

**CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL  
PRINCIPAL BENCH**

**OA-2126/2009  
MA-2209/2018**

**New Delhi, this the 13<sup>th</sup> day of July, 2018**

**Hon'ble Mr. Justice L. Narasimha Reddy, Chairman  
Hon'ble Mr. Pradeep Kumar, Member (A)**

1. All India Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited  
Executive Association, through Prahlad Rai  
S/o Sh. Keshar Lal, Its General Secretary,  
Aged about 51 years, Registered Office  
At A-4/6, M.S. Flats, Peshwa Road Apartments  
New Delhi-01.
2. C.K. Gupta S/o P.N. Gupta aged about 56 years,  
R/o 833, Rasta Churukon Chaura Rasta 128, J&K Block  
Laxmi Nagar, Delhi Post held AGM(CMS-I),  
Wireless O&M
3. Prem Chand S/o Sh. Des Raj aged about 48 years,  
R/o CD/28A, DDA Flats, Hari Nagar, New Delhi,  
Post held Manager(IT) IT Cell BSNL, Bharat Sanchar  
Bhawan, Janpath, New Delhi.
4. S.V. Patel S/o Sh. Vishrambhai Patel aged about 55 years,  
R/o 3145/1 W.H.S. Kirati Nagar, new Delhi post held  
AGM(CMTS-CE) BSNL,  
Bharat Sanchar Bhawan, Janpath, New Delhi.
5. Tilak Raj Jhamb S/o Sh. Kushal chand aged about 50 years,  
R/o F-200B, Dilshad Garden, Delhi-95  
Post held Manager, AGM(CMTS)BSNL,  
Bharat Sanchar Bhawan, Janpath, New Delhi.
6. Braham Prakash S/o Sh. Dayakishan aged about 50 years,  
r/o 473, Laxman vihar Ph. II, Gurgaon,  
post held Dy. Manager, AGM(CMTS) BSNL,  
Bharat Sanchar Bhawan, Janpath, New Delhi.
7. Rajesh Kumar Sharma S/o Late Sh. M. Sharma  
Aged about 59 years, R/o 29-C DDA Flat Taimur Enclave  
New Delhi-65, Post held AGM(ML), BSNL,

Bharat Sanchar Bhawan, Janpath, New Delhi.

8. Satish Chander S/o late Sh. Ram Sarup aged about 50 years,  
R/o H.No. 142, Sector No. 29, Faridabad,  
Post held Manager, (ML-II) O/o GM(NM) BSNL,  
Bharat Sanchar Bhawan, Janpath, New Delhi.
9. R.P. Goyal S/o Kalyan Lal Gupta aged about 53 years,  
R/o P No 24, Vinoba Nagar, near Sector-11.  
Malviya Nagar, Jaipur-17 Post held SDE (MM)  
o/o CGM(NTP) Eastern Court, N. Delhi.
10. Sohan Lal Sharma S/o late Sh Radha Krishnan Sharma,  
Aged about 50 years, R/o. Vivekanand Nagar, Bahadur Garh,  
Post held AGM(CMTS) BSNL,  
Bharat Sanchar Bhawan, Janpath, New Delhi.
11. Jeet Singh S/o late Sh. Khacheru Singh aged about 50 years,  
R/o RZ-38, Kamal Park, Palam Colony, N.D.-45  
Post held Manager(CMTS) BSNL  
Bharat Sanchar Bhawan, Janpath, New Delhi.
12. Rajesh Krishna Sharma S/o S.K. Sharma aged about 54 years,  
r/o 289, Hathroi Garhi, Ahmer Road, Jaipur-001  
post held AGM(VAS), BSNL,  
Bharat Sanchar Bhawan, Janpath, New Delhi.
13. Tej Pal Singh S/o Prem Singh aged about 50 years,  
R/o 6/109, F-2 Sector-6, Vaishali, Ghaziabad-201010  
Post held AGM (CMTS-Infra), BSNL,  
Bharat Sanchar Bhawan, Janpath, New Delhi.
14. S.N. Seth, s/o P.N. Seth aged about 50 years,  
R/o 204, Guru Jambheshwar Nagar 'A' Vaishli JP-21  
Post held Manager (Vigilance), BSNL,  
Statesman House, New Delhi.
15. Naveen Prakash S/o Sh. B.B. Sharma,  
Aged about 51 years, R/o 198/1, Jagrati Vihar Meerut (UP)  
Posted as AGM(Estt.) O.o CGMT UP(W) Circle,  
1st Floor MDA bldg. Meerut-250003.
16. Munna Lal Gupta S/o Sh. Shyam Lal,  
Aged about 51 years, R/o 16/1 Kozy Colony opposite,  
Defence colony, Mawana road posted as AD(PG), O/o CGMT UP  
(W) BSNL Circle 11rd Floor MDA bldg. Meerut-250003.

