khambaliya,  
DMC: Rajkot.

15. Sh. Hulasram Randive,  
S/o Sh. Sadaram Randive,  
DOB: 07/01/1964,  
DOJ: 10/11/1989  
LPT: Malanjkhanda  
DMC:Raipur (CG).

16. Sh. Roopsingh Saiyam  
S/o Sh. Ratansing Saiyam,  
DOB: 03/04/1966  
DOJ:25/10/1990  
LPT: Malanjkhanda  
DMC: Raipur (CG).

17. Sh. Ghanshyam Arlekar,  
S/o Sh. Shanu Arlekar,  
DOB: 12/03/1965  
DOJ: 01/09/1989  
DDK: Panji Goa.

18. Sh. Santosh Kudalkar,  
s/o sh. Datta Kudalkar,  
DOB: 21/01/1965  
DOJ:15/05/1991  
DDK : Panji Goa.

19. Sh. Yashwant Parab,  
S/o Sh. Dattaram Parab,  
DOB: 25/06/1961  
DOJ:20/05/1991  
DDK: Panji Goa

20. Sh. Sadanand Parab,  
S/o Sh. Shankar Parab,  
DOB: 14/02/1963  
DOJ: 01/11/1989  
DDK: Panji Goa.

21. Sh. Dinesh Sinh Rana,  
S/o Sh. Prabhat Sinh Rana,  
DOB: 17/05/1966,  
DOJ: 22/06/1988,  
LPT: Surendranagar,  
DMC: Rajkot.

22. Sh. Avinash Borade,  
S/o Sh. Tukaram Borade  
DOB: 29/12/1962  
DOJ: 07/02/1992  
LPT: Akkalkot DMC: solapur.

23. Sh. Virshan Bhai Dhodya,  
S/o Sh. Nbarsinha Bhai Dhodya,  
DOB: 01/06/1969  
ODJ: 22/11/1990  
LPT: Navapur DMC: Surat.

24. Sh Mannulal Suryanvansi,  
s/o Sh. Chhatalal Suryanvansi  
DOB: 30/07/1965  
DOJ: 22/07/1989  
DDK: Raipur (CG).

25. Sh. Bachanlal Manzi,  
s/o Sh. Shivprasad Manzi,  
DOB: 18/05/1970  
DOJ: 24/07/1990  
DDK: Raipur (CG).

26. Sh. Sadanand Jha,  
S/o Sh. Shamakant Jha,  
DOB: 12/10/1969  
DOJ: 13/10/1989  
DDK: Raipur (CG).

27. Sh. Kishor Bagul,  
S/o Sh. Ragunath Bagul,  
DOB: 01/01/1965  
DOJ: 15/02/1991  
LPT: Shahada

DMC: Jalgaon.

28. Sh. Sanjay pawar,  
S/o Sh. Shakar Pawar,  
DOB: 17/01/1964  
DOJ:22/02/1992  
LPT: Nashik  
DMC: Nashik.

29. Sh. Mahendra Aheer  
s/o Sh. Vinayak Aher,  
DOB: 20/07/1963  
DOJ: 14/11/1991  
LPT: Manmad  
DMC: Aurangabad.

30. Sh. Suresh Khandare,  
S/o Sh. Jayram Khandare,  
DOB: 01/06/1964  
DOJ: 31/03/1992  
LPT: Barshi  
DMC: Solapur

31. Sh. Ganapat Madavi,  
S/o Sh. Damaji Madavi,  
DOB: 04/05/1970  
DOJ: 29/05/1991  
LPT: Kinwat,  
DMC: Nanded.

32. Sh. Kishor Kumar,  
s/o Sh. Nagappa,  
DOB: 23/05/1965  
DOJ: 17/10/1989  
LPT: Udupi Manipal  
DMC: Mangalore (Karnataka).

33. Sh. Vasant Kumar Shettar,  
S/o Sh. Manjunath  
DOB: 08/02/1966  
DOJ: 28/03/1990  
LPT: Ranebennur  
DMC: Davangere.

34. Sh. Dilip Nikalje,  
S/o Sh. Ranu Nikalje,  
DOB: 04/02/1961  
DOJ: 03/12/1987

LPT: Mangalwedha  
DMC: Solapur.

