

**CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL  
ERNAKULAM BENCH**

**Original Application No.180/00298/2015**

Thursday, this the 28<sup>th</sup> day of February, 2019

**Hon'ble Mr. E.K. Bharat Bhushan, Administrative Member**  
**Hon'ble Mr.Ashish Kalia, Judicial Member**

1. P.N. Geethanjali,  
D/o. late K. Narayana Pillai, aged 55 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer,  
PF15, Thiruvananthapuram  
residing at Anjali, Pooram Nagar-2,  
Contonment North, Kollam-1.
2. Anil Kumar S  
S/o. late N. Sreedharan Nair, aged 53 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer,  
O/o.AG A&E, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at Breeze, TC 41/1684, Manacaud,  
Thiruvananthapuram-695 009.
3. K. Raja Radhakrishna Rajan  
S/o.late B. Kathiresan, Aged 57 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer,  
AAD, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at TC 41/339, Pavithra Nagar,  
PNRA 57, Manacaud, Thiruvannathapuram.
4. Santhakumari.S  
W/o. Premachandran, Aged 57 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer,  
AAD, Thiruvananthapuram,  
residing at Sopanam, T.C.42/1440(2),  
House No.4, Sreevaraha Nagar, Thiruvananthapuram
5. D. Lekshmi Ammal,  
D/o. late J.D.Sharma, Aged 60 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer  
LA 04, O/o.AG, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at T.C.50/846, Ayodhya  
Thaliyal, Karamana P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram-695 002.

6. Seasor K. Abraham,  
S/o.K.E.Abraham, Aged 54 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer  
0E, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at TC 11/2429,  
Post Office Lane, Nalanchira P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram.
7. Gopakumaran Thampi K.B,  
S/o. late V. Krishnan Nair, aged 51 years,  
Assisant Accounts Officer,  
PM, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at TC 28/116, Thalakkulam House,  
Athani Lane, Kaithamukku  
Petta P.O., Thiruvananthapuram.
8. Yegneswaran P,  
S/o.Y.P. Ramachandra Iyer, Aged 50 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer  
CCell, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at Ram Nivas, TC. 36/1568,  
Sreevaraham North, Manacaud P.O  
Thiruvananthapuram-9
9. Jayakumar K.K,  
S/o.K. Kuttappan, Aged 52 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer  
CCell, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at TC 49/125, Kamaleswaram  
Manacaud P.O., Thiruvananthapuram-9.
10. Gopakumar S,  
S/o.Sundaresan Nair M, Aged 52 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer  
CCell, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at Aravindam, Vellanad,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695541.
11. V. Jayaraman  
S/o.V.R. Venketeswaran, aged 54 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer  
GE1, Thiruvananthapuram,  
residing at Sreechakram,  
TC 42/886(2), Kavu Lane,  
Mankeezh Junction, Vallakkadavu P.O.  
Thiruvananthapuram-695 008.

12. B.K.Jayakumaran Nair  
S/o.late K. Bhaskara Pillai, Aged 57 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer,  
DAE, O/o.AG, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at Charanath Gardens,  
Edagramam, Karumam P.O., Thiruvananthapuram-2.
13. Yogesh A,  
S/o.V.P.Appukuttan, aged 48 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer, PAO 2, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at Sreeniketan, HTGRA-16, Hill Top Gardens,  
Puravoorkonam, Karakulam,  
Thiruvananthapuram-695 564.
14. Meera Menon R.  
S/o.G.K. Menon, Aged 48 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer,  
PF 21, O/o.AG, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at Apartment No.D9  
Oak Leaf, Heera Swiss Town  
Sasthamangalam, Thiruvananthapuram.
15. T.S. Harihara Iyer  
S/o.T.N.Sankara Iyer, Aged 53 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer, PF 15, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at 'Sankaram' TC 18/936(2)  
Theli Bhagam, Thirumala, Thiruvananthapuram-695 006.
16. K.T.Manoj Kumar  
S/o.K. Thankappan, aged 46 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer  
AAD, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at Chaithram , TC 18/936(3)  
Theli Bhagam, Thirumala,  
Thiruvananthapuram-695 006.
17. Sundarambal V,  
D/o.A. Valliammal, Aged 56 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer  
GE 34, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at KP 1/180, Sreerenjini, Mukkola  
Thiruvananthapuram.
18. Harikumar M.B,  
S/o.A. Balakrishna Pillai  
Aged 50 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer  
AAD, Thiruvananthapuram,  
residing at Shreyas, TC 12/472(14)

