

**CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL  
ERNAKULAM BENCH**

**R.A.No.180/00032/2017 in O.A.No.180/00282/2016  
with M.A.No.180/00506/2017,  
**R.A.No.180/00033/2017 in O.A.No.180/00961/2015  
with M.A.No.180/00507/2017,  
**R.A.No.180/00034/2017 in O.A.No.1195/2013  
with M.A.No.180/00508/2017,  
**R.A.No.180/00035/2017 in O.A.No.1219/2013  
with M.A.No.180/00509/2017,  
**R.A.No.180/00036/2017 in O.A.No.180/00020/2014  
with M.A.No.180/00510/2017,  
**R.A.No.180/00037/2017 in O.A.No.180/00881/2015  
with M.A.No.180/00511/2017  
**& R.A.No.180/00038/2017 in O.A.No.180/00533/2015  
with M.A.No.180/00515/2017**************

**Monday, this the 12<sup>th</sup> day of February, 2018**

**CORAM:**

**HON'BLE Mr.U.SARATHCHANDRAN, JUDICIAL MEMBER  
HON'BLE Mr.E.K.BHARAT BHUSHAN, ADMINISTRATIVE MEMBER**

**R.A.No.180/00032/2017 in O.A.No.180/00282/2016**

1. Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
represented by its Managing Director,  
Corporate Office, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor,  
Bharat Sanchar Bhavan, New Delhi – 110 001.
2. The Chief General Manager,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Telecom, Kerala Circle, Trivandrum – 695 033.      ...Review Applicants

**(By Advocate Mr.V.Santharam)**

**V e r s u s**

1. Karunakaran EN,  
S/o.Narayanan Nambiar,  
Krishna Bhavan, KP 14/416, Koodali PO,  
Retired Divisional Engineer (Net Work Operation),  
Bharath Sanchar Nigam Limited, Mattanur.

2. P.P. Krishnan, Kousthubham,  
S/o.M. Raman Nair, Kousthubham, Kalikkadavu PO,  
Pilicode, retired Deputy General Manager (officiating),  
N.W.O Bharath Sanchar Nigam Ltd, Kasargod.
3. K.T.Gopalan, S/o.V.Chindan Nair,  
Anjana, MLA Road, PO Kozhummal, Kannur Dist.  
Retired Deputy General Manager (Net Work Operation)  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Ltd. Kannur.
4. E.Sukumaran,  
MP Kunhuraman, Sreenilayam,  
Kijnathil PO, Edchakal, Via. Trikarapur,  
Retired Divisional Engineer (NOW),  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Ltd. Cheruvathur, Kannur.
5. A. Padmanabhan,  
S/o.Govindan, Sreerag,  
Machery PO, Mowanchery, Kannur,  
Retired Deputy General manager, (L/A),  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Ltd. Kannur.
6. Gopinathan V.K., S/o.Kunhikelappan,  
Sarovaram, Iringanur PO, Vatakara, Kozhikode Dist.  
Retired Divisional Engineer (Net Work Operation)  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Ltd., Thalassery.
7. O.C. Vijayachandran,  
S/o.K. Narayanan Nair,  
Kathandiyil House, Near Ukkandan Peedika,  
PO Thiruvangad, Tellicherry.  
Retired Deputy General Manager (Administration),  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Ltd, Kannur.
8. C. Krishnan, S/o.C. Velayudhan,  
Chaithanya, Chakkarayan House,  
Chandrasekharan Street, PO, Kuthuparamba.  
Retired Assistant General Manager (CP)  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Ltd., Kannur.
9. Jayarajan KV, S/o Anandan,  
Kazhakam, Nambiarmotta, PO Kakkat, Kannur,  
Retired Deputy General Manager (Net Work Operation)  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Ltd., Thalassery. ...Review Respondents

**(By Advocate Mr.P.Chandrasekhar)**

**R.A.No.180/00033/2017 in O.A.No.180/00961/2015**

1. Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
represented by its Managing Director,  
Corporate Office, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor,  
Bharat Sanchar Bhavan, New Delhi – 110 001.
2. The Chief General Manager,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Telecom, Kerala Circle, Trivandrum – 695 033. ...Review Applicants

