

Central Administrative Tribunal Principal Bench, New Delhi

O.A. No.2673/2016
M.A.No.2410/2016

With
O.A.No.3104/2016
M.A.No.3795/2016
M.A.No.2744/2016

O.A.No.760/2016

O.A.No.1007/2016

O.A.No.3466/2016
M.A.No.243/2017

O.A.No.3402/2016
M.A.No.2982/2016
M.A.No.78/2017

Tuesday, this the 20th day of March 2018

Hon'ble Mr. Justice Permod Kohli, Chairman
Hon'ble Mr. K.N. Shrivastava, Member (A)

O.A.No.2673/2016

1. Mr. Puran Singh Rana
S/o Sh. Pratap Singh Rana
R/o H. No. 51,
Village – Mungeshpur, Delhi - 110039
M. No. 9910892820
Age = 34
Post = 112/12 (Natural Science - Male)
Roll No. = 48000222
2. Rekha Malik
D/o Sh. Jagdish Chander Malik
R/o RZ-224-E, X-Block,
Roshanpura Ext.,
Najafgarh, New Delhi -110043
Mob No. 8800240205
Age = 39
Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
Roll No. =53000395
3. Ms. Jyoti
D/o Sh. Ranbir Singh

R/o C-33, Block-C,
Old Roshanpura Ext.,
Near SBI Bank, Najafgarh,
New Delhi -110043
Mob.No. 8826956677
Age = 29
Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
Roll No. = 53000346

4. Ms. Mala Vatsa
D/o Sh. J. P. Vatsa
R/o H. No. 133, Extension-2,
Nangloi, New Delhi-110041
No. 8901219444, 9416527025
Age = 36
Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
Roll No. =53000580
5. Ms. Sulakshna
D/o Sh. R. K. Sharma
R/o D-287, Nawada Housing Complex,
Uttam Nagar, New Delhi-110059
M. No. 9654757475, 9711316869
Age = 39
Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
Roll No. =53000246
6. Mr. Pardeep Kumar Yadav
S/o Sh. Baljeet Yadav
R/o Vill- Kazipur,
PO- Ujwa, New Delhi-110073
M. No. 9718218150, 8376034042
Age = 32
Post = 112/12 (Natural Science- Male)
Roll No. =48000155
7. Ms. Anita Devi
D/o Sh. Jaibir
R/o H. No. E-3, Gali No.4, Patel Nagar,
Bahadur Garh -124507
M. No. 9812001866, 9671095900
Age = 30
Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
Roll No. =53000282
8. Ms. Chetna Vats
D/o Sh. Gyan Parkash Vats
R/o WZ-502A, Gali -17C,
Sadh Nagar, Plam Colony,
New Delhi-110045

M. No. 9910562450

Age = 29

Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)

Roll No. =53000301

9. Ms. Kaushlya Devi
D/o Sh. Hira Singh
R/o RZF-200, Gali-19,
Sadh Nagar, Plam Colony,
New Delhi-110045
No.9868737490
Age = 35
Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
Roll No. =53000345
10. Ms. Mamta Yadav
D/o Sh. Sube Singh
R/o RZD5/5, UGF,
Back side Vashisht Park,
Pankha Road, New Delhi - 110046
No. 9868737490
Age = 35
Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
Roll No. =53000485
11. Ms. Sonika Arya
D/o Sh. Ishwar Singh
R/o H. No. 70-71,
VPO-Karala, Pana-Daviwaada,
New Delhi-110086
Age = 32
Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
Roll No. =53000187
12. Ms. Sunita Rani
D/o Sh. Mahender Singh
R/o 5/501, Indira Colony, Sonapat-131001
M. No. 9416723800
Age = 39
Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
Roll No. =53000142
13. Mr. Madhukant Anand
S/o Sh. Jaswant Singh
R/o VPO-Razapur,
Ghaziabad, UP-201002
M. No.7844855808
Age = 32
Post = 112/12 (Natural Science- Male)
Roll No. =48000144

14. Ms. Shilpi Goyal
D/o Vinod Kumar
R/o Kh. No. 631/2, Gali No.2,
Nambardar Colony, Vill. Buraru-84
M. No.9013335165, 7836073625
Age = 35
Post =117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
Roll No. =53000467
15. Ms. Meena Devi
D/o Sh. Ram Chander
R/o H. No. 2640, Sector 23,
Sonepat, Haryana-131001
M. No.8222811467
Age = 35
Post =117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
Roll No. =53000014
16. Ms. Rajni Devi
D/o Sh. Raghbir Singh
R/o 868, Sector – 23,
Sonepat, Haryana-131001
M. No.8199057029
Age = 33
Post =117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
Roll No. =53000614
17. Ms. Santosh Rani
W/o Sh. Lekh Raj
R/o D-67, floor-2,
West Vinod Nagar, Gali-4,
Opp. Saraswati Kunj,
Delhi - 110092
M. No.9868414158, 9818530187
Age = 36
Post =117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
Roll No. =53000125
18. Ms. Lalita
W/o Sh. Brijesh Pal
R/o C2, Old Govindpura,
Parwana Road, Delhi-110051
M. No.9868950671
Age = 40
Post =117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
Roll No. =53000523
19. Ms. Kavita Joshi
D/o Sh. Narayan Dutt Joshi
R/o E1/10/8, Sector-15,

Rohini, Delhi-89
 M. No.9911989206
 Age = 42
 Post =117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
 Roll No. =53000539

