

**Central Administrative Tribunal  
Ernakulam Bench**

**OA/180/00137/2016**

Monday this the 28<sup>th</sup> day of May, 2018

**CORAM**

**HON'BLE MR.E.K.BHARAT BHUSHAN, ADMINISTRATIVE MEMBER**

1. M.M.Aprem  
Group Head SIG (Retd),  
VSSC, ISRO P.O.  
Thiruvmmntimpurmn-695022.  
Residing at EVRA-C-10,  
Elipode, Thirumala P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram-695 006.
2. H.Surendra  
DGM.IED, AVN (Retd)  
VSSC, ISRO P.O.  
Thiruvmmntimpurmn-695022.  
Residing at T.C.9-1437(2)  
“Shruthi, Moolayil Lane  
Sasthamangalam, Thiruvananthapuram-695 010
3. K.Naveena Kumar  
Group Director (PPEG/MSA (Retd)  
VSSC, ISRO P.O.  
Thiruvananthapuram-695 022.  
Residing at T.C.12/660  
Kaveri, LVMRA-15A, Kunnukuzhi  
Vanchiyoor P.O., Thiruvananthapuram-695 035
4. S.Soorianarayanan  
Group Director QMPG/MVIT (Retd), VSSC  
Valaimala P.O.  
Thiruvananthapuram-695 547  
Residing at T.C.36/1569-32  
Flat No.DD7, Promag Pradakshina Apartments  
Kothalam Jn., Sreevaraham  
Thiruvananthapuram-695 003.
5. Chaman Lal Ojha  
Group Director PD/RSR (Retd),  
VSSC, ISRO P.O., Thiruvananthapuram-695 022.  
Residing at Devi Sadan, Plot 26, Tilak Nagar  
Nalanchira P.O., Thiruvananthapuram-695 015.

6. M.Harikumar  
Scientist/Engineer-G, NISD (Retd)  
VSSC, ISRO P.O., Thiruvananthapuram-695 022.  
Residing at T.C.16/1669, Aswini, JWRA-17  
DPI Junction, Jagathy, Thiruvananthapuram-695 014.
7. K.Rajendran  
Group Director, DPD, RLV-TD (Retd),  
VSSC, ISRO P.O., Thiruvananthapuram-695 022.  
Residing at T.C.02/1199 (CR-91), Kappat House  
P.O.Kazhakootam, Thiruvananthapuram-695 582.
8. M.Ravindranathan  
Scientist-Engineer-G (Retd)  
R&QA, IISU, VSSC, Vattiyoorakavu  
Thiruvananthapuram-695 013.  
Residing at 'BYUDAE', CHLRA D3  
T.C.4/165, Ambala Nagar Extn Colony  
Kowdiar P.O., Thiruvananthapuram-695 003.
9. R.Balakrishna Menon  
Scientist-Engineer-G (Retd)  
VSSC, ISRO P.O., Thiruvananthapuram-695 022.  
Residing at CSM Nagar-70, "VIPANCHIKA",  
Edappazhini, Sasthamangalam P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram-695 010.
10. U.Janardana Naik  
Scientist-Engineer-G (Retd)  
VSSC, ISRO P.O., Thiruvananthapuram-695 022.  
Residing at 74, Tagore Gardens,  
Medical College P.O., Thiruvananthapuram-695 011.
11. Dr.T.L.Varghese  
Scientist-Engineer-G (Retd)  
VSSC, ISRO P.O., Thiruvananthapuram-695 022.  
Residing at T.C.6/457  
Sreyas Thoppil, Swagath Nagar, Arapura Junction  
Vattiyoorakavu P.O., Thiruvananthapuram-695 013.
12. V.R.Ramakrishnan  
Scientist-Engineer-G (Retd)  
VSSC, ISRO P.O., Thiruvananthapuram-695 022.  
Residing at Maruthi, T.C. 36/864,  
ERA 32, Palkulangara P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram 695 008.