Plamoodu, Pattom P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram-695 004.

19. Nirmala N.V,  
W/o.N. Vasudevan Namboodiri  
Aged 56 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer  
GE4, O/o.AG., Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at SWARA-128 B  
Sreekanteswaram, Fort (P.O),  
Thiruvananthapuram-23.
20. Anuradha A.S,  
W/o.K.V. Janardhanan Pillai, Aged 55 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer  
GE 5, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at TC 9/1796(2)  
Pattanikunnu Lane, Sasthamangalam,  
Thiruvananthapuram-10.
- 21 R. Muraleedharan Nair,  
S/o.S. Raghavan Pillai  
Aged 58 years, Assistant Accounts Officer  
O/o.AG, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at Ragam, UG 11 a, Ulloor Gardens,  
Ulloor, Medical College P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram.
- 22 S. Latha,  
W/o.S.Balachandran Potti, Aged 54 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer  
PO 3, O/o.AG, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at Thiruvonam, 44/1498,  
Sreepadam Street, West Fort, Thiruvananthapuram.
23. Oommen M.M  
S/o.late Kocheria Mathulla, aged 54 years  
Assistant Accounts Officer, PF 18, Thiruvananthapuram  
residing at Mulamoottil House, KP 1/623 C  
Parakkode Lane, Nalanchira (PO),  
Thiruvananthapuram.
24. V.R. Vijayakumari,  
D/o.R. Rama Pai, Aged 59 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer  
O/o.AG, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at 'Swathi' H.No.5,

- Manava Nagar, Palkulangara, Pettah P.O.  
Thiruvananthapuram-24.
25. K. Sreedharan,  
S/o.V.K.Nair, Aged 60 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer  
O/o.AG, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at TC 17/1213(3), Sastha Nagar,  
Pangode, Thirumala P.O.  
Thiruvananthapuram-6.
26. Varghese P.T,  
S/o.P.V. Thankachan, Aged 50 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer  
TAO3, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at H.No.27  
Co-operative Housing Colony,  
Mannammoola, Peroorkada  
Thiruvananthapuram
27. Mridula A.J,  
D/o.A.I. Johny, Aged 51 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer  
PF20, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at H.No.25, Altharakkal, Yamuna Colony  
Kudappanakkunnu, Thiruvananthapuram.
28. Mallika C.],  
D/o.Janardhanan Pillai, Aged 53 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer  
CO-ORD, Thiruvananthapuram  
residing at TC 28/463(1)  
Chempakkada Junction,  
Palkulangara, Thiruvananthapuram-24.
29. Sathiapriya Vidyadharan K.  
S/o.T.Sivaraman, aged 54 years  
Assistant Accounts Officer  
Records, O/o.AG, Thiruvananthapuram.  
Residing at Poomadyam, C-34  
Ravinagar, Peroorkada,  
Thiruvananthapuram-5.

