

OA.No.170/00101/2017/CAT/Bangalore Bench
CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL
BANGALORE BENCH

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.170/00101/2017

DATED THIS THE 31st DAY OF OCTOBER, 2018

HON'BLE DR.K.B.SURESH, MEMBER (J)

HON'BLE SHRI C.V.SANKAR, MEMBER (A)

T.S.Sambamurthy
 S/o Late T.Subba Bhatta
 Aged 83 years, retired as Head Clerk
 South Western Railway, Mysuru.
 Residing at
 No.290, Padmashri Nilaya
 12th Cross, Vijayanagar
 Railway Layout
 Mysuru-570 016.

....Applicant

(By Advocate Sri A.R.Holla)

Vs.

1. Union of India
 By Secretary
 Ministry of Railways
 Railway Board
 Rail Bhavan
 New Delhi-110 001.
2. The General Manager
 South Western Railway
 Hubballi-580 020.
3. The Senior Divisional Finance Manager
 South Western Railway
 Irwin Road
 Mysuru-570 021.

...Respondents

(By Advocate Sri N.Amaresh)

ORDER

(PER HON'BLE SHRI C.V.SANKAR, MEMBER (ADMN.))

The applicant has filed the present OA seeking the following relief:

- a) *To quash the order No.P.500/MYS/PEN/ADALAT/2014/7115 dtd.05.12.2014, issued by the respondent No.3, Annexure-A6.*
- b) *Direct the respondents to fix the pension of the applicant in the*

Pay Band Rs.9300-34800 + Grade Pay of Rs.4200/- with effect from 01.01.2006 and extend consequential benefits to the applicant accordingly.

2. The applicant while working as Head Clerk in the Divisional Office of South Western Railway, Mysuru, retired on 31.12.1991 on attaining the age of superannuation. He was in the pay scale of Rs.1400-2300 at the time of retirement and had completed 35 years of service. His Pension Payment Order dtd.31.12.1991 is annexed at Annexure-A1. His pension was revised w.e.f. 01.01.1996 in accordance with the CCS(RP) Rules, 1998 fixing his pension in the revised scale of Rs.5000-8000 vide Revised Pension Payment Order dtd.Nil.1998(Annexure-A2). Thereafter his pension has been revised w.e.f. 01.01.2006 in accordance with the CCS(RP) Rules, 2008 and his pension is fixed at Rs.5907/- w.e.f. 01.01.2006 construing his pay scale as Rs.4500-7000(pre-revised) vide Revised Pension Payment Order dtd.15.06.2010(Annexure-A3). He submits that the pre-revised pay scale of Head Clerk is Rs.5000-8000 and not Rs.4500-7000 as mentioned in the above order. This has been clarified by the Department of Railways vide order dtd.19.01.2011(Annexure-A4). However the respondents did not rectify the mistake committed in fixing his pension w.e.f. 01.01.2006.
3. The applicant submitted a representation dtd.04.02.2013(Annexure-A5) to the 3rd respondent with a request to rectify the error in fixing his pension and re-fix the pension in the pay band Rs.9300-34800 + Grade Pay of Rs.4200 w.e.f. 01.01.2006. In response to the same, 3rd respondent issued an order dtd.05.12.2014 holding that the pension fixed in the scale of Rs.4500-7000 in the PPO dtd.15.06.2010(Annexure-A6) is in order and hence the question of revision of the pension of the applicant does not arise. Copies of the statement containing the details of pay scales and the corresponding pension

OA.No.170/00101/2017/CAT/Bangalore Bench
w.e.f. 01.01.2006 is produced at Annexure-A7.

4. The applicant submits that fixation of pension of the pre-2006 retirees has been the subject matter before the several Benches of this Tribunal and also High Courts. It has been held that the pension of the pre-2006 retirees has to be fixed based on the pay of the employee in the Pay Band + Grade Pay corresponding to the pay at the time of his retirement. The pension shall not be less than 50% of the minimum of the pay in the Pay Band + Grade Pay and not minimum of the pay of the Pay Band+ Grade Pay. This has been affirmed by the Hon'ble Apex Court and in spite of which, the error crept in the fixation of pension of the applicant w.e.f. 01.01.2006 has not been rectified.
5. The applicant further submits that the impugned order at Annexure-A6 is arbitrary and unreasonable. There is no dispute regarding the pay scale of the applicant at the time of his retirement in 31.12.1991 which is Rs.1400-2300 and the corresponding revised scale as per CCS(RP) Rules, 1998 is Rs.5000-8000. The same has been noted in PPO at Annexure-A2 which has been confirmed by the Railway authorities also vide order dtd.19.01.2011. But while fixing the pension w.e.f. 01.01.2006 as per CCS(RP) Rules, 2008, the pre-2006 scale of the applicant was noted as Rs.4500-7000 instead of Rs.5000-8000 which is purely an arithmetical error. Instead of rectifying the error, the 3rd respondent has sought to justify his stand in terms of the impugned order at Annexure-A6. The 3rd respondent failed to consider the ground urged by the applicant in his representation dtd.04.02.2013 in an objective manner and redress the grievance of the applicant. As such, Annexure-A6 is liable to be quashed and the respondents are liable to be directed to fix his pension in accordance with above representation and extend consequential benefits to him.