13. S.Ganapathi  
Scientist-Engineer-G (Retd)  
VSSC, ISRO P.O., Thiruvananthapuram-695 022.  
Residing at 39/1771(4), Second Street,  
Yamuna Nagar, Manacaud  
Thiruvananthapuram-695 009.
14. V.Vijayan Nair  
Scientist-Engineer-G (Retd)  
VSSC, ISRO P.O., Thiruvananthapuram-695 022.  
Residing at Vishal, T.C. 2/53  
Kakkanad Lane, Kesavadasapuram,  
Thiruvananthapuram-695 004.
15. Dr.V.V.Karunakaran  
Scientist-Engineer-G (Retd)  
VSSC, ISRO P.O., Thiruvananthapuram-695 022.  
Residing at House No.75, NCC Nagar  
Peroorkada, Thiruvananthapuram-695 005.
16. Dr.V.Indira  
Chief Medical Officer MO'G (Retd)  
VSSC, ISRO P.O., Thiruvananthapuram-695 022.  
Residing at T.C.27
17. R. Subramoniam,  
Deputy General Manager, Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at T.C.27/373,  
'ANUGRAHA', General Hospital Junction,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 035.
18. Dr. V.C. Joseph,  
Scientist G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at 'SAN JOSE',  
T.C. 9/903, PLRA-C-5, Panicker's Lane, Sasthamangalam P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 010.
19. K. Damodaran,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at Aswathi, Lotus Villa,  
Sasthamangalam P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 010.
20. R. Dorairaj,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at 4-B, May Flower,  
Ceebros Garden, 1/2, Vembuliamman Koil Street,  
Virugambakkam, Chennai – 600 092.
21. Dr. V.V. Karunakaran,

Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
 Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at House No. 75,  
 NCC Nagar, Peroorkada, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 005.

22. C. George Stephens,  
 Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), Civil Engineering Division,  
 SBSC, SHAR Centre, Nellore , Andhra Pradesh,  
 Residing at BILSHI, K-30, Kailas Nagar,  
 Kesavadasapuram, Pattom P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 004.

23. S. Prakash,  
 Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
 Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at House No. TRA 62,  
 T.C. 12/492, Prasoon, Thekkumood, Vanchiyoor P.O.,  
 Thiruvananthapuram – 695 035.

24. Lalitha Ramachandran,  
 Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), LPSC, Valiamala.,  
 Thiruvananthapuram – 695 547, Residing at J-18, Janvilla Lane,  
 Sasthamangalam P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 010.

25. J. Geetha,  
 Deputy Director (Retd.), Management Systems Area,  
 VSSC, ISRO P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022,  
 Residing at KEERTHI, A-87, Elankom Gardens,  
 Vellayambalam, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 010.

26. R. Ayyappadasan Pillai,  
 Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
 Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at T.C. 14/719,  
 RAKENDU,  
 Kumarapuram, Medical College P.O.,  
 Thiruvananthapuram – 695 011.

27. K. Rajagopal,  
 Head, RSTD (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
 Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022,  
 Residing at 6/752-1, SURAJ, Ananatha Nagar, Arappura Jn.,  
 Vattiyorkavu, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 013.

28. P. Thampi Paul,  
 Deputy Director I/C, R&QA (Retd.), IISU, Vattiyorkavu,  
 Thiruvananthapuram-695 013, Residing at ‘THEJUS’, T,C, 11/3302  
 Christ Nagar, Kowdiar P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 003.

29. Dr. Omana Mammen,  
 Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
 Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at MRA 30A,

Mannadi Lane, Ambalamukku, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 005.

30. George Abraham,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at MRA-30A,  
Mannadi Lane, Ambalamukku, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 005.
31. M.A. Joseph,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at SP III 632 (GRA.C-107), JYOTI THIS, G.P. Road, Kunnil Lane, Chavadi Mukku, Sreekaryam P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 017.
32. George Varghese,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), MEF, LPSC, Valiamala.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 547, Residing at Cordial Estates, 3C, Law College Junction, Vanchiyoor P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 035.
33. N. Raveendran Pillay,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at Sreereshmam, A22, Forest Office Lane, Vazhuthacaud, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 014.
34. Abraham Tharakan,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), CMS, VSSC, REPLACE AREA,  
Vattiyoorkavu, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 013,  
Residing at CRA-G-42, KALHARA,  
Charachira, , Thiruvananthapuram – 695 003.
35. Dr. George Joseph,  
Group Director, ADTD (Retd.), AERO, VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at Vallathu, T.C., 8/1719, BN-146, Durga Lane, Pongumoodu, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 011.
36. V. Krishna Swamy,  
Deputy General Manager (Retd.), Avionics, VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at T.C. 2/1838,  
Vbgra No.34, Veerabhadra Gardens Pattom P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 004.
37. S. Muthu Krishna Iyer,  
Deputy General Manager (AVN) (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at 50/1468(5), TARA 17, Vilayil Lane, Thaliyal, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 002.
38. V.P. Balagangadharan,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,

Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at ALAKA, T.C. 6/1100,  
Kanjirampara, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 030

39. R. Sivaramakrishnan,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), RPP, VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at ‘SIVAPRIYA’  
A, Adarsh Nagar, Pattom P.O , Thiruvananthapuram – 695 004.
40. N. Kannan,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), IISU, REPLACE Complex,  
Vattiyoorkavu, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 013,  
Residing at Plot No. 92 (82/409 H1), Mullai Nagar,  
Suramangalam, Salem, Tamilnadu – 636 005.
41. V. Devarajulu,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at JNRA-D15,  
Tower View Compound, Judge Road, Karamana,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 002.
42. P. Ravindran Nair,  
Scientist/Engineer H (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at Vaisakh, PLRA-194,  
Panachamoodu Lane, Pattom, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 004.
43. A. Narayanan Kutty,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at House No.107,  
JYOTSNA, Prasanth Nagar, Ulloor,  
Medical College P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 011
44. K. Palanivelu,  
Associate Project Director (Retd.), GSLV Project, VSSC, ISRO  
P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at Flat 3B,  
Skyline Melody Apartments, Vazhuthacaud,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 014.
45. N. Janardhanan,  
Group Director, Engineer G (Retd.), MID, LMIG, MVIT,  
Valiamala, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 547,  
Residing at VP 1/40, House No. 26, MANKUDIL,  
NPP Nagar, Lane No.1, Peroorkada, Thiruvananthapuram – 695  
005.
46. K. Sreekumar,  
Group Director (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at 6/281 (14), Krishna,  
Netaji Road, Vattiyoorkavu, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 013.

47. Kasagani Janardhana Rao,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at Flat No. 101,  
Door No. 1-2-25/25A, Sri Ranga Nilayam, Street No. 16,  
Gagan Mahal, Domalguda, Hyderabad – 500 029.

48. E.J. Francis,  
Scientist/Engineer G, Group Director (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at T.C. 6-584,  
Vilayil Road, PTP Nagar P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 038.

49. Dr. Malladi Satyanarayana,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at VARA-578,  
T.C. 6/759(1), Anantha Colony, Arappura, Vattiyoorkavu,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 013.

50. T.M. Ganesan,  
Scientist/Engineer G , General Manager (Retd.), LPSC,  
Valiamala, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 547, Residing at 4/869,  
Deepam, Parvathy Nagar, Kowdiar, Thiruvananthapuram – 695  
003.

51. K. Gopalakrishna Pillai,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, Valiamala Complex.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 547, Residing at W 40, Sujrabhi,  
Sastri Nagar West, Karamana P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695  
002.

52. K.P. Jacob,  
Scientist/Engineer G , Group Director,(Retd.), ISG, IISU,  
Vattiyoorkavu P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 013,  
Residing at SHARON, T.C. 7/1229, Santhi Nagar,  
Sreekariyam P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 017.

53. R. Radhakrishna Pillai,  
Group Director (Retd.), MVIT, VSSC, Valiamala,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 547, Residing at T.C. 16/85 (5),  
EVRA-299, Krishnavilasom Road, Jagathy,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 014.

54. R. Subramanian,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), TFG/IISU, VSSC, Vattiyoorkavu,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 013, Residing at T.C. 38/390,  
VYASA. 235, Valiachalai Street, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 036.

55. V.N. Rajan,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at T.C. No. 3/2403,

PKRA-70, Marappalam, Pattom, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 004.

56. Dr. Rm. Muthiah,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at Narayana Illam, D-46,  
Sree Devi Nagar, Karamana, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 002.
57. Dr. S. Annamala Pillai,  
Scientist/Engineer G, Deputy Director (STR) (Retd.), VSSC,  
ISRO P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at  
'SOVARNA'  
T.C. 39/1600, Kalyan Hospital Road, Manacaud P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 009.
58. Dr. K. Kanaka Raju,  
Head (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at T.C. No. 5/824(2),  
Panicker's Lane, Mannamoola, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 005.
59. Dr. T.S. Lakshmanan,  
Head (MCD) (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at A3, II Floor,  
Sree Padmam Residency, Ullattu Lane, Sree Varaham,  
Manacaud P.O. Thiruvananthapuram – 695 009.
60. M. Sivasubramonia Pillai,  
Group Head (EPG) (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at T.C. 8/1824,  
Swarnalaya, SKNRA-1, Sreekrishna Nagar,  
Thirumala, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 006.
61. S. Radhakrishnan,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), LPSC, Valiamala Complex, ISRO,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 547, Residing at T.C. 21/118,  
'USHUSS', Near KSEB Office (Old), Karamana,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 002.
62. T.J. Thomas,  
Scientist/Engineer G, Group Head (Retd.), VSSC, Valiamala,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 547, Residing at J53, Jyothi Nagar,  
Pattom P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 004.
63. N. Gopalakrishnan Unni,  
Scientist/Engineer G, Group Director (Retd.), LPSC,  
Valiamala P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 547,  
Residing at Pushpakam, PMRA C17, Near Madathil Temple,  
Pappanamcode P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 018.
64. M. Thanapalan,

Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, Vattiyoorkavu P.O.,  
 Thiruvananthapuram – 695 013, Residing at Mani Raj Bhavan,  
 T.C. 21/559, Karamana, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 002.

65. Anand Prakash,  
 Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), APD (Mission), PSLV Project,  
 Valiamala P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 547,  
 Residing at 61/3, Kallumoodu Gardens, Anayara P.O.,  
 Thiruvananthapuram – 695 029.

66. Dr. R. Ramaswamy,  
 Scientist/Engineer G, Head (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
 Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at ‘KARTHIK’,  
 No.5, Belhaven Gardens, Kowdiar, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 003.

67. Sundaresan Muthuswamy,  
 Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
 Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at Plot No. 38,  
 RAMANA,  
 V.K. Krishna Menon Nagar, Vallakadavu P.O.,  
 Thiruvananthapuram – 695 008.

68. A. Ramasubramanian,  
 General Manager (Retd.), MEF/LPSC, Valiamala,  
 Thiruvananthapuram – 695 547, Residing at 7/1223,  
 Koottam Vila Road, Vattiyoorkavu P.O.,  
 Thiruvananthapuram – 695 013.

69. K.N. Balasubramanian,  
 Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
 Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at Sapthagiri,  
 T.C. 55/703, Santosh Nagar, Pappanamcode P.O.,  
 Thiruvananthapuram – 695 018.

70. N. Govindarajulu,  
 Scientist/Enginner G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
 Thiruvananthapuram 695022,  
 Residing at Block: II, Flat: 17, Kendriya Vihar,  
 Miyapur, Hyderabad – 500 049.

71. Kethineni Singarao,  
 Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
 Thiruvananthapuram 695022,  
 Residing at Flat 15, Block 9, Kendriya Vihar,  
 Miyapur, Mayuri Nagar, Hyderaad – 500 049.

72. Dr. S. Pattabiraman,  
 Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
 Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at No.3

East Spur Tank Road, Chetpet, Chennai -600 031.

73. K. Jothivelu,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at Flat E H-68,  
4<sup>th</sup> Street, Anna Nagar East, Chennai – 600 102.
74. Virendra Kumar Goyal,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at 301,  
Divya Jyothi Earth, Kasavana Halli, Bangalore – 560 035.
75. K. Gandhiraj,  
Deputy General Manager (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at 15, Sakthi Nagar  
(Near Cheran Nagar), G.N. Mills P.O., Coimbatore – 641 029.
76. T.R. Balakrishnan,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at No.16/2 (old),  
39/2 (New), Soundrarajan Street, T. Nagar, Chennai – 600 017.
77. P. Radhakrishnan Nair,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at Ragam,  
T.C. 6/795, Arappuramukku, Vattiyoorkavu P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 013.
78. V. Saseendran,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at Deepam,  
T.C. 27/1674-1, Pattoor, Vanchiyoor P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram-695 035.
79. P.J. Abraham,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at KPRA-62,  
T.C. 3/2458, TKD Road, East Pattom,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 004.
80. J. Joseph,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at M47,  
Kelachamparampil, Maithri Nagar, Sreekariyam P.O.,  
Thiruvananthapuram – 695 017.
81. K. Gopinathan Nair,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O.,

Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at Kanchana, Panayil Lane, Kumarapuram, Medical College P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 011.

82. Ajay Kumar Gupta,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at 406, Prasanth Nagar, Ulloor, Medical College P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 011.

83. G. Muthuraman,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at 59-Benwells Park, Benwells Road, Cantonment, Trichy, Tamilnadu-620 001.

