

**CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL
ERNAKULAM BENCH**

Original Application No.180/00123/2018

Original Application No.180/00278/2018

Original Application No.180/00513/2017

Tuesday, this the 12th day of March, 2019

CORAM:

HON'BLE Mr.E.K.BHARAT BHUSHAN, ...ADMINISTRATIVE MEMBER

OA No.123/2018

1. Shri P.M.Ramakrishnan,
S/o Kunhappa Nambiar,
Aged 65 years,
(Retd Station Superintendent,
Southern Railway, Mahe),
residing at "Anjali", Chala East P.O.,
Kannur – 670 521.

2. Shri K.Somachandran,
S/o Kannan,
Aged 66 years,
(Retd N.A.Khalasi, Southern Railway
Kannur),
Residing at Thayil House, Pannen Para,
Chalad P.O., Kannur – 670 014.

3. Shri T.K.Haridas,
S/o Govindan,
Aged 65 years,
(Retd Head Trolleyman, Southern Railway,
Kannur), Residing at "HARITHAM',
Adoor, Kadachira P.O.,
Kanur – 670 621.

4. Shri N.Kannan,
S/o Kanjiran,
Aged 66 years,
(Retd Chief ticket Inspector,

Southern Railway, Kannur),
Residing at N.K.Nivas,
East Kappumkara, Azhikode South,
Kannur – 670 009.

5. Shri M.K.Mukunda Das,
S/o Sankaran Nair,
Aged 67 years,
(Retd Station Superintendent,
Southern Railway, Valappatanam),
residing at Kunnummal House,
Chembilode, Mowanchery,
Kannur – 670 613.
6. Shri V.P.Kamalakshan,
S/o Kunhikanna,
Aged 65 years,
(Retd Gate Keeper, Southern Railway,
Trikarpur,
Residing at Thekkumbad,
Koovapuram P.O.,
Kannur – 670 309.
7. Shri Gopalan Thekkan,
S/o Kannan, Aged 69 years,
(Retd Sr. Gate Keeper, Southern Railway,
Payyannur),
Residing at Mangalassery House,
Ariyil P.O. Pattuvam,
Thaliparamba, Kannur – 670 143.
8. Shri K.Ravindran,
S/o Chirulandan,
Aged 63 years,
(Retd Gang Mate, Southern Railway, Chandera),
Residing at “Vengat”, Cheruvathur P.O.,
Kasargod – 671 313.
9. Shri P.Jayakrishnan,
S/o Raman Nair,
Aged 65 years,
(Retd Gate Keeper, Southern Railway,
Kasargod), Residing at Parambath House,
Kuttamath, Cheruvathur P.O.,
Kasargod – 671 313.

10. Shri K.V.Raghavan,
S/o Raman,
Aged 65 years,
(Retd Gate Keeper, Southern Railway,
Trikarpar),
Residing at “Ambujam”,
Kizhakkumkara, Anjanur P.O.,
Kannur – 671 531.
11. Shri M.V.Bhaskaran,
S/o Kunhambu,
Aged 65 years,
Retd Keymanm Southern Railway,
Trikarpur,
Residing at Matradan House,
Olat P.O., Kasargod – 631 310.
12. Shri M.Devadasan,
S/o Kannan,
Aged 65 years,
Retd Trackman,
Southern Railway, Charvattur,
Residing at Valambil Veedu,
Achamthuruthi P.O.,
Kasargod -671 351.
13. Shri A.Sudhakaran,
S/o Krishnan,
Aged 64 years,
Retd Loco Pilot (Goods)
Southern Railway, Mangalore,
Residing at “Narayaneeyam”,
Cheruvathur P.O.,
Kasargod – 671 313.
14. Shri K.Rajan,
S/o Kunhambu,
Aged 67 years,
Retd Blacksmith, Southern Railway,
Kannur,
Residing at Kallayi House,
Anivalyal, Muthappan Kavu P.O.,
Azhikode, Kannur – 670 009.

15. Shri A.Narayanankutty,
S/o Chuthukutty,
Aged 68 years,
Retd Shunting master,
Southern Railway, Mangalore,
Residing at Meethole Veedu,
Panunda, Pachapoika PO,
Kannur – 670 643.

16. Shri A.Raghavan,
S/o Kanhiran,
Aged 70 years,
Retd Sr.Cook, Southern Railway,
Kannur,
residing at Kayattiyil House,
Keezhara P.O., Kannur-670 301.