35. Sh. G. Vardhan,  
s/o sh. G. Gangadharan,  
DOB: 09/04/1962  
DOJ: 27/07/1987  
DDK: Bangalore

36. Sh. M. Nagraj,  
S/o Sh. Muniswamy,  
DOB: 10/02/1963  
DOJ: 03/03/1987  
DDK : Bangalore.

37. Sh. M. Iyappa,  
S/o Sh. Muniswamy,  
DOB: 01/12/1960  
DOJ: 06/01/1989  
DDK: Bangalore.

38. Sh. V. Nagraj,  
S/o Sh. Veerappachar'k.v.  
DOB: 06/04/1964  
DOJ: 03/03/1988  
DDK: Bangalore

39. Sh. M. Manju Nath  
S/o Sh. Ma,ingappa,  
DOB: 23/07/1968  
DOJ: 11/07/1991  
DDK : Bangalore

40. Sh. K. Chanra Shekershastry,  
S/o Sh. Chidanda shastry,  
DOB: 05/12/1968  
DOJ: 15/07/1991  
DDK : Bangalore.

41. Sh. Anand Kumar,  
s/o sh. Muniswamy K.  
DOB: 15/01/1960  
DOJ: 19/11/1984  
DDK : Bangalore.

42. Sh. Madhu Suhan,  
S/o Sh. P.K. Narayan Nair,  
DOB: 04/04/1969

DOJ: 10/05/1990  
DDK: Bangalore.

43. Sh. M. Madeva,  
S/o Sh. Muniyappa,  
DOB: 30/04/1965  
DOJ: 30/08/1990  
LPT: KGF  
DMC: Bangalore.

44. Sh. Babu Saheb Kanthi,  
s/o sh. Rajesahed Kanthi,  
DOB: 24/04/1965  
DOJ: 10/11/1989  
LPT: Hiriyur,  
DMC: Davanager.

45. Sh. Baby,  
S/o Sh. Orphan  
DOB: 15/08/1963  
DOJ: 17/11/1984  
DDK : Bnagalore.

46. Sh. MD. Nazeer Ahmad,  
S/o Sh. Shaik Ahmed,  
DOB: 29/11/1964  
DOJ: 24/04/1990  
LPT: Nirmac  
DMC: Kareem Nagar (tel)

47. Sh. Suresh Gaikwad,  
S/o Sh. Gopinath Gaikwad,  
DOB: 30/05/1964  
DOJ: 16/11/1987  
LPT: Ahmadnagar  
DMC: Aurangabad (MH).

48. Sh. Ramesh Salve,  
S/o Sh. Soja Salve,  
DOB: 01/01/1962  
DOJ: 26/10/1987  
LPT: Ahmadnagar,  
DMC: Aurangabad (MH).

49. Sh. Preetam Balmiki,  
S/o sh. Ganga Prasad,  
DOB: 11/06/1962  
DOJ: 22/08/1991

LPT: Khurai,  
DMC: Sagar (MP).

50. Sh. Atmaram Lokhande,  
S/o Sh. Chandrakant Lokhande,  
DOB: 01/06/1968  
DOJ: 32/05/1992  
AIR: Pune (MH).

51. Sh. Jnanananda,  
S/o Sh. Krishnappa Bhandary,  
DOB: 22/09/1965  
DOJ: 05/04/1990  
AIR : Mangaluru.

52. Sh. Govind Sadiya,  
S/o Sh. Dudabhai Saidya,  
DOB: 10/08/1969  
DOJ: 15/04/1989  
LPT: Porbandar DDMC: Rajkot.

53. Sh. T. Mahalingappa,  
s/o Sh. Thimmaiah,  
DOB: 01/06/1961  
DOJ: 29/11/1989  
7 OA-3394/2016  
DD HPT Hassan Karnataka,

54. Sh. Shivanand Hatagade,  
S/o Sh. Ganeshrao,  
DOB: 01/06/1965  
DOJ: 23/11/1989  
LPT: Degloor,  
DMC: Nanded (MH)

55. Sh. Vijay Kumar B. Jamadar,  
s/o Sh. Basvant Ray,  
DOB: 01/06/1964  
DOJ: 14.08.1989  
DDRC: Solapur,  
DMC: Solapur (MH.).

56. Sh. Basi. Subbarauidi.  
S/o Sh. Thirumalaiah,  
DOB: 07/08/1963  
DOJ: 12/08/1992  
Air: Hyderabad  
(Telangana).



57. Sh. Gurudas G. Gawas,  
S/o Sh. Ganesh B. Gawas,  
DOB: 26/02/1964  
DOJ: 28/05/1987  
Helper: 01 April 1995  
AIR : Panji Goa.

58. Sh. Jumma Tadavi,  
S/o sh. Ismaile Tadavi  
DOB: 05/01/1970  
DOJ: 25/04/1995  
HPT: Jalgaon

59. Sh. Shivputra Sarwadkar,  
S/o Sh. Laxman Sarwadkar,  
DOB 18/04/1970  
DOJ: 17/03/1994  
LPT: Pandharpur  
DMC: Solapur.

