

**Central Administrative Tribunal
Principal Bench, New Delhi.**

**RA-22/2016, MA-314/2016, MA-315/2016 in OA-4130/2013
With
RA-23/2016, MA-316/2016, MA-315/2016 in OA-789/2013**

Reserved on : 10.08.2017.

Pronounced on : 17.08.2017.

**Hon'ble Mr. Shekhar Agarwal, Member (A)
Hon'ble Mr. Raj Vir Sharma, Member (J)**

RA-22/2016, MA-314/2016, MA-315/2016 in OA-4130/2013

1. S.K. Balasubramanian, aged about 73 years
Retd Director Avadi Heavy Vehicles
Factory (MOD)
S/o S. Krishnamurthy
Ram Manar, 2nd Floor,
42-M.G., Chakrapani Street,
Sathya Garden, Saligramam,
Chennai-600093.
2. R. Surendra Babu, aged 66 years
Retd Scientist-D, DRDO (MOD)
S/o A. Ramaswamy,
5/1 'OMKARA', 6th F Cross,
Kaggadasapura, C.V. Raman Nagar,
Bangalore-560093.
3. Tilak Raj Dutt, aged about 66 years
Retd Scientist-D, DRDO (MOD)
S/o Om Prakash Dastta,
101, Shakti Regency, 6th Main
Kaggadasapura, C.V. Raman Nagar,
Bangalore-560093.
4. J. Nicholas Babu Rao, aged about 62 years
Retd Scientist-D, DRDO (MOD)
S/o Santhoji Rao,
22/2, 2nd Cross Road, Vivekananda Nagar,
Bangalore-560093.
5. Dr. C.K. Pandey, aged about 73 years,
Retd Director (Geology) – GSI
S/o B.K. Pandey
“BRIJASHRYA” CM 11/1, Sector-B,
Aliganj, Lucknow-226024,(UP).

6. Madhav Kumar Gupta, aged about 61 years
Retd Dy. General Manager,
Canteen Stores Deptt. (MOD)
S/o Dr. R.K. Gupta,
A-401, Venus Building,
Chikuwadi, Borivali (W),
Mumbai-400092.
7. Dr. P.K. Raju, aged about 77 years
Retd. Associate Professor-Indian Institute
of Astrophysics, Dept. of Science & Technology,
S/o P.M. Krishnaswamy,
18 BHCS Layout, 1st Main end Cross,
Bannerghatta Road,
Bangalore-560076.
Karnataka.
8. K.Y. Srinivasan, aged about 79 years
Retd. Dy. CME Rlys.,
S/o K.Y. Ramanujachari,
69-A, 1st Floor, U.R. Nagar Extension,
Anna Nagar West Extn.,
Chennai-600101.
9. G. Srinivasan, aged about 77 years
Retd. Director Finance, DO Telecom,
S/o D. Gopalan,
39/17, 1st Street, LIC Colony,
Dr. Radhakrishnan Nagar,
Thiruvanmiyur, Chennai-600041.
10. K.K. Bansal, aged about 77 years
Retd. Dy. G.M. DO Telecom
S/o Ram Babu,
15 Shayona Bunglows,
Part-I, R.C. Tech Road,
Ghatlodia, Ahmedabad-380061.
11. All India Central Confederation
of Pensioner Associations
through its Secretary General
Sh. Ramachandran S.S. having
Office at 144, New Suryakiran Apts,
Plot No. 65, 5th avenue,
I.P. Extn., Patparganj,
Delhi-10092. Review Applicants

Versus

1. Union of India through
Its Secretary,
Dept. of Expenditure,

Ministry of Finance,
Central Secretariat,
North Block,
New Delhi-110001.

2. The Secretary,
Dept. of Personnel & Pension,
Administrative Reforms and Public Grievance
5th Floor, Sardar Patel Bhawan,
Sansad Marg,
New Delhi-110001. Respondents

RA-23/2016, MA-316/2016, MA-317/2016 in OA-789/2013

1. H. V. Dasan aged about 83 years
Retd Director F & A DO Telecom.
S/o A. Venkataraman
Flat No.2 CEE DEEYES Apt
370, By pass Road, Velacheri,
Chennai-600042.
2. G.K. Aneja aged about 74 years
Retd Director Telecom, DO Telecom.
S/o P.L. Aneja
9602 Sector-C, Pocket-9
Vasautkunj, New Delhi-110070
3. V. Ramakrishna Iyer aged about 78 years
Retd Director, DO Telecom.
S/o R.V. Mani Iyer
T.C, 24/337 Sastha Coil Road
Tycaud, Thiruvananthapuram,
PIN-695014, KERALA
4. E.P. Seshadri aged about 77 years
Retd Director, F&A DO Telecom.
S/o E.S. Parameshwara Iyer
J.P.N. 24, J.P. Nagar
Thiruvananthapuram-695008
KERALA
5. K.V. Mohan Kumar aged about 68 years,
Retd Director, F&A DO Telecom.
S/o Velayudhan Nair
“Sitara”, TC-35/2565
Valiyvila, Tirumala
Thiruvananthapuram-695006

Kerala.