20. Mr. Badre Alam
 S/o Sh. Mahboob Ali
 R/o VPO- Mubarakpur Pikar,
 Ambedkar Nagar, UP-224176
 M. No.8545915412, 9455352335
 Age = 29
 Post = 116/12 (Sanskrit - Male)
 Roll No. =52000507
21. Mr. Manoj Baranwal
 S/o Sh. Dinanath Baranwal
 R/o Vill. – Gaura, PO- Koilsa,
 Distt. – Azamgarh, UP-276142
 M. No.9415153947, 8545828354
 Age = 28
 Post = 116/12 (Sanskrit - Male)
 Roll No. = 52000766
22. Ms. Aparna
 D/o Sh. Anul Chandra Dass
 R/o Arya Samaj Mandir,
 B-Block, Saraswati Vihar,
 Delhi-34
 M. No.8826229560, 9818396225
 Age = 33
 Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit - Female)
 Roll No. =53000410
23. Ms. Swati
 D/o Sh. Dharampal
 R/o GH-8/216,
 Paschim Vihar, Delhi-87
 M. No.9717570542,9910654104
 Age = 29
 Post =111/12 (Maths – Female)
 Roll No. =47000041
24. Mr. Ajay Kumar Tiwari
 S/o Sh. Deonarayan Tiwari
 R/o Vill- Maldepur, PO-Mittoopur,
 Ghaziabad, UP-276143
 M. No.9415273778, 8115166240
 Age = 35

Post =116/12 (Sanskrit - Male)
Roll No. =52000785

25. Ms. Sonam Jain
D/o Sh. Rata Kumar Jain
R/o C-106, 3rd Floor,
Ganesh Nagar, New Delhi
M. No. 9910462317, 9654735801
Age = 26
Post =117/12 (Sanskrit - female)
Roll No. =53000205
26. Ms. Seema Devi
W/o Sh. Shilendra Kumar Singh
R/o H. No. 376, Gali -5,
Bhagat Vihar, Karawal Nagar,
Delhi-94
M. No. 9711618264
Age = 39
Post =117/12 (Sanskrit - female)
Roll No. =53000116
27. Mr. Birda Ram Kharetia
S/o Sh. Hari Ram Kharetia
R/o VPO. – Hingonia Via Jobner,
Teh.- Phulera, Jaipur,
Rajasthan-303328
M. No.9785189439, 9929037607
Age = 30
Post =116/12 (Sanskrit - Male)
Roll No. =52000215
28. Ms. Leena
Sh. Madan Lal
R/o Flat No.726, Sector-13,
Pocket-B, Metro View Appt.
Dwarka, New Delhi
M. No.9350099570, 9313701877
Age = 39
Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit - Female)
Roll No. =53000347
29. Ms. Rekha Devi
D/o Sh. Ramesh Chand
R/o H. No. 1/4222,
Ram Nagar, Ext. Nala Road,
Shahdra, Delhi-32
M. No. 9871767973
Age = 39

Post =117/12 (Sanskrit - Female)
Roll No. =53000402

30. Mr. Rajendra Kumar Sharma
S/o Sh. Muralidhar Sharma
R/o 78-C, Vikas Puri Ext.,
Pocket-A, Vikaspuri,
New Delhi-18
M. No. 9868476667
Age = 32
Post =116/12 (Sanskrit - Male)
Roll No. =52000343
31. Ms. Swati
D/o Late Radhe Shyam
R/o K-2, Tarachand Colony,
Mahipalpur, New Delhi-37
M. No.9910654104
Age = 26
Post =117/12 (Sanskrit - Female)
Roll No. =53000155
32. Mr. Ram Singh Saini
S/o Sh. Bodu Ram Singh
R/o Saini Medical, Amarsar,
Teh- Shahpura, Jaipur,
Rajasthan-303601
M. No.9414989866, 9694032372
Age = 34
Post = 116/12 (Sanskrit - Male)
Roll No. = 52000752
33. Mr. Anil Kumar
S/o Sh. Subhash Chandar
R/o Vill.- Bharolawali,
PO- Hanspur, Disst. Fatehabad,
Haryana-125051
M. No.9466750630
Age = 27
Post =116/12 (Sanskrit - Male)
Roll No. =52000189
34. Mr. Harish Chandra Kukreti
S/o Sh. Devananda kukreti
R/o Room No. 201,
Mahanadi Hostel, JNU,
Delhi-67
M. No.9013702287
Age = 30

Post = 116/12 (Sanskrit - Male)
Roll No. = 52000777

35. Ms. Kavita Sharma
D/o Late Sh. Dharamvir Sharma
R/o 1456A, Gali-13,
Govind Puri Kalkaji, Delhi-19
M. No.8882641898
Age = 30
Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit - Female)
Roll No. = 53000598

36. Mr. Ved Mitra Arya
S/o Sh. Anil Chandra Arya
R/o D-100, Ashok Vihar,
Phase-1, Delhi-52
M. No.9868607423
Age = 32
Post = 116/12 (Sanskrit - Male)
Roll No. = 52000136

37. Mr. Mohan Lal Yogi
S/o Sh. Ramakant Yogi
R/o VPO, Hasampur,
Teh-Neem Ka Thana,
Sikar, Rajasthan
M. No.8385065244
Age = 30
Post = 116/12 (Sanskrit - Male)
Roll No. = 52000705

38. Mr. Sunil Kumar
S/o Sh. Maharam Singh
R/o Vill-Sharifabad Rajpur,
Post- Farrukh Nagar,
Thana Loni, Ghaziabad,
UP-201006
M. No.9953440397
Age = 36
Post = 110/12 (Maths – Male)
Roll No. = 46000184

39. Mr. Trilok Chand Sharma
S/o Sh. Yogesh Chand Sharma
R/o 245, Shanti Kunjm Alwar, Rajasthan
M. No.9461194743
Age = 33
Post = 116/12 (Sanskrit - Male)
Roll No. = 52000589

