

**Central Administrative Tribunal  
Principal Bench**

OA No. 1543/2017

New Delhi, this the 22<sup>nd</sup> day of August, 2017

**Hon'ble Mr. Justice Permod Kohli, Chairman**  
**Hon'ble Mr. K. N. Shrivastava, Member (A)**

1. Forum of MCD Engineers  
Through Its Gen. Secy. Sh. A.P. Khan  
Regd. office:- 8/53, Moti Nagar,  
New Delhi-110015
2. Satyavir Singh,  
S/o Sh. Sukhan Singh  
Aged:- 58  
R/o 64, Ashoka Enclave-III, Faridabad  
(Haryana)  
Serving as AE (Civil) in the  
Office of EE (Pr.)/City Zone,  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
3. Arun Kumar Jain  
S/o Late Sh. Mahavir Prasad Jain  
Aged:- 53  
R/o Pocket-A, Flat No. 59B,  
Phase-II, Ashok Vihar, Delhi-110052  
Serving as AE(Civil) with CE-I  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
4. Sunil Dawar  
S/o Sh. O.P. Dawar  
Aged:- 51  
C-31 Shakti Nagar Extension, Delhi-52  
Serving as AE (Civil) in C&D Plant  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
5. Shahid Mahmood  
S/o SH. Syed Usman  
Aged:- 56  
R/o 148-D, Pocket J&K, Dilshad Garden,  
Delhi  
Serving as AE (Civil) with CE central Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation

6. Ashok Kumar  
S/o Sh. Khajan Singh  
Aged:- 56  
R/o RZ-D-40, Dabri Extension East,  
New Delhi-45  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the  
office of EE(P&M), DEMS,  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
7. Sikandar Hayat  
S/o Late Sh. Latif Ahmad  
Aged:- 58  
R/o D-18/11, Okhla Vihar, Jamia Nagar,  
New Delhi-25  
Serving as AECivil) in the office of SE(Plg.)  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
8. Suraj Prakash Sagta  
S/o Late Sh. I.D. Sagta  
Aged:- 50  
R/o 31, Lotus Enclave, Parwana Road,  
Pitampura Delhi-34  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of  
EE(Pr.)/KBZ  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
9. Vijay Kumar Agarwal  
S/o Late Sh. R.B. Gupta  
Aged:- 57  
R/o A-303, Ground Floor, Meera Bagh,  
New Delhi-87  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE  
(Bldg.)/HQ  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
10. Sanjeev Dara  
S/o Sh. Upender Kumar  
Aged:- 52  
R/o D-145, 1st Floor, Mansarover Garden,  
New Delhi-15  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE  
(Bldg.)/HQ  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation

11. Shyam Sunder  
Sh. Chander Prakash  
Aged:- 59  
R/o D-27, Nigam Colony, Azad Pur Delhi-33  
Serving as AE (Civil) with CE Narela Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
12. Ajay Kumar Jain  
Late Sh. Devender Kumar Jain  
Aged:- 50  
R/o H.No. 148/20, Indira Colony, Atlas Road,  
Sonipat-131001, (Haryana)  
Serving as AECivil) in the office of SE(Plg.)  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
13. Ramesh Chandra  
S/o Sh. Damder Singh  
Aged:- 52  
R/o B-455, MIG Flats, East of Loni Road,  
Delhi-93  
Serving as AE(Civil) with CE-II  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
14. Rajeev Sharma  
S/o Sh. O.P. Sharma  
Aged:- 53  
R/o H.No. 169/ A-2, 2nd Floor, Paschim Vihar,  
New Delhi-63  
Serving as AE (C) in the office EE (Bldg.)/ HQ  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
15. R.P. Sharma  
S/o Late Sh. L.D. Sharma  
Aged:- 52  
R/o H-502, Prince Apartments, I.P. Extn.,  
New Delhi-92  
AE (Civil) in the office of EE (Bldg.)/HQ  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
16. Aditya Nashier  
S/o Sh. J. R. Nashier  
Aged:- 52  
R/o 44, Suvidha Kunj, Pitam Pura,  
Delhi-110034  
Serving as AECivil) in the office of SE(Plg.)  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation

17. Sunil Jain  
Sh. Pawan Kumar Jain  
Aged:- 49  
R/o QP-67, Maurya Enclave, Pitampura,  
Delhi-110034  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of  
EE(Pr.)/SP Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
18. Shafeeq Ahmad  
S/o Late Sh. Mohd. Hanif  
Aged:- 53  
R/o H.No. 1008 A- Gali No. 20,  
Subhash Mohalla North, Ghonda, Delhi-53  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)/  
SP Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
19. Shyam Lal Saini  
S/o Late Sh. M.R. Saini  
Aged:- 55  
R/o B-194, SFS Flats, Sheikh Sarai Phase-I,  
New Delhi-110017  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(Bldg.)-  
I/Central Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
20. Adish Kumar Jain  
S/o Late Sh. F.M. Jain  
Aged:- 53  
R/o Flat No. 421, Plot No. 28,  
Veer Apartments, Sector-13, Rohini,  
Delhi-110085  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of  
EE(Bldg.)/SP Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
21. Naresh Sharma  
S/o Sh. R.K Sharma  
Aged:- 53  
R/o 245, Rajdhani Enclave, Pitam Pura,  
Delhi-34  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of SE(Plg.)  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation

22. Pradeep Kumar Rastogi  
S/o Late Sh. S.P. Rastogi  
Aged:- 52  
R/o C-6/85, DDA Flat, East of Kailash,  
New Delhi-65  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of SE(QC)  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
23. Rajesh Tewatia  
S/o Late Sh. Kishan Singh Tewatia  
Aged:-50  
R/o D-267, Ashok Vihar, Phase-I,  
Delhi-110052  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE(Bldg.)-I/  
Central Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
24. Abdul Majid  
S/o Abdul Wahid  
Aged:- 51  
R/o C-5, Noor Nagar Extn. Johri Farm,  
Jamia Nagar, New Delhi-110025  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE(Bldg.)-I/  
Central Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
25. Mithlesh Kumari  
W/o Sh. Anirudh Sharma  
Aged:- 43  
R/o C-154, Golf View Apartment, Saket,  
New Delhi-110017  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of SE(Lab.)  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
26. Ravinder Bansal  
S/o Sh. Roshan Lal Bansal  
Aged:- 42  
R/o D-12/147, Sector-8, Rohini,  
New Delhi-110085  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of SE(Plg.)  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
27. Rajesh Gupta  
S/o Sh. T.C. Gupta  
Aged:- 52

R/o A-108, Ashok Vihar Phase-I,  
Delhi-110052  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of SE(Plg.)  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation

28. Rajesh Kumar Garg  
S/o Late Sham Lal Garg  
Aged:- 50  
R/o H.No.62, Deepali, Pitampura,  
New Delhi-110034  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of SE(Plg.)  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
29. Rajiv Khurana  
S/o Sh. T.R. Khurana  
Aged:- 55  
R/o A-402, Vasundhra Apartment,  
Plot No. 16, Sec-6 Dwarka,  
New Delhi-110075  
Serving as AE(Civil) with E-in-C office  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
30. Krishan Kumar Gupta  
S/o Late Sh. R. R. Gupta  
Aged:- 57  
R/o Plot No. 6, site No.7,  
New Rajender Nagar, New Delhi-110060  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(Bldg.)  
City Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
31. Tej Pal Puri  
S/o Late Sh. K.D. Puri  
Aged:- 52  
R/o B-2, 2nd Floor, Amarpali Sector-1,  
Rohini, Delhi-110085  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of SE(Plg.)  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
32. Ashok Kumar Gupta  
S/o Late Sh. B.N. Gupta  
Aged:- 52  
R/o 42, Ashoka Appartment, A -2, Block,  
Paschim Vihar, Delhi  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of SE(Plg.)  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation

33. Anurag Saxena  
S/o Late Sh. S.N.Saxena  
Aged:- 53  
R/o H.No. 9536, C-9, Vasant kunj,  
New Delhi-110070  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-I/  
Central Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
34. Devendra Kishore  
S/o Sh. Uma Nand  
Aged:- 52  
R/o 80-H, Pkt-4, Mayur Vihar Phase-1,  
Delhi-110092  
Serving as AE(Civil)/ Central Store  
East Delhi Municipal Corporation
35. Amar Singh Bizaraniyan  
S/o Sh. Hanuman Singh  
Aged:- 52  
R/o 49, Data Ram apartment, Sec-18,  
Rohini, Delhi-89  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-II/  
Narela Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
36. Devender Singh  
S/o Sh. Mukhtyar Singh  
Aged:- 55  
R/o Village & P.O. Nangal kalan, Sonipat  
Haryana  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-I/  
Narela Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
37. Vinod Kumar Verma  
S/o Sh. Shri Krishan  
Aged:- 53  
R/o 99, Vidya Vihar society, West Enclave,  
Pitam Pura, Delhi-110034  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-I/  
Narela Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
38. Ananad Prakash

S/o Sh. Mange Ram  
Aged:- 53  
R/o H.No. 370, Village & PO Nangal Thakran,  
Delh-39  
Serving as AE(Civil) in Central Store  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation

39. Mohd. Ahmed  
S/o Late Sh. Ashfaq Ahmed  
Aged:- 54  
R/o K/22C, Sheikh Sarai, Ph-II, New Delhi-17  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(Bldg.)/  
Najafgarh Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
40. Farrukh Mustafa siddiqi  
S/o Mohd. Mustafa Siddiqi  
Aged:- 54  
R/o G-26, Hazrat Nozamuddin west,  
New Delhi-110013  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-I/  
Central Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
41. Sandeep Kumar Sharma  
S/o Late Sh. Om Prakash Sharma  
Aged:- 52  
R/o 60, Vidya Vihar, west Enclave,  
Pitam Pura,  
Delhi-110034  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE(Pr.)-III/  
Rohini Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
42. Mahipal  
S/o Late Sh. Om Parkash  
Aged:- 54  
R/o J-24, sriniwas Puri, New Delhi-110065  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of  
EE(DEMS)/Central Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
43. Chatar Singh Mangla  
S/o Late Sh. Johari Lal



Aged:- 53  
R/o H.No. 157, Sekh Pura Mohalla,  
Near Old CIA Office,  
Palwal, Haryana  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-I/  
Central Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation

44. Hukam Singh  
S/o Sh. Kalu Ram  
Aged:- 57  
R/o Village & P.O.Barula, Sector-49, Noida  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE(Bldg.)-II/  
Central Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation

45. Pradeep Kumar  
S/o Late Om Prakash Mishra  
Aged:- 53  
R/o B-211, DDA MIG Flats, East of Loni Road,  
Delhi-110093  
Serving as AE(Civil) in Vigilance Depatt.  
East Delhi Municipal Corporation

46. Farogh Anjum  
S/o Sh. Anwar-ul-Hasan  
Aged:- 53  
R/o 53A, Pkt-M, Sarita Vihar,  
New Delhi-110076  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of SE(Lab.)  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation

47. Prem Chand  
S/o Late Dhara Singh  
Aged:- 56  
R/o 5/132, Nehru road, Baraut,  
District Baghpat, UP-250611  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-II/  
Shah. North Zone,  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation

48. Sushil Kumar  
S/o Late Bashesar Dass Jain  
Aged:- 50

R/o BL-90, Ist Floor, Shalimar Bagh,  
New Delhi-110088  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE (Bldg.)-I/  
Central Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation

49. Rakesh Kant Lavania  
S/o Late S.K. Lavania  
Aged:- 57  
R/o A-108, Rachna Vaishali Sector-3,  
Ghaziabad, UP-201010  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE (Bldg.)-I/  
Central Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
50. Vimal Kumar Bhandari  
S/o Late P.C. Bhandari  
Aged:- 53  
R/o F-3/41, Sector-11, Rohini,  
New Delhi-110085  
Serving as AE(Civil) ) in the office EE (M)-I/  
Narela Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
51. Naresh Kumar Dhingra  
S/o Sh. P.L. Dhingra  
Aged:- 51  
R/o 127, Sainik Vihar, Pitampura,  
New Delhi-110034  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE (M)-I/  
West Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
52. Zubair Ahmad Khan  
S/o Late K.U. Khan  
Aged:- 53  
R/o 225, Gali No. 8, Gaffar Manzil,  
Jamia Nagar, New Delhi-110025  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE (M)-I/  
Civil Line Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
53. Mohd. Hasib Khan  
S/o Late Mohd. Habib Khan

Aged:- 53  
R/o 153/12, Gaffar Manzil, Jamia Nagar,  
New Delhi-110025  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE (M)-I/  
Civil Line Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation

54. Syed Afzal Ali  
S/o Late Mukhtar Ahmad  
Aged:- 57  
R/o C-61, Radhey Shyam Extension,  
Parwana Road,  
Khajuri Delhi  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE (M)-IV/  
Rohini Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
55. Y.P. Singh  
S/o Sh. Ram Singh  
Aged:- 52  
R/o A-2/162, Sector-3, Rohini, Delhi  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE (M)-IV/  
Rohini Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
56. Sunil Kumar Gupta  
S/o Sh. Prakash Chandra Gupta  
Aged:- 52  
R/o C-490, Saraswati Vihar, Delhi-110034  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE (M)-IV/  
Rohini Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
57. Rajender Singh  
S/o Sh. Daya Ram  
Aged:- 51  
R/o H.No. 575, IInd Greater Noida,  
Gautam Budh Nagar, UP  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE (M)-IV/  
Central Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
58. Ishaat Ullah Khan  
S/o Late Fayyaz Ullah Khan