6. T.C. Linganna aged about 74 years
Retd Director, DO Telecom.
S/o Chinna Kannu
15, Ganga Street, Rajaji Nagar,
Villiwakkam, Chennai-600049.
7. P.R. Gopala Krishnan Nair aged about 79 years
Retd Director, F&A DO Telecom.
S/o K.P. Raman Nair
Kavyam, 49/524, Parayad Road
Elamakkara, Kochi-682026
Kerala.
8. K. Subramanian aged about 71 years
Retd Director, F&A DO Telecom.
S/o S. Krishnamurthy,
148/2, Gitanjali Colony, 7th Avenue
Anna Nagar(West)
Chennai-600040
9. K. Gopalan aged about 73 years
Retd Director, F&A DO Telecom.
S/o V. Krishnaswamy
Flat No.11, Ganapathy Villa
New No.26, Ramachandra Street
T. Nagar, Chennai-600017
10. T.K.K. Iyengar aged about 75 years
Retd Joint Commr. Income Tax, CBDT
S/o T.S. Raghavachar
540, 22nd Cross, 14th Main
Banasankari 2nd stage
Bangalore-560070
Karnataka.
11. M. Dandhapani aged about 75 years
Retd Dy. Commr, Income Tax CBDT
S/o Muthuswamy
No.14, T.D. Main Girinagar 2nd phase
Banasankari 3rd stage
Bangalore-560085
12. N. Srinivasan. aged about 79 years
Retd Dy. Commr, Income Tax CBDT

S/o Natesan,
Site No. 94, 8th Cross,
Opposite to food world, 2nd stage
1st Phase, Chandra Layout
Bangalore-560040
Karnataka

13. V.S.N. Rao aged about 76 years
Retd DGM. DO Telecom.
S/o Srinivasa Rao,
1174 Bel Layout, 2nd Phase
1st main 1st Cross, Vidhyaranyapuram
Bangalore-560097
Karnataka.

14. M.R. Viswanatha, aged about 72 years
Retd DGM, DO Telecom.
S/o Ramaswamiaiah
72, Telecom Colony, NTY layout
Bangalore-560026.
Karnataka.

15. K.G. Shetty aged about 75 years
Retd Director, DO Telecom.
S/o M. Nagappa Shetty
53, NTY layout,
Bangalore-560025.
Karnataka.

16. B.R. Rao aged about 73 years
Retd DGM, DO Telecom.
S/o A.T. Rao
100, Telecom. Colony, NTY layout
Off Mysore Road
Bangalore-560026
Karnataka.

17. K.G. Kulgod aged about 70 years
Retd DGM. DO Telecom.
S/o Bimaj
258 AECS, 1st stage, 3rd Main
Geddalalahalli, Bangalore- 560094
Karnataka.

18. M.G.N. Moorthy aged about 75 years
Retd DGM. DO Telecom.

S/o N. Gopala Sastry
77, 12th Main, BSK 2nd stage
Bangalore-560070
Karnataka.

19. M.N. Satyanarayana Rao aged about 75 years

Retd Director, DO Telecom.
S/o V. Nanjappa
1187-35-C Cross, 28th Main
4 K.T. Block, Jayanagar
Bangalore-560041.
Karnataka.

20. B.R. Shankar Rao aged about 74 years

Retd Director DO Telecom.
S/o Ramachandra Rao
991/1 E Main Road Girinagar 2nd phase
Bangalore-560085.
Karnataka.

21. S. Sathyanarayana Rao aged about 75 years

Retd Director, DO Telecom.
S/o S. Subba Rao
76-12 Main Road 29th Cross
BSK 2nd stage Bangalore-560070
Karnataka.

22. T.N. Sonwalkar aged about 77 years

Retd Director, Silk Board
Ministry of Commerce
S/o N.B. Sonwalkar
672- 9th Main 23rd Cross
Sector-7, HSR layout
Bangalore-560102
Karnataka.

23. S.G. Vittal aged about 79 years

Retd Director, DO Telecom.
S/o S. Govinda Rao
84, 3rd Main, Dattatraya Nagar
B.S.K. 3rd stage
Bangalore-560085
Karnataka.

24. T.A. Gopalakrishnan aged about 75 years

Retd Director, DO Telecom.

S/o T.G. Ananthakrishnan
1870-32 Cross-, 10th main
B.S.K. 2nd stage
Bangalore-560070
Karnataka.

25. M. Jagannath aged about 73 years

Retd Director, DO Telecom.

S/o M.S. Rao
442, 7th Cross 2nd Block
R.T. Nagar, Bangalore-560032.
Karnataka.

26. R. Subramanian aged about 71 years

Retd Director, F&A DO Telecom.

S/o T.K. Ramaswami
21/7 Kurinji Illam, Gurukkal Colony
West, Chinna Tirupathi Salem-636008

27. N.S. Balakrishnan aged about 79 years

Retd Director Costing,
Ministry of Finance
S/o N.K. Sundaresa Iyer,
503, Sundeep Appt, Amrut Nagar
Ghatkopar West. Mumbai-400086

28. C.U. Sarma, aged about 75 years

Retd DGM, DO Telecom.

S/o Veerabhadra Rao
11-3-369, Road No.13,
Alakapuri, Hyderabad-500035.

29. P.D. Deshpande aged about 71 years

Retd DGM, DO Telecom.

S/o Damodar,
BAHAR, 124, Telecom. Nagar
Nagpur-440022.

30. A.S. Kothandaraman aged about 75 years

Retd Director, F&A DO Telecom.