40. Mr. Randheer Singh
S/o Sh. Baldev Singh Yadav
R/o Vill. – Majri Khurd, Teh. – Neemarana,
Alwar, Rajasthan-301703
M. No.8058660427
Age = 33
Post = 116/12 (Sanskrit - Male)
Roll No. =5200061
41. Mr. Shrawan Kumar
S/o Sh. Mahipal Singh
R/o Vill- Daurala, PO Rawta,
New Delhi-110073
M. No.9873282598
Age = 34
Post =106/12 (English - Male)
Roll No. = 42000331
42. Mr. Mahendra Kulhari
S/o Sh. Kurda Ram
R/o VPO- Bajisar,
Via- Mandawa, Distt.- Jhunjhunu,
Rajasthan-333704
M. No.8104268390
Age = 35
Post = 116/12 (Sanskrit - Male)
Roll No. = 52000024
43. Mr. Baljeet
S/o Sh. Ram Kala
R/o VPO Dumerkha Kalan,
Tehshil- Narwana,
District- Jind,
Haryana-126116
M. No.9555201438, 9812106609
Age = 29
Post = 116/12 (Sanskrit - Male)
Roll No. = 53000266
44. Mr. Vikash Sharma
S/o Sh. Raghbir Singh
R/o VPO- Puthi, Teh.-Gohana,
Sonapat, Haryana
M. No. 9813751257
Age = 29
Post = 116/12 (Sanskrit - Male)
Roll No. = 52000812
45. Mr. Purushottam Sharma
S/o Sh. Hari Bhagat

R/o 868, A/12, Azad Nagar,
 Thanesar, Kurukshetra
 M. No. 9468013231
 Age = 30
 Post = 116/12 (Sanskrit - Male)
 Roll No. = 52000405

46. Mr. Som Dutt
 S/o Sh. Harmesh Kumar
 R/o 868, A/12, Azad Nagar,
 Thanesar, Kurukshetra
 M. No. 9996152283
 Age = 30
 Post = 116/12 (Sanskrit - Male)
 Roll No. =
47. Ms. Geeta
 D/o Sh. Gobind Ram
 R/o H. No. 5741, Gali No. 81,
 Regarpura, Karol Bagh,
 New Delhi-110005
 M. No. 8744951212
 Age = 32
 Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit - Female)
 Roll No. = 53000562
48. Ms. Vinita Kumari Sharma
 D/o Ashok Kumar Sharma
 R/o Vill-Papri, Post Sothana,
 Tehsil-Virat Nagar,
 Dist-Jaipur-303102
 Rajasthan
 M. No. 9958393021
 Age = 29
 Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit - Female)
 Roll No. = 53000008
49. Mr. Ram Parkash
 Sh. Baruram
 VPO Tohana Khera,
 Teh. Narwanaajind,
 Haryana-126116
 M. No. 8950201341
 Age = 30
 Post = 116/12 (Sanskrit - Male)
 Roll No. = 52000008
50. Ms. Suneeta Kumari
 D/o Sh. Hira Lal
 R/o B-276, Mangla Puri,

Phase-II Palam,
New Delhi-110045
M. No. 9990493847
Age = 30
Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit - Female)
Roll No. = 53000002

51. Ms. Krishna
D/o Sh. Lekhraj
R/o H. No. 164, Gali No.6
Than Singh Nagar,
Anand Parvat, New Delhi
M. No. 9891666392
Age = 34
Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit - Female)
Roll No. = 53000487
52. Ms. Arti Gosa
D/o Sh. Swami Nath Gosa
R/o B-531, Hastsal Colony,
Uttam Nagar, New Delhi-110059
M. No. 9958483174
Age = 38
Post = 111/12 (Maths – Female)
Roll No. = 47100704
53. Ms. Loveleena
D/o Sh. Santosh Dass
R/o B-1377, Shastri Nagar,
Delhi-110052
M. No. 9868265654
Age = 30
Post = 111/12 (Maths – Female)
Roll No. = 47000382
54. Mr. Yogesh Kumar
S/o Sh. Trilok Chand
R/o C-157, Avantika Sector-1,
Rohini, Delhi-110085
M. No. 9650727376
Age = 33
Post = 116/12 (Sanskrit – Male)
Roll No. = 52000677
55. Mr. Deependra Joshi
S/o Sh. Anil Kumar Joshi
R/o VPO-Thoi, Teh. Sri Madhopur,
Dist. Sikar, Rajasthan-332719
M. No. 9772724326
Age = 27

Post =116/12 (Sanskrit – Male)
Roll No. = 52000574

56. Mr. Shiv Kant Sharma
S/o Sh. Keshav Sharma
R/o Katepura Post. Dopura,
Th-Basari, Distt. Dholpur,
Rajasthan-328022
Age = 25
Post = 116/12 (Sanskrit – Male)
Roll No. = 52000714
57. Ms. Renu Dubey
D/o Sh. Radhe Shyam Dubey
R/o C-3, 2nd Floor,
Vijay Vihar, Phase-II,
Rohini, Delhi-110085
M. No. 9999945379
Age = 34
Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
Roll No. = 53000033
58. Ms. Archana
D/o Sh. Babu Ram
R/o C-13/418, Laxmi Vihar
Burari Delhi-110084
M. No. 9818344824, 9971386942
Age = 39
Post = 113/12 (Natural Science – Female)
Roll No. = 49000728
59. Ms. Vineeta Sharma
D/o Sh. Munni Lal Sharma
R/o K-123, Phase-I,
Vijay Vihar, Rohini,
Delhi-110085
Age = 36
Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
Roll No. = 53000283
60. Ms. Poonam Mishra
D/o Sh. Mahesh Chand Mishra
R/o N-228, Raghubir Nagar,
New Delhi-110027
Age = 27
Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
Roll No. =53000531
61. Ms. Sharmila Kumari
W/o Sh. Ashadeep

R/o Vill- Bhitera,
 Post-Rewali,
 Teh.- Behror,
 Distt- Alwar (Rajasthan)
 Age = 26
 Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
 Roll No. =53000564

62. Ms. Sanjogata
 D/o Sh. Amilal
 R/o Vill- Maharajawas,
 PO-Rewali, Teh.- Behror
 Alwar (Rajasthan)
 Age = 28
 Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
 Roll No. =53000400

