

CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL,
ERNAKULAM BENCH

Original Application No. 181/00014/2015
Original Application No. 181/00015/2015
Original Application No. 181/00017/2015
Original Application No. 181/00018/2015
Original Application No. 181/00020/2015
Original Application No. 181/00027/2015
Original Application No. 181/00036/2015
Original Application No. 181/00060/2015

Friday, this the 22nd day of February, 2019

CORAM:

Hon'ble Mr. E.K. Bharat Bhushan, Administrative Member
Hon'ble Mr. Ashish Kalia, Judicial Member

1. **Original Application No. 181/00014/2015 -**

Sharafudeen T., S/o. Late B. Karamath,
 Therakkal House, Kadamat, Union Territory of
 Lakshadweep – 682 556.

..... **Applicant**

(By Advocate : Mr. Arun Raj – Not present)

V e r s u s

1. The Administrator, Union Territory of Lakshadweep,
Kavarathi – 682 555.
2. The Deputy Collector (HQ), Collectorate,
Administration of the Union Territory of Lakshadweep,
Union Territory of Lakshadweep, Kavaratti – 682 555.
3. Sub Divisional Officer, Office of the Sub Divisional Officer,
Kadamat, Union Territory of Lakshadweep – 682 556.
4. Assistant Settlement Officer, Office of the Sub Divisional
Officer, Kadamat, Union Territory of Lakshadweep – 682 556.
5. Secretary (Panchayats), Union Territory of Lakshadweep,
Kavaratti – 682 555.

..... **Respondents**

(By Advocate : Mr. S. Manu)

2. **Original Application No. 181/00015/2015 -**

P.N. Beerankunhi, S/o. Late Alimechetta Abdulla,
Puthiyannal House, Kadamat Island, Union Territory of Lakshadweep-
682556. **Applicant**

(By Advocate : Mr. Arun Raj – Not present)

V e r s u s

1. The Administrator, Union Territory of Lakshadweep,
Kavarathi – 682 555.
2. The Deputy Collector (HQ), Collectorate,
Administration of the Union Territory of Lakshadweep,
Union Territory of Lakshadweep, Kavaratti – 682 555.
3. Sub Divisional Officer, Office of the Sub Divisional Officer,
Kadamat, Union Territory of Lakshadweep – 682 556.
4. Assistant Settlement Officer, Office of the Sub Divisional
Officer, Kadamat, Union Territory of Lakshadweep – 682 556.
5. Secretary (Panchayats), Union Territory of Lakshadweep,
Kavaratti – 682 555. **Respondents**

(By Advocate : Mr. S. Manu)

3. **Original Application No. 181/00017/2015 -**

1. A.K. Sajeed, Akkara House, Kalpeni Island.
2. P. Haseena, Poodyem House, Kalpeni Island.
3. A.T. Ahadabi, Athanam Thottam House, Kalpeni Island.
4. P.P. Sulaikha, Puthiya Pandaram House, Kalpeni Island.
5. C.P. Noorjahan, Chemmanam Palli House, Kalpeni Island.
6. A.K. Beebi, Arakkalar House, Kalpeni Island.
7. M.P. Mohammed, Mullipura House, Kalpeni Island.
8. Suharabi, aged 50 years, D/o. Thang Koya, Kakkanal House,
Andrott. **Applicants**

(By Advocate : Mr. K.B. Gangesh)

V e r s u s

1. The Administrator, Administration of the Union Territory of Lakshadweep, Kavaratti – 682 555.
2. The Director of Panchayats, Administration of the Union Territory of Lakshadweep (Secretariat), Kavaratti – 682 555.
3. Department of Agriculture, Union Territory of Lakshadweep, Kavarathi, represented by its Director – 682 555. **Respondents**

(By Advocate : Mr. S. Manu)

4. **Original Application No. 181/00018/2015 -**

1. Mohammed Abdul Razak, aged 34 years, S/o. U.K. Nalla Koya, Attalada House, Andrott Island.
2. K. Moosa, aged 42, S/o. Buhari, Kandilam House, Kadmath Island.
3. Hamza Koya B., aged 59 years, S/o. Abdul Khader, Biriymmada House, Andrott Island. **Applicants**

(By Advocate : Mr. K.B. Gangesh)

