

**Central Administrative Tribunal
Principal Bench**

CP No.464/2016 in OA No.1919/2016

New Delhi, this the 8th day of December, 2016

**Hon'ble Mr. Justice Permod Kohli, Chairman
Hon'ble Mr. Shekhar Agarwal, Member (A)**

1. Shri Raghubir Singh,
S/o Devi Dass,
Aged about 55 year,
Working as A.C.
Technician-I (Group C).
2. Shri Bansi Lal,
S/o Shri Bihari Lal,
Aged about 52 year, Working as A.C.
Helper (Group C).
3. Shri Dukhi Ram,
S/o Shri Ram Garib,
Aged 54 year, Working as A.C.
Helper (Group C).
4. Shri Satish Kumar,
S/o Shri Prakash Chand,
Aged 41 year, Working as A.C.
Technician-II (Group-C)
5. Shri Ram Narayan,
S/o Shri Kishan Lal,
Aged 52 year, Working as A.C.
Technician-I (Group-C).
6. Shri Furqan Ahmad,
S/o Shri Mohd Ahmad,
Aged 47 year, Working as A.C.
Technician-II (Group-C).
7. Shri Hira Lal,
S/o Shri Mahatam Prasad,
Aged 42 year, Working as A.C.
2 OA-1919/2016, Helper (Group-C).
8. Shri Ramesh Kumar,
S/o Shri Ram Singh,
Aged 45 year, Working as A.C.
Helper (Group-C).

9. Shri Pawan Kumar,
S/o Shri Om Prakash Sharma,
Aged 47 year, Working as A.C.
Technician-II (Group-C).
10. Shri Raja Ram,
S/o Shri Ram Sanjeewan,
Aged 52 year, Working as A.C.
Helper (Group-C).
11. Shri Abhay Raj,
S/o Shri Ram Kishore,
Aged 52 year, Working as A.C.
Helper (Group-C).
12. Shri Daulat Ram,
S/o Shri Kishore Lal,
Aged 59 year, Working as A.C.
Technician-I (Group-C).
13. Shri Lokmani,
S/o Shri Ram Dutt Joshi,
Aged 54 year, Working as A.C.
Helper (Group-C).
14. Shri Surjeet Kumar,
S/o Shri Girdhari Lal,
Aged 47 year, Working as A.C.
Helper (Group-C).
15. Shri Rishi Pal,
S/o Shri Shadi Singh,
Aged 47 year, Working as A.C.
Technician-I (Group-C).
3 OA-1919/2016
16. Shri Chhotey Lal,
S/o Shri Ram Khilawan,
Aged 58 year, Working as A.C.
Helper (Group-C).
17. Shri Jai Prakash,
S/o Shri Malkhan Singh,
Aged 58 year, Working as A.C.
Technician-I (Group-C).
18. Shri Dinesh Kumar,
S/o Shri Phool Singh,
Aged 54 year, Working as A.C.
Helper (Group-C).

19. Shri Rakesh Kumar,
S/o Shri Ram Chandra Sharma,
Aged 52 year, Working as A.C.
Helper (Group-C).
 20. Shri Ved Prakash,
S/o Shri gulaba Ram,
Aged 58 year, Working as A.C.
Technician-I (Group-C).
- ... Applicants

(By Advocate: Shri Manjeet Singh Reen)

All applicants working under Senior Section A.C.
Coaching Northern Railway, Old Delhi, Delhi)

Versus

Union of India & Others : through

1. Shri A K Puthia, General Manager
Northern Railway, Baroda House
New Delhi.
 2. Shri Arun Arora
Divisional Railway Manager
Northern Railway, State Entry Road
New Delhi.
 3. Shri Harvir Singh
Senior Section Engineer
Northern Railway, AC Coaching
Delhi.
- ...Respondents

(By Advocate: Shri S M Arif)

ORDER (ORAL)

Justice Permod Kohli, Chairman :-

Vide judgment dated 31.05.2015 passed in OA No.
1919/2016 following directions were issued:-

"5. In view of the limited prayer made by the applicants, this OA is disposed of at the admission stage itself without issuing notices to the respondents with a direction to the respondents that the representation dated 02.05.2016 of the applicants herein may be considered by them and in case it is found that the applicants herein are

similarly situated as applicants in OA No. 117/2008, then they shall be extended the same benefits as were granted to the applicants of OA No. 117/2008. In any case, respondents shall communicate their decision to the applicants by means of a reasoned and speaking order within a period of 60 days. No costs."

2. The respondents have filed the compliance affidavit annexing thereto copy of an order dated 14.10.2016, whereby the claim of the applicants has been denied holding that they are not similarly situated. The order is a reasoned one. Shri M.S. Reen, learned counsel appearing for the applicants submits that in similar matters Bombay High Court has decided otherwise. In any case, we cannot examine the validity of this order in the present contempt proceedings, particularly in view of the clear directions of this Tribunal according liberty to the respondents to examine the cases of the applicants in terms of the directions passed in OA No.117/2008.

2. In this view of the matter, the Order of this Tribunal stands complied with. The applicants are at liberty to seek remedial measures, in the event they are still aggrieved with the order of compliance. Hence, the contempt proceedings are dropped. Notices issued to the alleged contemnors are discharged.

(Shekhar Agarwal)
Member(A)

(Justice Permod Kohli)
Chairman

/vb/