**(By Advocate Mr.V.Santharam)**

**V e r s u s**

1. Thankamma Thomas, W/o.Thomas,  
Retired Assistant General Manager (Administration),  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited, Ernakulam.  
Residing at Kayalumkol House,  
32/284, Thammanam P.O., Cochin – 682 032.
2. Subhadra Amma S,  
W/o.late Easwaran Namboothiri,  
Retired Divisional Engineer,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Cheriyamadam, Thevannur,  
Vaikom Village, Ayur, Kollam District – 671 533.
3. Ambili,  
D/o.late Easwaran Namboothiri,  
Retired Divisional Engineer,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Cheriyamadam, Thevannur,  
Vaikom Village, Ayur, Kollam District – 671 533.
4. Aswathy,  
D/o.late Easwaran Namboothiri,  
Retired Divisional Engineer,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Cheriyamadam, Thevannur,  
Vaikom Village, Ayur,  
Kollam District – 671 533. ...Review Respondents

**(By Advocate Mr.P.Chandrasekhar)**

**R.A.No.180/00034/2017 in O.A.No.1195/2013**

1. Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited  
represented by its Managing Director,  
Corporate Office, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor,  
Bharat Sanchar Bhavan, New Delhi – 110 001.

2. The Chief General Manager,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Telecom, Kerala Circle, Trivandrum – 695 033.

3. The Principal General Manager,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Ernakulam, Kochi – 682 016.

...Review Applicants

**(By Advocate Mr.V.Santharam)**

**V e r s u s**

1. John Varghese,  
Divisional Engineer (Vigilance) (Retired),  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited, E-3,  
Telecom Officers' Quarters, Perumannoor,  
Gurudwara Road, Thevara, Kochi – 682 015.

2. Thomas P Thomas,  
Project Manager (Retired), Project Udan,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited, BSNL Bhavan,  
Ernakulam, Kochi – 682 016.

...Review Respondents

**(By Advocate Mr.P.Chandrasekhar)**

**R.A.No.180/00035/2017 in O.A.No.1219/2013**

1. Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
represented by its Managing Director,  
Corporate Office, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor,  
Bharat Sanchar Bhavan,  
New Delhi – 110 001.

2. The Chief General Manager,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Telecom, Kerala Circle,  
Trivandrum – 695 033.

3. The Principal General Manager,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Ernakulam, Kochi – 682 016.

4. The Principal General Manager,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Malappuram, Malappuram District.

...Review Applicants

**(By Advocate Mr.V.Santharam)**

**V e r s u s**

1. Chinnamma Thomas, W/o.A.P.Thomas,  
Retired Assistant General Manager (CFA-NWP II),  
Office of the Principal General Manager,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited, Kottayam.  
Residing at Ambattu, Malloossery P.O.,  
Kottayam – 680 041.
2. Alice Thomas, W/o.P.V.Thomas,  
Retired Divisional Engineer (Digital Tax and OCB),  
Telephone Exchange Building,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited, Kottayam.  
Residing at Pallickaleth, Malloossery P.O.,  
Kottayam – 680 041.
3. K.C.Sitadevi,  
W/o.T.V.Somasekharan Nair,  
Retired Divisional Engineer,  
Office of General Manager Telecom, Malappuram.  
Residing at Chaithram, M.C.Road,  
Kanakkar Post, Kottayam – 686 632.
4. Mariamma Sunny, W/o.Sunny Philips,  
Retired Assistant General Manager,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited.  
Residing at Panachiparambil, “BLISS”,  
Muttambalam Post, Kanjikuzhy, Kottayam – 686 004.
5. Mariamma Joseph, W/o.late M.T.Joseph,  
Retired Assistant General Manager,  
Office of the Principal General Manager,  
Telecom, Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited, Kottayam.  
Residing at Muttathukunnel, Muttambalam Post,  
Kottayam – 686 004.
6. Lellamma Sebastian, W/o.E.K.Sebastian,  
Retired Assistant General Manager,  
Office of the Principal General Manager, Telecom.  
Residing at Elamthuruthil, Manganam P.O.,  
Kottayam – 686 018.

...Applicants

**(By Advocate Mr.P.Chandrasekhar)**

**R.A.No.180/00036/2017 in O.A.No.180/00020/2014**

1. Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited  
represented by its Managing Director,  
Corporate Office, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor,  
Bharat Sanchar Bhavan, New Delhi – 110 001.

2. The Chief General Manager,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Telecom, Kerala Circle, Trivandrum – 695 033.
3. The General Manager, Telecom,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited, Palakkad.
4. The General Manager, Telecom,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Kozhikode.