63. Mr. Shakir Ali Khan
 S/o Mohd. Yousuf
 R/o C-12/456, Yamuna Vihar,
 Delhi-110053
 Age = 36
 Post = 110/12 (Maths – Male)
 Roll No. = 46000128

64. Mr. Joginder Singh
 S/o Sh. Tara Chand
 R/o VPO. Machhrouli
 Teh. Samalkha Dist. Panipat,
 Haryana
 Age = 35
 Post = 116/12 (Sanskrit – Male)
 Roll No. = 52000865

65. Mr. Shiv Narayan
 S/o Sh. Madan Lal
 R/o Village- Jodhras, Post- Kaliyas
 Teh- Asind Dist. Bhilwara
 Rajasthan, Pin-311021
 Age = 27
 Post = 116/12 (Sanskrit – Male)
 Roll No. = 52000598

66. Mr. Pradeep Kumar
 S/o Sh. Fateh Chand Sharma
 R/o J-5, Dakshin Puri,
 Dr. Ambedkar Nagar,
 Sector-5, New Delhi
 Age =

Post =116/12 (Sanskrit – Male)
Roll No. = 52000746

67. Mr. Zainul Abedin
S/o Sh. Tajuddin
R/o 68, New Tara Puri Gali
Aara Machine Wali
Lisari Road, Meerut,
M. No. 9634221413
Age = 32
Post = 110/12 (Maths – Male)
Roll No. = 46000013
68. Ms. Sharda
D/o Sh. Satwant
C/o Virender Kumar
151, Veena Enclave Extn., Nangloi,
Delhi - 110041
Age = 32
Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
Roll No. = 53000460
69. Ms. Laxmi
D/o Shri Mahavir Prasda Gaur
R/o Lakshmi Mill, Nayi Basti,
Near Nagla Darbar, Police Station: Post Gonda,
District – Aligarh, UP
Mob No. 950938241
Age = 29
Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
Roll No. = 53000068
70. Mr. Bharat Kumar Derasari
S/o Sh. Sumer Mal G Derasari
Near Meena Well,
Sardarshahar, Dist Churu,
Rajasthan
M. No. 9461328642, 9636838480
Age = 33
Post = 116/12 (Sanskrit – Male)
Roll No. =52000146
71. Ms. Seema
D/o Sh. Shanker Lal
R/o D-I 43, Dr. Amedkar Nagar, Sec – 4,
New Delhi - 110062
Mob No. 9648326677
Age = 34
Post = 113/12 (Natural Science Female)
Roll No. = 49000107

72. Ms. Chander Kiran Mudgal
D/o Sh. Satish Chandra Mudgal
R/o c/o Rajiv Sharma,
72/5, St. No.-3, East Moti Bagh,
Sarai Rohilla, Delhi-110007
Mobile No. 9868980769, 8750935437
Age = 34
Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
Roll No. = 53000381
73. Ms. Mausam Bai Meena
D/o Sh. Ram Singh Meena
R/o Gaon Nagal Meena
Hindan Nagala Meena Karauli
Rajasthan-322230
M. No. 9875285520
Age = 27
Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
Roll No. = 53000312
74. Ms. Anjana Sharma
D/o Sh. Trilok Chand
R/o B-100, Pratap Garden Uttam Nagar,
New Delhi-110059
M. No. 9350477331, 9971851819
Age = 34
Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
Roll No. = 53000569
75. Ms. Ritu Khatri
D/o Sh. Tejbhan
R/o 280-B, Setia Colony,
Sri Ganganagar (Rajasthan)-335001
M. No. 9024736012, 9024225894, 9214043700
Age = 31
Post = 117/12 (Sanskrit – Female)
Roll No. = 53000566
76. Mr. Jayaprakash Dhawan
S/o Sh. Gangasahay
R/o Narayanpura, Kolana,
Dausa, Rajasthan-303313
M. No. 9694018724, 9694577658, 9414308852
Age = 32
Post = 116/12 (Sanskrit – Male)
Roll No. = 52000639

..Applicants

(Mr. Ashok Aggarwal, Mr. Anuj Aggarwal and Mr. Tenzing Thinlay Lepcha,
Advocates)

Versus

1. Govt. of NCT of Delhi
Through its Chief Secretary
Delhi Secretariat
IP Estate, New Delhi – 110 002
2. Delhi Subordinate Services Selection Board
(DSSSB)
Through its Chairman
Govt. of NCT of Delhi
FC-18, Institutional Area
Karkardooma, Delhi – 110 092
3. Union of India
Through its Secretary
Ministry of Human Resource & Development
Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi – 110 001
4. Director of Education
Directorate of Education
Govt. of NCT of Delhi
Old Secretariat Building
Civil Lines, Delhi – 110 054
5. National Council for Teacher Education
(NCTE)
Through its Secretary
Hans Bhawan, Wing II
1, Bahadur Shah Zafar Marg
New Delhi – 110 002

..Respondents

(Mrs. Sumedha Sharma, Advocate for respondent No. 1 & 2,
Mr. Raghuvendra Pandey and Mr. Ishan Prakash, Advocates for
respondent Nos. 3 & 4 -
Mr. Shaikh Abdus Sattar, Advocate for respondent No.5)

O.A.No.3104/2016

1. Mamta Gupta
d/o Sh. Deen Dayal Gupta
r/o H.No.51
197, Akashdarshan Aptt.
Mayur Vihar, Phase-I, Delhi-91
Age 39
Post : 15/13 (Sanskrit-Female)
Roll No.53100133
2. Reena Bai Meena
d/o Sh. Phoolya Ram Meenu