60. Sh. Daud Dhuliya,  
S/o Sh. Vinja Dhuliya,  
DOB: 06/06/1966  
DOJ: 21/03/1994  
LPT: Jaora,  
DMC: Ratlam (MP).

61. Sh. C. Ramakrishna,  
DOB: 08/06/1971  
DOJ: 24/02/1995  
LPT: Pavagada,  
DMC: Bangalore (Karnataka).

62. Sh. M.S. Mani,  
S/o Sh. Munirathnam,  
DOB: 20/07/1968  
DOJ: 17/01/1992  
DDK: Bangalore  
(Karnataka).

63. Sh. S. Riyaz Ahmed,  
s/o Sh. Shaikahmed,  
DOB: 12/06/1968  
DOJ: 06/07/1991  
DDK: Bangalore  
(Karnataka).

... Petitioners

(By Advocate: Dr. Ashwani Bhardwaj)

Versus

1. Shri Ajay Mittal,  
Secretary,  
Ministry of Information & Broadcasting,  
Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
  2. Shri Rajeev Singh  
The CEO.,  
Prasar Bharti,  
PTI Building,  
New Delhi.
  3. Smt. Supriya Sahu,  
The Director General,  
Doordarshan Kendra,  
Doordarshan Bhawan,  
Mandi House,  
New Delhi.
- ... Respondents

(By Advocate: Mr. Saket Chandan for Mr. Rajeev Sharma)

**CP No. 384/2017**

1. Sh. Ravindra Baliram Patil  
S/o Sh. Baliram Shankar Patil  
D.O. Birth: 05/04/1959, Age 57  
D.O. Joining: 09/10/1984  
LPT: Raver DMC: Bhusawal.
2. Sh. Suhas Laxmanprasad Sharma  
S/o Sh. Laxmanprasad Y. Sharma  
D.O. Birth: 17/01/1968, Age: 48  
D.O. Joining: 29/06/1991  
LPT: TVRC Beed  
DMC: Auranga Bad
3. Sh. Ambika Prasad Upadhyay  
S/o Late Sh. Mihi Lal Upadhyay  
D.O. Birth: 01/07/1962, Age-54  
D.O. Joining: 16/09/1988  
LPT: Narsinghpur  
DMC: Jabalpur
4. Sh. Sunkara Lakshmana Rao  
S/o Sh. S. Papa Rao  
D.O. Birth: 05/04/1967, Age 49  
D.O. Joining: 05/02/1992  
LPT: Kakinada, DMC: Rajahmundry

5. Sh. M. Ramchander  
S/o Sh. Shanker  
D.O. Birth: 07/11/1962, Age 54  
D.O. Joining: 05/06/1992  
AIR: Hyderabad.
6. Sh. Md. Khaleed Ali Khan  
S/o Sh. M.B.A. Khan  
D.O. Birth: 12/09/1966  
D.O. Joining: 24/01/1992  
AIR: Hyderabad (Telangana)
7. Sh. Nyalam Lingam  
S/o Sh. Nyalam Narsimlu  
D.O. Birth: 20/02/1962  
D.O. Joining: 01/06/1987  
LPT: Nizamabad  
DMC: Hyderabad.
8. Sh. Guduru Sreenivasulu  
S/o Sh. Guduru Muneiah  
D.O. Birth: 02/01/1962,  
D.O. Joining: 11/06/1987  
LPTV: Kadapa  
DMC: Kadapa District (AP.)
9. Sh. Mamidisetla Jayaram  
S/o Sh. Mamidisetla Pedda Subbanna  
D.O. Birth: 08/07/1970  
D.O. Joining: 07/01/1995  
LPTV: Proddatur  
DMC: Kadapa District.
10. Sh. Mogusala Ramana Reddy  
S/o Sh. Laxma Reddy  
D.O. Birth: 10/08/1965  
D.O. Joining: 08/01/1990  
LPT: Ramagundam  
DMC: Warangal.
11. Sh. Jenu Nageswara Rao  
S/o Sh. J. Venkateswara Rao  
D.O. Birth: 24/05/1970  
D.O. Joining: 26/03/1994  
LPT: Bhimavaram  
DMC: Rajahmundry(AP).

12. Sh. R. Chitti Babu  
S/o Late Sh. R. Rama Krishna  
D.O. Birth: 19/06/1963  
D.O. Joining: 04/08/1992  
DDK: Hyderabad.

13. Sh. P. Vasudev  
S/o Sh. P. Rajahai  
D.O. Birth: 19/04/1963  
D.O. Joining: 15/06/1988  
DDK: Hyderabad.

14. Sh. Sode Raja Pratap Rudradev  
S/o Sh. S. Vedaprakash  
D.O. Birth: 01/12/1959  
D.O. Joining: 06/02/1988  
DDK: Hyderabad.