84. S. Murugesan,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at FFL2, Maharaaj Apartments, Plot No. 23, Vaidegi Road, Kottivakkam, Chennai – 600 041.

85. S.V. Subba Rao,  
Scientist/Engineer G (Retd.), VSSC, ISRO P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at K.P.9/648 (Plot No. 304), A.K.G. Nagar, Peroorkada, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 005.

86. C. Bhaskaran,  
Group Director (Retd.), SDEG, VSSC, ISRO P.O., Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022, Residing at Chundaran House, Ramatheru, Pallikkunnu P.O., Kannur – 670 004.

87. Shri Ram Tandan  
Group Director (Retd.) , AFDG,AERO,VSSC,ISRO P.O.,Thiruvananthapuram 695 022,  
Residing at MALLIKA-41, T.C. 11/1180, WATT'S Lane, Nanthancode, Thiruvananthapuram - 695 003.

**..Applicants**

(By Advocate Mr. Vishnu Chempazhanthiyil)  
Vs.

1. The Secretary & Chairman,  
Department of Space, Indian Space Research Organization, Antariksh Bhavan, New BEL Road, Bangalore – 560 094.
2. Union of India, represented by its Cabinet Secretary, Government of India, New Delhi – 110 001.
3. The Director, Vikram Sarabhai Space Centre,

Thumba, ISRO P.O, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 022.

4. The Director, Liquid Propulsion Systems Centre,  
Valiamala, Thiruvananthapuram – 695 547.

(By Advocate Mr. N. Anilkumar, Sr.PCGSC) ...Respondents

This OA having been heard on 16<sup>th</sup> May, 2018, the Tribunal delivered the following order on 28.05.2018.

### **ORDER**

MA/180/1084/2016 is filed by the 3<sup>rd</sup> respondent in the OA – Vikram Sarabhai Space Centre - praying for deleting the 2<sup>nd</sup> respondent from the party array. For the reason stated in the M.A, the MA is allowed and the 2<sup>nd</sup> respondent (Union of India represented by its Cabinet Secretary) is allowed to be deleted.

2. The applicants are retired Scientists/Engineers in Grade-G under the Department of Space (DoS for short). They are aggrieved by the inaction on the part of the DoS to rectify the anomaly which has resulted in pensioners of lower grade drawing higher pension than them. The reliefs sought in the OA are as follows:

*(i) Declare that the refusal on the part of the respondents to rectify the anomaly with regard to pensioners in Grade of Scientists/Engineers-G drawing lesser pension than Scientists/Engineers-SG, is illegal and arbitrary.*

*(ii) Direct the respondents to implement the Cabinet decision with regard to removal of anomaly of senior in Scientists/Engineers G Grade drawing less emoluments as compared to juniors in feeder grade of Scientists/Engineers SG and grant all consequential benefits to the applicants from the due date.*

*(iii) Direct the respondents to rectify the pay/pension anomaly by remedial steps of grant of two increments to Scientists/Engineers in G Grade w.e.f. 1.1.1996 with all consequential benefits to the applicants.*

*(iv) Call for the records leading to the issue of Clarification No.5 in*

*Annexure A5 and set aside Clarification No.5 in Annexure A5.*

3. The facts of the case are as below:

DOS sanctioned two additional increments to Scientists/Engineers in the Grade SD, SE, SF and SG with effect from 1.1.1996 with the stipulation that the additional increments shall not be considered as pay for benefits like DA, HRA, pension and pensionary benefits etc. A copy of the O.M. dated 3.2.1999 issued by the 2<sup>nd</sup> respondent is at Annexure A1. This O.M. excluded the next higher Grade of Scientists/Engineers-G from the grant of the two additional increments. This brought about a situation of Scientists-G Grade in the pay scale of 18400-22400 drawing less emoluments as compared to their juniors in the feeder Grade of SG who were on Rs.16400/-20000/-. The Council of Ministers at its meeting held in October, 2007 considered this issue and resolved to rectify this anomaly; it was decided that two additional increments will be granted to Scientists-G Grade at the time of promotion. However, it is stated in the OA that this decision was never implemented. The fact of this decision not being implemented was informed to the Scientists in question through the RTI route, a copy of the communication being marked as Annexure A2. The matter was taken up before the Hon'ble High Court of Kerala, in Writ Petition (C) No.29710/2004, which, in its order dated 18.1.2007, held as under:

*“Thus, the additional increments granted as per Exhibit P1 fall within the definition of pay. Necessarily, all attributes that may be added to emoluments reckoning pay shall have to be paid to them, whether it be DA, HRA. Equally so is the pension to the retired employees, because pension is also reckoned based on the pay drawn”.*

Thus, it came to be accepted that all subsequent benefits including pension

would take into account the additional increments sanctioned to various categories. This order was challenged before the Hon'ble Supreme Court but the same met with no success and the SLPs were dismissed by order dated 4.4.2011.