17. Aziz Ahmad S/o late Sh. Noor Mohammad,  
Aged about 48 years, R/o 478/30 Jhabjhali Mohalla Lucknow  
Posted as Sr SDE TAX, under GMM,  
Lucknow, NTR, Circle.
18. Ashok Kumar Chaubey S/o Shri Ganga Narain  
Aged about 53 years, R/o 9B, Gayatripuram Kursi Road,  
Lucknow, posted as Sr SDE oFC Mtce Lucknow, NTR , Circle
19. Anjani Krishna S/o late Shri Jagjiwan Krishna  
Aged about 54 years, R/o 347/412, 20  
Tikait Rai Bara Talab Lucknow  
Posted as Sr. SDE OFC Mtce Lucknow, NTR Circle.
20. Alok Shrivastaa S/o late Sh. Kaushal Kishore Srivastava  
Aged about 46 years, R/o type-IV/03, Telephon Exchange, compound,  
Kaiserbagh Lucknow, posted as Sr SDE OFC Mtce, under GMM,  
Lucknow, NTR, Circle.
21. A.K. Jain, S/o late Sh. Chaiman Lal Jain,  
Aged about 48 years, R/o Type-IV Q- Telephone  
Exch. Colony Shuklagang, Distt. Unnao(UP) posted as  
Sr. SDE(CCN) O/o TDM Unnao, UP()E Circle.
22. Chandrama Yadav s/o late Sh. Sandhu Yadav,  
Aged about 48 years, R/o 7/555, vikas Nagar Lucknow,  
Posted as Sr SED OFC Mtce, under GMM Lucknow  
NTR Circle.
23. C.S. Mishra, S/o late Sh. R.N. Mishra,  
Aged about 51 years, R/o D-1/62, Sector-F, Jankipuram, Lucknow,  
Posted as Sr SDE(Tech), under GMM Lucknow,  
NTR Circle
24. Dinesh Prasad Singh, S/o late Sh. Ram Ajore Singh,  
Aged about 47 years, R/o 28, Preet Vihar colony,  
Kamta Surendra Nagar Lucknow poste as Sr SDE Fault Control under  
GMM Lucknow, NTR Circle.
25. Lala Ram S/o late Sh. Ganshyam  
Aged about 50 years,  
r/o 2/48 vijaiant Khand Gomati Nagar,  
Lucknow, posted as Sr SDE OFC Mtce under GMM Lucknow  
NTR Circle.
26. Raquim Ali S/o late Sh. Alemun,  
Aged about 49 years, R/o C-2828,

Rajajipuram Lucknow,  
Posted as Sr SDE(TT) o/o GMM Mtce  
Lucknow, NTR Circle.