V e r s u s

1. The Administrator, Administration of the Union Territory of Lakshadweep, Kavaratti – 682 555.
2. The Director of Panchayats, Administration of the Union Territory of Lakshadweep (Secretariat), Kavaratti.
3. Department of Environment of Forests, Union Territory of Lakshadweep, Kavarathi. **Respondents**

(By Advocate : Mr. S. Manu)

5. **Original Application No. 181/00020/2015 -**

1. M.C. Jaffar, Pakkipura House, Kalpeni Island.
2. Habsa A., Alikome House, Kiltan Island.
3. A.P. Naseema, Aynapura House, Kavaratti Island. **Applicants**

(By Advocate : Mr. K.B. Gangesh)

V e r s u s

1. The Administrator, Administration of the Union Territory of Lakshadweep, Kavaratti.
2. The Director of Panchayats, Administration of the Union Territory of Lakshadweep (Secretariat), Kavaratti.
3. Department of Environment of Forests, Union Territory of Lakshadweep, Kavaratti. **Respondents**

(By Advocate : Mr. S. Manu)

6. **Original Application No. 181/00027/2015 -**

B.C. Abdul Raheem, S/o. K. Hamzakoya,
Belichetta House, Amini Island. **Applicant**

(By Advocate : Mr. K.B. Gangesh)

V e r s u s

1. The Administrator, Administration of the Union Territory of Lakshadweep, Kavaratti.
2. The Director of Panchayats, Administration of the Union Territory of Lakshadweep (Secretariat), Kavaratti.
3. Department of Animal Husbandry, Union Territory of Lakshadweep, Kavaratti, represented by its Director. **Respondents**

(By Advocate : Mr. S. Manu)

7. **Original Application No. 181/00036/2015 -**

1. Suharabi P., aged 40 years, D/o. Kunhikunhi, Pallicham House, Kavaratti Island.
2. Maharnoor M.P., aged 40 years, D/o. Hamzath, Molakepura House, Kavaratti Island.
3. Halimbai U.P., aged 40 years, D/o. Mohamood, Ullikanapura, Kavaratti Island.
4. Amina P.V., aged 45 years, D/o. Manaf, Puthiyaveedu, Kavaratti Island.

5. Saromma K.P., aged 48 years, D/o. Ibrahimkutty, Keelakochithiyapuram, Kavaratti Island.
6. Jameela M.P., aged 41 years, D/o. Subair, Mullipura, Kavaratti Island.
7. Beebi A., aged 38 years, D/o. Cheriyaakoya, Avappada House, Kavaratti Island.
8. Beebi Aynepura, aged 40 years, D/o. Abdurahiman, Aynepura House, Kavaratti Island.
9. Rahmath Beegum B., aged 40 years, D/o. Ali, Baliyali House, Kavaratti Island.
10. Sadihath V.M., aged 37 years, D/o. Valiya Abdurahiman, Vadakkumelachadam, Kavaratti Island.
11. Rahiyambee T.P., aged 39 years, D/o. Ahammed K.P., Thottathapura, Kavaratti Island.
12. Beefathumma B., aged 42 years, D/o. Aboobacker, Beeramthoda, Kavaratti Island.
13. Rahmath Beegum P.P., aged 37 years, D/o. Attal K.P., Pockarachepura, Kavaratti Island.
14. Marjanath, aged 41 years, D/o. Muthu Aynapura, Kuthippappepura, Kavaratti Island. **Applicants**

(By Advocate : Mr. K.B. Gangesh)

V e r s u s

1. The Administrator, Administration of the Union Territory of Lakshadweep, Kavaratti.
2. The Director of Panchayats, Administration of the Union Territory of Lakshadweep (Secretariat), Kavaratti.
3. Department of Industries, Union Territory of Lakshadweep, Kavaratti, represented by the Director of Industries. **Respondents**

(By Advocate : Mr. S. Manu)