S/o A.H. Sundaresan
Flat No. IV, 2nd floor, Plot-B
Parson Riverina,
10, Ammamandapam Road
Srirangam-620006.
Tamil Nadu.

31. Gopinath Tripathy, aged about 76 years

Retd Director, DO Telecom.

S/o Ramakrishna Tripathy

74, Madhusudan Nagar, Unit-IV

Bhubaneshwar-751001.

Odisha

32. Sarjit Singh aged about 74 years

Retd Scientist, DRDO,

Ministry of Defence

S/o Harbans Singh

Vill & PO: Khurdpur, Dist- Jalandhar-144102.

Punjab.

33. A.K. Malhotra aged about 67 years

Retd. Director GSI

S/o R.C. Malhotra

Plot No. 255, Flat No. S-2, Anand Niketan

Adarshnagar, Jaipur-302004.

Rajasthan.

34. G.S. Bhat aged about 75 years

Retd Director, DO Telecom.

S/o G. Kesava Bhat

Padmakripa Ananthashayana

Karkala- 574104

Karnataka.

35. M.G.K. Nair aged about 79 years

Retd. Director I.C.A.R.

S/o C.S.V.R. Sastry

Room No. 7B, Shrimahaganapthy Sevashram,

Vattiyoor Kavu

Thiruvananthapuram-695013.

Kerala

36. H.S. Iyer, aged about 76 years

Retd. Director F&A ICAR

S/o S. Harihara Iyer

39-B Vinayak Nagar,

Thiruvananthapuram- 695018

Kerala.

37. N.V. Goplakrishnan aged about 71 years

Retd. Scientist –D DRDO,

Ministry Of Defence
S/o N.R.V. Iyer
Gokul No.13, 3rd Cross
Jayabharatha Nagar.
Bangalore-560033.
Karnataka

38. V.M. Selvaraj aged about 69 years

Retd Scientist -D DRDO,
Ministry Of Defence
S/o V.M. Manickkavelu
2562, 16-D Main Road,
HAL 2nd stage Bangalore- 560008
Karnataka.

39. V. Lakshmana Rao aged about 71 years

Retd. DGM, DO Telecom.
S/o S. Venkat Rao
A-102 prince manor
114, PH Road, Kellys, Kilpauk,
Chennai-600010

40. V. Gurumurthy aged about 71 years

Retd DGM DO Telecom.
S/o N. Venkatanarayanan
12, Sreeram Nagar, 2nd street
Vyasarpady, Chennai-600039.

41. T.S. Divakar aged about 73 years

Retd. Scientist-D, D.R.D.O,
Ministry Of Defence
S/o T.N. Shamanna
713, 8th Main Indiranagar, HAL 2nd stage,
Bangalore- 560008
Karnataka.

42. S. Ramaswamy aged about 73 years

Retd. DGM, DO Telecom.
S/o K. Sundararajan,
5, Telegraph, Colony,
Nanganallur, Chennai-600061.

43. R. Srinivasan aged about 73 years

Retd Director, DO Telecom.
S/o S. Radhakrishnan

New 6, Kannika Colony,
2nd Street Nanganalur, Chennai-600061.

44. G. Vallinayagam, aged about 73 years

Retd. DGM, DO Telecom.
S/o V.M. Ganapatyappa Pillai
928, Maxworth Nagar
Sunnambukulathur Main Road,
Chennai-600117.

45. N. Venugopalan aged about 72 years

Retd. DGM, DO Telecom.
S/o S. Natesan
2/26 Rajagopalan Street
West Mambalam, Chennai-600033.

46. M.N. Dange aged about 70 years

Retd. Director GSI
S/o N.D. Dange
G-2 Mitra Appt
188, Pandey Layout
Khamla, Nagpur-440025.
Maharashtra.

47. K.V.S. Bhaskara Rao aged about 64 years

Retd. Director GSI
S/o K. Narashimamurthy
122, Swami Colony
Katal Road, Nagpur- 440013.
Maharashtra.

48. L.V. Sundaram, aged about 74 years

Retd. DGM, DO Telecom.
S/o L.R. Viswanathan
H 113/1 18th Cross Street
Vasanthnagar, Chennai-600090.

49. B. Chakkavorty aged about 74 years

Retd. DGM, DO Telecom.
S/o P.C. Chakravorty
49/7, B.T. Road, Narendranagar,
Kolkata-700056.

50. Mrigendra Kumar Saha aged about 76 years

Retd. Director, DO Telecom.
S/o M.K. Saha

12/4/K Priyanath Chakraborty Lane
Baranagar, Kolkata-700035.

51. Gouresh Chandra Dev aged about 74 years

Retd. Director, DO Telecom.

S/o B.C. Dev

P-46 Tagore Park

R.N. Tagore Road Belgharia,
Kolkata-700056.

52. Proceed Kumar Ray aged about 70 years

Retd. Director, DO Telecom.

S/o B.K. Ray

114, Ashokgarh, Kolkata-700108

53. Ajit Chandra De aged about 72 years

Retd. Director, DO Telecom.

S/o Ashwini Kumar De

Flat 4A, Plot 1-51/2, Moore Avenue,
Kolkata-700040.

54. Jagatjyoti Deb aged about 74 year

Retd. Director, DO Telecom.