27. Suresh Prasad Mishra S/o late Sh. Ram Narayan Mishra  
Aged about 52 years, R/o Qtre No. 90, Type-IV,  
Telecom Colony, Aliganj, Lucknow, posted as  
Sr SDE Ofc Lucknow, NTR Circle.
28. Shyam Kishore, S/o late sh. P.D. Dixit,  
Aged about 48 years, R/o 538K/449B, Triveni Nagar-III Sitapur  
Road Lucknow, posted as Sr SDE(Plg) O/o PGMT Lucknow,  
Under CGMT UP(E) Circle.
29. U.P. Singh, s/o late Sh. Bahal Singh,  
Aged about 54 years, R/o 13/17, vikas Nagar, Lucknow  
Posted as Sr SDE Trans Lucknow (TT) O.o PGMT  
Lucknow, under CGMT, UP(E) Circle.
30. Ram Prasad S/o late Sh. Raghu Nath Singh,  
Aged about 50 years, R/o 117/408 O Block Geeta Nagar  
Kanpur-25 posted as Sr. SDE, OFC Route Kanpur under  
GMM Lucknow, NTR Circle.
31. S.P.S. Rathore, s/o late Sh. Puttar Singh,  
Aged about 46 years, R/o 390 shivpura Naveen Nagar Kanpur (UP),  
posted as Sr. SDE, OFC Route  
Kanpur under GMM Lucknow, NTR Circle.
32. S.N. Yadav S/o late Sh. Rameshwar Prasad,  
Aged about 47 years, R/o Q.No. 3, New CTO Compound  
Colony, Mall Road, Kanpur(UP) posted as Sr. SDE, MUX  
Kanpur under GMM Lucknow, NTR Circle.
33. B.K. Tripathi, S/o Sh. S.D. Tripathi R/o 117/113  
EM Block Kakadev Kanpur, aged about 44 years, posted as Sr.  
SDE(OFC) Route Kanpur under GMM Lucknow, NTR Circle.
34. Rajesh Pratap Singh, S/o Sh. Sankatha Prasad Singh,  
Aged about 48 years, R/o C-66, Sarvodaya Nagar Lucknow, posted as  
Sr SDE (Admn) o/o GMM Lucknow, NTR Circle.
35. Satish Chand Sharma, S/o Sh. Om Dutt Sharma,  
Aged about 47 years, R/o Q.No. 4 Telecom Officer colony Sector 19,  
Noida (UP), posted as AGM(MM) O/o CGMT UP(W) Circle, MDA  
Building Meerut, UP(W) Circle.

36. Ashok Kumar Sharma, S/o Sh. Ishwari Prasad Sharma, aged about 49 years, R/o Q-326, Pallavpuram Phase-II Meerut-250101, posted as DE(Phone) Boundary road Lalkurti Telephone Exchange Meerut, UP (W) Circle.
37. Dharmendra Kumar Jain S/o Sh. S.L. Jain, Aged about 51 years, R/o 67-C, Jain Nagar Meerut, Posted as AGM(plg) O/o GMTD BSNL GPO Compound Meerut Cantt.-25001, UP(W) Circle.
38. Manoj Sharma s/o Sh. V.C. Sharma, Aged about 48 years, R/o 232 Purva Ahiran Budana Gate Meerut City 250002, posted as AGM (Rural & Vig.)O/oGMTD Meerut, GPO Compound, Meerut Cantt 250001, UP(W) Circle.
39. B.S. Bhadauria S/o Sh. Maujam Singh Bhadauria, Aged about 50 years, R/o 89, Greater Ganga, Ganga Nagar, Mawana Road, Meerut (UP) posted as AGM (Admn). O/o GMTD Meerut, UP(W) Circle.
40. S.K. Pandey, s/o Sh. Sita Ram pandey Aged about 56 years, R/o Q-2 Type IV Sanchar Colony, D-Pocket, Ganga Nagar, Meerut UP posted as DE(vig.) O/o CGMT UP(W) Circle, Meerut.
41. A.K.S. Pundir, s/o Sh. Rukam Pal singh, Aged about 48 years, R/o Deen Dayal Puram Near Purani Chungi, Nadarai Gate Kasganj (UP) posted as DE(A&P) O/o TDM Badaun, UP(W) Circle. ...Applicants

(through Ms. Rani Chhabra)

Versus

1. Department of Telecommunications  
Through Secretary Telecom Sanchar Bhawan,  
20, Ashoka Road, New Delhi-110001.
2. Chairman cum managing Director,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Bharat Sanchar Bhawan, Janpath  
New Delhi-110001.
3. General manager(Personnel),  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Bharat Sanchar Bhawan, 4<sup>th</sup> floor,

Janpath , New Delhi-110001.