30. Ms.Beenamma  
W/o.M.N.Sidharthan, aged 60 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer  
O/o.AG, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at Souparnika KRA 182,  
Kulasekharam, Kodunganoor P.O.,  
Vattiyoorkavu, Thiruvananthapuram-13.
31. Suresh Babu K.V,  
S/o.Sukumaran K.V., Aged 51 years,  
Accounts Officer, O/o.AG, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at Muthukolam, TLRA-47,  
Thoppil Lane, Kumarapuram,  
Thiruvananthapuram-11.
32. C.S. Suresh Kumar,  
S/o.G. Chandrasekhara Pillai, Aged 55 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer, AAD, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at TC 36/30 (KERA 135)  
Karali, Vallakkadavu P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram-695 008.
33. B.Rajalakshmi  
D/o.late K. Bhaskaran Nair, Aged 53 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer,  
GE 15, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at PMRA 1, Mele Puthen Veedu  
Muttada P.O., Thiruvananthapuram-695 025.
- 34 K.T. Mohanan  
S/o.late K.T. Thami, Aged 53 years,  
Accounts Officer, O/o.AG, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at KP VI/679, MNWA 35A,  
Mariya Nagar, Erappukuzhi  
Kudappanakunnu P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram-695 043.
35. G.N.Vinod  
S/o.late R. Gopinathan Nair, Aged 54 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer, DAE 1, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at TC 07/1979  
Vishakam, House No.27,  
Bridge Lane. Ulloor, Medical College P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram-11.
36. Kurian.G  
S/o late K.George, Aged 58 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer, IAD, Thiruvananthapuram,  
residing at T.C.11/1916 (1),NBRA 73, Bethany,

YMR, Kowdiar P.O.  
Thiruvananthapuram, PIN — 695 003

37. Mohammed Rail U.,  
S/o.late M.Umar Akbar,Aged 53 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer,  
O/o.AG AEE, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at 2/243, "Rabeea" Sanyasiparambu,Olavakkod,  
Palakkad-678 002.
38. Mohanan A.P  
S/o.late Narayanan Unni, aged 52 years  
Assistant Accounts Officer  
O/o.AG A&E, Thiruvananthapuram.  
residing at 'Ayilyam', Kuttur Road, Muthuvana,  
Puzhakkal P.O., Thrissur - 680 553.
39. P.Sivadasan  
S/o late P.Raman, Aged 56 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer,  
O/o.AG A&E,, Thrissur Branch.  
residing at Poonchalil House,  
Chuduvathur, Shornur-1, Palakkad - 679 121.
40. T.A.Hassan  
S/o P.V.Ali, Aged 52 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer,  
O/o.AG A&E,, Thrissur Branch.  
residing at Palikuzhi House,  
Krishnapuram, Pullokkara P.O.,  
Thrissur - 680 655.
41. Jaikumar Bhaskaran  
S/o late C.P.Bhaskaran, Aged 48 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer,  
O/o.AG A&E,, Thrissur Branch.  
residing at 1 -387 (23/241), 'Shreyas'  
Madathil Lane, Kanattukara  
Thrissur - 680 011.
42. P.Rajan  
S/o Chandran M.R., Aged 52 years  
Assistant Accounts Officer,  
O/o.AG A&E,, Thrissur Branch.  
Residing at 52/1183  
'Shanthi', M.R.Vasu Road  
Ayyanthole Road  
Thrissur - 680 003.

43. C.Prabhakaran  
S/o C. Balan Pillai, Aged 53 years  
Assistant Accounts Officer,  
O/o.AG (AEE), Thrissur Branch  
Residing at 'Nandanam'  
Edamuttam P.O., Thrissur - 680 568.
44. Sasikumar.P (No.1)  
S/o N.K.Sankara Narayanan, Aged 53 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer  
O/o.AG A&E, Thrissur.  
Residing at 'Krishnakripa'  
111/440, Near Bappuji School  
Parli, Palakkad - 678 612.
45. Manjula P.K  
D/o.P.T.Krishnan Nambiar, Aged 52 years  
Assistant Accounts Officer,  
O/o.AG (AEE), Thrissur.  
Residing at 'Manjuvihar'  
Near Karthyayani Temple  
Ayyanthole, Thrissur - 680 003
46. Muraleedharan V.R.  
S/o Raman Ezhuthachan V.N, Aged 52 years  
Assistant Accounts Officer,  
O/o.AG A&E, Thrissur.  
Residing at Velloore Kizhakkoot House  
Choorakkattukara,  
Ambala Nagar P.O.  
Thrissur - 680 555.
47. Varghese K.A.  
S/o K.T.Antony, Aged 53 years  
Assistant Accounts Officer,  
DAE K1, Branch Office, Kottayam.  
Residing at Koippuram House  
Kottamuri P.O., Chonjody, Thrikkodithanam  
Changanacherry - 686 105.
48. Suresh P.D.,  
S/o P.S.Damodaran, Aged 51 years  
Accounts Officer, O/o.AG A&E, Kottayam Branch.  
Residing at 'Vaishakam'  
Mariathuruthu, Kottayam - 686 017.