S/o Jagatjiban Dev

96, Subhayan Park,

Kolkata-700061

55. Dr. Satyabrata Chakravorty aged about 68 years

Retd. Director G.S.I.

S/o S.N. Chakravorty

15/8, Rajkishore Pal lane

Jadavpur, Kolkata-700075.

56. Tridib Kumar Chatterjee aged about 72 years

Retd. Director, DO Telecom.

S/o Bireswar Chatterjee

17 F Balleygunj station Road

Balleygunj, Kolkata-700019.

57. Mohit Kumar Saha aged about 75 years

Retd. DGM, DO Telecom.

S/o M.N. Saha

12-1-D Gangulipara Lane Paikpara,

Kolkata-700002

58. Amalkrishna Das aged about 75 years

Retd. Director, DO Telecom.
S/o Mahananda Das
H/1-31, S.L. Sarani, Baguihati,
Kolkata-700059.

59. K.A. Visweswaraiah aged about 71 years

Retd. Director, DO Telecom.
S/o K. Annaiah Sastry
253 F Block, Sahakara Nagar,
Bangalore-560092.
Karnataka.

60. K.R. Siddeswar aged about 71 years

Retd. Director, DO Telecom.
S/o R.T. Siddeswar
195, G-Block 17th Main, 7th Cross
Sahakara Nagar, Bangalore-560092.
Karnataka

61. M.S. Venkataramaiah aged about 75 years

Retd. DGM, DO Telecom.
S/o Srinivasaiah
279, F-Block, Sahakara Nagar
16th Main Bangalore-560092
Karnataka.

62. S.P. Venkatesh Jois aged about 73 years

Retd. Director, DO Telecom.
S/o S. Putta Shama Jois
722, 2nd Cross, 16th main A- Block
Sahakara Nagar, Bangalore-560092.
Karnataka.

63. S.P. Misra aged about 78 years

Retd. Director, DO Telecom.
S/o Ramanand Misra
17, Avas Vikas Colony
Batiahatta (North) Gorakhpur-273061.
Uttar Pradesh.

64. T.K. Viswanathan aged about 77 years

Retd. Director, DO Telecom.
S/o M.S. Krishna Iyer
Plot -16, Road-7 Balmiki Street
Gandhinagar, Saligramam,
Chennai-600093.

65. H.M. Nagabhushana aged about 72 years

Retd. Principal Scientific Officer,
Ministry Of Defence
S/o H. Mylraiah
86A CIL layout
2nd Main RMV Extension
Stage-II Sanjoynagar,
Bangalore-560094.
Karnataka.

66. T. Sreeranga aged about 74 years

Retd. Principal Scientific Officer,
Ministry Of Defence
S/o T. Thirunarayananachar
230, 15th Main Bhanasankari
2nd Stage Bangalore-560070.
Karnataka.

67. B. Rajasekhar aged about 71 years

Retd DGM, Do Telecom.
S/o B. Satyanarayana Sarma
126, 8th Cross, Soudhamini Layout
Konanakunte, Bangalore-560062.
Karnataka.

68. G.R. Sundaram aged about 71 years

Retd. Director Ordnance Factory.
Ministry Of Defence
S/o G.S. Ramaswamy
D-102, Payal palace Apartment
7th Main, 3rd Block, 4th stage
Basaveswarnagar, Bangalore-560079.
Karnataka.

69. T.V. Seshadri aged about 71 years

Retd. Principal Scientific Officer,
Ministry Of Defence
S/o T.V. Venkatachar,
B-1/8, 1st main Road.
Reliable Lake view residency,
Halur Road,
Bangalore-560102.
Karnataka.

70. V.R.K. Iyengar, aged about 71 years

Retd. DGM, DO Telecom.
S/o S.V. Rangachar
“Shriswetadri”
39/9B, 1st E Cross, Remco Layout
Vijayanagar, Bangalore-560104.
Karnataka.

71. A. Thulasi Das aged about 73 years
Retd. Director Met. Department
S/o A. Parthasarathy Naidu
5/8 B.D.A. Flat B.T.M. layout
Bannerghatta Road
Bangalore-560076.
Karnataka.

72. Amitabh Roy aged about 66 years
Retd Director GSI
S/o J.P. Roy
Flat No.12, Mahendra Villa
45, K.P.Road, Behala, Kolkata-700060

73. A.S. Banerjee aged about 73 years
Retd Director GSI
S/o Ganganarayan Banerjee
C-4, Green Wood HSG Co-Op Ltd.
315-B Upen Banerjee Road,
Kolkata-700060.

74. S.K. Basu aged about 67 years
Retd. Director GSI
S/o Harendra N. Basu
Flat- No.4- 31M H Block Group-II
Patuli Township,
Kolkata- 700094.

75. Abhijit Ghosh aged about 74 years.
Retd Director GSI
S/o Berendra Nath Ghosh
B-7/2, 68/1 Bagmari Road,
Kolkata-700054.

76. S.P. Banerjee aged about 74 years
Retd Director GSI
S/o Gopalchandra Banerjee
DB-II Flat -115 Sector-I Salt Lake City,

Kolkata-700064.

77. B.B. Mullick aged about 73 years

Retd. Director GSI

S/o Ajit Kumar Mullick

Vill- Narendrapur

PO- Munsirhat, Dist- Howrah-711410.