...Review Applicants

**(By Advocate Mr.V.Santharam)**

**V e r s u s**

1. N.V.Chandramohan Nair,  
S/o.K.R.Vasudevan Nair (late),  
Retired Assistant General Manager,  
Office of the General Manager, Telecom, Palakkad.  
Residing at 5/394, Mohan Nivas, Gayathri Road,  
Manissery P.O., Ottappalam, Palakkad District – 679 521.
2. K.Lakshmanan, S/o.Kunhelan,  
Retired Assistant General Manager CSC/CM,  
Office of the General Manager, Telecom, Palakkad.  
Residing at Rajalakshmi House, YMCA Road,  
Shornur, Palakkad – 679 121.
3. K.D.John, S/o.Ulahannan Devassia,  
Retired Assistant General Manager (CM & TRANS),  
Office of the General Manager, Telecom, Palakkad.  
Residing at Kalladayil House, Giri Nagar,  
NSS Engineering College P.O., Palakkad – 678 008.
4. Rajan Maroli, S/o.Krishnan M,  
Retired Assistant General Manager (OP),  
Office of Principal General Manager, Calicut.  
Residing at Krishna, 29/1816A, Near Maladath Temple,  
P.O. Kottoli, Kozhikode – 673 016.

...Review Respondents

**(By Advocate Mr.P.Chandrasekhar)**

**R.A.No.180/00037/2017 in O.A.No.180/00881/2015**

1. Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
represented by its Managing Director,  
Corporate Office, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor,  
Bharat Sanchar Bhavan, New Delhi – 110 001.

2. The Chief General Manager,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Telecom, Kerala Circle, Trivandrum – 695 033. ...Review Applicants

**(By Advocate Mr.V.Santharam)**

**V e r s u s**

1. N.Gopalakrishnan,  
S/o.P.Narayana Pillai,  
Retired Assistant General Manager (HR),  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
T.C.No.55/2030 Archana, Akshaya Nagar,  
Kaimanam P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 040.
2. G.Jayakumar,  
S/o.late M.N.Gopalan Nair,  
Retired Divisional Engineer (DTAV & EWSD),  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited, Sreelakshmi,  
T.C.22/234, NRA-98, Swathe Nagar Lane I,  
Peroorkada P.O., Trivandrum – 695 005.
3. Sivaprasad P Pillai,  
S/o.C.K.Parameswaran,  
Retired Divisional Engineer (Regular),  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Remya, GN 17, Gandhiji Nagar,  
Nalanchira P.O., Trivandrum – 33.
4. Padmakumari Amma P.M.,  
D/o.Madhavan Nair,  
Assistant General Manager, Telecom,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Shreyas, TC 10/1737, Vattiyoorkavu P.O.
5. Salimma Mathew,  
Retired Divisional Engineer (CTSD),  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Thengumoottil House, Thaikkattukara PO,  
Companyyadi, Aluva – 683 106.
6. Nehar Beegum,  
W/o.late Gavir Rawther,  
Divisional Engineer (T),  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Madathil House, Chooralkulangara,  
PO Ettumanoor, Kottayam District.

7. Violet Sarojam,  
W/o.Jacob Japa Singh,  
Retired Divisional Engineer (Regular),  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Cherukari, TC No.5/2385, Kowdiyar,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 3.
8. L.Saraswathi Amma,  
W/o.Rajasekharan,  
Retired Divisional Engineer (T&M),  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Athira House, West Gate, Ettumanur,  
Kottayam – 686 631.
9. Thressiamma Joseph,  
W/o.N.T.Mathew,  
Retired Divisional Engineer (STR),  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Vadavathur P.O., Kottayam – 686 010.
10. Savithri V.V., W/o.Haridas,  
Retired Divisional Engineer (MNC),  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
B4, Lakshmi Apartment,  
Chalappuram, Calicut – 2.

...Review Respondents

**(By Advocate Mr.P.Chandrasekhar)**

**R.A.No.180/00038/2017 in O.A.No.180/00533/2015**

1. Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
represented by its Managing Director,  
Corporate Office, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor,  
Bharat Sanchar Bhavan, New Delhi – 110 001.
2. The Chief General Manager,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Telecom, Kerala Circle, Trivandrum – 695 033.

...Review Applicants

**(By Advocate Mr.V.Santharam)**

**V e r s u s**

1. G.Mohandas,  
S/o.Venugopala Panicker,  
Retired Deputy General Manager (O),  
Divisional Engineer (Regular),  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Staff No.15247, Trivandrum.