17. M.Saseendran,
S/o Govindan,
Aged 68 years,
Retd Trackman,
Southern Railway,
Kannur,
Residing at M.S.Nivas,
Thakkli Peedika Varam,
Kannur – 670 594.

18. Shri Gopalan,
S/o Kanhiran,
Aged 68 years,
Retd Sr.Technician/Ele,
Southern Railway, Kannur,
Residing at Koyileriyan House,
Parakkadavu,
Anchampeedika P.O.,
Kannur – 670 331.

19. P.V.Ravindran,
S/o Raiju Nambiar,
Aged 65 years,
Retd Sr.Trackman,
Southern Railway, Kannur,
Residing at Palakkil House,
Pappinisery P.O.,
Kannur – 670 561.

20. Shri P.E.Surendran,
S/o Unnikutty,
Aged 68 years,
Retd Chief Ticket Inspector,
Southern Railway, Kannur,
Residing at Neena Nivas,
Muzhappilangad P.O., Madam,
Kannur – 670 662.
21. Shri P.P.Haridasan,
S/o Anandan Nambiar,
Aged 65 years,
Retd Sr.Gate Keeper,
Southern Railway, Kannur,
Residing at Maniyeri House,
Theeyannur, Kanjirangad PO.,
Kannur – 670 142.
22. Shri P.A.Ramapathy,
S/o Padmanabhan Nambiar,
Aged 65 years,
Retd Station Superintendent,
Southern Railway, Payangadi,
Residing at Chanal House,
Aroli P.O., Via Pappinasseri,
Kannur – 670 566.
23. C.V.Haridas,
S/o Krishnan,
Aged 64 years,
Retd Senior Supervisor/P.way,
Southern Railway, Kannur,
residing at "SMRITHI", Kadachira PO,
Kannur – 670 621.
24. Shri Jayan Mulyil,
S/o Anandan,
Aged 65 years,
Retd Sr.Technician/Mech,
Southern Railway, Kannur,
Residing at "SHIVAKRIPA' Olayikara,
Pachapoika P.O.,
Koothuparambu, Kannur -670 643.

25. Shri M.P.Sreedharan,
S/o Gopalan,
Aged 77 years,
Retd Commercial Supervisor,
Southern Railway,
Kannur, residing at "Sadgamaya"
Padikkundu, Pallikunnu P.O.,
Kannur – 670 004.
26. Shri T.Bhaskaran,
S/o Parangodan,
Aged 66 years,
Retd Section Engineer/Sig,
Southern Railway, Kannur,
residing at Thattaruvalappil House,
Perumpadavu, Karippal P.O.,
Kannur – 670 581.
27. Shri K.P.Sureshbabu,
S/o Krishnan Nair,
Aged 65 years,
Retd. Sr.Technician/Mech,
Southern Railway, Kannur,
Residing at Kizhakke Parambath House,
ParaL P.O. Thalassery, Kannur-670 671.
28. Shri Satheesan M.,
S/o Mukundan,
Aged 69 years,
Retd Loco Pilot (Mail),
Southern Railway, Calicut,
residing at 'YESHAS' near Juma Masjid,
Alavil P.O., Chirakkal, Kannur-670 008.
29. Shri T.Padmanabhan,
S/o Ambadi,
Aged 63 years,
Retd. Gangmate, Southern Railway,
Payyannur, Residing at Thandarayi House,
Kandankali PO, Payyannur.
30. Shri P.A.Rajendran,
S/o Raghavan Nambiar,
Aged 65 years,
Retd Mail Guard,

Southern Railway, Kannur,
Residing at "RAJADHANI" Mangattidam Post,
Kannur – 670 643.

31. Shri P.Rajan,
S/o Payyar,
Aged 64 years,
Retd. Station Manager,
Southern Railway, Kannur,
Residing at "SANSAN" Kezhakke Motta,
Chirakkal P.O.,
Kannur – 670 011.

32. Shri K.K.Prabhakaran,
S/o Kunhiraman,
Aged 63 years,
Retd. Senior Section Engineer,
CSW, Southern Railway, Kannur,
residing at "MALAVIKA"
Sahakarana Road, Manal,
Alavil P.O., Kannur – 670 008.Applicants

(By Advocate M/s.Varkey & Martin)

Vs.