Aged:- 53  
R/o 162, GF, Pkt-2, Jasola,  
New Delhi-110025  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE (M)-IV/  
Central Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation

59. Virender Singh Chauhan  
S/o Sh. Dilawar Singh  
Aged:- 49  
R/o 9B, pkt-B, Mayur Vihar Ph-II,  
Delhi-110091  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of SE (Lab.)  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
60. Rajesh Kumar Gupta  
S/o Sh. Ramdhari Gupta  
Aged:- 51  
R/o D-111, MCD Colony, Azadpur,  
Delhi-110033  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of SE (Lab.)  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
61. Ranjiv Jain  
S/o Late Jagdish Lal Jain  
Aged:- 52  
R/o Flat No. 30, Plot No. 2,  
Unique Apartment, Sector-13, Rohini,  
Delhi-110085  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of SE (Lab.)  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
62. Mrs. Shashi  
W/o Sutikshan Kumar  
Aged:- 51  
R/o E-27, MCD Flats, Kamla Nagar,  
Delhi-110007  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of SE (Lab.)  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
63. Dinesh Kalra  
S/o Late C.L. Kalra  
Aged:- 50

R/o C-7/107, Yamuna Vihar, Delhi-110059  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of SE (Lab.)  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation

64. Krishan Pal Yadav  
Late Shyam Singh Yadav  
Aged:- 58  
R/o Flat No. 105, Data Ram Society,  
Sector-18, Rohini, Delhi-110089  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of SE (Lab.)  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
65. Dev Priya Bhardwaj  
S/o Sh. B.N. Bhardwaj  
Aged:- 51  
R/o IX/5020, East Old Seelampur,  
Delhi-110031  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of SE (Lab.)  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
66. Mukesh Sharma  
S/o Late B.B. Sharma  
Aged:- 52  
R/o 69, Dharma Kunj Apartment, Sector-9,  
Rohini, New Delhi  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE(Pr.)-II/  
West Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
67. Nutan Kumar Gupta  
S/o Late B.K. Gupta  
Aged:- 55  
R/o 6, Hans Vihar, Sector-13, Rohini,  
Delhi-110085  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-II/  
Civil Line Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
68. Ashok Kumar  
S/o Sh Rameshwar Das  
Aged:- 54  
R/o H.No.18, Gaurav Nagar, Kirari Suleman,

Delhi-110086  
Serving as AE(Auto) in the office of EE(Auto)  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation

69. Pramod Vashisht  
S/o Late Bhim Singh Vashisth  
Aged:- 52  
R/o F-124, Prashant Vihar, Rohini,  
Delhi-110085  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of  
SE(Bldg.)/HQ  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
70. Aslam Parvez Khan  
S/o Sh. F.R. Khan  
Aged:- 57  
R/o 65/41, Punjabi Bagh West,  
New Delhi-110026  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-I/  
Rohini Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
71. Sunil Kumar Malhotra  
S/o Late Veer Bhan Malhotra  
Aged:- 54  
R/o F-55, Prashant Vihar, Delhi-110085  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of SE-II/  
Rohini Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
72. Sushil Kumar Chauhan  
S/o Sh. Dhir Singh Chauhan  
Aged:- 53  
R/o AM-19, Shalimar Bagh,  
New Delhi-110088  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE(Bldg.-I)/  
Rohini Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
73. Sharad Kumar Gupta  
S/o Late M.L. Gupta  
Aged:- 53  
R/o DU-161, Pitampura, New Delhi-110034

Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE(Bldg.)-II,  
Rohini Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation

74. Pradeep Kumar Sharma  
S/o Late Suraj Bhan Sharma  
Aged:- 52  
R/o E-61, New Saraswati, Sector-9, Rohini,  
Delhi-110085  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE(Bldg.)-II/  
Civil Line Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
75. Anil Kumar Aggarwal  
S/o Late Mange Ram  
Aged:- 50  
R/o 7A, Ayodhya Enclave, Sector-13, Rohini  
Serving as AE (C) in the office EE (Bldg.)-II/  
Civil Line Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
76. Feroze Muzaffar  
S/o Dr. Muzaffar Hanfi  
Aged:- 54  
R/o 358 Batla House, Jamia Nagar,  
New Delhi-110025  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE(DEMS)-/  
Najafgarg Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
77. Dhirender Singh Chahal  
S/o Late Dharam Singh  
Aged:- 52  
R/o 232- Pkt-IV, Sector-24, Rohini,  
New Delhi-110085  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE(Bldg.)-I/  
Civil Line Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
78. Rishab Kumar Jain  
S/o Late Rajinder Kumar Jain  
Aged:- 54  
R/o 24, Bahubali Enclave, New Delhi-110092  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE(Bldg.)-II/  
Civil Line Zone