2. K.Vijayakumaran Nair,  
Retired Deputy General Manager,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Sowparnika, SRA – C5, Venjarode,  
Sreekariyam P.O., Trivandrum – 695 017.
3. B.Sudhakaran,  
Deputy General Manager,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Avani, Poovanpara, Alemcode P.O.,  
Attingal, Trivandrum District.
4. B.Ramesan, Staff No.17966,  
Retired Divisional Engineer (Vigilance),  
Office of the General Manager, Telecom District,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Velleyttambalam, Kollam.
5. Radha Anand,  
Retired Divisional Engineer,  
Telecom, Staff No.14700,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Oachira, Kollam.
6. Valsala G, Staff No.34118,  
Retired Assistant General Manager,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Velleyttambalam, Kollam.
7. K.Saraswathi Antharjanam,  
Retired Divisional Engineer,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Chavara, Kollam.
8. K.R.Sasidharan Pillai,  
Retired Divisional Engineer, CTSD,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited, Ernakulam.
9. M.K.Ramamoorthy,  
Retired Divisional Engineer,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Ushus, 31/721, P&T Lane,  
Kachapally Road, Vyttila, Kochi – 682 019.
10. K.B.Reghunathan Nair, Staff No.135001,  
Retired Divisional Engineer, BSNL Mobile Services,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited, Telephone Exchange,  
North Paravur, Ernakulam District.

11. S.Ananthanarayanan,  
Retired Divisional Engineer,  
Installation and Maintenance, Staff No.11450,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Ltd., Kannur.
12. C.Kuriyan,  
Retired Divisional Engineer,  
Staff No.15664, Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,  
Kanhangad, Kasargod District.
13. Sherly Fernandes,  
Retired Divisional Engineer (IMPCS),  
Office of the General Manager, Telecom District,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited, Kollam. ...Review Respondents

**(By Advocate Mr.P.Chandrasekhar)**

These review applications having been heard on 24<sup>th</sup> January 2018, the Tribunal on 12<sup>th</sup> February 2018 delivered the following :

### **ORDER**

#### **HON'BLE Mr.U.SARATHCHANDRAN, JUDICIAL MEMBER**

Respondents in the above captioned Original Applications are the Review Applicants. They seek a review of the Annexure R.A.-1 order which has been passed by this Tribunal resting on its earlier decision in O.A.No.109/2011 along with O.A.Nos.110/2011 and 236/2011. In the order in O.A.No.109/2011 and connected cases this Tribunal has passed order as extracted below :

“13. The respondents are directed to step up the pay of the applicants to the level of pay of their juniors with effect from the date of arising of the anomaly of seniors drawing less pay than their juniors in respect of each of the applicants within a period of 3 months from the date of receipt of a copy of this order. However, this order will not stand in the way of the Committee set up to deal with the issue under consideration in these O.As, giving a more beneficial recommendation for the applicants.”

2. Subsequently in O.A.No.1195/2013 and five connected cases also this Tribunal relied on this afore-extracted order. In those cases and it was ordered by this Tribunal as follows :

*“15. Respondent argues that the decision of High Court of Kerala in O.P.(CAT) Nos.1560, 1576 & 1592 of 2012 has not attained finality as S.L.P(Civil) Nos.7716, 13346 & 13421 of 2013 filed challenging the same are pending before the Supreme Court. Noting the above contention, we direct that the benefit of O.A.No.109/2011 and other cases upheld vide High Court of Kerala in O.P.(CAT) No.1560/2012 and other cases detailed hereinabove be extended to the applicants in the six Original Applications within six weeks subject to the condition that if the Apex Court does not rule in favour of the applicants, applicants will refund any excess payment received as a result of the order in these Original Applications. The applicants shall make an undertaking to that effect, namely, that in case the Hon'ble Supreme Court decides against the case pleaded by them (by the applicants), they will refund the amount so received. These Original Applications are disposed of accordingly. No costs.*

3. As it was pointed out by the respondents in the afore-captioned OAs that though the orders extracted above have been confirmed by the Hon'ble High Court they have not attained finality as S.L.P.Nos.7716/2013, 13346/2013 and 13421/2013 challenging the judgment of the Hon'ble High Court are pending before the Apex Court. Hence this Tribunal in the afore-captioned OAs made it clear that the benefits of the O.A.No.109/2011 and other connected cases and the orders passed in O.A.No.1195/2013 were being extended to the applicants in the afore-captioned O.As subject to the condition that if the Apex Court does not rule in favour of the applicants, the applicants will refund any excess payment received as a result of the order of this Tribunal making suitable undertakings to that effect. Orders passed in the afore-captioned O.As are almost identical and are common in nature.