78. Subhas Chandra Ray aged about 72 years

Retd. Director DO Telecom.

S/o Dwarka Nath Ray

Flat 211 Block-34, Parnasreepally

Govt. quarters,

Kolkata-700060.

79. Kulendu Das Gupta aged about 75 years

Retd. Director DO Telecom.

S/o Suresh Chandra Das Gupta

67, Flat-D Jadunath Mukherjee Road,

Behala,

Kolkata-700034.

80. Pranab Kumar Basu aged about 71 years

Retd. Director DO Telecom.

S/o Hirendranath Basu

BJ-175 Salt lake Sector-II

Kolkata-700091.

81. Subhas Chandra Basu aged about 70 years

Retd. Director, DO Telecom.

S/o Radharaman Basu

CD-279 2nd floor Sector-I

Saltlake City, Kolkata-700064.

82. Sudhir Chandra Haldar aged about 69 years

Retd. Director DO Telecom.

S/o Suresh Chandra Haldar

31 New Road Mandirpara Birati

Kolkata-700051.

83. Nityagopal Kundu aged about 74 years

Retd. DGM DO Telecom.

S/o Kanailal Kundu

41-A Narendra Nagar, Belghoria,

Kolkata-700056.

84. R. Subramanian aged about 72 years

Retd. DGM DO Telecom.
S/o E.N. Ramanathan
RA-A-703 Poorva Riveria Apartment
Marathapally, Old Airport Road,
Bangalore-560103.
Karnataka.

85. R. Varadarajan aged about 71 years

Retd. Director DO Telecom.
S/o V. Ramamoorthy
2-B Srinivas Apartment
46/48, Unnamalai Ammal Street
T. Nagar, Chennai-600017.

86. M.C. Kesavamurthy Rao aged about 79 years

Retd. Deputy Commission
Ministry of Water Resources
S/o Chakrapani Rao MR
770, 16th Main 17th Cross, Banasankari 2nd Stage,
Bangalore-560070. Karnataka.

87. T.N. Ganapathy aged about 72 years

Retd. DGM, DO Telecom.
S/o T.S. Nagarajan
9/15 10th Street,
Shantinagar, Adambakkam,
Chennai-600088.

88. R. Ganapathyraman aged about 70 years

Retd. DGM, DO Telecom.
S/o Rama Iyer
4-151 Parvatipuram, Nagarcoil- 629003.
Tamil Nadu.

89. N. Parthasarathy aged about 72 years

Retd. Director DO Telecom.
S/o N. Srinivasan
9, East Tank Street, Triplicane,
Chennai-600005

90. A.V. Chepe aged about 74 years

Retd. Director GSI
S/o A. Bhalachandra Chepe
14, Dindayalnagar, New Friends layout,

Nagpur-440022.
Maharashtra.

91. G.C. Satyanarayanan aged about 73 years

Retd. Director GSI
S/o GSR Krishna Iyer
71, Dindayal Nagar, New Friends Layout,
Nagpur-440022.
Maharashtra.

92. S.S. Bose aged about 69 years

Retd. Director GSI
S/o Sripada Bose
FD-220/2, Sector-III, Salt Lake City
Bidhan Nagar,
Kolkata-700016.

93. S. Mohan Gandhi aged about 78 years

Retd. Joint Commissioner of Income Tax
CBDT, Ministry of Finance
S/o Dr. R. Sundararajan
188A Thatheneri Main Road,
Dr. Sundara Rajan Nagar
Madurai-625-018.
Tamil Nadu.

94. G. Natarajan aged about 77 years

Retd. Joint Commissioner of Income Tax
CBDT, Ministry of Finance
S/o K. Guruswamy
New No.1 old No.38, G, Block 8th street
Anna Nagar,
Chennai-600040.

95. P.K.S. Manian aged about 71 years

Retd DGM DO Telecom.
S/o P.S. Krishnan
27/5 Rupam Apartments
Pondicherry Road, Kotturpuram,
Chennai- 600085.

96. P.N. Alace aged about 72 years

Retd DGM, DO Telecom.
S/o Perianayagam
2, 7th Street Rajajinagar, Villiakkam,
Chennai-600049.

97.R. Ganesan aged about 74 years

Retd. DGM, DO Telecom.

S/o N. Rajagopalan

817-A prestige, Shantiniketan

Near ITPL, White Field Road,

Bangalore-560048.

Karnataka

98.V. Narayananan aged about 75 years

Retd Joint Commr. CBDT

S/o venkataraman

C/o G. Kumar

New No.3- III Avenue, Basant Nagar,

Chennai-600090.

99.Dr. Barin Chatterjee aged about 71 years

Retd. Director GSI

S/o N.C. Chatterjee

Flat- HIG-B-1/4, Calcutta Green,

Phase-I, 1050/2 Survey Park,

Kolkata-700075.

100. R. Aravamudan aged about 73 years

Retd. Joint Commr. CBDT

S/o R. Raghavachari

Flat No.12, 1st floor Mahalaxmi Flats

137/138 Pilliarkoil Street Jafferkhanpet,

Chennai-600083.

101.M.V. Sankaranarayanan aged about 77 years

Retd. Director F&A DO Telecom.

S/o M.R. Venkatachalam

46, Kailash Apartment 45,

I- P-Ext. Delhi-110092.

102.Priya Gopal Goswami aged about 75 years

Retd. Director, DO Telecom.