4. DOS, however, implemented the judgment at Annexure A3 only in respect of the applicants therein, and similarly placed employees and pensioners filed OAs in various forums in the country. This Tribunal allowed the OAs bearing number 632/2012, 790/2012, 791/2012, 792/2012 and 847/2012. It was made clear that all the applicants similarly placed are entitled to the benefits of judgment of the Hon'ble High Court of Kerala at Annexure A3. The appeal against this order was also dismissed.

5. In accordance with the above, DOS issued a clarificatory O.M. Dated 22.5.2014, copy of which is marked as Annexure A5. In the said O.M., under Query No.5, while referring to the disparity in pay, pension and pensionary benefits relating to Scientists/Engineers in the Grade of G & H, when compared to their junior Scientists/Engineers-SF/SG, the following answer was provided:

*“The disparity in total emoluments exists even otherwise now. The consequential impact cannot be rectified”.*

6. Thus, the admitted anomaly involves the disparity in pension between senior Scientists/Engineers Grade G and H when compared to junior Scientists/Engineers in Grade SF/SG. While admitting this, the respondent Department did not propose to do anything in the matter despite the fact that the anomaly persisted directly in conflict with the Cabinet decision of October 2007. Further, in a judgment of the Hon'ble High Court of Patna in

Civil Writ Jurisdiction Case No.10757/2010 (Annexure A6), it was ordered that the basic pay of the senior ought to be stepped up in such contingencies to avoid disparity and discrimination. A person in the higher grade cannot draw less remuneration or less pension than a person who was in the junior grade. The Court put it poignantly thus:

*“The principle of law, as decided by the Hon’ble Apex Court is plain and simple; that a senior officer cannot get pension less than his junior. If that be, the effect of pay fixation then the pension would have to be stepped up to avoid such hostile discrimination”.*

7. The applicants in the OA state that the anomaly referred to above is being continued with and DoS has ignored its obligation to implement the Cabinet decision.

8. As grounds, the applicants submit that the inaction on the part of the official respondents is unjust, illegal, arbitrary and violates Articles 14 & 16 of the Constitution of India. There is no justification whatsoever in continuing to deny the benefit of two additional increments to those who are promoted to Scientists-G Grade in the pay scale of 18400-22400 at the time of promotion. It is impermissible that a situation, where the official respondents openly admit that there exists an anomaly, should co-exist in a scenario where there is no remedy on offer.

9. Reply has been filed by the respondents. It goes on to mention that the Department of Space is an umbrella organization under which several units such as VSSC, LPSC, SDSC-SHAR are functioning. The Scientists who are employed in these units are rendering great service to the nation. It was on account of this fact that special incentives such as additional increments have been contemplated and granted to them from time to time.

The statement goes on to admit the sequence of events in the case narrated in the OA. It further submits that the applicants were excluded as having belonged to a category which was not eligible for grant of additional increments. Consequently their pension has also not been revised providing for the two additional increments which they never got. As per extant orders, on sanction of pension, no provision exists for stepping up of pension of seniors on par with juniors. In so far as the Cabinet decision is concerned, it is stated that the matter was taken up with the Ministry of Finance, Department of Expenditure and, that Department had examined the same giving the following advice:

*“Since the additional increments were not available to Scientists 'G' and 'H' there was a possibility in the drop of their emoluments at the time of their promotion to Scientists-G level. However, in order to protect any drop in emoluments at the time of their promotion from Scientists-F to Scientists-G level, Rs.2000/- special pay was granted to them. Therefore, even under the pre-revised dispensation, there was no justification for demanding two additional increments at the time of promotion to Scientists-G level, particularly when a special pay of Rs.2000/- p.m., had been granted for these levels precisely to protect any drop in emoluments. Also, since the span of the pre-revised scale of Rs.18400-22400 was merely 8 years, grant of additional increments at the time of promotion to this scale would have led to early stagnation. In view of the foregoing, neither in the pre-01.01.2006 dispensation, nor under the revised pay structure implemented after 6th CPC, there is any justification to grant two additional increments to Scientists on their promotion to Scientists -G level in DAE & DOS”.*

10. As DOS had taken up the issue with the Cabinet Secretariat and had further exerted themselves to pursue the decision taken by the Council of Ministers, they contend that they have no further role in the matter.