49. Rajendran C.G.,  
S/o Gopala Kaimal, Aged 55 years,  
Assistant Accounts Officer,  
O/o.AG &A &E, Ernakulam branch.  
Residing at Thengumpillil House  
Panangad P.O, Kochi - 682 506. .... **Applicants**

**(By Advocate – Mr.R.V.Sreejith)**

**V e r s u s**

- 1 Union of India, represented by the Secretary  
to the Government of India  
Ministry of Personnel  
Public Grievances & Pension  
Department of Personnel & Training  
North Block, New Delhi – 110 001
2. The Comptroller & Auditor General of India  
9 Deen Dayal Upadhyaya Marg  
New Delhi – 110 124
3. The Principal Accountant General (A&E)  
Kerala, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 001 ..... **Respondents**

**(By Advocate – Mr.K.I.Mayankutty Mather)**

This Original Application having been heard and reserved for orders on 19.2.2019, the Tribunal on 28.2.2019 delivered the following:

**ORDER**

**Per: Mr.Bharat Bhushan, Administrative Member**

Original Application No.180/00298/2015 is filed by 49 applicants who all, except 3, are Assistant Accounts Officers in Pay Band 2 of Rs.9300-34800 with grade pay of Rs.4800/- and two of whom are Senior Accounts Officers. They are aggrieved by the refusal on the part of the respondents to extend the benefit of 3<sup>rd</sup> financial upgradation of Pay Band 2 with Grade Pay Rs.5400/- under MACP Scheme. The respondents had denied the benefit on

the ground that they have already availed 3 promotions from the grade of direct entry. They are further aggrieved by a certain number of officials who are junior to them having been placed higher in higher Grade Pay, earning Rs.5400/-. This is being done by the respondents on the strength of para 20 of the MACP Scheme which lays down that:

“Financial upgradation under the MACPS shall be purely personal to the employee and shall have no relevance to his seniority position. As such, there shall be no additional financial upgradation for the senior employees on the ground that the junior employee in the grade has got higher pay/grade pay under the MACPS. ”

2. Respondents have filed a detailed reply statement.
3. We have heard Shri.R.V.Sreejith on behalf of the applicants and Shri.Vineeth Komalachandran for Mr.K.I.Mayankutty Mather on behalf of the respondents. Perused the records.
4. We see that the very same issue involved, has been adjudicated by this Tribunal in O.A 180/01011/2015. In orders pronounced on 2<sup>nd</sup> Aug 2018, we considered the issue in detail and ruled as follows:

“6. The applicants fall under two categories and the first category of officials got promotion as Accountants followed by their promotion as Senior Accountants. On passing the SOGE examination they were promoted as AAO. The second category consists of officials who got promotion as Accountants and Sr. Accountants. On passing the SOGE examination they were appointed as Section

Officer on *ad hoc* basis and they became AAO not by promotion but by unification of scales of pay of Section Officers and AAO with effect from 1.1.2006.