S/o Srigopal Goswami

No.3 Khelati Babu Lane

Belgachhia, Kolkata-700037.

103.S.A. Pandhare aged about 71 years

Retd. Director GSI.

S/o Appaji

Flat- A-2/403, Rahul Towers

Right Bhusari Colony Kothrud,

Pune-411038.
Maharashtra

104.D. Rajasekaran aged about 77 years

Retd. Joint Commr. CBDT
Ministry of Finance
S/o B.M. Duraiswami
New 78, Old V-99, 5th main Road
Anna Nagar, Chennai-600040.

105.T.V. P. Rao aged about 77 years

Retd. Director, DO Telecom.
S/o T. Ananda Rao
A-17 Kakatia Appts Plot-86
I-P Extn Patparganj, Delhi-110092.

106.C. Obuleshu aged about 73 years

Retd. Director F&A, DO Telecom.
S/o Chinta Narasimhappa
Flat- No. 304, Sri Srinivasa Vihar Appts.
Rukmanipuram, A.S. Rao Nagar,
Hyderabad-500062.

107.K.G.S. Subramaniam aged about 80 years

Retd. Director, DO Telecom.
S/o A.S.R. Krishna Iyer
F-3 Vijay Castle
7th Street Laxmi Nagar, 1st stage
Nanganallur, Chennai-600061.

108.Sachidananda Sakha Mondal aged about 76 years

Retd. Director, DO Telecom.
S/o Bankim Chandra Mondal
Roy Nagar Dimond Harbor,
PO/ Dist- South-24 Parganas-743331.

109.S. Pachiappan aged about 73 years

Retd. Director F&A, DO Telecom.
S/o S. Murugesa Mudali
205, Krishna Residency
AIR by pass Road, Annamiah Marg.
Trirupathi-517501.
Andhra Pradesh.

110.S.W. Khankoje aged about 80 years

Retd. Director, DO Telecom.

S/o W.R. Khankoje
Plot- No. 74, 3/721 Nehru Nagar
Bilaspur-495001.
Chattisgarh.

111.S. Sundaram aged about 79 years

Retd. Director, DO Telecom.
S/o K.S. Subramaniam
Old 12, New 22- Sivaraman Street
Mandavali Chennai- 600028.

112.G.V. Radhakrishnan aged about 76 years

Retd. Dy. G.M. DO Telecom.
S/o G.S. Venkataraman.
Old 8, New ¾, 3rd Street Gill Nagar,
Chennai-600014.

113.K.S. Prakash Murthy aged about 59 years

Retd. Scientist –D DRDO
Ministry Of Defence
S/o K. S.N. Murthy
Flat- 705 Block-D Mantri Tranquil
7/9/13 Gubblala Off Kanakapura Road
Bangalore-560061.
Karnataka.

114. Mrs. Pramila S. Chabria aged about 66 years

Retd. Scientist –D DRDO
Ministry Of Defence
Wife of Mr. Shyam Chabria
No.5, 2nd cross, N.S. Iyengar Street,
Sheshadripuram,
Bangalore. 560020.
Karnataka.

115.Mrs. T.S. Prabhavati aged about 66 years

Retd. Scientist –D DRDO
Ministry Of Defence
Wife of Sri D.S. Nagraj
No.16 2nd Main Road Tata Silk Farm
Basavangudi, Bangalore-560004.
Karnataka.

116. Mr. V.K. Govardhan aged about 69 years.

Retd. Dy. CME (SE RLY.)
S/o V. Kanakaiah

32-77/13 (SR-40) Sitharam Nagar
New Safilguda, R.K. Puram,
Hyderabad-500056.

117.N. Dinakar kale aged about 78 years
Retd. Scientist –D DRDO
Ministry Of Defence
S/o Sri Nanjappa
4, Arachana apartment (S-1)
12th Cross Margosa Road,
Malleswaram, Bangalore-560003.
Karnataka.

118.M.V. Joga Rao aged about 81 years
Retd. Director GSI
S/o Konecti Rao
402, Niltarang Apartments
Plot- No.9 Amravati Road
Nagpur-440033.
Maharashtra.

119.A.C. Khare aged about 71 years
Retd. Director GSI
S/o Banwarilal Srivastava
D-3 Mulick Complex, Somalwada,
Nagpur-440025.
Maharashtra.

120.G.K. Sudheendra aged about 62 years
Retd. Scientist –D DRDO
Ministry Of Defence
S/o G. Krishnamurthy
No.8 to Sukhasampada, Green Field-II Layout
Singapur Gardens, Kanakapura Road,
Doddakalaba Sandra, Bangalore-560062.
Karnataka.

121.R.S. Subba Rao aged about 72 years
Retd. Scientist –D DRDO
Ministry Of Defence
S/o R. Sankara Rao
No.878, 19th main 14th cross
BSK-II 2nd stage, Bangalore-560070
Karnataka.

122.U.G. Uppin aged about 69 years

Retd. Scientist –D DRDO MOD
S/o G.V. Uppin
32, NHCS layout Cauveri Nagar
Magadi Road, Bangalore-560079.
Karnataka.

123.K.V. Jagdish aged about 58 years
Retd. Scientist –D DRDO
Ministry Of Defence
S/o K. Venkobasa
24, 8th Cross 1st, Main
Prashanta Nagar, Bangalore-560079.
Karnataka.