4. Raj Kishore Pradhan, DE, RTTC,  
BSNL Vani Vihar through CGMT, BSNL,  
Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
5. Ramesh Chandra Khuntia, DE,  
O/o the GMTD, BSNL, Door Sanchar Bhawan,  
Cuttack-753012, through CGMT, BSNL, Orissa Circle,  
Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
6. Sannadyave Gowda M.D. DE,  
Through CGMT, BSNL,  
Karnataka Circle, Bangalore.
7. Sarada Prasad Samantaray, DE Marketing,  
o/o the CGMT,BSNL, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor,  
Door Sanchar Bhawan, Bhubaneswar-751022,  
Through CGMT, BSNL, Orissa Circle  
Bhubaneswar(Orissa).
8. Satyapriya Mohanty, SDE,  
Through CGMT, BSNL,  
NE-II Dimapur, Nagaland.
9. Sudhakaran G, DE, through CGMT BSNL,  
Kerala Circle, Tiruvantapuram (Kerala).
10. Malay Kanti Dasgupta, De, through CGMT,  
BSNL, Kolkata Telecom district, Kolkatta.
11. Ramesh V, DE, through CGMT BSNL,  
Southern Telecom Region, Chennai.
12. Thangavel S, De, O/o CGMT BSNL,  
Tamil Nadu Circle, Chennai.
13. K.K. Mishra, AGM(IT), through CGMT BSNL,  
Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
14. Vijayan A, DE, through CGMT BSNL,  
Kerala Circle, Tiruvananthapuram (Kerala).
15. Trilochan Nanda, DE, o/o GMTD BSNL,  
Door Sanchar Bhawan Cuttak through CGMT BSNL,  
Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).

16. Shyamal Munshi, SDE, through CGMT BSNL, West Bengal Circle, Kolkata.
17. Vinod Kumar, K.V., DE, through CGMT BSNL, Kerala Circle, Tiruvananthapuram (Kerala).
18. Manivannan K., DE, through CGMT BSNL, Telecom District, Chennai.
19. G.V. Bhaskar Rao, DE, through CGMT BSNL, Andhra Pradesh Circle, Hyderabad.
20. Suryamurthy N, DE, through CGMT BSNL, Southern Telecom Region, Chennai.
21. P.K. Shukla, DE, through CGMT BSNL, Gujrat Circle, Ahemdabad.
22. Suriendra Pal Singh Sandhu, DE, through CGMT BSNL, Punjab Circle, Chandigarh.
23. Baskaran C.K., DE, through CGMT BSNL, Telecom District Chennai.
24. Punam Lata, DE, through CGMT BSNL NTR, Kidwai Bhawan, Janpath, New Delhi-01.
25. Debendra Ch. Pradhan, DE, through CGMT BSNL, Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
26. Rajendra Kumar Behera, TDE, BSNL, Phulabani, through CGMT BSNL, Orissa Circle. Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
27. Abhaya Kumar Swain, DE, through CGMT BSNL, Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
28. Manasendu Das, DE, CMTS BSNL, Telephone Bhawan, Bhubaneswar-751001, DE, through CGMT BSNL, Orissa Circle Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
29. Manoj Kumar Tripathy DE, CMTS BSNL, Telephone Bhawan, Sambalpur through CGMT BSNL, Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa)
30. H.D. Kulkarni, DE, through CGMT BSNL, BRBR AITT, Jabalpur (MP).

31. Brahmananda Pati, DE, through CGMT BSNL, Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
32. Sailes Mohapatra, DE, through CGMT BSNL, Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar(Orissa).
33. Manmohan Khullar, DE, through CGMT BSNL, Punjab Circle, Chandigarh.
34. Jayanti Panda, De  
O/o the DE, GMTD BSNL, Door Sanchar Bhawan  
Bhubaneswar-751022, through CGMT BSNL,  
Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
35. Bhagabat Sah DE  
CMTS, BSNL, Telephone Bhawan,  
Bhubaneswar-751001, through CGMT, BSNL,  
Orissa Circle. Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
36. Golak Bihari Nayak DE  
OFC, ETR, BSNL, Telephone Bhawan,  
Koraput, through CGMT, BSNL,  
Eastern Telecom Region, Kolkata.
37. Udaya Narayan Das, DE, through CGMT, BSNL,  
Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar(Orissa).
38. Sanjib Kumar Routray, DE, through CGMT, BSNL,  
Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
39. Atul Kumar Jain, DE, AGM in BSNL Corporate Office,  
Through CMD BSNL, Bharat Sanchar Bhwan,  
Janpath, New Delhi-01.
40. S.S. Rajpoot, DE,  
through CGMT, BSNL,  
Western Telecom Region, Mumbai.
41. Chetan Kr. Jain, AGM in BSNL Corporate Office,  
through CMD, BSNL, Bharat Sanchar Bhawan,  
janpath, New Delhi-01.
42. Anup Kumar Verma,  
AGM in BSNL Corporate Office,  
through CMD, BSNL, Bharat Sanchar Bhawan,  
Janpath, New Delhi-01.