15. Sh. Nune Bikshapathi  
S/o Sh. N. Chandraiah  
D.O. Birth: 02/03/1960  
D.O. Joining: 03/02/1983  
DDK: Hyderabad.

16. Sh. Pastam Ramulu  
S/o Sh. P. Pochaiab  
D.O. Birth: 30/03/1960  
D.O. Joining, 16/11/1991  
DDK: Hyderabad.

17. Sh. P. Krishna  
S/o Sh. Dhamaraj  
D.O. Birth: 10/10/1958  
D.O. Joining: 08/02/1983  
DDK: Hyderabad.

18. Sh. Kommu Maisalah  
S/o Sh. K. Durgaih  
D.O. Birth: 10/04/1958  
D.O. Joining: 03/02/1983  
DDK: Hyderabad.

19. Sh. S. Janglah  
S/o Late S. Satya  
D.O. Birth: 01/01/1960  
D.O. Joining: 07/03/1984  
DDK: Hyderabad.

20. Sh. Doddoju Rameswaram  
S/o Sh. D. Pedda Govindalah  
D.O. Birth: 07/06/1968  
D.O. Joining: 29/11/1990  
DDK: Hyderabad.

21. Sh. T. Harinath Rao  
S/o Sh. T. Hanumanth Rao  
D.O. Birth: 04/04/1969  
D.O. Joining: 07/08/1992  
DDK: Hyderabad.

22. Sh. Katta Janardhan  
S/o Sh. K. Venkataiah  
D.O. Birth: 11/01/1963  
D.O. Joining: 06/06/1992  
DDK: Hyderabad.

23. Sh. Shivsingh Kanwar  
S/o Sh. Mattulal Kanwar  
D.O. Birth: 04/02/1967  
D.O. Joining: 24/05/1990  
LPT: Sakti, DMC: Bilaspur(CG).

24. Sh. Narayan Singh Rathore  
S/o Sh. Udayram Rathore  
D.O. Birth: 09/05/1967  
D.O. Joining: 20/07/1990  
LPT: Pendra Road  
DMC: Shahdol (MP).

25. Sh. Rupchand Narnowre  
S/o Sh. Tularam Narnowre  
D.O. Birth: 10/03/1965  
D.O. Joining: 09/11/1989  
LPT: Balaghat, DMC: Jabalpur(MP).

26. Sh. Balu Gengaje  
S/o Sh. Laxman Gangaje  
D.O. Birth: 10/06/1971  
D.O. Joining: 10/01/1994  
AIR: Pune.

27. Sh. M. Veeraswamy  
S/o Sh. Yellaiah  
D.O. Birth: 05/10/1970  
D.O. Joining: 09/10/1990  
DDK: Warangal.

28. Sh. M. Satya Rao  
S/o Late Sh. M. Ramarao  
D.O. Birth: 13/06/1971  
D.O. Joining: 18/05/1995  
LPT TVRC: Kurasia  
DMC: Shahdol(MP).

29. Sh. P. Ramulu  
S/o Sh. Narayana  
D.O. Birth: 16/10/1957  
D.O. Joining: 19/08/1982  
DDK: Hyderabad.

30. Sh. Messi. Sammaiah  
S/o Sh. Muthaiah  
D.O. Birth: 03/09/1964  
D.O. Joining: 18/12/1992  
TVRC: Yellandu  
DMC: Warangal

31. Sh. Ponduri Venkata S. Rao  
S/o Sh. Ponduri Anjaneylu  
D.O. Birth: 01/07/1965  
D.O. Joining: 27/02/1988  
LPTV: Nellore  
DMC: Nellore(AP).

32. Sh. E. Gyaneshwar  
S/o Sh. E. Sudershan  
D.O. Birth: 04/06/1960  
D.O. Joining: 25/11/1991  
DDK: Hyderabad.

33. Sh. Raju Bhaguji Kuslangwad  
S/o Sh. B. Punjaji Kuslangwad  
D.O. Birth: 02/09/1968  
D.O. Joining: 27/10/1990  
DD HPT: Aurangabad.

34. Sh. Asadi Rajendran  
S/o Sh. Asadi Jesudas  
D.O. Birth: 01/07/1959  
D.O. Joining: 11/07/1991  
AIR: Kadapa (AP)

35. Sh. V. Ashok Kumar  
S/o Sh. V. Balaram

D.O. Birth: 25/10/1960  
D.O. Joining: 12/03/1991  
TVRC: Nalgonda  
DMC: Hyderabad.