- r/o F-66A, Gali No.9
F Block, Vikas Nagar
Uttam Nagar, New Delhi – 110 059
Age 28
Post : 15/13 (Sanskrit-Female)
Roll No.53100158
3. Nisha Rani d/o Sh. Rohtash Singh
r/o H.No.1487, VPO Karala
New Delhi – 110 081
Age 26
Post : 15/13 (Sanskrit-Female)
Roll No.53100070
4. Subhash Chand Gurjar
s/o Sh. Dataram Gurjar
r/o VIII, Kakarana Chota – Post Sothana
Teh. Virat Nagar, Dist. Jaipur
(Raj) Pin 303102
Age 27
Post : 14/13 (Sanskrit-Male)
Roll No.52100212
5. Arti Gosa d/o late Shri Swami Nath Gosa
r/o B-531 JJ Colony Hastal Road
Uttam Nagar, Delhi – 110 059
Age 38
Post : 9/13 (Maths-Male)
Roll No.47100104
6. Seema Verma d/o Sh. Shankar Lal
r/o D-I-43, Dr. Ambedkar Nagar
Sector 4, New Delhi – 110 062
Age 38
Post : 11/13 (Natural Science – Female)
Roll No.49000107
7. Naveen Kumar s/o Sh. Satyender
r/o Village Chandpura, Tehsil Ateli
Distt. Mohindergarh
Haryana – 123021
Age 27
Post 8/13 (Maths-Male)
Roll No.46100213
8. Manish Kumar s/o Sh. Samunder Singh
r/o VPO Khanda, Tehsil Kharkhoda
Distt. Sonapat, Haryana 131402
Age 27

Post : 8/13 (Maths-Male)
Roll No.46000335

9. Mr. Puram Singh Rana
s/o Sh. Pratap Singh Rana
r/o H.No.51
Village – Mungeshpur, Delhi – 110 039
Age 34
Post : 10/13 (Natural Science-Male)
Roll No.48000222

10. Richa Rani
d/o Sudhir Kumar
r/o D-127, Avantika Rohini Sec 1
Delhi – 110 085
Age 29
Post : 9/13 (Maths-Female)
Roll No.47000694

11. Zainul Abedin s/o Tajuddin
r/o 68 New Tarapuri
Lisari Road Meerut
UP
Age 32
Post : 8/13 (Maths-Male)
Roll No.46000013

12. Sunita Devi d/o Sh. Anil Kumar
r/o C-17, Pachiya, Mohalla
Chawala Village
New Delhi – 110 071
Age 44
Post : 7/13 (Hindi-Female)
Roll No.45100361 & 45001092

13. Raj Kumar Verma
s/o Sh. Karan Verma
r/o VPO Lohasana Bara
Distt. Churu, Rajasthan
Age 40
Post : 12/13 (Social Science Male)
Roll No.54000327

..Applicants

(Mr. Ashok Aggarwal, Mr. Anuj Aggarwal and Mr. Tenzing Thinlay Lepcha,
Advocates)

Versus

1. Govt. of NCT of Delhi
Through its Chief Secretary

Delhi Secretariat
IP Estate, New Delhi – 110 002

2. Delhi Subordinate Services Selection Board
(DSSSB)
Through its Chairman
Govt. of NCT of Delhi
FC-18, Institutional Area
Karkardooma, Delhi – 110 092
3. Union of India
Through its Secretary
Ministry of Human Resource & Development
Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi – 110 001
4. Director of Education
Directorate of Education
Govt. of NCT of Delhi
Old Secretariat Building
Civil Lines, Delhi – 110 054
5. National Council for Teacher Education
(NCTE)
Through its Secretary
Hans Bhawan, Wing II
1, Bahadur Shah Zafar Marg
New Delhi – 110 002

..Respondents

(Mrs. Sangita Rai, Advocate for respondent No. 1 & 2 –
Nemo for other respondents)

O.A.No.760/2016

Shri Hemant Kumar, aged 26 years
s/o Shri Amar Singh
r/o 1/2203, East Ram Nagar
Mandoli Road, Shahdara
Delhi – 110 032

..Applicant

(Mr. Ashok Aggarwal, Mr. Anuj Aggarwal and Mr. Tenzing Thinlay Lepcha,
Advocates)

Versus

1. Govt. of NCT of Delhi
Through its Chief Secretary
Delhi Secretariat
IP Estate, New Delhi – 110 002

2. Union of India
Through its Secretary
Ministry of Human Resource & Development
Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi – 110 001
3. Delhi Subordinate Services Selection Board (DSSSB)
Through its Chairman
Govt. of NCT of Delhi
FC-18, Institutional Area
Karkardooma, Delhi – 110 092
4. North Delhi Municipal Corporation (NDMC)
Through its Commissioner (North)
Dr. S P M Civil Centre
J L Nehru Marg
New Delhi – 110 002
5. South Delhi Municipal Corporation (SDMC)
Through its Commissioner (South)
23rd Floor, Civic Centre
Minto Road, New Delhi – 110 002
6. East Delhi Municipal Corporation (EDMC)
Through its Commissioner (East)
419, Udyog Sadan, Patparganj Industrial Area
New Delhi – 110 096

..Respondents

(Mr. R N Singh, Mr. Satyendra Kumar, Mr. K M Singh, Mr. Satyendra Kumar, Mr. R K Jain, Mrs. Sangita Rai, Mr. Bal Kishan, Advocates)

O.A.No.1007/2016

Smt. Shashi Verma
w/o Shri Anand Kumar Verma (Roll No.17001355)
aged 41 years
r/o RZ 1117/1, Sadh Nagar Street No.11
Palam Colony, New Delhi – 110 054

..Applicant

(Mr. Ashok Aggarwal, Mr. Anuj Aggarwal and Mr. Tenzing Thinlay Lepcha, Advocates)

Versus

1. Govt. of NCT of Delhi
Through its Chief Secretary
Delhi Secretariat
IP Estate, New Delhi – 110 002

2. Union of India
Through its Secretary
Ministry of Human Resource & Development
Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi – 110 001
3. Delhi Subordinate Services Selection Board
(DSSSB)
Through its Chairman
Govt. of NCT of Delhi
FC-18, Institutional Area
Karkardooma, Delhi – 110 092