4. The relief sought in these R.As are also common i.e. to review the order passed by this Tribunal in above captioned O.As. In support of their grounds for review the Review Applicants state that although the S.L.P mentioned in the orders passed by this Tribunal have been dismissed, one

Civil Appeal ie. C.A.No.4389/2010 and connected cases is still pending before the Hon'ble Supreme Court wherein the existing seniority list of Sub Divisional Engineers will have an impact depending on the final judgment of that Civil Appeal pending before the Apex Court. Therefore the review applicants state that it is likely that the many juniors may become seniors of the applicants. The Review Applicants further stated that since all the applicants are retired the possibility of recovery of amounts from those applicants would be difficult and hence a review of the order on the aforementioned O.As is required.

5. We have heard Shri.V.Santharam, learned counsel for the review applicants and Shri.P.Chandrasekhar, learned counsel for the respondents in the R.A/applicants in the O.A. It is clear from the copies of the orders of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India dismissing the S.L.Ps filed against the earlier decisions of the Tribunal relied in these O.As, the *ratio* on which this Tribunal has passed the orders under review has attained finality. Needless to say that the orders passed by this Tribunal in the aforementioned O.As have also consequently attained finality. Review Applicants now seek a review of the order on the ground that there is a likelihood of change in the seniority if the Civil Appeals pending before the Hon'ble Supreme Court is decided against the respondents in these Review Applications. According to the Review Applicants in that event the amount paid to the Review Respondents will have to be recovered which would be a difficult proposition as the Review Respondents in these Review Applications had retired from service.

6. In **State of West Bengal & Others v. Kamal Sengupta & Another** (2008) 3 AISLJ 209 the Apex Court has enumerated the principles to be followed in the applications for review of the orders passed by the Administrative Tribunals which are as follows :

- “(i) The power of the Tribunal to review its order/decision under Section 22(3) (f) of the Act is akin/analogous to the power of a Civil Court under Section 114 read with Order 47 Rule 1 CPC.
- (ii) The Tribunal can review its decision on either of the grounds enumerated in Order 47 Rule 1 and not otherwise.
- (iii) The expression “any other sufficient reason” appearing in Order 47 Rule 1 has to be interpreted in the light of other specified grounds.
- (iv) An error which is not self-evident and which can be discovered by a long process of reasoning, cannot be treated as an error apparent on the face of record justifying exercise of power under Section 22(3)(f).
- (v) An erroneous order/decision cannot be corrected in the guise of exercise of power of review.
- (vi) A decision/order cannot be reviewed under Section 22(3)(f) on the basis of subsequent decision/judgment of a coordinate or larger Bench of the Tribunal or of a superior Court.
- (vii) While considering an application for review, the Tribunal must confine its adjudication with reference to material which was available at the time of initial decision. The happening of some subsequent event or development cannot be taken note of for declaring the initial order/decision as vitiated by an error apparent.
- (viii) Mere discovery of a new or important matter or evidence is not sufficient ground for review. The party seeking review has also to show that such matter or evidence was not within its knowledge and even after the exercise of due diligence, the same could not be produced before the Court/Tribunal earlier.”

7. In the light of the above principles laid down by the Hon'ble Supreme Court, we find no reason to entertain a review of the orders passed in the afore-captioned O.As. Moreover, the Review Applications have been filed in a belated manner which is not permissible in the light of the Apex Court decision in *Gopabandhu Biswal v. Krishna Chandra Mohanty & Ors.* (1998) 4 SCC 447. In that case the Apex Court held :

“The power of review which is granted to an Administrative Tribunal is similar to power given to a civil court under Order 47, Rule 1 of the Code of Civil Procedure, 1908. Therefore, any person (inter alia) who considers himself aggrieved by a decree or order from which an appeal is allowed, but from which no appeal has been preferred can apply for review under Order 47, Rule 1(1) (a). An appeal lies to the Supreme Court from a decision of the Administrative Tribunal. If an appeal is preferred, the power to review cannot be exercised.....”