43. Bhupendra Kausik,  
AGM in BSNL Corporate Office,  
through CMD, BSNL, Bharat Sanchar Bhawan,  
Janpath, New Delhi-01.
44. Altab Ahmed Khan,  
AGM in BSNL Corporate Office,  
through CMD, BSNL, Bharat Sanchar Bhawan,  
Janpath, New Delhi-01.
45. Sujata Choudhary, DE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
North East Circle, Shilong (Meighlaya),
46. T H Saratchandra Meetei, DE,  
through CGMT, BSNL,  
north East II Deemapur (Nagaland).
47. Geeta Rani Swain, DE,  
through CGMT, BSNL,  
Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
48. Vevekananda Nath DE,  
through CGMT, BSNL,  
Assam Circle, Gauhati.
49. Seshadev Mishra DE,  
ETP, Telephone Bhawan, Bajrakabati Road,  
Cuttack-753001 through CGMT, BSNL,  
Eastern Telecom Project, Kolkata.
50. Surajit Chakraborty, DE,  
through CGMT, BSNL,  
North East Circle, Shilong (Meighlaya).
51. Arun Kumar Pandey, DE,  
through CGMT, BSNL, Madhya Pradesh Circle, Bhopal.
52. Brinda Prasad, DE,  
through CGMT, BSNL, Mumbai.
53. Pradeep Rathore,  
DE, through CGMT, BSNL,  
Madhya Pradesh circle, Bhopal.
54. Surendra Babu, SDE,

through CGMT, BSNL, UP(W)  
Circle, Meerut.

55. Yogesh Kumar Sharma,  
DE, through CGMT, BSNL,  
Madhya Pradesh Circle, Bhopal.
56. Dhananjoy Mondal, SDE,  
through CGMT, BSNL,  
Kolkatta Telecom District Kolkata.
57. Sharad Kumar Srivastava, SDE,  
through CGMT, BSNL, Western Telecom Region, Mumbai.
58. B.P. Kuyate, SDE,  
through CGMT, BSNL, Maharashtra  
Circle, Mumbai.
59. Sanjib Sardar, SDE,  
through CGMT, BSNL, Kolkata Telecom Factory, Kolkatta.
60. N.G. Dazzi, SDE,  
through CGMT, BSNL, North East II  
Deemapur, (Nagaland).
61. Sanjay Kumar Jain, SDE,  
through CGMT, BSNL, Punjab Circle,  
Chandigarh.
62. Prasenjit Bhattarcharjee, SDE,  
through CGMT, BSNL,  
North East Circle, Shilong (Meighlaya).
63. Rajeev Kumar Gangwar, SDE,  
through CGMT, BSNL,  
Rajasthan Circle, Jaipur.
64. Shiv Kumar S, SDE,  
through CGMT, BSNL,  
Karnatak Circle, Bangalore.
65. Indira Thakur, SDE,  
through CGMT, BSNL,  
Himachal Pradesh Circle, Shimla.
66. Utpal Ch. Bowmick, SDE,  
through CGMT, BSNL,

North East Circle, Shilong (Meighlaya).

67. Suraj Prakash Taneja, SDE,  
through CGMT, BSNL,  
Himachal Pradesh Circle, Shimla.
68. Anil Dhiman, SDE,  
through CGMT, BSNL,  
Himachal Pradesh Circle, Shimla.
69. Pradeep Kumar Sahoo, DE  
o/o GM TD, BSNL, Door Sanchar Bhawan,  
Rourkela through CGMT, BSNL,  
Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
70. Ajit Kumar Das DE,  
BB O/o GM TD, Telephone Bhawan,  
Berhampur, Ganjam DE, through CGMT, BSNL,  
Orissa circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
71. Manoj Kumar Chhotray, DE  
O/o GM TD, BSNL, Balasore-1 DE, through CGMT, BSNL,  
Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
72. Ramesh Ch. Sahu, SDE,  
through CGMT, BSNL,  
Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
73. Hrushikesh Patra DE  
Trans., O/o GM TD, Telephone Bhawan,  
Berhampur, Ganjam, through CGMT, BSNL,  
Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
74. Srinivas Mohapatra DE,  
O/o GM TD, Telephone Bhawan, Berhampur,  
Ganjam, through CGMT, BSNL,  
Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
75. Gouragopal Pattnaik DE CMTS, Telephone Bhawan,  
Berhampur, Ganjam, through CGMT, BSNL,  
Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
76. Avas Majhi, SDE,  
through CGMT, BSNL,  
Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
77. Ramesh Kumar SDE