..Respondents

(Mr. Y P Singh, Advocate for respondent No.2 – *Nemo* for others)

O.A.No.3466/2016

1. Preeti d/o Late Ran Singh
r/o H.No.740, Gali No.11
Near Masjid Khadar Haider Pur
Shalimar Bagh, Delhi – 110 088
Age 25
Roll No.45100488
Post Code 07/13
2. Suchitra Kumari
d/o Sh. Suresh Kumar
r/o J-46 CHanakya Palace P-J
Uttam Nagar, New Delhi – 110 059
Age 36 years
Roll No.53000492
Post Code 117/12

..Applicants

(Mr. Ashok Aggarwal, Mr. Anuj Aggarwal and Mr. Tenzing Thinlay Lepcha, Advocates)

Versus

1. Govt. of NCT of Delhi
Through its Chief Secretary
Delhi Secretariat
IP Estate, New Delhi – 110 002
2. Delhi Subordinate Services Selection Board
(DSSSB)
Through its Chairman
Govt. of NCT of Delhi
FC-18, Institutional Area
Karkardooma, Delhi – 110 092

3. Union of India
Through its Secretary
Ministry of Human Resource & Development
Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi – 110 001
4. Director of Education
Directorate of Education
Govt. of NCT of Delhi
Old Secretariat Building
Civil Lines, Delhi – 110 054
5. National Council for Teacher Education
(NCTE)
Through its Secretary
Hans Bhawan, Wing II
1, Bahadur Shah Zafar Marg
New Delhi – 110 002

..Respondents

(Mrs. Sangita Rai, Mr. Raghuendra Pandey and Mr. Ishan Prakash,
Advocates)

O.A.No.3402/2016

1. Pradeep Kumar Mordiya
s/o sh. Ram Lal Mordiya
r/o Vill. Chitwari Dist. Jaipur
Rajasthan-303805
Age 34
Post Code 116/12 (SKT.)
Roll No.52000350
2. Ganesh Narayan Balai
s/o Sh. Shiv Ram Bunkar
r/o V/P Tuntoly, Teh. Chaksu
Distt. Jaipur, Rajasthan 303903
Age 29
Post Code 116/12 (SKT)
Roll No.52000058
3. Dinesh Kumar Balai
s/o Sh. Shiv Ram Balai
r/o V/P Tuntoly, Teh. Chaksu
Distt. Jaipur, Rajasthan 303903
Age 28
Post Code 116/12 (SKT)
Roll No.52000082
4. Jyoti d/o Sh. Om Prakash
r/o 262, Koko Bagri
Vill Karala, Delhi

Age 31
Post Code 117/12/ (SKT)
Roll No.53000270

5. Suman Kumar Jakhad
d/o Sh. Bhanwar Lal Jakhar
r/o G-71/3A (UGF), Block G
Dilshad Garden, Delhi – 110 095
Age 30
Post Code 117/12 (SKT)
Roll No.53000189

..Applicants

(Mr. Ashok Aggarwal, Mr. Anuj Aggarwal and Mr. Tenzing Thinlay Lepcha,
Advocates)

Versus

1. Govt. of NCT of Delhi
Through its Chief Secretary
Delhi Secretariat
IP Estate, New Delhi – 110 002
2. Delhi Subordinate Services Selection Board
(DSSSB)
Through its Chairman
Govt. of NCT of Delhi
FC-18, Institutional Area
Karkardooma, Delhi – 110 092
3. Union of India
Through its Secretary
Ministry of Human Resource & Development
Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi – 110 001
4. Director of Education
Directorate of Education
Govt. of NCT of Delhi
Old Secretariat Building
Civil Lines, Delhi – 110 054
5. National Council for Teacher Education
(NCTE)
Through its Secretary
Hans Bhawan, Wing II
1, Bahadur Shah Zafar Marg
New Delhi – 110 002

..Respondents

(Mrs. Sangita Rai, Mr. Raghuvendra Pandey and Mr. Ishan Prakash,
Advocates)

O R D E R (ORAL)

Mr. K. N. Shrivastava:

Since common issues of facts and laws are involved, it is decided to dispose of these O.As. by this common order.

2. M.A. No.2410/2016 in O.A. No.2673/2016, M.A. No.2744/2016 in O.A. No.3104/2016 and M.A. No.2982/2016 in O.A. No.3402/2016 seeking joining together are allowed.

3. The applicants in all these O.As. had participated in the selection process for the posts of Trained Graduate Teacher (TGT) in various streams / Special Educator (Primary) / Special Education Teacher; in pursuance to the Advertisements mentioned in these O.As., issued by the Delhi Subordinate Services Selection Board (DSSSB). These selections were to be made by DSSSB for the Directorate of Education (DoE), Govt. of NCT of Delhi / Municipal Corporations of Delhi, New Delhi Municipal Council (NDMC) & Autonomous Bodies of Govt. of NCT of Delhi.