1. Union of India,
Represented by the Chairman,
Railway Board, Rail Bhavan,
New Delhi – 110 001.

2. The Financial Advisor & Chief Accounts Officer,
Southern Railway,
Chennai – 3.

3. The Sr. Divisional Finance Manager,
Southern Railway,
Palghat Division,
Palghat – 678 002.

4. The Sr. Divisional Personnel Officer,
Southern Railway, Palghat Division,
Palghat – 678 002.Respondents

(By Mr.V.A.Shaji, ACGSC for respondents)

OA NO.278/2018

1. Shri Ramachandran V.,
S/o Padmanabhan,
Aged 72 years,
Senior Technician (Electrical), (Rtd), S.Rly.,
Kuzhuppillil House, Chengal, Kalady,
Ernakulam Dist. 683 574.
2. Shri Pramodhan M.R.,
S/o M.P.Ramankutty,
Aged 63 years,
Technician I - , (Retd), S.Rly.,
Moopiniyil House,
Near Saneeswara Temple,
Kochippara P.O.,
Palakkad – 678 557.
3. Shri Muhammed Alikhan,
S/o Akbarkhan,
Aged 71 years,
Senior Technician – (Retd), S.Rly.,
Vettukattukalam, Kaliampara,
Panattukara P.O., Wadakkancherry,
Thrissur Dist. 680 582.
4. Shri A.A.Thomas,
S/o Antony,
Aged 70 years,
Senior Technician – (Retd) S.Rly.,
Achandy House, Angamaly South P.O.,
Ernakulam Dist – 683 572.
5. Shri Basheer P.M.,
S/o Moideen Kunju,
Aged 57years,
Senior Technician (Retd) S. Rly.,
Palakkattil House, Thuruth,
Aluva, Ernakulam Dist. 683 101.
6. Shri C.K.Mathew,
S/o K.Unnunni,
Aged 78 years,
Secretary, Railway Pensioners'

.9.

Association, Kochi,
Chelippallil, Vidya Vihar Road,
Thevara P.O.,
Cochin – 682 013.

....Applicants

(By Advocate Shri C.S.G.Nair)

Vs.

1. Union of India,
Represented by the Chairman,
Railway Board, Rail Bhavan,
New Delhi – 110 001.
2. The Financial Advisor & Chief Accounts Officer,
Southern Railway,
Chennai -3.
3. The Senior Divisional Financial Manager,
Southern Railway, Thiruvananthapuram Division,
Thiruvananthapuram -14.
4. The Divisional Personnel Officer,
Southern Railway,
Thiruvananthapuram Division,
Thiruvananthapuram – 14.Respondents

(By Mr.V.A.Shaji, ACGSC for respondents)

OA No.513/2017

Shri Daniel M.D.,
Aged 59 years,
S/o Ithac Devassia,
Retired Chief Depot Material Superintendent,
S&T Workshop, Poddanur,
Southern Railway,
Residing at Machiyanickel House,
Ellumpuram P.O.,
Muttom, Thodupuzha.

....Applicant

(By Advocate M/s.Varkey & Martin)

V e r s u s

1. Union of India,
Represented by General Manager,
Southern Railway,
Chennai – 3.
2. The Deputy Financial Advisor and
Chief Accounts Officer,
Workshop and Stores, Poddanur,
Southern Railway,
Coimbatore – 641 023.Respondents

(By Ms. Mini R. Menon for Respondents)

These applications having been heard on 6th March, 2019, the Tribunal on 12th March, 2019 delivered the following :

O R D E R

OA No.123/2018, OA No.278/2018 and OA No.513/2017 are disposed of through this common order as common issues of facts and law are involved. OA No.123/2018 is filed by Shri P.M.Ramakrishnan and others who are Railway pensioners claiming Fixed Medical Allowance under Retired Employees Liberalized Health Scheme (RELHS). OA No.513/2017 is filed by Shri Daniel M.D, also a Railway pensioner seeking the same benefits. OA No.278/2018 is filed by Shri Ramachandran V. and others which includes the Railway Pensioners' Association, Kochi; they too seek the same benefits as mentioned above. To ensure ease in discussing the common issues , OA No.123/2018 is taken as the lead case.

.11.