7. The respondents further contend that as per the revised pay structure with effect from 1.1.2006 the posts of Section Officer and AAO have been merged and placed in PB-2 9,300-34,800/- with Grade Pay of Rs. 4,800/- and re-designated as AAO. They further submit that although the officials who had entered service as Accountant and promoted as Sr. Accountant, Section Officer and Asst. Accounts Officer enjoyed three levels of promotion with fixation benefit thereof, 3<sup>rd</sup> financial upgradation under MACP with GP of Rs. 5,400/- in PB-2 9300-34,800/- was granted to them due to the fact that the scales of pay of SO and AAO were unified and the posts re-designated as AAO with effect from 1.1.2006 in conformity with paragraph 5 of the MACP scheme according to which promotions earned/upgradation granted under the ACP scheme in the past to those grades which now carry the same Grade Pay due to merger of pay scales/upgradations of posts recommended by VIth CPC shall be ignored for the purpose of granting upgradations under MACPs. They rely on the judgment of the Full Bench of this Tribunal in OA No. 1103/2013 wherein the order passed by the Chennai Bench has been examined holding that the order of Chennai Bench is *per incuriam*. The above position of the Full Bench was affirmed by the High Court of Kerala in OP (CAT) No. 58/2015. Later the Chennai Bench in a subsequent order dated 31.10.2014 while referring to the claim of the applicants observed that the order in OA No. 966/2010 and 967/2010 relied on by the applicants is *per incuriam*. The Principal Bench of the Tribunal also in OA No. 436/2015 has considered the similar issue and after examining the various orders pronounced by different benches observed that the claim of the applicants therein is completely misplaced, relying on wrong principles which would result in double benefit because they would get the benefit of promotion as well as upgradation which was never the spirit of MACP scheme and dismissed the OA.

8. Heard the learned counsel appearing for the applicant and the learned counsel appearing for the respondents. Perused all records. The challenge in this O.A is on two counts. The applicants lay claim

to the Grade Pay of Rs.5400/- in PB-2 on the ground that their juniors were granted benefits such as higher Grade Pay. Secondly they are aggrieved by para 20 of Annexure A-1 MACP Scheme which reads as follows :

Financial upgradation under MACP Scheme shall be purely personal to the employee and shall have no relevance to his seniority position. As such there shall be no additional financial upgradation for the senior employees on the ground that junior employees in the grade has got higher pay/grade pay under the MACP Scheme.

9.Applicants called to their assistance the decision of the Chennai Bench of this Tribunal in O.A.Nos.966/2007 and 967/2007 wherein the applicants in that case had got the benefit of Grade Pay of Rs.5400/- from the date on which the said benefit was extended to the juniors who are impleaded in the case. The respondents had implemented the judgment vide order dated 27.8.2014. The applicants contention is that, being similarly placed, they too ought to get the same benefit. Secondly, they have challenged a feature of the MACP Scheme that has already been mentioned. MACP Scheme is an anti stagnation relief measure which envisages three financial upgradations counted from the entry grade on completion of 10, 20 and 30 years of service respectively. The Scheme is not applicable to those officials who have already enjoyed three promotions. The scheme in para 20 already referred to states clearly that the benefit under the Scheme was purely personal to the employee and shall have no relevance to his/her seniority position and no financial upgradation is to be allowed for a senior employee on the ground that junior employee in the grade has got higher pay/grade pay under the Scheme.

10. We have examined the details of service of the applicants. The first group has got three promotions while in service and the second group got two, plus benefit of unification of scales of Section Officer and AAO whereby they were placed in PB-2 Rs.9300-34800 with Grade Pay of Rs.4800/- while being redesignated as AAO. Having been benefited thrice as above they do not appear to have a case as made out in the O.A. Further the applicants set store by the judgment of the Chennai Bench. However, the Full Bench of this Tribunal in O.A.No.1103/2013 had

.13.

examined the said judgment and held that the order of Chennai Bench is *per incuriam*. This has been upheld by the Hon'ble High Court of Kerala as well.