4. The applicants, in all these cases, possessed the requisite educational qualifications, except that they had not passed Central Teacher Eligibility Test (CTET) as on the last dates for receipt of applications as notified in the Advertisements. A written test was to be conducted by DSSSB to select candidates for the posts advertised. The applicants were duly issued individual admit cards for participating in the written examination. They participated in the written examination. However, their candidatures were rejected vide Rejection Notices No.12 dated 16.05.2016, No.30 dated 15.06.2016, No.28 dated 10.06.2016, No.16 dated 19.05.2016, No.07 dated

02.05.2016 and No.18 dated 20.05.2016 *qua* applicants in O.A. No.2673/2016, Rejection Notices No.43 dated 18.07.2016, No.46 dated 27.07.2016, No.48 dated 27.07.2016, No.54 dated 01.08.2016, No.52 dated 01.08.2016, No.58 dated 03.08.2016 and No.62 dated 19.08.2016 *qua* applicants in O.A. No.3104/2016, Rejection Notice No.429 dated 29.12.2015 *qua* applicant in O.A. No.760/2016, Rejection Notice No.436 dated 03.02.2016 *qua* applicant in O.A. No.1007/2016, Rejection Notices No.30 dated 15.06.2016 and No.41 dated 18.07.2016 *qua* applicants in O.A. No.3466/2016 & Rejection Notices No.28 dated 10.06.2016 and No.30 dated 15.06.2016 *qua* applicants in O.A. No.3402/2016, solely on the ground of “**CTET after cut off date**” (emphasis supplied). They, however, acquired the CTET qualification in the years 2013, 2014 and 2015, i.e., after the last date for receipt of applications but before the appointment letters could be issued to the selected candidates. Succinctly, the facts, as noticed from these O.As. and relevant for the adjudication of the controversy involved, are summarized in the table below:-

Sl. No.	O.A. No.	Post	Indenting Agency	Advertisement No.	Last date for receipt of applications	Years/date of acquisition of CTET qualification
1.	O.A.No.2673/2016	TGT	DoE, GNCTD	No.02/2012	15.06.2012	2013, 2014 & 2015
2.	O.A. No.3104/2016	TGT	DoE, GNCTD	No.01/2013	20.03.2013	2013, 2014 & 2015
3.	O.A.No.760/2016	Special Educator (Primary)	GNCTD, MCD, NDMC and Autonomous Bodies of GNCTD	No.01/2014	27.02.2014	09.10.2014
4.	O.A.No.1007/2016	Special Education Teacher	GNCTD, MCD, NDMC and Autonomous Bodies of GNCTD	No.01/2014	27.02.2014	21.03.2014

5.	O.A.No.3466/2016	TGT	DoE, GNCTD	No.02/2012	15.06.2012	Before document verification date
6.	O.A.No.3402/2016	TGT	DoE, GNCTD	No.02/2012	15.06.2012	2013, 2014 & 2015

Aggrieved by the rejection of their candidatures, the applicants have filed these O.As. As the reliefs are common in these O.As., the reliefs claimed in O.A. No.2673/2016 are noticed hereinbelow:-

“(i) Set aside the impugned Rejection Notice No.12 dated 16.05.2016, Rejection Notice No.30 dated 15.06.2016, Rejection Notice No.28 dated 10.06.2016, Rejection Notice No.16 dated 19.05.2016, Rejection Notice No.07 dated 02.05.2016 and Rejection Notice No.18 dated 20.05.2016, whereby the candidature of the applicants for the post of Trained Graduate Teacher (TGT) in Directorate of Education has been rejected on the ground “CTET – after cut off date”.

(ii) Declare that the applicant/candidates are duly eligible and satisfy all the requisite qualifications, including CTET qualification, for the post of Trained Graduate Teacher (TGT) in Directorate of Education as per the Recruitment Rules and as per Section 23 (2) of the Right to Education Act, 2009 and are, therefore, entitled to be considered for appointment in their respective post/post codes as advertised in the advertisement No.02/2012 published by the DSSSB, respondent No.2 herein;

(iii) direct the Govt. of NCT of Delhi to make a proposal to the Central Government seeking relaxation of CTET qualification for appointment to the post of Trained Graduate Teacher (TGT) in Directorate of Education and further, direct the respondents to relax CTET qualification with respect to the applicants herein in terms of Section 23 (2) of the Right to Education Act, 2009 in terms of the said proposal.”

5. To decide the controversy raised in these O.A.s, we refer the important grounds pleaded in O.A. No.2673/2016 in support of the reliefs claimed and they are as under:-

5.1 The Recruitment Rules (RRs) for the posts in question, as published in the Delhi Gazette, do not prescribe CTET as a mandatory qualification. The RR's also do not stipulate that all the essential qualifications must be acquired before the closing date of receipt of the applications.

5.2 As per the RRs for the posts published by the Directorate of Education, Govt. of NCT of Delhi, all the educational qualifications are required to be satisfied at the time of appointment of the candidates to respective posts. In this regard, the applicants have cited the Annexure A-7 order dated 11.09.2013, relevant portion of which is extracted below:-

“Order

Whereas, the Hon’ble High Court of Delhi vide order dated 16.07.2013 in WPC No.4409/2013 titled as Jyotsna Gosa Vs. Govt. of NCT of Delhi & Ors has directed as under:-

“In view of the aforesaid, the writ petition for the present is dismissed as withdrawn and the Director of Education is directed to pass a fresh order within four weeks from today by making an appropriate reference to the letter of the Director of Education dated 19.03.2012 as also the provision of Section 23 (2) of the RTE Act, 2009. The petitioner is given liberty thereafter, if she is not satisfied with the order now to be passed by the Director of Education to approach the Court by filing an

appropriate case if the petitioner still has any grievance which can be legally pursued. Parties are left to bear their own costs.”

And whereas, vide order dated 03.08.2012, the Directorate of Education had cancelled the appointment of nine TGT teachers appointed by the DTEA (Registered) Schools on the grounds that are appointment of candidates as TGTs and Assistant Teachers who have not qualified the Central Teachers Eligibility Test (CTET), which is a mandatory condition for appointment to the aforementioned posts, was in contravention / violation of the direction issued vide notification No.F.4(6)(350)/E-IV/2011/621 dated 07.10.2011.

And whereas, the said order was challenged in the Hon’ble High Court vide WPC No.5270/2012 wherein the Hon’ble High Court vide order dated 16.04.2013 directed that the representation of the teachers under Rule 97 of the DSEAR, 1973, be considered and pass a speaking order.