- o/o DE OFC, ETR, Telephone Bhawan,  
Koraput, through CGMT, BSNL,  
Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
78. Manoj Kumar Mullick, DE  
O/o the GMTD, BSNL Door Sanchar Bhawan,  
Bhubaneswar-751022, through CGMT, BSNL,  
Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
79. Ram Krishna Paul, SDE,  
Through CGMT, BSNL, Assam Circle, Gauhati.
80. Rajkumar Mishra, DE  
O/o GM CMTS, Orissa Circle,  
IDCO Tower 7<sup>th</sup> Floor, Bhubaneswar-22  
through CGMT, BSNL,  
Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
81. Shiv Kr. Rishiwar, DE  
Through CGMT, BSNL,  
Madhya Pradesh Circle, Bhopal.
82. P. Damoda DE,  
o/o GM TD, BSNL, Telephone Bhawan,  
koraput, through CGMT, BSNL,  
Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
83. Anjan Kumar Mallick DE  
Trans., Telephone Bhawan, Bajrakabati Road,  
Cuttack-753001 through CGMT, BSNL,  
Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
84. Nishit K. Puadhaya, SDE, BSNL,  
Madhya Pradesh Circle, Bhopal.
85. Hemant Gupta, SDE, through CGMT BSNL,  
Himachal Pradesh Circle, Shimla.
86. Ch. Debandra Singh, SDE,  
through CGMT, BSNL,  
North East Circle, Shilong (Meighlaya)
87. E. Dinesh, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL  
Andhra Pradesh Circle, Hyderabad.
88. G. Ravi Kumar, SDE,

- Through CGMT BSNL,  
Andhra Pradesh Circle, Hyderabad.
89. Sanjay Singh Pathania, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Himachal Pradesh Circle, Shimla.
90. MD. Siraj Mohiddin, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Andhra Pradesh circle, Hyderabad.
91. Deepak Guleria, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Himachal Pradesh Circle, Shimla.
92. Mrinal Roay, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Assam Circle, Gauhati.
93. B. Sridhar, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Andhra Pradesh Circle, Hyderabad.
94. Amit Prakash, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Madhya Pradesh Circle, Bhopal.
95. Amresh Kumar, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL NTR,  
Kidwai Bhawan, Janpath, New Delhi-01.
96. Rajesh Kumar Kashyap, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL NTR,  
Kidwai Bhawan, Janpath, New Delhi-01.
97. Indira Sekhar sudhansu Mishra SDE  
Through CMD,BSNL, Bharat Sanchar Bhawan,  
Janpath, New Delhi.
98. Pratibha Gupta, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Madhya Pradesh Circle, Bhopal.
99. Rajesh Singh Thakur, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Madhya Pradesh Circle, Bhopal.

100. Shaik Vazwwruddin, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Andhra Pradesh Circle, Hyderabad.
101. Mohd. Salarudding, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Andhra Pradesh Circle, Hyderabad.
102. Umesh Kumar, SDE,  
Through CMD BSNL, Bharat Sanchar Bhawan,  
Janpath, New Delhi.
103. Milan Jain, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Madhya Pradesh Circle, Bhopal.
104. Manoj Kumar Mishra, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
NTR, Kidwai Bhawan, Janpath, New Delhi-01.
105. Sanjay Kumar Agarwal, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
UP(W) Circle, Meerut.
106. Vivek Namdeo, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Madhya Pradesh Circle, Bhopal.
107. Bhavna Sharma, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Himachal Pradesh Circle, Shimla.
108. Rupendra Pathak, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Bihar Circle, Patna.
109. Sheela V, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Karnatak circle, Bangalore.
110. Hari Kishan Tambia, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Rajasthan Circle, Jaipur.
111. Ravindra Shukla, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Madhya Pradesh circle, Bhopal.