8. **Original Application No. 181/00060/2015 -**

1. K.V. Nazeer, (Date of birth – 20.2.1974), aged 41, S/o. Facil, Kodivalappu House, Kiltan, (Cook, Junior Basic Secondary School, Kiltan).
 2. K.P. Davood, aged 36, (date of birth – 1.1.1978), S/o. Muthukoya, Residing at Kilappura House, Kiltan, (Cook, Government Senior Secondary School, Kiltan).
 3. H.M. Rafeekhan (date of birth – 11.2.1975), aged 39, S/o. Abdul Rahiman, Haja Manzil, Kiltan, Cook, Junior Basic Secondary School, Kiltan Island.
 4. C.H. Sayed Mohammed Koya, (Date of birth – 4.8.1968), aged 46, S/o. Muthukoya, Chamayam House, Kiltan, Cook, Senior Basic Secondary School, Kiltan.
 5. N.P. Muthukoya, (Date of birth – 28.1.1974), aged 39, S/o. Seethikoya, Nalakappura House, Kiltan, Cook, Senior Basic Secondary School, Kiltan.
 6. A.P. Abdulla, (Date of birth 28.2.1968), aged 46, S/o. Khalid, Arimappura House, Kiltan, Cook, Government Senior Secondary School, Kiltan.
- **Applicants**

(By Advocate : Mr. P.V. Mohanan)

V e r s u s

1. Administrator, U T of Lakshadweep, Kavaratti – 682 555.
 2. Director of Education, Department of Education, UT of Lakshadweep, Kavaratti – 682 555.
 3. The Principal, Government Senior Secondary School, Kiltan – 682 558.
 4. Director of Panchayat, Lakshadweep District Panchayat, Kavaratti – 682 555.
- **Respondents**

(By Advocate : Mr. S. Manu)

These applications having been heard on 15.02.2019 the Tribunal on 22.02.2019 delivered the following:

ORDER

Hon'ble Mr. Ashish Kalia, Judicial Member –

The relief claimed by the applicants in these OAs are altogether one and same i.e. to quash and set aside the impugned orders issued by the respondents while implementing the orders of this Tribunal in OA No. 29/2013 and connected matters and to declare that the applicants are not liable to be terminated by the respondents so as to replace them by another set of casual labourers.

2. The common question raised in the present Original Applications is whether they are entitled for regularisation of their services as casual labourer or not ?

3. The admitted factual position of the cases are that the applicants have worked with the respondents for 89 days with artificial breaks of one day and thereafter they have been re-engaged. Most of them are disengaged pursuance to fresh employment notice issued by the respondents.

4. The respondents have filed their reply statement wherein it is submitted that large number of causal labourers have approached this Tribunal for continuing in service and granting them permanency. As per the interim order passed by this Tribunal it was directed for categorization of labourers in five groups. But all these interim orders stand automatically vacated on disposal of casual labourer cases on 6th March, 2014. Thereafter the Division Bench of the Hon'ble High Court in OP (CAT) No. 133 of

2012 and 606 of 2012 considered the case of casual labourers in Union Territory of Lakshadweep and on 6.6.2012 dismissed the claim of casual labourers for regularization observing as under:

“.....As already stated casual basis appointments could only be a period of 89 days and after a break, they can be reappointed depending upon the exigency, number of vacancies and the number of people who applied for such casual labour status. It is left to the department to appoint them in batches so as to see everyone would get a minimum of 89 days of employment in an year.

4. We are at loss to understand how the present petitioners can claim any preferential right over the applicants before Tribunal or claim better right than any other casual labourer. Irrespective of the nomenclature ultimately it waters down to the position that all were casual labourers. In the absence of any legal protection for them to get absorbed in the department where they are employed for a long period as casual labourers, we are afraid that they will not be entitled to any benefit of permanency. Therefore, in the light of circular or guidelines issued by the Lakshadweep Administration, guarantee of 89 days of employment must be extended to all the persons subject to the conditions referred to in the circular, irrespective of length of time since they were discharging their work as casual labourers.”

5. It is further submitted that the method adopted by administration to ensure minimum employment to maximum number of persons by streamlining the engagement of casual labourers is already upheld by the Hon’ble High Court in OP (CAT) No. 133 of 2012 which were again challenged before the Hon’ble apex court in SLP No. 26011 of 2013 and on 13.9.2013 the apex court dismissed the SLP. Thus the method adopted by the administration to streamline the engagement of casual labourers was upheld. Respondents have relied upon the judgment of the apex court in ***Mallikarjuna Rao v. State of A.P.*** – (1992) 2 SCC 707 wherein it was held as under:

“It is nether legal nor proper for the High Courts or Administrative Tribunals to issue directions or advisory sermons to the Executives in respect of the sphere which is exclusively within the domain of the executive under the constitution.”