11. The challenge against MACP Scheme is that para 20 militates against the general principle that senior should not be paid less than the junior. However, MACP Scheme is a specific scheme meant to alleviate the difficulties of personnel who stagnate at a certain level during the service without promotion. In order to ensure relief to them they are to be sanctioned three financial upgradations at 10, 20 and 30 years interval in the service if they fail to be promoted. As an integral feature of the said scheme, it has been laid down that while bequeathing benefits under the scheme, the ground that a junior is getting higher pay/grade pay cannot be a reason for a senior to seek still further benefits. We feel that this condition is included in the scheme in order to ensure uniformity and a general principle should not be utilized to erode the essence of the scheme.

12. Considering all aspects we do not see any merit in the O.A. Accordingly, the O.A is dismissed. No costs. ”

5. Accordingly the Original Application fails and is dismissed. No costs.

**(ASHISH KALIA)**  
**JUDICIAL MEMBER**

**(E.K.BHARAT BHUSHAN)**  
**ADMINISTRATIVE MEMBER**

**List of Annexures**

Annexure A1 - Annexure A1: True copy of the MACP Scheme for the Central Government Civil employees circulated as per Government of India, Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances & Pensions, (Department of Personnel & Training) Office Memorandum No.35034/3/2008-Estt.(D) dated 19.5.2009.

Annexure A7: True copy of the letter dated 12.12.2014 issued by the respondents.

Annexure A8: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn II/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 1<sup>st</sup> applicant.

Annexure A9: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn II/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 2<sup>nd</sup> applicant.

Annexure A10: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn II/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 3<sup>rd</sup> applicant.

Annexure A11: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn II/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 4<sup>th</sup> applicant.

Annexure A12: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn II/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 6<sup>th</sup> applicant.

Annexure A13: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn II/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 7<sup>th</sup> applicant.

Annexure A14: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn II/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 8<sup>th</sup> applicant.

Annexure A15: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn II/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 9<sup>th</sup> applicant.

Annexure A16: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn II/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 10<sup>th</sup> applicant.

Annexure A17: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn II/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 11<sup>th</sup> applicant.

Annexure A18: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn II/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 13<sup>th</sup> applicant.

Annexure A19: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn II/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 15<sup>th</sup> applicant.

Annexure A20: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn I/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 16<sup>th</sup> applicant.

Annexure A21: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn II/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 17<sup>th</sup> applicant.

Annexure A22: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn I/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 18<sup>th</sup> applicant.

Annexure A23: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn II/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 20<sup>th</sup> applicant.

Annexure A24: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn II/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 23<sup>rd</sup> applicant.

Annexure A25: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn II/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 26<sup>th</sup> applicant.

Annexure A26: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn II/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 27<sup>th</sup> applicant.

Annexure A27: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn II/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 28<sup>th</sup> applicant.

Annexure A28: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn II/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 32<sup>nd</sup> applicant.

Annexure A29: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn II/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 33<sup>rd</sup> applicant.

Annexure A30: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn II/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 35<sup>th</sup> applicant.

Annexure A31: True copy of the memorandum No.Admn II/MACPS.Crores/III/14-15 dated 16.1.2015 issued to the 36<sup>th</sup> applicant.

Annexure A2: True copy of final order dated 29.12.2010 in O.A.Nos.966/2009 and 967/2009 of the Chennai Bench of this Hon'ble Tribunal.

Annexure A3: True copy of the order dated 22.3.2013 of the Hon'ble CAT, Chennai Bench in O.A.No.1103/2011.

Annexure A4: True copy of the common Order dated 19.3.2014 of the Hon'ble High Court of Kerala, Chennai in W.P.Nos.18611 & 18612 of 2011.

Annexure A5: True copy of the order dated 19.8.2014 of the Hon'ble Apex Court in un-numbered S.L.P /2014.

Annexure A6: True copy of the representation dated 11.9.2014 submitted by the 1<sup>st</sup> applicant.

Annexure A32: True copy of the order dated 17.11.2014 of the Bombay Bench of this Hon'ble Tribunal in O.A.Nos.540/2011 to 543/2011.

. . . . .