112. K.B. Upasani, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Maharashtra Circle, Mumbai.
113. A Shivakumar, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Andhra Pradesh Circle, Hyderabad.
114. Brahmananda Nayak, DE  
O/o DGM Mtce., ETR MW Campus  
Bhubaneswar-751012, Through CGMT BSNL,  
Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar(Orissa).
115. Ajay Kumar Tiwari, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Madhya Pradesh Circle, Bhopal.
116. Abhay Gupta, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Madhya Pradesh circle, Bhopal.
117. Dharmendra Kumar Jain, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Madhya Pradesh Circle, Bhopal.
118. Anita Bhardwaj, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Himachal Pradesh Circle, Shimla.
119. Alok Kumar Srivastava, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Madhya Pradesh Circle, Bhopal.
120. S.K. Agarwal, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Chhatisgarh Circle, Raipur.
121. Singh D.S., SDE,  
CGMT MTNL, Mumbai.
122. Girish s, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Karnatak Circle, Bangalore.
123. Janak Raj, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,

Haryana Circle, ambala.

124. Ram Bilas Verma, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL NTR,  
Kidwai Bhawan, Janpath, New Delhi-01.
125. S.N. Laghate, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Madhya Pradesh Circle, Bhopal.
126. M. Giridhar, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Andhra Pradesh circle, Hyderabad.
127. Biswajit Lenka DE  
CMTS, Telephone Bhawan, Keonjhar,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar(Orissa).
128. R.G. Dalvi, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Maharashtra Circle, Mumbai.
129. Nongmeikapam, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
North East Circle, Shilong (Meighlaya).
130. Bijay Karmakar, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Kolkatta Telecom District, Kolkatta.
131. R.M. Bhatia, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Maharashtra Circle, Mumbai.
132. Sushanta Kumar Mishra DE  
O/o TDM, BSNL, Bolangir, Through CGMT BSNL,  
Orissa circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).
133. H. Khogen singh, SDE  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
North East circle, Shilong (Meighlaya).
134. Laxman Meher DE,  
O/o the GMTD, BSNL, Kachery Road,  
Sambalpur-768001, Through CGMT BSNL,  
Orissa Circle, Bhubaneswar (Orissa).



135. M Birendra Singh, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
North East Circle, Shilong (Meighlaya).
  136. P.S. Parmar, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Gujarat Circle, Ahemdabad.
  137. Sathiyar D, SDE  
Through CGMT BSNL, Tamil Nadu Circle, Chennai.
  138. Kumareshan G, SDE  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Karnatak Circle, Bangalore.
  139. Rajeshwari K, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Tamil Nadu Circle, Chennai.
  140. Sivagama Sundari S, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Tamil Nadu Circle, Chennai.
  141. Jitesh Kumar, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Punjab Circle, Chandigarh.
  142. J.K. Patel, SDE,  
Through CGMT BSNL,  
Gujarat Circle, Ahemdabad. ...Respondents
- (through Sh. Subhash Gosain for R-1)

### **ORDER(ORAL)**

#### **Hon'ble Mr. Justice L. Narasimha Reddy, Chairman**

The OA was filed challenging the seniority list of the Sub-Divisional Engineer cadre in the BSNL. Identical issue was dealt with by the Ernakulam Bench of the CAT in OA No. 86/2009 and the same was decided through order dated 18.02.2010. Though at one stage, this OA was sought to be

disposed of in terms of the said order, it came to light that the applicants therein filed a Writ Petition before a division bench of the Kerala High Court at Ernakulam, and the Writ Petition was dismissed through judgment dated 01.07.2013 and that in turn, has been upheld by the Hon'ble Supreme Court in CA No. 392/2017 dated 12.12.2017. The result is that the order passed by the Ernakulam Bench of the CAT as modified by the Kerala High Court in OP(CAT) No. 2941/11(Z), has become final. This factual and legal position is disputed by the learned counsel for the respondents.

2. We, therefore, dispose of this OA in terms of the judgment of the Hon'ble Kerala High Court, the operative part of which is extracted hereunder:

"47.....Hence the 147 candidates ought to be considered for the 1/3<sup>rd</sup> vacancies in 1994-95, 1995-96 and 1996-97 (up to 22.7.1996) according to their merit as also their eligibility to appear for the combined examination. The eligibility year has to be considered since, one combined examination was held for three years. A candidate entitled to appear in 1996 (by reason of completing five years of regular service in the feeder category on the 1<sup>st</sup> of the January of the year) cannot be placed in the vacancy of 1994-1995; however, high his rank may be. If the seniority list required any recast on the above lines; obviously, the official respondent ought to do so."

There shall be no order as to costs.

**(Pradeep Kumar)**  
**Member (A)**

**(Justice L. Narasimha Reddy)**  
**Chairman**

/ns/