North Delhi Municipal Corporation

79. Sunil Kumar Taneja  
S/o Late Manohar Lal Taneja  
Aged:- 54  
R/o I-114, 3rd Floor, Ashok Vihar, Ph-I,  
Delhi-110052  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(Pr.)  
Civil Line Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
80. Shishan Pal Garg  
S/o Late N.R. Garg  
Aged:- 53  
R/o GD-105, Ist Floor, Pitampura,  
Delhi-110088  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE(Bldg.)-I/  
West Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
81. Sunil Mohan Gupta  
Sh. R.D. Gupta  
Aged:- 54  
R/o 27/4, Onkar Nagar, Tri Nagar,  
Delhi-110035  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE(Bldg.)/  
Karol Bagh Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
82. Kaptaan Singh  
S/o Late Sh. Rati Ram  
Aged:- 55  
R/o A-1/311, IInd Floor Janakpuri,  
Delhi-110058  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-I/  
Rohini Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
83. Jagdish S Dayani  
S/o Late Satram Dass Dayani  
Aged:- 55  
R/o A-38, Lajtap Nagar-I, New Delhi  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of Supreme



Court Monitoring Committee  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation

84. Abhay Kumar Jain  
S/o Late Surender Kumar Jain  
Aged:- 53  
R/o B-25, Ist Floor, Ram Puri,  
Near Alakh Nanda Apartment, Ghaziabad, UP  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-IV/  
Civil Line Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
85. Kulbir Singh  
S/o Sh. Nafe Singh  
Aged:- 50  
R/o Jahaz Appartment,  
Back Side Inder Enclave, Pachim Vihar,  
New Delhi  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of SE(Lab.)  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
86. Naresh Kumar Garg  
S/o Sh. Gurdial Singh  
Aged:- 52  
R/o Madhav Kunj, B-7/83/1, DDA Flats,  
Ground Floor,  
Safdarjung Enclave, New Delhi-110029  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-III/  
South Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
87. Mahesh Kumar Gulati  
S/o Sh. Hari Chand Gulati  
Aged:- 56  
R/o KP-348, Pitam Pura, Delhi-110034  
Serving as AE(Civil) with CE-III  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
88. Rajender Singh Vashisht  
S/o Sh. Daleep Singh  
Aged:- 54  
R/o A-2/155, Sector-3, Rohini, Delhi-110088  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-I/  
West Zone

## South Delhi Municipal Corporation

89. Dinesh Kumar Gupta  
S/o Late Sh. D.P.Gupta  
Aged:- 58  
R/o V-540, Gali No. 16, Vijay Park, Maujpur,  
Delhi-110053  
Serving as JE(Civil) in the office of  
SE(DEMS)/HQ  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
90. Daya Nand Dahiya  
S/o Late Sh. Chandan Singh  
Aged:- 57  
R/o 60, Maheswari Apprtment, sector-14,  
Rohini, Delhi-85  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of  
EE(Bldg.)/West Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
91. Surander Singh  
S/o Sh. Hukam Chand  
Aged:- 50  
R/o A-1/311, Ground Floor Janakpuri, Delhi  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-I/  
Rohini Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
92. Narinder Singh Grover  
S/o Sh. Sant Ram Singh Grover  
Aged:- 51  
R/o C-2, New Gobind Pura, Gali No. 9,  
Kailash Mandir Gali, Delhi -51  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-I/  
Shahdara(North)  
East Delhi Municipal Corporation
93. Sahanser Pal Singh  
S/o Sh. Randhir Singh  
Aged:- 58  
R/o H.No. 20, Pkt E-4, sector-11, Rohini,  
Delhi-110085

Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-IV/  
Civil Line Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation

94. Anand Parkash,  
S/o Sh. Baleshwar,  
Aged:- 56  
R/o B-1480, Shashtri Nagar, New Delhi  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-I/  
West Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
95. Vinod Kumar Gupta  
S/o Sh. Hukam Chand  
Aged:- 53  
R/o WT-195B, Pitam Pura, New Delhi-110034  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE(Bldg.)-II/  
Rohini Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
96. Parmod kumar  
S/o Sh. Sobran Singh  
Aged:- 54  
R/o 120A, Pockey-B, Dishad Graden,  
Delhi-110095  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(Pr.)-I/  
Shahdara (North)  
East Delhi Municipal Corporation
97. Zavvar Kazim  
S/o Sh. Iftikar Hussain  
Aged:- 52  
R/o 150D, Pkt J&K, Dishad Garden,  
Delhi-110095  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(Pr.)-I/  
Shahdara (North)  
East Delhi Municipal Corporation
98. Atulendra Kr. Mittal  
S/o Sh. Jagdish Parshad Mittal  
Aged:- 57  
R/o 9A, Pkt. B, Dishad Graden, Delhi

Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-I/  
South Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation

99. Vikas Gupta  
S/o Sh. D.P.Gupta  
Aged:- 53  
R/o A-1/1, Krishana Nagar, delhi-110051  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-II/  
South Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
- 100 Baljeet Singh  
S/o Sh. Bodal Ram  
Aged:- 54  
R/o B-190, Sec-26, NOIDA,  
Distt. Goutam Budh Nagar, UP  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-II/  
South Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
- 101 Ashok Kumar Kanodiya  
S/o Sh. Ram Sharan  
Aged:- 52  
R/o B-643, DDA Flat, Loni Road, Delhi  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(Pr.)-I/  
Shahdara (South)  
East Delhi Municipal Corporation
102. Bijender Kumar Garg  
S/o Sh. Giani Ram Garg  
Aged:- 57  
R/o A-1/57, 1st Floor, sector-8, Rohini,  
Delhi-110085  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-IV/  
Civil Line Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
103. Pardeep Kumar Chauhan  
S/o Sh. Bhawar Singh  
Aged:- 52  
R/o B-76, Shakti apprtment, sec-9, Rohini

Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE(Pr.)-II/  
Rohini Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation

104. Ramesh Chander Mittal  
S/o Sh. Om Prakash Mittal  
Aged:- 53  
R/o 2A/102, Rang Rasayan Apartment,  
Sec-13, Rohini, Delhi-85  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(Pr.)-I/  
Rohini Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
105. M. A. Siddiqui  
S/o Late Sh. Moin-Uddin  
Aged:- 54  
R/o 1448, Chatta Nawab Sahib,  
Farash Khana, Delhi-110006  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of  
EE(Pr.)/City Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
106. Indramani Ram  
S/o Sh. Bunel Ram  
Aged:- 52  
R/o 90-D, Block C, Pkt C, Shalimar Bagh,  
Delhi-110088  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE  
(Central Store)  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
107. Pardeep Kumar Pandey  
S/o Sh. R.P.Pandey  
Aged:- 53  
R/o B-39, Sec-12, Noida, U.P  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(Pr.)-I/  
Shahdara (North)  
East Delhi Municipal Corporation
108. Ankur Tyagi  
S/o Sh. Amar Singh Tyagi  
Aged:- 52  
R/o B-206, Satya Shanti Appartment,  
Plot No. 23, Sec-13, Rohini, Delhi -85

Serving as JE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)/  
SP Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation

109. Saleem Ahmad Khan  
S/o Sh. Saghir Ahmad Khan  
Aged: - 57  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE(Pr.)-II/  
Central Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
110. Rakesh Ahuja  
S/o Sh. A.N. Ahuja  
Aged:- 52  
R/o 909, Vikas Kunj, Vikash Puri, New Delhi  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-I/  
West Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
111. Umed Singh  
S/o Late Sh. Prithi Singh  
Aged:- 55  
R/o H.No. 22, Shri Nagar Extention,  
Delhi-110052  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE(DEMS)/  
Najafgarh Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
112. Agnivesh Sharma  
S/o Sh. B.L. Shastri  
Aged:- 51  
R/o Flat No. 335, Lake View Apartment,  
Sector-9, Rohini, Delhi-110083  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE(Bldg.)-I/  
Civil Line Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
113. S.M. R. Zaidi  
S/o Sh. S.M. Zaidi  
Aged:- 50  
R/o 4/204, East End apprtment, Mayur Vihar,  
Phase-I

Extn., Delhi-11023  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-II/  
City Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation

114. S.K. Sharma  
S/o Sh. K.S. Sharma  
Aged:- 53  
R/o B-3/82, SF, Paschim Vihar, New Delhi  
Serving as AE(Civil) with Supreme Court  
Monitoring Committee  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
115. Dhirendra Dogra  
S/o Sh. Viswamitra Dogra  
Aged:- 57  
R/o M-539, Guru Harkishan Marg,  
Paschim Vihar, New Delhi-110087  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-III/  
West Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
116. Ravi Kumar Saxena  
S/o Late Sh. R.C. Saxena  
Aged:- 54  
R/o C-52, M.P.Enclave, Pitam Pura,  
New Delhi-110034  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of  
EE(Bldg.)/Karol Bagh Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
117. Rajbir Singh  
S/o Sh. Chatter Singh  
Aged:- 50  
R/o BL-111, FF, L-Block Hari Nagar,  
New Delhi-110064  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-I/  
West Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
118. Ajay Kumar Sharma  
S/o Sh. J.P. Sharma  
Aged:- 51  
R/o 9/80, Sector-3, Rajinder Nagar,  
Sahibabad, UP

Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE(M)-IV/  
Central Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation

119. Akil Hussain  
S/o Sh. Munaf Khan  
Aged:- 56  
R/o F-13/36, FF, Jogabai Extension,  
Jamia Nagar, New Delhi-110025  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-II/  
Central Zone  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
120. Birpal Singh  
S/o Sh. Harchandi  
Aged:- 53  
R/o H.No. 145, Sector-10, Faridabad,  
Haryana  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-I/  
SP Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
121. Shiv Kumar Goyal  
S/o Sh. Ved Prakash Goyal  
Aged:- 57  
R/o H.No. KC/44-C, Ashok Vihar,  
New Delhi-52  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of  
EE(Bldg.)/Narela Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
122. Anuj Tayal  
S/o Sh. M.C. Tayal  
Aged:- 53  
R/o H.No. 1/16, Shalimar Park, Shahdara,  
Delhi-32  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE  
(SLF/DEMS)  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
123. R.P. Gupta  
S/o Sh. Chaitu Prasad Sah  
Aged:- 53  
R/o H.No. A-141, Dilshad Colony, Delhi-95



Serving as AE (Civil) in the office of  
EE(Pr.)/Karol Bagh Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation

124. Ashwani Kumar  
S/o Sh. M.S. Tyagi  
Aged:- 53  
R/o H.No. Flat No. 43 Popular Apptt.  
Sector-13 Rohini, Delhi-85  
Serving as JE(Civil) in the office of EE (M)-II  
Civil Line Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
125. Parveen Kumar Jain  
S/o Sh. Ishwar Dass Jain  
Aged:- 44  
R/o H.No. 291, FF, Deepali Pitampura,  
Delhi-34  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of SE(Plg.)  
South Delhi Municipal Corporation
126. Parmod Kumar Singhal  
S/o Late Sh. Shri Ram Singhal  
Aged:- 52  
R/o A-3/44, Sector-3 Rohini Delhi-85  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of  
SE(Narela)  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
127. Avedhesh Kumar Sharma  
S/o Late Sh. Hari Shanker Sharma  
Aged:- 53  
R/o 148, Chander Lok, Pitampura Delhi-34  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(Pr.)  
Narela Zone  
North Delhi Municipal Corporation
128. Ravinder Kumar  
S/o Late Sh. Ramji Lal  
Aged:- 51  
R/o 82,83 CPO Block, Madangir New Delhi 62  
Serving as AE(Civil) in the office of EE(M)-IV/  
Central Zone

### South Delhi Municipal Corporation

129. Mohd. Anjum  
 S/o Late Mr. Mohd. Mateen  
 Aged:- 56  
 R/o H.No. 22 Gali No. 1 Johri Farm,  
 Jamia Nagar, New Delhi-25  
 Serving as AE(Civil) in the office EE(Bldg.)-I/  
 West Zone,  
 South Delhi Municipal Corporation

(All the applicants are Group 'B' and Serving in Municipal Corporations of Delhi) ...Applicants

(By Advocate: Mr. M.K. Bhardwaj)

Versus

### North Delhi Municipal Corporation & Ors.

1. North Delhi Municipal Corporation,  
 through its Commissioner,  
 North Delhi Municipal Corporation,  
 4<sup>th</sup> Floor, Civic Centre, Minto Road,  
 New Delhi-110002
2. South Delhi Municipal Corporation,  
 through its Commissioner,  
 9<sup>th</sup> Floor, Civic Centre, Minto Road,  
 New Delhi-110002
3. East Delhi Municipal Corporation,  
 through its Commissioner,  
 419, Udyog Sadan,  
 Patpar Ganj Industrial Area,  
 Delhi-110095

...Respondents

(By Advocates: Mr. RN Singh and Mr. R.K. Jain)

**: O R D E R (ORAL) :**

**Justice Permod Kohli :**

In this Original Application filed under Section 19 of the Administrative Tribunals Act, 1985, the applicants have prayed for following reliefs:-

- “(a) To declare the action of respondents in not granting the scale of Rs.15600-39100 with Grade of Rs.6600 in PB3 attached to the promotional posts as 2<sup>nd</sup> financial upgradation to the applicants under MACP from due date with all arrears of pay, as illegal, arbitrary and unjustified and direct the respondents to grant scale of Rs.15600-39100 with Grade Pay of Rs.6600 in PB 3 attached to the promotional posts, as 2<sup>nd</sup> financial upgradation with all consequential benefits.
- (b) To declare the action of respondents in not granting financial upgradation to the applicants under MACP Scheme in the pay scales attached to the promotional post as illegal, arbitrary and unjustified and issue same directions as issued while allowing OA No. 1586/2014 vide orders dated 08.09.2015 & OA No. 3637/2015 in case of similarly placed persons.
- (c) To allow the OA with costs.
- (d) Pass such other direction or directions order or orders as this Hon’ble Tribunal may deem fit and proper to meet the ends of justice.”