2. Shri P.M.Ramakrishnan and 31 others, applicants in OA No.123/2018 had retired from Railways between 2000 and 2014,. They are aggrieved by the denial of Fixed Medical Allowance (FMA) despite the fact that they reside beyond 2.5. kms of the nearest Railway Hospital/Health Unit and are not availing Out Patient Dispensing (OPD) facility except for chronic diseases. It is pointed out that RELHS had been introduced in 1997 for providing medical facilities for Railway pensioners/family pensioners at Railway Hospital or Health Units, if they opt for the same and make a one time payment equal to their last pay. Subsequently as per V Pay Commission recommendations, the Railway Board issued RBE No.65/1999 dated 21.04.1999 granting a monthly Fixed Medical Allowance of Rs.100/- to pensioners/family pensioners residing outside the City/Town/Municipality limits of places where a Railway Hospital or Health Units was situated. A copy of the Railway Board order is at Annexure A1. By this directive, beneficiaries were required to exercise an option for availing Fixed Medical Allowance.

3. Pursuant to an order of this Tribunal in OA No.430/2000, upheld by Hon'ble High Court of Kerala and Hon'ble Supreme Court , it was decided to grant FMA to pensioners residing beyond 2.5. kms of Railway Hospital/Health Units. As per RBE No.45/2004 dated 01.03.2004, the pensioners were required to submit a revised undertaking in the Form , copy of which is available at Annexure A2. It is maintained by the applicants that the one time option/undertaking envisaged under Annexure A1 letter became

.12.

redundant once the newly added beneficiaries furnished the undertaking Form at Annexure A2. However, the 4th respondent as per order dated 23.03.2015 rejected the applications (Annexure A4). Annexure A4 letter is quoted below:

"SOUTHERN RAILWAY
Divisional Office,
Personnel Branch,
Palghat, Dt.23.3.15

No.J/P 626/sett.VII/04/2011

Shri T.Bhaskaran,
E.K.PW/X/386 D.Kunduthadam Road,
PO Karippal,
Kannur Dt.670681.

Sub: Request for sanction of FMA.
Ref: Your representation.

Your representation in connection with the granting of FMA has been examined in detail, you have retired under superannuation on 30.04.2011. At the time of retirement you have specially opted for OPD vide Annexure XIII.

"As per Board's letter PC.V98/1/7/1 dt.15.7.2002 (RBE No.107/2002), those who do not opt for FMA at the time of retirement, the same can be granted at a later stage, only on one condition that "one change in option in the life time of a pensioner shall be allowed which should be supported by the proper proof of change of residential address".

Your application does not contain the proper proof of change in residential address. Therefore you may obtain a certification from Revenue Authorities for the residential change to process the case further.

For Sr.DOP/PGT"

4. While the earlier guidelines were reiterated in various circulars of Railway Board issued from 2004 to 2009, a further relaxation for FMA to the effect, that members of RELHS availing OPD facilities for chronic diseases are also eligible for the same, was issued as per letter dated 12.10.2006. And

.13.

Railway Board issued RBE No.83/2011 dated 07.06.2011 suitably revising the undertaking Form.

5. The applicants maintain that they became aware of Annexure A5, A6 and A7 at a group meeting of pensioners on 01.05.2017 and all the 32 applicants submitted the claims for FMA in the revised undertaking Form (Annexure A5 and A6). Subsequently, Railway Board issued another order, copy of which is at Annexure A9 reiterating their earlier orders and calling upon the Zonal Railways for a review of the prevailing status in their Railway zone for redressing the grievances of the pensioners. According to this the applicants seek FMA from the commencement of their pension at Rs.100/- pm from 01.12.1997, Rs.300/- pm from 01.09.2008, Rs.500/- pm from 19.11.2014 and Rs.1000/- pm from 01.07.2017.

6. As grounds, the applicants maintain that the option attached to Annexure A1 order, which denied FMA to pensioners living within the City/Town/Municipality limits where a Railway Hospital/health Unit was situated, was to ensure that the applicants did not avail the benefit by giving false residential address. This was corrected with the same purpose in mind, bringing in a condition that those persons who were living beyond 2.5. kms of Railway Hospital/Health Unit would be eligible for FMA. Subsequently, FMA was also extended to persons who while residing beyond 2.5 kms of Railway Hospital/Health Unit was availing medical facilities for chronic diseases only

at Railway Hospital. So there is no justification to deny the benefit as prayed for.