Further in *Asif Hamed v. Jammu & Kashmir* – AIR 1989 SC 1899 the apex court held:

“The Constitution does not permit the Court to direct or advise the executive in matters of policy or to sermonize qua any matter which under the Constitution lies within the sphere of legislative or executive, provided these authorities do not transgress, their constitutional powers or statutory powers.”

6. It is further submitted that the Department will extend the benefit of relaxation in age, educational qualification once any policy decision is taken by the competent authority and these applicants would not be treated in isolation as casual labourers have been engaged in other Departments of UT of Lakshadweep administration. The Director of Panchayats is the nodal Department through which all the other Departments of UT of Lakshadweep Administration including Department of Science & Technology engage casual labourers whenever any need arises. They have further relied upon the judgment of the apex court in *Harminder Kaur v. Union of India* – (2009) 13 SCC 90 wherein it was held that long service by itself may not be a ground for directing regularisation. Regularisation is not a mode of appointment. When appointments in public office are required to be made, the provisions of Articles 14 & 16 of the Constitution of India are required to be scrupulously followed. In *Nand Kumar v. State of Bihar* – (2014) 5 SCC 300 the Hon’ble apex court held that daily wagers are not appointees in strict sense of the term appointment. Consequences of their appointments

being temporary, was within their knowledge and therefore they cannot invoke theory of legitimate expectation for being conformed in the post. Lastly in ***Secretary, State of Karnataka & Ors. v. Umadevi & Ors.*** - Civil Appeal Nos. 3595/1999 and connected cases dated 10.4.2006 the Hon'ble apex court has drawn a distinction between the temporary employee and daily wager and those who are appointed irregularly in the sense that there was no completion of some statutory procedure in the selection process which did not go to the root of the selection process. Further in the judgment of the apex court in ***Satya Prakash & Ors. v. State of Bihar & Ors.*** - Civil Appeal No. 2440/2010 decided on 16.3.2010 it is quite evident that the person engaged on daily wage basis not against a regular vacancy without selection process in accordance with the Recruitment Rules are not entitled to get the benefit of paragraph 53 of the judgment of the apex court in ***Umadevi's*** case (*supra*).

7. Shri Manu, learned counsel for the respondents in the matter of cook, ayas, peon, watch & ward at schools, had drawn our attention to Annexure R1(b) in OA No. 181/60/2015 where it is mentioned that the proposal for 51 casual labourers for watch and ward and 26 daily waged casual labourers to work as Peons have been approved. OA No. 181/60/2015 is also squarely covered by the decision of the Hon'ble High Court.

8. During the course of arguments Mr. Manu had submitted that for getting the expertise and loyalty the administration had decided that cook, ayah, peon and watch and ward who are mostly deputed in the schools shall

get appointment in the spell of 89 days for one year session. It is also in conformity with the order passed by the Hon'ble High Court.

9. In the nut shell the respondents have emphasized that because of the special reasons and circumstances the limited number of need of casual labourers were rationally distributed amongst the residents of Lakshadweep Islands. The Hon'ble High Court in WP(C) No. 5289 of 2015 – ***Hidayathulla & Ors. v. Admn., UTL & Ors.***, dated 20th August, 2018 considered the question of jurisdiction whether this Tribunal can entertain the labourers engaged by Village Panchayat. The Hon'ble High Court observed that there is nothing wrong in the direction given by the Tribunal for formulation of transparent scheme for engagement of casual labourers and rational distribution of employment by the administration as well as Panchayat.

10. During the course of arguments Mr. Gangesh had tried to distinguish between the casual labourers engaged by the administration vis-a-vis the Panchayat. He has submitted that both categories stands on a different pedestal and the casual labourers engaged by the administration directly are on the better footing than the casual labourers engaged by the village panchayat. We are not impressed by the proposition laid before us by the applicants herein in OA No. 17 of 2015. The administration has formed a welfare policy for engagement of casual labourers by the administration as well as by the village panchayat i.e. initially one should be engaged for 89 days from the names already registered with different districts which means

a particular person of a particular district has got more chance of re-employment as and when vacancies are there. Department has already taken into consideration the relaxation in age as well as relaxation in educational qualification.

11. In view of the above we dispose of these Original Applications directing the respondents to follow the judgment passed by the Hon'ble High Court in WP(C) No. 5289 of 2015 – *Hidayathulla & Ors. v. Admn., UTL & Ors.*, dated 20th August, 2018. No order as to costs.