11. As annexures the following documents have been appended to the statement:

Annexure R1(a) proposal for removal of anomaly in the case of scientists/engineers-G&H - request for approval.

Annexure R1(b): Reference made by Cabinet Secretariat to Secretary, Expenditure.

Annexure R1(c): Communication of Department of Expenditure, Ministry of Finance, Implementation Cell giving their views on the issue;

Annexure R1(d): Internal notings of the Cabinet Secretariat:

Annexure R1(e): O.M. incentives for Scientists/Engineers in DOS/ISRO granted to scientists/engineers SB/SE/SF and SG.

12. A rejoinder was filed by the applicants emphatically stating that the special pay of Rs.2000 was not granted to Scientist/Engineers-G in the Department of Space, despite the proposal made as per Annexure R1(a). This is the root of the problem, according to the applicants.

13. In the additional reply statement filed on behalf of the respondents, the earlier contentions made in the reply statement are reiterated. Again it is admitted that the anomaly referred to in the OA is continuing to persist. Shri Vishnu S.chempazhanthiyil, learned counsel appeared on behalf of the applicants and Shri N.Anilkumar appeared on behalf of the respondents. They have been heard and all records perused.

14. The case involves disparity in pensions of a section of employees who retired as Scientist/Engineers-G grade from various institutions under the Department of Space. As an incentive for the meritorious service to the country at large, two increments were ordered to be given to various categories in the scientific establishments. However, these incentives stopped at the level of Grade-F, and Scientists/Engineers of Grade G&H were excluded. Subsequently, in compliance with various court orders on the subject, DOS had taken up the matter for rectification of the said anomaly. This was also necessitated on account of the Council of Ministers decision of

2007. From the documents and pleadings, this Tribunal sees that a certain amount of misunderstanding has occurred in the subsequent steps that were taken. The authorities were under the mistaken notion that a special pay of Rs.2000 was granted to G & H categories. this was not correct as the special pay had been allowed only for H category. Thus, while Scientists/Engineers belonging to H category were assuaged the grievance of G Grade personnel continued to fester.

15. It is a matter of concern that despite categoric orders of even the Hon'ble Apex Court on the inherent principle thereof, personnel who retired from a higher grade are being paid less pension than those who were their juniors and exited from a junior grade. The reply provided in the Office Memorandum at Annexure A5 that the disparity "exists even otherwise now. The consequent impact cannot be rectified", brings no credit to the respondent organization. This Tribunal concludes that the anomaly has to be urgently rectified. The prayer in the OA is allowed in full. All consequential benefits are to be allowed to the applicants and related orders passed within three months of the receipt of the order. No costs.

*(E.K.Bharat Bhushan)  
Administrative Member*

kspps

**List of Annexures of the Applicants**

**Annexure A-1**

- True copy of the Office Memorandum No. 2/10(8)/98-I dated 03.02.99 issued by the 2<sup>nd</sup> respondent.

**Annexure A-2**

- True copy of the information supplied under RTI Act.

**Annexure A-3**

- True copy of the judgment dated 18.01.2007 in W.P. (C) No. 31525/2004 of the Hon'ble High Court of

Kerala.

**Annexure A-4** - True copy of the judgment in O.A. No. 632/2012 of the Hon'ble Central Administrative Tribunal, Ernakulam Bench.

**Annexure A-5** - True copy of the O.M. No. A.II/10(8)/98-I(Vol. IV) dated 22.05.2014 issued by the 2<sup>nd</sup> respondent.

**Annexure A-6** - True copy of the judgment in Civil Writ Jurisdiction Case No. 10757/2010 of the Hon'ble High Court of Patna.

**List of Annexures of the Respondents**

**Annexure R1(a)** - True copy of the Communication dated 17.11.2007.

**Annexure R1(b)** - True copy of the Communication dated 24.06.2009.

**Annexure R1(c)** - True copy of the Communication dated 30.06.2009.

**Annexure R1(d)** - True copy of the Communication dated 08.07.2009.

**Annexure R1(e)** - A copy of the OM No. A2/10(8)/98-II (Vol III) dated 20.01.2014.

\*\*\*