And whereas, pursuant to the directions of the Hon’ble High Court dated 16.04.2013 in WPC No.5270/2012, the Directorate of Education vide order dated 31.05.2013 had rejected the request of the nine applicants for relaxing the qualification of passing CTET and observed as under:-

“And whereas, pursuant to the directions of the Hon’ble High Court dated 16.04.2013 in WPC No.5270/2012 and CM No.3271/2013 a representation dated 08.05.2013 was received in the Directorate of Education from 09 TGT teachers, as detailed below, with the requests to exercise the powers under rule 97 of the DSEAR, 1973 and relax the qualification of passing of CTET in their case and consequently release their salaries.”

5.3 Section 23 of the Right of Children to Free and Compulsory Education Act, 2009 (RTE Act, 2009) also supports the case of the applicants in the matter of minimum qualifications, which reads as under:-

“23. Qualification for appointment and terms and conditions of service of teachers-(1) Any person possessing such minimum qualifications, as laid down by an academic authority, authorized by the Central Government, by notification, shall be eligible for appointment as a Teacher.

(2) Where a State does not have adequate institutions offering courses or training in teacher education, or teachers possessing minimum qualifications as laid down under sub-section (1) are not available in sufficient numbers, the Central Government may, if it deem necessary, by notification, relax the minimum qualifications required for appointment as a teacher, for such period, not exceeding five years, as may be specified in that notification:

Provided that a teacher who, at the commencement of this Act, does not possess minimum qualifications as laid down under sub-section (1), shall acquire such minimum qualifications within a period of five years.

(3) The salary and allowances payable to, and the terms and conditions of service of, teacher shall be such as may be prescribed.”

5.4 The Central Government has powers to relax the CTET qualification in terms of Section 23 of RTE Act, 2009. The applicants, however, acquired CTET qualification before the issuance of the appointment letters but after the closing date of receipt of the applications.

5.5 Reliance is placed on the judgment of Hon'ble Delhi High Court in **Neelam v. Govt. of NCT of Delhi** (W.P. (C) No.189/2016) decided on 11.01.2016.

6. Pursuant to the notices issued, the respondents entered appearance. Replies, however, have been filed on behalf of respondent Nos. 1 & 2 and respondent No.5 only. In the reply filed on behalf of respondent Nos. 1 & 2, the following important averments have been made:-

6.1 The Advertisement No.02/2012 (Annexure A-2), clearly stated that “the educational qualification, age, experience and other eligibility conditions as stipulated above against the post shall be determined as on the closing date of receipt of applications”.

6.2 In the Advertisement, the CTET qualification has been mentioned as one of the essential qualifications. Further, in paragraph 10 (1) of Section C of the Advertisement, it has been clearly stated that the candidates applying for the posts must ensure that they fulfill all the eligibility conditions. Merely because a candidate has been allowed to appear in the examination, does not mean that he/she has been declared eligible for the selection.

6.3 The Advertisement has clearly stated that if, on verification at any time before or after the written examination or at any stage of recruitment process, it is found that a candidate does not fulfill any of the eligibility conditions on the closing date of receipt of application, his/her candidature for the post applied for will be cancelled by the DSSSB / appointing authority.

6.4 These applicants were well aware at the time of applying of posts that they did not fulfill all the eligibility criteria prescribed as on the cut-off date.

7. Respondent No.5, in its reply, has not mentioned any significant points.

8. On completion of pleadings, these cases were taken up for hearing the arguments of the parties today. Arguments of learned counsel for applicants and learned counsel for respective respondents were heard.

9. We have gone through the contents of Annexure A-2 Advertisement 02/2012. Paragraph 4 (ii) of Section C 'eligibility conditions' clearly prescribes that "The educational qualifications, age, experience etc. as stipulated in Section-A shall be determined as on the closing date of receipt of applications". It emphatically states that the candidates applying for the advertised posts must possess the requisite essential qualifications on the date of closing date. It is, therefore, logical to assume that the applicants were well aware that they were not fulfilling all the requisite qualifications in terms of not possessing the CTET qualification.

10. The pleading of the applicants that they acquired the CTET qualification well before the appointment letters were issued to the selected candidates, would not help them in the matter. The rule of game cannot be changed midway as per the ratio of law laid down by Hon'ble Supreme Court in **Chairman, Vizianagaram Social Welfare Residential School Society v. M. Tripura Sundari Devi**, [(1990) 3 SCC 655].

11. The contention of the applicants that in its order dated 11.09.2013, the Directorate of Education has also contemplated that all the requisite qualifications, including CTET, should have been acquired at the time of appointment, is repelled for the simple reason that the controversy involved has to be adjudicated strictly in accordance with the terms of appointment, as notified in the Annexure A-2 Advertisement. Any deviation from it would be illegal.

12. Reference of Section 23 (2) of RTE Act, 2009 made by the applicants to espouse their cause is too farfetched. The context and intent behind the RTE Act, 2009 are entirely different. The judgment of Hon'ble Delhi High Court in **Neelam's** case (supra) is of no relevance to the facts of the present cases.

13. To fortify our view, we refer to a recent judgment of Hon'ble Delhi High Court in **Annu & others v. Govt. of NCT of Delhi & others** (W.P. (C) No.11328/2017) decided on 11.01.2018, wherein it has been observed that the petitioners having taken part in the process of selection despite being aware of the mandatory eligibility criteria prescribed therein, had waived their right to challenge the mandatory condition of CTET contained in the Advertisement. Thus, it was held that the respondents were fully justified in not appointing the petitioners to the post of TGT especially in light of the admitted position that none of the petitioners were holding the CTET qualification on the crucial date.

14. In the conspectus of discussions in the pre-paragraphs, we do not find any merit in these O.As. Accordingly, the O.As. are dismissed without any order as to cost.

Let a copy of this order be placed in respective files.

With this, all ancillary Applications stand disposed of.

(K.N. Shrivastava)
Member (A)

(Justice Permod Kohli)
Chairman

March 20, 2018
/sunil/