“In the present case, a special leave petition had been rejected. The order of the Tribunal therefore became final and binding. Rejection of SLP under Article 136, in effect, amounts to declining to entertain an appeal, thus making the judgment and order appealed against final and binding. Once SLP is filed and rejected, the party cannot go back to the Tribunal to apply for review.”

8. In the light of the afore-cited rulings of the Apex Court, we dismiss the R.A.No.180/00032/2017 in O.A.No.180/00282/2016 and M.A.No.180/00506/2017 (condone delay), R.A.No.180/00033/2017 in O.A.No.180/00961/2015 and M.A.No.180/00507/2017 (condone delay), R.A.No.180/00034/2017 in O.A.No.1195/2013 and M.A.No.180/00508/2017 (condone delay), R.A.No.180/00035/2017 in O.A.No.1219/2013 and M.A.No.180/00509/2017 (condone delay), R.A.No.180/00036/2017 in O.A.No.180/00020/2014 and M.A.No.180/00510/2017 (condone delay), R.A.No.180/00037/2017 in O.A.No.180/00881/2015 and M.A.No.180/00511/2017 (condone delay) & R.A.No.180/00038/2017 in O.A.No.180/00533/2015 and M.A.No.180/00515/2017 (condone delay). No costs.

(Dated this the 12<sup>th</sup> day of February 2018)

**(E.K.BHARAT BHUSHAN)**  
**ADMINISTRATIVE MEMBER**

**(U.SARATHCHANDRAN)**  
**JUDICIAL MEMBER**

**asp**

**List of Annexures in R.A.No.180/00032/2017 in O.A.No.180/00282/2016**

- 1. Annexure RA-1** – True copy of the order dated 13.3.2017 in O.A.No.282 of 2016 of this Hon'ble Tribunal.
- 2. Annexure RA-2** – True copy of the order dated 8.1.2015 in SLP No.7716 of 2013 of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India.
- 3. Annexure RA-3** – True copy of the order dated 10.1.2017 passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in SLP No.24303 of 2013 and connected matters.
- 4. Annexure RA-4** – True copy of the Office Memorandum dated 18.1.2007 issued by the BSNL Corporate Office.
- 5. Annexure RA-5** – True copy of the DoT No.40-12/2004/Pen(T)(Pt) dated 5.7.2017.
- 6. Annexure RA-6** – True copy of the stay order dated 23.8.2017 granted by the Hon'ble Central Administrative Tribunal, Jaipur Bench in O.A.No.291/435/2017.
- 7. Annexure RA-7** – True copy of the Modified Assured Career Progression Scheme (MACP).

**List of Annexures in R.A.No.180/00033/2017 in O.A.No.180/00961/2015**

- 1. Annexure RA-1** – True copy of the order dated 16.2.2017 in O.A.No.961 of 2015 of this Hon'ble Tribunal.
- 2. Annexure RA-2** – True copy of the order dated 8.1.2015 in SLP No.7716 of 2013 of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India.
- 3. Annexure RA-3** – True copy of the order dated 10.1.2017 passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in SLP No.24303 of 2013 and connected matters.
- 4. Annexure RA-4** – True copy of the Office Memorandum dated 18.1.2007 issued by the BSNL Corporate Office.
- 5. Annexure RA-5** – True copy of the DoT No.40-12/2004/Pen(T)(Pt) dated 5.7.2017.
- 6. Annexure RA-6** – True copy of the stay order dated 23.8.2017 granted by the Hon'ble Central Administrative Tribunal, Jaipur Bench in O.A.No.291/435/2017.
- 7. Annexure RA-7** – True copy of the Modified Assured Career Progression Scheme (MACP).

**List of Annexures in R.A.No.180/00034/2017 in O.A.No.1195/2013**

- 1. Annexure RA-1** – True copy of the order dated 16.2.2017 in O.A.No.1195 of 2013 of this Hon'ble Tribunal.
- 2. Annexure RA-2** – True copy of the order dated 8.1.2015 in SLP No.7716 of 2013 of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India.
- 3. Annexure RA-3** – True copy of the order dated 10.1.2017 passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in SLP No.24303 of 2013 and connected matters.
- 4. Annexure RA-4** – True copy of the Office Memorandum dated 18.1.2007 issued by the BSNL Corporate Office.
- 5. Annexure RA-5** – True copy of the DoT No.40-12/2004/Pen(T)(Pt) dated 5.7.2017.
- 6. Annexure RA-6** – True copy of the stay order dated 23.8.2017 granted by the Hon'ble Central Administrative Tribunal, Jaipur Bench in O.A.No.291/435/2017.
- 7. Annexure RA-7** – True copy of the Modified Assured Career Progression Scheme (MACP).