36. Sh. Rama Naik  
S/o Sh. Bheema Naik  
D.O. Birth: 20/07/1963  
D.O. Joining: 19/01/1994  
DDK-HPT Hassan  
DMC-Mysure(Karnataka). .....Petitioners

(By Advocate: Dr. Ashwani Bhardwaj )

Versus

1. Shri Ajay Mittal,  
Secretary,  
Ministry of Information & Broadcasting,  
Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
2. Shri Rajeev Singh  
The CEO.,  
Prasar Bharti,  
PTI Building,  
New Delhi.
3. Smt. Supriya Sahu,  
The Director General,  
Doordarshan Kendra,  
Doordarshan Bhawan,  
Mandi House,  
New Delhi. ... Respondents

(By Advocate: Mr. Saket Chandan for Mr. Rajeev Sharma)

**CP No. 386/2017**

(01) Sh. Ashish Mandal  
S/o Late Narendra Nath Mandal  
D.O. Birth: 26/06/1973  
D.O. Joining: 13/06/2003  
LPT: Kanker  
DMC: Raipur (CG)

(02) Sh. Sanilla Ganesh  
S/o Sh. Jangaiah

D.O. Birth: 02/08/1968  
D.O. Joining: 19/06/1996  
LPT: Veldanda  
DMC: Mahaboobnagar

(03) Sh. Dharimisetty Venkata Rao  
S/o Sh. Dharimisetty Ramanaiah  
D.O. Birth:15/01/1976  
D.O. Joining: 22/03/1990  
LPT: Lakkireddypalli  
DMC: Kadapa District (AP)

(04) Sh. Vepamanu Jagannathan  
S/o Sh. Vepamanu C. Govindappa  
D.O. Birth:03/05/1972  
D.O. Joining: 01/10/1999  
LPT: Kadiri  
DMC: Kadapa District (AP)

(05) Sh. M. Ramulu  
S/o Sh. Bakkaiah  
D.O. Birth:15/11/1970  
D.O. Joining: 16/02/2000  
TVRC: Nagarkurnool  
DMC: Mahaboobnagar (Tel.)

(06) Sh. Vikas Sudhakar Badkas  
S/o Sh. Sudhakar Badkas  
D.O. Birth:07/07/1972  
D.O. Joining: 09/11/1996  
LPT: Vita  
DMC: Kolhapur

(07) Sh. M. Amaranath Naik  
S/o Sh. M. Deepala Naik  
D.O. Birth:06/06/1970  
D.O. Joining: 07/05/1997  
TVRC: Kuppam  
DMC: Bangalore.

(08) Sh. Malkhan Singh Patel  
S/o Sh. Nathooram Patel  
D.O. Birth:23/10/1975  
D.O. Joining: 16/03/2000  
TVRC: Panchmari  
DMC: Itarsi (MP).

(09) Sh. Nitil Ganpat Rahate



S/o Sh. Ganpat S. Rahate  
D.O. Birth:26/07/1971  
D.O. Joining: 09/11/1999  
LPT: Deoruki  
DMC: Kolhapur.

(10) Sh. Rajesh Balwant Vichare  
S/o Sh. Balwant R. Vichare  
D.O. Birth:26/06/1975  
D.O. Joining: 05/11/1999  
LPT: Rajapur  
DMC: Kolhapur.

(11) Sh. D. Jyotheeswaran  
S/o Sh. K. Doraswamy  
D.O. Birth:10/05/1973  
D.O. Joining: 29/09/1997  
LPT: Palaman  
DMC: Kadapa District (AP)

(12) Sh. Kirtikumar K. Sh. Mali  
S/o Sh. Kashiram Sh. Mali  
D.O. Birth:25/07/1971  
D.O. Joining: 11/10/1999  
DDK: HPT Bhuj (Gujrat)

(13) Sh. Rajnish Asarsa,  
S/o Sh. Bhagwati Prasad  
D.O.B. :13/10/1973  
D.O. Joining: 12/12/1997  
DDK: Ahmedabad (Gujrat)

(14) Sh. Nagendra Sian Barad  
S/o Sh. Arian Bhai Ata Bhai Barad  
D.O. Birth:01/06/1970  
D.O. Joining: 05/05/1998  
LPT: Veraval  
DMC: Rajkot (Gujrat)

(15) Sh. Narayan Pawar  
S/o Sh. Manikrao Pawar  
D.O. Birth:16/02/1975  
D.O. Joining: 01/02/1999  
TVRC: Amravati  
DMC: Akola.