6. The respondents have filed their reply statement wherein they have taken preliminary objection saying that the OA is barred by limitation as the request of the applicant for revision of pension/family pension has been rejected about 2 years back duly explaining the reasons vide office letter dtd.05.12.2014 and now after expiry of more than 2 years approaching this Tribunal is not acceptable in the eye of law. Hence, the OA is not maintainable and is liable to be dismissed with costs.
7. They submit that after retirement of the applicant from service on superannuation on 31.12.1991, his pension was fixed at Rs.860/- in pay scale Rs.1400-2300 according to IV CPC w.e.f. 01.06.1992. On implementation of V CPC, the pension was modified at Rs.2613/- in scale Rs.4500-7000 w.e.f. 01.01.1996. In the said PPO, the scale of pay of the applicant in V PC was mentioned as Rs.5000-8000 instead of Rs.4500-7000 inadvertently. On implementation of VI CPC, the pension was modified further at Rs.5907/- in pay band Rs.5200-20200 + 2800(GP) w.e.f. 01.01.2006. In the said PPO, the scale of pay in V PC is clearly mentioned as Rs.4500-7000 not Rs.5000-8000 as was inadvertently indicated in previous PPO. It is submitted that as there is no error in fixing his pension, the question of rectifying the mistake committed in fixing the pension w.e.f. 01.01.2006 does not arise. The office is not aware about the letter at Annexure-A4 dtd.19.01.2011 as the said letter is not issued by Railway Board and hence, it cannot be treated as final and the respondents are not bound to act thereon. In response to the representation dtd.04.02.2013 of the applicant, the respondents issued an order dtd.05.12.2014 stating that the pension of the applicant is fixed in accordance with the existing provisions of Railway Board and DOP&PW and Railway Board's letters dtd.16.02.2009(Annexure-R1), 02.02.2010(Annexure-R2) &

OA.No.170/00101/2017/CAT/Bangalore Bench

13.04.2016. It is reaffirmed that the scale of pay/pay band(Grade Pay) corresponding to IV CPC pay scale of Rs.1400-2300 in the V CPC & VI CPC is Rs.4500-7000 and Rs.5200-20200(GP Rs.2800) respectively as has been indicated in S.No.9 of Annexure-1 of Dept. of Pension and Pensioner's Welfare(DOP&PW) OM dtd.14.10.2008 circulated on the Railways vide office letter dtd.18.10.2008. From this, it is clear that granting the scale of pay/pay band(Grade Pay) corresponding to IV CPC pay scale of Rs.1400-2300 in the V CPC & VI CPC is Rs.4500-7000 and Rs.5200-2022(GP Rs.2800) in the case of the applicant is just and correct and no revision of pension is warranted. And therefore, the applicant is not entitled for any relief and the OA is liable to be dismissed.

8. We have heard the Learned Counsel for both the parties who have filed their written arguments note. The Learned Counsels for the applicant and the respondents have made submissions reiterating the factual position and their points as highlighted by them in the OA and reply statement.
9. We have gone through the main contentions of the applicant and reply of the respondents in detail. The matter involved relates to only one issue namely whether the persons in the pay scale of Rs.1400-2300 at the time of IV CPC are eligible to be fitted in the pay scale of Rs.5000-8000 or Rs.4500-7000 under the V CPC. As admitted by the applicant, he was in the pay scale of Rs.1400-2300 at the time of retirement. As brought out by the reply of the respondents and the detailed concordance table annexed to R1, it is clear that the pay scale of Rs.5000-8000 has been granted only in the cases where the pay scale had been Rs.1400-2600 as S-9 Grade. The applicant admittedly was in the pay scale of only Rs.1400-2300. The only support which he has for his contention for the higher pay scale of Rs.5000-8000 is the Pension

Payment Order enclosed at Annexure-A2 in which the respondents have admitted that the pay scale of Rs.5000-8000 has been mentioned inadvertently. The applicant has produced another document at Annexure-A4 wherein a purported letter of Central Railway has been enclosed. The applicant has not been able to produce anything other than this for substantiating his claim that the scale of Rs.1400-2300 for Head Clerks of Ministerial Staff other than Accounts Dept. has been revised as Rs.5000-8000. The various orders of the Railway Board cited by the respondents are also of no assistance to the applicant's contention. The same has been reaffirmed as evidenced by the Railway Board's letter dtd.02.02.2010 enclosed as Annexure-R2 by the respondents wherein it is clearly stated that the scale of pay corresponding to 4th CPC pay scale of Rs.1400-2300 is Rs.4500-7000. We are unable to agree with the applicant and therefore, the OA is dismissed. No costs.

(C.V.SANKAR)
MEMBER (A)

(DR.K.B.SURESH)
MEMBER (J)

/ps/

Annexures referred to by the applicant in OA.No.170/00101/2017

Annexure A1: Copy of the order dtd.31.12.1991

OA.No.170/00101/2017/CAT/Bangalore Bench

Annexure A2: Copy of the order dtd.nil.1998

Annexure A3: Copy of the order dtd.15.06.2010

Annexure A4: Copy of the circular dtd.19.01.2011

Annexure A5: Copy of applicant's representation dtd.04.02.2013

Annexure A6: Copy of the order dtd.05.12.2014

Annexure A7: Copy of the statement of pay scales with the corresponding pension
w.e.f. 01.01.2006

Annexures with MA.No.348/2017 filed by the respondents

Annexure-MA1: Copy of Railway Board's letter dtd.19.04.2016

Annexures with reply statement:

Annexure-R1: Copy of Letter dtd.05.01.2011 along with Railway Board's letter
dtd.16.02.2009

Annexure-R3: Copy of RBE No.24/2010