2. The claim of the applicants is that they were appointed as JE(Civil) between 1986 and 1993 and posted at different places. Even after rendering requisite number of years of service, there were no promotional avenues for them for want of vacancies and made to stagnate on the same post for years together. The 5<sup>th</sup>

Central Pay Commission recommended for grant of two time bound financial upgradations on completion of 12 and 24 years of regular service in the existing hierarchy subject to the condition that the concerned employee has not been granted any promotion. The applicants having not got any promotion, became entitled to the financial upgradations under the aforesaid Scheme. On completion of 12 years of service, the applicants were granted first financial upgradation in the pay scale of Rs.6500-10500 which was the pay scale for the post of AE (Civil). This financial upgradation was allowed on being found fit by the competent authority. Before the applicants could complete 24 years of required service, the Government of India, Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances & Pensions, DoP&T issued OM dated 19.05.2009 for grant of three financial upgradations under MACP on the basis of 10, 20 and 30 years of regular service. Under the Sixth CPC, 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> financial upgradations have been placed in PB-2 in pay scale of Rs.15600-39100 with Grade Pay of Rs.6600 and PB-3 in scale of Rs.15600-39100 with Grade Pay of Rs.7600. The grievance of the applicants is that after the MACP Scheme came into operation, they were given Grade Pay of Rs.4800 in the same pay on account of 2<sup>nd</sup> financial upgradation. Under these circumstances, the present OA has been filed. A detailed counter affidavit has been filed by the

respondents disputing the claim of the applicants, although it is admitted that the pay scale of Rs.15600-39100 carries Grade Pay of Rs.6600 in PB-2.

3. During the course of hearing, we find that the controversy in this case is squarely covered by the judgment of the this Tribunal dated 08.09.2015 passed in OA No. 1586/2014 and judgment dated 10.12.2015 passed in OA No. 3637/2015. The judgment in OA No. 1586/2014 was passed in case of Assistant Teachers on the basis of the judgments of the Hon'ble Punjab & Haryana High Court and of the Hon'ble High Court of Delhi. The operative part of the judgment of this Tribunal is as under:-

“6. In view of the judgment of High Court of Punjab & Haryana in CWP No. 19387/2011 (supra) and Order of the High Court of Delhi in WP(C) No. 3608/2014 (supra), we are of the view that though the MACP Scheme provides for promotion in the next Grade Pay, in view of the judgment of Punjab & Haryana High Court, which has also not been interfered by the Supreme Court, now the settled position is that even under the MACP Scheme, financial upgradations would be as per promotional hierarchy. As such, the applicants would be entitled for second financial upgradation in 2013 in the GP of Rs.5400/- with effect from the date they have completed 20 years of regular service, if otherwise found eligible. The respondents are, therefore, directed to issue orders accordingly re-fixing the pay of the applicants with all successive increments and pay all arrears due to them.”

4. Considering the aforesaid judgment, another Division Bench of this Tribunal considered the claim of JEs working in the South Delhi Municipal Corporation, who were also similarly situated as the present applicants are and vide its order dated

10.12.2015 passed in OA No. 3637/2015, following directions were issued:-

“2. Respondents have filed their reply. In this, they have stated that the case of the applicants is squarely covered by the judgment of this Tribunal in OA No. 1586/2014 dated 08.09.2015. The applicants are accordingly entitled to the same relief as has been granted to the applicant of the aforesaid OA. The applicants have also filed MA-3297/2015 seeking extension of benefit of the aforesaid judgment. In view of the reply filed by the respondents, this OA is disposed of with the direction to the respondents to extend the benefit of judgment dated 08.09.2015 of OA No. 1586/2015 to the present applicants as well within a period of 60 days from the date of receipt of a certified copy of this order. No costs. “

5. The issue involved in the present OA is squarely covered by the aforesaid judgments. This OA is allowed in terms of the abovementioned judgments, particularly, the last judgment of this Tribunal.

**(K. N. Shrivastava)**  
**Member (A)**

**(Justice Permod Kohli)**  
**Chairman**

/lg/