(ASHISH KALIA)
JUDICIAL MEMBER

(E.K. BHARAT BHUSHAN)
ADMINISTRATIVE MEMBER

“SA”

Original Application No. 181/00014/2015

APPLICANT'S ANNEXURES

- Annexure A1** - True copy of the circular F. No. 1/5/99-ASO dated 1.5.1999.
- Annexure A2** - True copy of the order F. No. 1/5/99-ASO dated 14.5.1999.
- Annexure A3** - True copy of the statement of marks prepared by the selection board.
- Annexure A4** - True copy of the office order No. 1/5/99-ASO dated 18.5.1999.
- Annexure A5** - True copy of the certificate of experience dated 13.10.2014 issued to the applicant by the 4th respondent.
- Annexure A6** - True copy of the office order F. No. 6/15/2012-SDO dated 5.2.2013.
- Annexure A7** - True copy of the letter F. No. 1/4/2013-SDO(Kdt)/1317 dated 3.2.2014.
- Annexure A8** - True copy of the circular F.No. 5/8/2014-DOP dated 12.2.2015.
- Annexure A9** - True copy of the order dated 6.3.2014 passed by the Hon'ble Tribunal in OA No. 29 of 2013 and connected cases.

RESPONDENTS' ANNEXURES

- Annexure R1(a)** - True copy of the circular F. No. 5/6/2003-DoP&RD dated 12.11.2003.
- Annexure R1(b)** - True copy of the F. No. 5/26/2003-DoP&RD dated 4.11.2008.
- Annexure R1(c)** - True copy of the order dated 17.8.2009 in OA No. 611/2008.
- Annexure R1(d)** - True copy of the common judgment in OP (CAT) No. 133 of 2012 and 606 of 2012.

Original Application No. 181/00015/2015

APPLICANT'S ANNEXURES

- Annexure A1** - True copy of the order No. F. No. 3/2/2006-ABDO (Kdt) dated 15.2.2007.
- Annexure A2** - True copy of the certificates of merit issued to the applicant.
- Annexure A3** - True copy of the order F. No. 6/15/2012-SDO dated 5.2.2013.
- Annexure A4** - True copy of the letter F. No. 1/4/2013-SDO (Kdt)/1317 dated 3.2.2014.
- Annexure A5** - True copy of the circular F. No. 5/8/2014-DOP dated 12.2.2015.
- Annexure A6** - True copy of the order dated 6.3.2014 passed by the Hon'ble Tribunal in OA No. 29 of 2013 and connected case.

RESPONDENTS' ANNEXURES

- Annexure R1(a)** - True copy of the circular F. No. 5/6/2003-DoP&RD dated 12.11.2003.
- Annexure R1(b)** - True copy of the F. No. 5/26/2003-DoP&RD dated 4.11.2008.
- Annexure R1(c)** - True copy of the order dated 17.8.2009 in OA No. 611/2008.
- Annexure R1(d)** - True copy of the common judgment in OP (CAT) No. 133 of 2012 and 606 of 2012.

Original Application No. 181/00017/2015

APPLICANTS' ANNEXURES

- Annexure A1** - True copy of the office order dated 3.1.1997 appointing the applicants and 15 others issued by the 3rd respondent.

- Annexure A2** - True copy of interim order passed by this Tribunal in OA No. 29/2013 and connected cases on 3.7.2013.
- Annexure A3** - True copy of the order passed by this Tribunal in OA No. 29/2013 and connected cases on 5.3.2014.
- Annexure A4** - True copy of order dated 8.4.2014 passed by the Hon'ble High Court in OP (CAT) No. 88/2014.
- Annexure A5** - True copy of interim order dated 26.8.2014 passed by the Hon'ble High Court in OP (CAT) No. 88/2014.
- Annexure A6** - True copy of circular F. No. 5/14/2012-DOP Vol. 1 dated 9.7.2014 issued by the 2nd respondent.
- Annexure A7** - True copy of order F. No. 5/8/2014-DOP dated 12.2.2015 issued by the 2nd respondent.
- Annexure A8** - True copy of order dated 9.1.2015 passed by this Hon'ble Tribunal in OA No. 181/0005/2015.