**List of Annexures in R.A.No.180/00035/2017 in O.A.No.1219/2013**

- 1. Annexure RA-1** – True copy of the order dated 16.2.2017 in O.A.No.1219 of 2013 of this Hon'ble Tribunal.
- 2. Annexure RA-2** – True copy of the order dated 8.1.2015 in SLP No.7716 of 2013 of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India.
- 3. Annexure RA-3** – True copy of the order dated 10.1.2017 passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in SLP No.24303 of 2013 and connected matters.
- 4. Annexure RA-4** – True copy of the Office Memorandum dated 18.1.2007 issued by the BSNL Corporate Office.
- 5. Annexure RA-5** – True copy of the DoT No.40-12/2004/Pen(T)(Pt) dated 5.7.2017.
- 6. Annexure RA-6** – True copy of the stay order dated 23.8.2017 granted by the Hon'ble Central Administrative Tribunal, Jaipur Bench in O.A.No.291/435/2017.
- 7. Annexure RA-7** – True copy of the Modified Assured Career Progression Scheme (MACP).

**List of Annexures in R.A.No.180/00036/2017 in O.A.No.180/00020/2014**

- 1. Annexure RA-1** – True copy of the order dated 16.2.2017 in O.A.No.20 of 2014 of this Hon'ble Tribunal.
- 2. Annexure RA-2** – True copy of the order dated 8.1.2015 in SLP No.7716 of 2013 of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India.
- 3. Annexure RA-3** – True copy of the order dated 10.1.2017 passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in SLP No.24303 of 2013 and connected matters.
- 4. Annexure RA-4** – True copy of the Office Memorandum dated 18.1.2007 issued by the BSNL Corporate Office.
- 5. Annexure RA-5** – True copy of the DoT No.40-12/2004/Pen(T)(Pt) dated 5.7.2017.
- 6. Annexure RA-6** – True copy of the stay order dated 23.8.2017 granted by the Hon'ble Central Administrative Tribunal, Jaipur Bench in O.A.No.291/435/2017.
- 7. Annexure RA-7** – True copy of the Modified Assured Career Progression Scheme (MACP).

**List of Annexures in R.A.No.180/00037/2017 in O.A.No.180/00881/2015**

- 1. Annexure RA-1** – True copy of the order dated 16.2.2017 in O.A.No.881 of 2015 of this Hon'ble Tribunal.
- 2. Annexure RA-2** – True copy of the order dated 8.1.2015 in SLP No.7716 of 2013 of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India.
- 3. Annexure RA-3** – True copy of the order dated 10.1.2017 passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in SLP No.24303 of 2013 and connected matters.
- 4. Annexure RA-4** – True copy of the Office Memorandum dated 18.1.2007 issued by the BSNL Corporate Office.
- 5. Annexure RA-5** – True copy of the DoT No.40-12/2004/Pen(T)(Pt) dated 5.7.2017.
- 6. Annexure RA-6** – True copy of the stay order dated 23.8.2017 granted by the Hon'ble Central Administrative Tribunal, Jaipur Bench in O.A.No.291/435/2017.
- 7. Annexure RA-7** – True copy of the Modified Assured Career Progression Scheme (MACP).

**List of Annexures in R.A.No.180/00038/2017 in O.A.No.180/00533/2015**

- 1. Annexure RA-1** – True copy of the order dated 16.2.2017 in O.A.No.533 of 2015 of this Hon'ble Tribunal.
  - 2. Annexure RA-2** – True copy of the order dated 8.1.2015 in SLP No.7716 of 2013 of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India.
  - 3. Annexure RA-3** – True copy of the order dated 10.1.2017 passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in SLP No.24303 of 2013 and connected matters.
  - 4. Annexure RA-4** – True copy of the Office Memorandum dated 18.1.2007 issued by the BSNL Corporate Office.
  - 5. Annexure RA-5** – True copy of the DoT No.40-12/2004/Pen(T)(Pt) dated 5.7.2017.
  - 6. Annexure RA-6** – True copy of the stay order dated 23.8.2017 granted by the Hon'ble Central Administrative Tribunal, Jaipur Bench in O.A.No.291/435/2017.
  - 7. Annexure RA-7** – True copy of the Modified Assured Career Progression Scheme (MACP).
-