124.H. Achutha aged about 73 years
Retd. Scientist –D DRDO
Ministry Of Defence
S/o H. Gopal Rao
983, Gopal Service Road,
RPG Layout, Hampinagar,
Bangalore-560104.
Karnataka.

125.M.S. Seshadri aged about 68 years
Retd. Chief Admn Officer,
Western Naval Command
Ministry Of Defence
S/o Srinivasachari
S-5 Prababati Garden apartments
1st Cross Lake City Layout. Kodichikkannahalli
Near Bus stop, Bangalore-560076.
Karnataka.

126.Narendra Nath Biswas aged about 76 years
Retd. Director DO Telecom.
S/o Harinath Biswas,
Flat No.C/3, Ideal Association, VIP Road
CIT scheme VII M, Kolkata-700054.

127. K.L. Mishra aged about 78 years
Retd. Director GSI
S/o Padamnath Mishra
170-A/549 Sainik Colony,
Faridabad.-121001.
Haryana.

128.K. Vasudevan aged about 62 years
Retd Joint Commr. of Income Tax, CBDT
S/o S. Krishnaswami
Flat 11, Block-E
Golden Jubilee Apartment Anna Main Road.
K.K. Nagar, Chennai-600078.

129.B.S. Venkatanarasaiah aged about 71 years
Retd Joint Commr. of Income Tax, CBDT
S/o B.V. Suryanarayanaiah
Ashadeep 682 12th cross-, 7th Block
West, Jayanagar, Bangalore-560082.
Karnataka

130. L. Gurusamy aged about 67 years
Retd Dy. Commr. of Income Tax, CBDT
S/o S. Laxminarashimahan
139, K.S. Ramaswami Street
K.K. Pudur Coimbatore-641038.
Tamil Nadu

131.P. Vijayakumar aged about 64 years
Retd Dy. Commr. of Income Tax, CBDT
S/o E.P. Parameswaran
Vysakham, 23/208-A, Gramam Road
(Sivam Coil Road) Tattamangalam,
Palakkad Dist- 678102.
Kerala

132. K. Padmanabhan aged about 77 years
Retd Dy. Secretary Ministry of Finance
S/o S. Krishnamurthy
119, DDA Flat Sector-V, Dwarka,
New Delhi-110075.

133.A.K. Mukhopadhyaya aged about 67 years
Retd. Director GSI
S/o Sisir Kumar Mukhopadhyaya Flat No.2,
31/M, Block-H Patauli Township,
Kolkata-700094.

134. K. Vaidyanathan aged about 75 years
Retd Dy. Commr. of Income Tax, CBDT
S/o N.R. Krishna Iyer
15 Old,47-New, North Usman Road,
T. Nagar, Chennai-600017.

135.J. Nagarajan aged about 62 years

Retd. Senior Social scientist (S-21)

Ministry of Urban Development

S/o S. Jayaraman

AO-31, Kalakunj,

TCPO Officers CGHS Ltd.

Shalimar Bagh, New Delhi-110088

136.Prakash Chandra Bhushan aged about 81 years

Retd Principal Zonal Training School West Rly

S/o K.C. Sharma

“Shardeya” Shiv Colony, Kundan Nagar,

Ajmer-305007 (Rajasthan)

137.D.C. Soni aged about 76 years

Retd DGM DO Telecom

S/o R.R. Soni

67, Ganga Appartment, Alaknanda

Kalkaji, New delhi-110019.

138.D. Veerabhadra Rao aged about 79 Years

Retd. Director F&A DO Telecom

S/o D. Seetharamamurthy

45-57-17, Narasimha Nagar

Saligramapuram, Visakhapatnam-530024

Andhra Pradesh.

139. A. | Mohd. Reeza aged 60 years

Retd. Joint Commissioner of Income Tax CBDT.

S/o A. Abdul Rahim

397-A, VGR Puram,

Alagesan Road, Sai Baba Colony

Coimbatore-641011

Tamil Nadu

140.Indu Bhushan Chhibber aged about 79 years

Retd. Director GSI.

S/o Bakshi Krishandas Chibbar

302, 3rd Floor, Springdale -I, Sterling Apartments

Raj Nagar, Nagpur-440013

Maharashtra.

141.Jagdeesh Narayan Mehrotra aged 78 years

Retd. Director (JAG-S-21) Indian Railways

S/o R. N. Mehrotra

3/106, Vishal Khand, Gomti Nagar,
Lucknow-226010
Uttar Pradesh

142.Smt. Sulbha Arvind Kulkarni.
W/o Late A.G. Kulkarni
Retd. Dist. Manager DO Telecom
C/o Raju A. Kulkarni
GF-9, Thakkar Bazar
New CBS, Nashik-422001
Maharashtra

143.All India Central Confederation of Pensioner Associations
Through its Secretary General
Sh. Ramachandran S.S.
having office at
144, New Suryakiran Apts,
Plot No.65, 5th avenue,
I.P.Extn., Patparganj,
Delhi-110092. Review Applicants

Versus

1. Union of India
Through its Secretary
Dept. of Expenditure
Ministry of Finance
Central Secretariat
North Block
New Delhi-110001.