...Petitioners

(By Advocate: Dr. Ashwani Bhardwaj )

Versus

1. Shri Ajay Mittal,  
Secretary,  
Ministry of Information & Broadcasting,  
Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
  2. Shri Rajeev Singh  
The CEO.,  
Prasar Bharti,  
PTI Building,  
New Delhi.
  3. Smt. Supriya Sahu,  
The Director General,  
Doordarshan Kendra,  
Doordarshan Bhawan,  
Mandi House,  
New Delhi.
- ... Respondents

(By Advocate: Mr. Saket Chandan for Mr. Rajeev Sharma)

**C.P. No.388 of 2017**

(1) Shri D.B. Ade  
S/o Shri Baba Raoji Ade  
D.O. Birth:13/01/1978  
D.O. Joining: 28/03/2000  
LPT: Umarched, DMC: Nanded

(2) Shri Jatin Kumar Deo  
S/o Shri Suranarayan Deo  
D.O. Birth: 12/01/1973  
D.O. Joining: 18/11/1998  
LPT: Rairakhol  
DMC: Sambalpur

(3) Shri Dilip Chourasiya  
S/o Shri Komalchand Chou.  
D.O. Birth: 16/06/1971  
D.O. Joining: 22/11/1999  
LPT: Kurwai  
DMC: Ashoknagar Guna (MP)

(4) Shri Mahesh Namdev  
S/o Shri Jeewanlal Namdev

D.O. Birth: 03/03/1972  
D.O. Joining: 18/07/1998  
LPT: Ashoknagar  
DMC: Ashoknagar (MP)

(5) Shri Rajesh Kumar Patel  
S/o Shri Kantu Bhai Patel  
D.O. Birth 01/06/1973  
D.O. Joining: 18/06/1998  
LPT: Dharampur DMC: Surat

(6) Shri Ashvin Bhai Patel  
S/o Shri Mohan Bhai Patel  
D.O. Birth: 12/06/1976  
D.O. Joining: 01/03/2000  
LPT: Dharampur DMC: Surat

(7) Shri Anil V Waghmare  
S/o Shri Vashwanath Waghmare  
D.O. Birth: 09/09/1975  
D.O. Joining: 05/01/1999  
LPT: Buldhana DMC: Bhusawal

(8) Shri Naresh Patel  
S/o Shri Kanji Bhai Patel  
D.O. Birth 23/04/1973  
D.O. Joining: 20/01/2000  
LPT: Amod DMC: Bharuch

(9) Shri Kashiram Tokare  
S/o Shri Ravji Tokare  
D.O. Birth: 10/11/1972  
D.O. Joining: 11/11/1998  
LPT: Silvassa DMC: Nasik

(10) Shri Vikas Bawane  
S/o Shri Karnuji Bawane  
D.O. Birth: 14/09/1974  
D.O. Joining 21/05/1997  
HPT: Chandrapur  
DMC: Chandrapur

(11) Shri Suresh B AAgawane  
S/o Shri Bhagwan AAgawane  
D.O. Birth: 01/06/1969  
D.O. Joining: 05/10/1995  
LPT: Dhule DDMC: Jalgaon

(12) Shri Vishwanath Thakare  
S/o Shri Shankar Thakare  
D.O. Birth: 04/05/1973  
D.O. Joining: 09/02/1999  
LPT: Yavatmal, DMC: Nagpur

(13) Shri Gajanan Tirmare  
S/o Shri Marotrao Tirmare  
D.O. Birth: 23/08/1973  
D.O. Joining: 29/01/1999  
LPT: Morshi, DMC: Nagpur

(14) Shri Dinesh Pawar  
S/o Shri Harising Pawar  
D.O. Birth: 06/05/1975  
D.O. Joining: 14/03/2000  
LPT: Betul  
DMC: Itarasi(MP)

(15) Shri Dileep Rajpur  
S/o Shri Pratap Rajput  
D.O. Birth 17/06/1975  
D.O. Joining: 13/03/2000  
LPT: Harda  
DMC: Itarasi

(16) Shri A Nagaraju  
S/o Shri Ramulu  
D.O. Birth: 15/04/1972  
D.O. Joining: 07/02/2000  
LPT: Medak  
DMC: Hyderabad(Telangana)

(17) Shri N. Mahesha  
S/o Shri Narayimhe Gowda  
D.O. Birth: 05/01/1972  
D.O. Joining: 27/03/1997  
DDK: Bangalore

(18) Shri C. Mahender  
S/o Shri Madhusudhan  
D.O. Birth: 18/05/1969  
D.O. Joining: 25/09/1997  
LPT: Kamareddy  
DMC: Hyderabad(Tel)

(19) Shri Rajmowli  
S/o Shri Santhaiah

D.O. Birth: 25/06/1968  
D.O. Joining: 28/10/1996  
LPT: Siddhipet, DMC: Hyderabad(Tel)

(20) Shri Govinda Pendam  
S/o Shri Ganpat Pendam  
D.O. Birth: 10/10/1974  
D.O. Joining: 01/11/1999  
LPT: Sironcha  
DMC: Chandrapur

(21) Shri Subhash Chandra Patel  
S/o Shri Govind Prasad Patel  
D.O. Birth: 02/10/1973  
D.O. Joining: 19/11/1999  
LPT: Sironj  
DMC: Ashoknagar Guna(MP)