RESPONDENTS' ANNEXURES

- Annexure R1(a)** - True copy of the circular F. No. 5/6/2003-DoP&RD dated 12.11.2003.
- Annexure R1(b)** - True copy of the F. No. 5/26/2003-DoP&RD dated 4.11.2008.
- Annexure R1(c)** - True copy of the order dated 17.8.2009 in OA No. 611/2008.
- Annexure R1(d)** - True copy of the common judgment in OP (CAT) No. 133 of 2012 and 606 of 2012.

Original Application No. 181/00018/2015

APPLICANTS' ANNEXURES

- Annexure A1** - True copy of the office order dated 30.12.2005 engaging the 1st applicant.
- Annexure A2** - True copy of the office order dated 17.1.1996 based on which the 2nd applicant was engaged.
- Annexure A3** - True copy of the office order dated 5.8.1996 engaging the 3rd applicant.
- Annexure A4** - True copy of interim order passed by this Tribunal in OA No. 29/2013 and connected cases on 3.7.2013.
- Annexure A5** - True copy of the order passed by this Tribunal in OA No. 29/2013 and connected cases on 5.3.2014.
- Annexure A6** - True copy of order dated 8.4.2014 passed by the Hon'ble High Court in OP (CAT) No. 88/2014.
- Annexure A7** - True copy of interim order dated 26.8.2014 passed by the Hon'ble High Court in OP (CAT) No. 88/2014.
- Annexure A8** - True copy of circular F. No. 5/14/2012-DOP Vol. 1 dated 9.7.2014 issued by the 2nd respondent.
- Annexure A9** - True copy of order F. No. 5/8/2014-DOP dated 12.2.2015 issued by the 2nd respondent.

RESPONDENTS' ANNEXURES

- Annexure R1(a)** - True copy of the circular F. No. 5/6/2003-DoP&RD dated 12.11.2003.
- Annexure R1(b)** - True copy of the F. No. 5/26/2003-DoP&RD dated 4.11.2008.
- Annexure R1(c)** - True copy of the order dated 17.8.2009 in OA No. 611/2008.

Annexure R1(d) - True copy of the common judgment in OP (CAT) No. 133 of 2012 and 606 of 2012.

Original Application No. 181/00020/2015

APPLICANTS' ANNEXURES

Annexure A1 - True copy of the labour list maintained by the 3rd respondent department.

Annexure A2 - True copy of interim order passed by this Tribunal in OA No. 29/2013 and connected cases on 3.7.2013.

Annexure A3 - True copy of the order passed by this Tribunal in OA No. 29/2013 and connected cases on 5.3.2014.

Annexure A4 - True copy of order dated 8.4.2014 passed by the Hon'ble High Court in OP (CAT) No. 88/2014.

Annexure A5 - True copy of interim order dated 26.8.2014 passed by the Hon'ble High Court in OP (CAT) No. 88/2014.

Annexure A6 - True copy of circular F. No. 5/14/2012-DOP Vol. 1 dated 9.7.2014 issued by the 2nd respondent.

Annexure A7 - True copy of order F. No. 5/8/2014-DOP dated 12.2.2015 issued by the 2nd respondent.

RESPONDENTS' ANNEXURES

Annexure R1(a) - True copy of the circular F. No. 5/6/2003-DoP&RD dated 12.11.2003.

Annexure R1(b) - True copy of the F. No. 5/26/2003-DoP&RD dated 4.11.2008.

Annexure R1(c) - True copy of the order dated 17.8.2009 in OA No. 611/2008.

Annexure R1(d) - True copy of the common judgment in OP (CAT) No. 133 of 2012 and 606 of 2012.

Original Application No. 181/00027/2015

APPLICANT'S ANNEXURES

Annexure A1 - True copy of the office order dated 11.11.1995 appointing the applicant and 4 others issued by the 3rd respondent.

Annexure A2 - True copy of office order dated 31.8.2010 issued by the 3rd respondent.

Annexure A3 - True copy of interim order passed by this Tribunal in OA No. 29/2013 and connected cases on 3.7.2013.

Annexure A4 - True copy of the order passed by this Tribunal in OA No. 29/2013 and connected cases on 5.3.2014.

Annexure A5 - True copy of order dated 8.4.2014 passed by the Hon'ble High Court in OP (CAT) No. 88/2014.

Annexure A6 - True copy of interim order dated 26.8.2014 passed by the Hon'ble High Court in OP (CAT) No. 88/2014.

Annexure A7 - True copy of circular F. No. 5/14/2012-DOP Vol. 1 dated 9.7.2014 issued by the 2nd respondent.