7. In the reply the respondents have submitted the background in which various directives with regard to medical facilities were issued in the form of RBEs sequentially referred to. It is maintained that the respondent organisation had to handle a large number of applications received for the purpose of recording change of residential address and thereby for availing Medical Allowance and this was the background in which the restriction of 2.5 kms was put for availing facilities of Railway Hospital/Health Unit. This was subsequently extended to persons who required OPD care for chronic diseases. It had been set down that pensioners/retirees can exercise only one time option for availing medical facilities of OPD at Railway Hospital or to claim FMA and the option is available on the ground of change of residence to a place beyond 2.5 kms of Railway Hospital/Dispensaries.

8. In respect of these applicants , all except applicant no.8 had submitted an undertaking and option declaring that their places of residence is beyond 2.5 kms from the nearest Railway Hospital/Health Unit and they would like to opt for OPD facility from Railway Hospital/health Units under RELHS-1997. Applicant no.8 opted for FMA. In line with the directives of the Railway Board, there is only a provision for exercising the option once on the ground

of change of residence. As the applicants had already exercised their option to remain within the Scheme, they cannot exercise their option again.

9. Heard Shri Martin G. Thottan on behalf of the applicants and Shri V.A.Shaji on behalf of the respondents in OA No.123/2018, Ms.Praseetha, learned Counsel for applicant and Shri V.A.Shaji, learned Counsel for respondents in OA No.278/2018 and Shri Martin G.Thottan, learned Counsel for applicant and Mrs.Mini R.Menon, learned Counsel for the respondents in OA No.513/2017. All the pleadings were examined. It is seen that the respondent employer had introduced the Scheme as on 1997. By way of orders issued in 1999 a pensioner/retiree living beyond the Municipality/Town/City limits would be available for drawing FMA in lieu of OPD care at the concerned Railway facility. The beneficiaries were required to exercise their option. Subsequently, for the purpose of curbing misuse, the City/Town/Municipality limits was removed and a limit of 2.5 kms as radial distance from the relevant Railway facility was introduced, whereby a person beyond this facility could avail of FMA provided he opted for the same. Till this stage, a person getting FMA could not simultaneously make use of any OPD facility at Railway Hospital/Health Unit. This was relaxed and persons with chronic diseases were allowed to utilise the facilities regardless of the fact that they were getting FMA.

10. In short, at present a pensioner/retiree who resides beyond a distance

.16.

of 2.5 kms from relevant Railway medical facility and who does not utilise OPD facilities except for chronic diseases would be entitled for FMA. All the persons in the OA are living beyond the 2.5. kms limits and are not availing any OPD facilities except for any chronic diseases. To direct the respondents to treat these applicants as eligible from the date the relevant amendments came to be issued ensuring their eligibility would be a relatively easy decision to take.

11. However, the respondents have brought in the element of exercise of option. By pointing out the undertaking given by the applicants at Annexure R9, the respondents contest the claim of the applicants on the ground that as per the undertaking referred to, they had clearly opted for "OPD medical facilities from Railway Hospital/Health Units under RELHS-1997". In otherwords, they did not opt for FMA. Instead the applicants call to their assistance the undertaking Form at Annexure A8 wherein while stating that they reside beyond 2.5 kms from a Railway facility and having not availed any treatment as out patient except in cases of chronic diseases, they are eligible as per orders of Railway Board on 02.11.2012. It is alleged by the applicants that they were made to fill up a Form which was in the older format (Annexure R9) and the relevant option to be taken into account is one at Annexure A8.

12. While we see obvious merits in the claim put forward by the applicants.,

.17.

we also realise that this would have large implications for the respondent organisation. Being a responsible Government of India entity, we are sure, they would not like to deny a benefit to pensioners, if it is legally permissible. We feel that the OAs can be disposed of by directing Respondent-1 to consider the case made out by the applicants and arrive at a decision keeping in view the extant regulations of the organisation as well. This may be done as expeditiously as possible. All the three OAs are disposed of. No costs.