2. The Secretary
Dept of Personnel & Pension
Administrative Reforms and Public Grievance
5th Floor, Sardar Patel Bhawan,
Sansad Marg,
New Delhi-110001. Respondents

Present : Sh. Soumyajit Pani, counsel for review applicants.

Sh. Rajesh Katyal, counsel for respondents.

ORDER

Mr. Shekhar Agarwal, Member (A)

These two review applications have been filed for review of our common order dated 28.01.2015 by which OA-971/2012, OA-789/2013 and OA-4130/2013 were dismissed. Applicants in all the three OAs approached the Hon'ble High Court of Delhi by means of Writ Petition. Thereafter, applicants of OA-789/2013 (H.V. Dasan & Ors. Vs. Ministry of Finance) and applicants of OA-4130/2013 (S.K. Balasubramaniam Vs. Ministry of Finance) pleaded before Hon'ble High Court that the Tribunal has dismissed all the three OAs but only facts and arguments of OA-971/2012 have been discussed in the order. They submitted that the case of the applicants of these two OAs was factually different and had the Tribunal taken this into account the result of the OAs would have been different. They further submitted that they would like to file review application before the Tribunal and highlight these submissions. On their so pleading, Hon'ble High Court of Delhi vide order dated 14.10.2015 disposed of the Writ Petition giving liberty to the applicants of the OAs to file a review application before the Tribunal. Accordingly, these review applications have been filed before us. It is noteworthy that the Writ Petition No. 10148/2015 filed by applicants of OA-971/2012 titled S.N. Dixit & Ors. Vs. UOI & Ors. has since been

dismissed by Hon'ble High Court and order of the Tribunal has been upheld.

2. The respondents have filed their reply opposing the review applications on the ground that there was no error in the judgment and that in the guise of the review applications the applicants were only trying to re-argue the matter.

3. We have heard learned counsel for the review applicants Sh. Soumyajit Pani and learned counsel for the respondents Sh. Rajesh Katyal and have perused the material placed on record. Sh. Pani pressed, mainly, the following grounds before us:-

(i) The applicants herein were different from the applicants of OA-971/2012 inasmuch those applicants were working in lower grades whereas almost all the review applicants herein were working in Grade S-21.

(ii) The applicants had submitted their written submissions. While the Tribunal has taken note of these submissions in para-6 of the judgment, no finding has been returned on the same.

(iii) In particular, their argument about allowing higher pay band to Lt. Cols/Cols and denying the same to civilians has not been considered by the Tribunal.

4. We have considered the above submissions. On perusal of the impugned judgment, we find that the OAs were dismissed mainly on the grounds narrated in paras-18 & 19 of the order. The relevant portions of the judgment are reproduced as hereunder:-

“18.....In the above mentioned cases Hon’ble Supreme Court has pointed out the limitation of the Courts in determining the issue of pay parity and has observed that it requires an Expert Body to do so. It cannot be done by self serving affidavits or counter affidavits. Further, they have laid down that such parity can be granted only after considering the nature or quantum of work, source and mode of recruitment/appointment, qualifications, responsibilities, reliability, experience and other functional needs, etc. Further, they have stated that this principle can be invoked only if there is wholesale identity between the two groups.

19. In the instant case it is admitted position that applicants are much junior to those with whom they are seeking parity namely those working in S-24 and higher grades. Such incumbents would be having different nature of duties and responsibilities, would be different in experience level, would have come through different methods of recruitment/appointment and would be discharging different duties all together. In fact, the applicants themselves are not homogenous group working in different grades, having different qualification and experience etc. As such, their claim for parity with those in S-24 to S-27 grades is not sustainable.”

4.1 A mere reading of the aforesaid paras would reveal that we have come to the conclusion that ‘equal pay for equal work’ cannot be applied in this case as those working in grade S-24 and above had different duties and responsibilities as well as experience level as compared to the applicants, who were working in lower grades. On that basis, the OAs have been dismissed. Thus, we have found that since the applicants were working in lower grades and having different nature of duties, they cannot seek parity with their seniors in so far as pay scales and grant of pensionary benefits were concerned. This view has also been subsequently upheld by

Hon'ble High Court while deciding WP(C) No. 10148/2015 filed in the case of S.N. Dixit and Ors. (supra) challenging our order. Hon'ble High Court has clearly observed that Article 14 was not applicable in this case. In this view of the matter, it was not material whether the applicants were working in S-21 or in lower grades. All of them would in any case not be similarly placed as those working in grades S-24 to S-27 with whom they were comparing themselves. Since the very locus standi of the applicants to claim parity with those working in S-24 and S-27 has not been accepted by us, it was not necessary for us to return finding on each and every issue raised by them. Thus, we do not find any merit in the contention of the review applicants that their case was different from the case of applicants of OA-971/2012 and, therefore, deserved to be dealt with separately. Also, there is not merit in their contention that their written submissions, in particular, their argument about granting higher pay band to Lt. Cols/Cols has not been considered by this Tribunal.

5. No other ground was pressed before us. In any case, we find that other grounds mentioned in the review applications as well as in written submissions given by the review applicants, an attempt has been made to re-argue the matter without pointing out any error apparent on the face of the record in the judgment. This is beyond review jurisdiction.

6. We, therefore, do not find any merit in these review applications and dismiss the same. No costs.

(Raj Vir Sharma)
Member (J)

(Shekhar Agarwal)
Member (A)

/vinita/