(22) Sh. Nawab Pathan  
S/o Shri Sattar Pathan  
D.O. Birth: 24/02/1975  
D.O. Joining: 01/01/1999  
LPT: Malegaon (Nasik)  
DMC: Aurangabad (MH)

(23) Shri Chandar Deshmukh  
S/o Shri Kashiram Deshmukh  
D.O. Birth: 01/06/1970  
D.O. Joining: 26/10/1995  
LPT: Satana  
DDMC: Aurangabad (MH)

(24) Shri Muniganti Ramamurthy  
S/o Shri M. Anandam  
D.O. Birth: 10/06/1971  
D.O. Joining: 25/09/1997  
DD Kendra Warangal

(25) Shri Pradeep Dugam  
S/o Sh. Vishwambher Dugam  
D.O. Birth: 29/12/1972  
D.O. Joining: 05/01/1999  
DDRC: Omerga

(26) Shri Basaboina Meghanath  
S/o Shri Satyanarayana  
D.O. Birth: 25/12/1975  
D.O. Joining: 11/02/1999

LPT: Bellampalli  
DDMC: Warangal (Tel.)

(27) Shri Haridas Ondre  
S/o Shri Bhimrao Ondre  
D.O. Birth: 10/05/1973  
D.O. Joining: 06/09/1999  
LPT: Bhamragad  
DDMC: Chandrapur

.....Petitioners

(By Advocate:Dr. Ashwani Bhardwaj)

Versus

1. Shri Ajay Mittal,  
Secretary,  
Ministry of Information & Broadcasting,  
Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
  2. Shri Rajeev Singh  
The CEO.,  
Prasar Bharti,  
PTI Building,  
New Delhi.
  3. Smt. Supriya Sahu,  
The Director General,  
Doordarshan Kendra,  
Doordarshan Bhawan,  
Mandi House,  
New Delhi.
- ... Respondents

(By Advocate: Mr. Saket Chandan for Mr. Rajeev Sharma)

**ORDER**

**By Hon'ble Mr. V. Ajay Kumar, Member (J):**

Since the facts and law involved in these CPs are identical, the same are disposed of by way of this common order. However, the facts in C.P. No. 390/2017 in OA No.3394/2016 are considered.

2. OA No. 3394/2016 filed by the applicants was disposed of by this Tribunal on 04.10.2016 as under:-

“2. Learned counsel for the applicant argued that this case was similar to OA No. 1949/2012 which was decided by a Co-ordinate Bench of this Tribunal on 03.04.2014. The aforesaid judgment was also followed in OA No. 3607/2014 decided on 10.10.2014. Learned counsel stated that the applicants would be satisfied in case directions were given to the respondents to examine the case of the applicants and extend to them the same benefits.

3. In view of the limited prayer made by the applicants, we dispose of this OA at admission stage itself without issuing notice to the respondents and without going into the merits of the case with a direction to them to examine the case of the applicants herein in the light of the judgment in and OA No. 3607/2014. In case it is found that the case of the applicants is similar to these aforementioned judgments, then they be extended the same benefits as were granted to the applicants therein. The respondents shall decide the case of the applicants within a period of sixty days from the date of receipt of a certified copy of this order and they shall communicate their decision to the applicants by means of a reasoned and speaking order. No costs.”

3. In compliance of the aforesaid orders, the respondents issued the Speaking Order dated 20.12.2016 and the relevant part of the same reads as under:-

“WHEREAS, Shri Hoobraj Singh Thakur & 62 ors. filed OA No.3394/2016 Vs. UOI & 2 ors. before the Hon’ble CAT, New Delhi seeking financial upgradation under ACP in the pay scale of Rs. 4500-7000 for the applicants as 1<sup>st</sup> ACP and 2<sup>nd</sup> ACP in the next pay scale as per their hierarchy. The Hon’ble CAT, Principal Bench, New Delhi passed an order on 04.10.2016 with the direction to the respondents to examine the case of the applicants in the light of the judgment in OA No. 1949/2012 and OA No. 3607/2014. In case, it is found that the case of the applicants is similar to these aforementioned judgments, then they be extended the same benefits as were granted to the applicants therein.

AND WHEREAS, some similarly situated persons had filed OA No. 1949/2012 and 3607/2014 for similar relief, which was disposed of by the Hon'ble CAT vide their order dated 03.04.2014 and 10.10.2014 respectively, inter-alia, directing the respondents to grant the scale of Technician, i.e. 4500-7000 to the applicants therein from the due date as ACP benefits.