**(E.K.BHARAT BHUSHAN)
ADMINISTRATIVE MEMBER**

sd

List of Annexures in O.A. No.180/00123/2018

1. **Annexure A1** – True copy of the Railway Board letter No.RBE No.65/99 dated 21.04.1999.
2. **Annexure A2** – True copy of the revised option form.
3. **Annexure A3** – True copy of the undertaking form submitted by the 26th applicant dated 01.04.2014.
4. **Annexure A4** – True copy of the letter No.J/P.626/Sett.VII/D4/2011 dated 23.03.15 issued by the 4th respondent.
5. **Annexure A5** – True copy of the Railway Board letter No. RBE No.83/2011 dated 07.06.2011 along with revised Undertaking Form.
6. **Annexure A6** – True copy of the Railway Board letter RBE No.117/2011 dated 26.08.2011.
7. **Annexure A7** - True copy of the Order No.2012/AC-II/21/Misc. Matters (RBA No.38/2012) dated 2.11.2012.
8. **Annexure A8** - True copy of the Form submitted by the 1st applicant dated 01.06.2017.
9. **Annexure A9** - True copy of the letter No.2014/AC-II/21/12(PL) dated 15.12.2017 (RBA No.177/2017).
10. **Annexure A10** - True extract copy of the paras 1 to 4 of Railway Board letter RBE No.107/22 dated 15.07.2002.
11. **Annexure R1** – True copy of the Railway Board order dated 23.10.1997.
12. **Annexure R2** – True copy of the Railway Board order RBE No.107/2002 dated 15.07.2002.
13. **Annexure R3** – True copy of the Railway Board order RBE No.45/2004 dated 01.03.2004.
14. **Annexure R4** – True copy of the Railway Board order RBE No.99/2007 dated 24.07.2007.
15. **Annexure R5** – True copy of the Railway Board letter No.2006/H/DC/JCM dated 12.10.2006.

.19.

16. **Annexure R6** – True copy of the Railway Board order RBE No.168/2009 dated 15.09.2009.
17. **Annexure R7** – True copy of the Railway Board order RBE No.146/2014 dated 19.12.2014.
18. **Annexure R8** – True copy of the Railway Board Order Letter No.PC-V/2010/A/Med./I dated 26.3.2015.
19. **Annexure R9** - True copies of Undertaking & Option form of the applicants.

List of Annexures in O.A. No.180/00278/2018

1. **Annexure A1** – True copy of the Resolution dt.15.01.2018.
2. **Annexure A2** – True copy of the Order RBE No.65/99 dt. 21.04.1999 issued by the Railway Board.
3. **Annexure A3** – True copy of the Railway Board issued a letter RBE No.45/2004 dated 01.03.2004 enclosing therewith a revised undertaking form.
4. **Annexure A4** – True copy of the Order RBE No.168/2009 dt.15.09.2009 issued by the Railway Board.
5. **Annexure A5** – True copy of the Order RBE No.83/2011 dt.07.06.2011 issued by the Railway Board.
6. **Annexure A6** – True copy of the Order RBE No.117/2011 dt.26.08.2011.
7. **Annexure A7** - True copy of the Circular RBA No.38/2012 dt.02.11.2012 issued by the Railway Board.
8. **Annexure A8** - True copy of the Order RBA No.177/2017 dt.15.12.2017 issued by the Railway Board.
9. **Annexure R1** - True copy of the PPO of the 1st applicant downloaded from Advanced Railway Pension Access Network.
10. **Annexure R2(a)** - True copy of option form submitted by the applicant No.2.
11. **Annexure R2(b)** – True copy of the option form submitted by the applicant No.3.

.20.

12. **Annexure R2(c)** – True copy of the option form submitted by the applicant No.4.
13. **Annexure R2(d)** – True copy of the option form submitted by the applicant No.5.
14. **Annexure R3** – True extract of RBE No.65/1999 of Railway Board.
15. **Annexure R4** – True copy of PBC No.200/2012 enclosing RBA No.38/2012, issued under No.2112/AC-II/21/Misc. Matter Date 02.11.2012 of Railway Board.

List of Annexures in O.A. No.180/00513/2017

1. **Annexure A1** – True copy of the extract of the PPO issued to the applicant.
2. **Annexure A2** – True copy of the applicant's representation dated 18.01.2016.
2. **Annexure R1** – True copy of the undertaking and option form dated 01.03.2004.
3. **Annexure R2** – True copy of the Rule RBE No.65/1999 dated 21.04.1999.
5. **Annexure R3** – True copy of the Rule RBE No.107/2002 dated 15.07.2002.
6. **Annexure R4** – True copy of the Rule RBE No.241/2004 dated 25.11.2004.
7. **Annexure A3** - True copy of the Railway Board RBE 45 of 2004 dated 01.03.2004.
8. **Annexure A4** - True copy of the letter dated 26.03.2008 submitted by the applicant.
9. **Annexure A5** - True copy of the Railway Board No.83/2011 dated 07.06.2011.