Annexure A8 - True copy of order F. No. 5/8/2014-DOP dated 12.2.2015 issued by the 2nd respondent.

RESPONDENTS' ANNEXURES

Nil

Original Application No. 181/00036/2015

APPLICANTS' ANNEXURES

Annexure A1 - True copy of the notice dated 18.10.1996 issued by the 3rd respondent inviting 3rd applicant for

an interview for recruitment.

- Annexure A2** - True copy of the notice dated 18.10.1996 issued by the 3rd respondent inviting 4th applicant for an interview for recruitment.
- Annexure A3** - True copy of the notice dated 18.10.1996 issued by the 3rd respondent inviting 8th applicant for an interview for recruitment.
- Annexure A4** - True copy of the notice dated 18.10.1996 issued by the 3rd respondent inviting 13th applicant for an interview for recruitment.
- Annexure A5** - True copy of order dated 24.12.1996 engaging 3rd applicant as casual labourers under the 3rd respondent.
- Annexure A6** - True copy of order dated 24.12.1996 engaging 4th applicant as casual labourers under the 3rd respondent.
- Annexure A7** - True copy of order dated 24.12.1996 engaging 12th applicant as casual labourers under the 3rd respondent.
- Annexure A8** - True copies of order dated 24.12.1996 engaging 13th applicant as casual labourers under the 3rd respondent.
- Annexure A9** - True copies of order dated 24.12.1996 engaging 14th applicant as casual labourers under the 3rd respondent.
- Annexure A10** - True copy of interim order passed by this Tribunal in OA No. 29/2013 and connected cases on 3.7.2013.
- Annexure A11** - True copy of the order passed by this Tribunal in OA No. 29/2013 and connected cases on 5.3.2014.
- Annexure A12** - True copy of order dated 8.4.2014 passed by the Hon'ble High Court in OP (CAT) No. 88/2014.

- Annexure A13** - True copy of interim order dated 26.8.2014 passed by the Hon'ble High Court in OP (CAT) No. 88/2014.
- Annexure A14** - True copy of circular F. No. 5/14/2012-DOP Vol. 1 dated 9.7.2014 issued by the 2nd respondent.
- Annexure A15** - True copy of order F. No. 5/8/2014-DOP dated 12.2.2015 issued by the 2nd respondent.

RESPONDENTS' ANNEXURES

- Annexure R1(a)** - True copy of the circular F. No. 5/6/2003-DoP&RD dated 12.11.2003.
- Annexure R1(b)** - True copy of the F. No. 5/26/2003-DoP&RD dated 4.11.2008.
- Annexure R1(c)** - True copy of the order dated 17.8.2009 in OA No. 611/2008.
- Annexure R1(d)** - True copy of the common judgment in OP (CAT) No. 133 of 2012 and 606 of 2012.

Original Application No. 181/00060/2015

APPLICANTS' ANNEXURES

- Annexure A1** - True copy of the proceeding F. No. 02/02/2012-GSSS (KTN) dated 1.10.2012.
- Annexure A2** - True copy of the proceeding F. No. 1/16/2005-Edn/Estt./1109 dated 22.4.2010.
- Annexure A3** - True copy of the letter F. No. 1/16/2005-Edn/Estt.5168 dated 15.12.2010.
- Annexure A4** - True copy of the order in OA No. 631/2011 dated 9.1.2012.
- Annexure A5** - True copy of the interim order in OA 601/2013 dated 3.7.2013.

- Annexure A6** - True copy of the circular F. No. 1/2/2012-Edn./(DP)/Estt dated 8.8.2013.
- Annexure A7** - True copy of the order F. NO. 5/8/2014-DOPT dated 12.2.2015.
- Annexure A8** - True copies of the interim order in Writ Petition (C) No. 6327/2015 dated 27.2.2015.
- Annexure A9** - True copies of the proceeding F. NO. 5/8/2014-DOP/138 dated 21.2.2015.
- Annexure A10** - True copy of the representation dated 8.12.2013.

RESPONDENTS' ANNEXURES

- Annexure R1(a)** - True copy of the notice F. No. 2/2/2012-GSSS(KLT) Vol-II dated 14.3.2014.
- Annexure R1(b)** - True copy of the order F. No. 1/8/2013-Edn. (DP) dated 16.5.2014.

-X-X-X-X-X-X-X-