AND WHEREAS, as per Recruitment rules Promotional avenue for the post of Helper, erstwhile Group 'D' post to Lower Division Clerk (LDC) & Technical is as under:

(A) 5% of the post of LDC are being filled by promotion on the basis of seniority subject to the rejection of the unfit (i) from amongst Group 'D' employees of All India Radio/ Doordarshan having nine years regular service in Group 'D' posts and (ii) possessing the educational qualifications for the post.

(B) 5% of the post of LDC are being filled up by promotion on the basis of Limited Departmental Competitive Examinations (LDCE) amongst Group 'D' employee of AIR & DDn.

(C) 5% of the post of Technician are being filled by promotion on the basis of Limited Departmental Competitive Examination from Helper.

Further, DG:AIR, being Cadre Controlling Authority of Engineering Staffs vide its letter dated 06.08.2014 informed that Helpers being erstwhile Gr. D employee are eligible for promotion as LDC and Technician. For promotion on the basis of seniority subject to the rejection of the unfit is only in the post of LDC. Therefore their next promotional post is LDC and not Technician since they can be promoted to the post of Technician only if they possess desired educational qualification required for the post of Technician and qualify the Limited Departmental Competitive Examination (LDCE) and not on seniority basis. In addition, Helpers including other certain posts who were granted upgraded pay scale by M/o I & B No.310/173/97-B (D) dated 25.02.1999 have not been granted/ approved for extending the benefit of ACP by the Ministry of I & B so far. Therefore, extending the benefit as per verdict of Hon'ble CAT, PB, New Delhi to the applicants of OA No. 1949/2012 appears contrary to the relevant provision of DOP&T on ACP instructions issued from time to time. Further, DG: DD was advised to challenge the Hon'ble CAT's order.

AND WHEREAS, DG: Doordarshan had filed Writ Petition no.5597/2015 before the Hon'ble High Court, New Delhi challenging order dated 03.04.2014 passed by the Hon'ble CAT, New Delhi. The Hon'ble High Court



vide its order dated 27.05.2015 gave following interim relief, "In the meanwhile, save and except to the extent that partial implementation of the order has already taken place, without disturbing the same, rest of the implementation of the order shall remain stayed till further order."

NOW THEREFORE, in view of the above, the Writ Petition is still pending for adjudication before the Hon'ble High Court and sub-judice, the competent authority has come to the conclusion that further necessary action in the matter i.e. financial upgradation under ACP in the pay scale of Rs.4500-7000 to the applicants working as Helpers would be taken up after final verdict in the case, which is hereby communicated to all applicants.

This issues with the approval of DG: DD."

4. In W.P. (C) No.5597/2015 in Union of India and Others Vs. Rishi Raj and Others (filed against the order of this Tribunal in OA No.1949/2012 dated 03.04.2014, following which, the OA of the applicants in the instant CP was disposed of), by order dated 27.05.2015, the Hon'ble High Court of Delhi passed the following order:-

"List the matter for final hearing on 29.10.2015. In the meanwhile, save and except to the extent that partial implementation of the order has already taken place, without disturbing the same, rest of the implementation of the order shall remain stayed till further orders".

5. The applicants in OA No.3394/2016 filed the instant CP alleging that the respondents have violated the orders of this Tribunal in the said OA dated 04.10.2016.

6. Heard Dr. Ashwani Bhardwaj, the learned counsel for the petitioners in all the CPs and Mr. Saket Chandan for Mr. Rajeev Sharma, the learned counsel for the

respondents in all the CPs and perused the pleadings on record.

7. Dr. Ashwani Bhardwaj, the learned counsel appearing for the petitioners submits that since the respondents have complied with the orders of this Tribunal in Rishi Raj's case (supra) to some extent, and since the Hon'ble High Court by its order dated 27.05.2015 in Rishi Raj's case, not stayed the partial implementation to the extent that the orders were already implemented, the action of the respondents in not granting the said benefit to the petitioners is in violation of the orders of this Tribunal.

8. We cannot agree with the submission of the learned counsel for the petitioners. Admittedly, the petitioners sought extension of benefit of the judgment in Rishi Raj and Others case. The Hon'ble High Court in W.P. (C) No.5597/2015 filed against the judgment in Rishi Raj and Other, after noticing that the orders in the said OA were complied with to some extent, saved that part and stayed the implementation of the remaining order. That means, once the order on which the petitioners are placing reliance is stayed by the Hon'ble High Court, the action of the respondents cannot be said to be a wilful

disobedience. It is not in dispute that the said stay is still in operation and the said W.P. is still pending.

9. In the circumstances, we do not find any merit in the CP and accordingly the same is dismissed.

10. The other CPs are also dismissed under the identical circumstances. No costs.

Let a copy of this order be placed in all the files.

**(Aradhana Johri)**  
**Member (A)**

**(V. Ajay Kumar)**  
**Member (J)**

RKS