

**Central Administrative Tribunal
Principal Bench**

**RA No.169/2017
In
OA No.2344/2017**

New Delhi, this the 26th day of July, 2017

**Hon'ble Mr. V. Ajay Kumar, Member (J)
Hon'ble Mr. Shekhar Agarwal, Member (A)**

D/o Personnel & Training,
Through its Under Secretary,
M/o Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions,
North Block,
New Delhi.

(By Advocate : Shri Hanu Bhaskar)

...Applicant

Versus

1. Shri Hemant Kumar,
S/o Subash Chand,
R/o H.No.384, H Block,
Kali Bari Marg,
New Delhi-110001,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Finance,
D/o Revenue, North Block, New Delhi-110001.
2. Shri Amit Kumar Gupta, Aged about 33 years,
S/o Late Suresh Chand Gupta,
R/o 75, Marg No.2, Laxmi Nagar,
Brahmapuri, Jaipur,
Rajasthan-302002,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Finance,
Department of Revenue, North Block, New Delhi-110001.
3. Saurabh Tiwari, Aged about 31 years,
S/o Harish Chandra Tiwari,
R/o A-2/32-33, Sector-4,
Rohini, Delhi-110085,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Textiles,
Udyog Bhawan, New Delhi-110001.
4. Hemlata Mathur, Aged about 31 years,
D/o Ramswaroop Mathur,
R/o E-106, Budh Vihar, Phase 2,

Shani Bazar Road,
Delhi-110086.

Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Coal,
Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi-110001.

5. Sushil Kumar Bharti, Aged about 33 years,
S/o Satish Kumar,
R/o C-682, Sangam Vihar,
New Delhi-110080,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Commerce and
Industry, Directorate General of Foreign Trade,
Udyog Bhawan, New Delhi-110001.
6. Ranjana Kumari, Aged about 31 years,
D/o Lal Babu,
R/o 610, Minto Road Hostel,
New Delhi-110002,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', UPSC,
Shahjahan Road, Dholpur House,
New Delhi-110069.
7. Ritu, Aged about 29 years,
D/o Shri Bhagwan,
R/o M-92, Pratap Market,
Munirka,
New Delhi-110067.
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', UPSC, Shahjahan Road,
Dholpur House,
New Delhi-110069.
8. Omendar Pratap Hiteshi, Aged about 27 years,
S/o Chiranjit Lal Hiteshi,
R/o B-5, South Anarkali (Krishna Nagar) near
Srikrishna Dairy, Post Office Gali No.8,
Delhi-110051,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', UPSC, Shahjahan Road,
Dholpur House,
New Delhi-110069.
9. Siddharth Chhibber, Aged about 28 years,
S/o Babu Lal Chhibber,
R/o House No.630, Ward No.5,
Mehrauli, New Delhi-110023,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Health and
Family Welfare, Nirman Bhawan
New Delhi-110011.

10. Pankaj Kumar, Aged about 32 years,
S/o Bhavnesh Kumar,
R/o Quarter No.742, Sector 12,
R.K. Puram, New Delhi-110022,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Department of Commerce,
Ministry of Commerce and Industry,
Udyog Bhawan, New Delhi-110011.
11. Swati, Aged about 32 years,
W/o Pankaj Kumar,
R/o Quarter No.742, Sector-12,
R.K. Puram, New Delhi-110022,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Defence, Sena
Bhawan, New Delhi-110011.
12. Jaya Mamgain, Aged about 32 years,
W/o Pankaj Dobriyal,
R/o House No. G-467, Srinivas Puri,
New Delhi-110065,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Department of Commerce,
Ministry of Commerce and Industry,
Udyog Bhawan, New Delhi-110011.
13. Meenakshi Kukreti, Aged about 28 years,
W/o Himanshu Kukreti,
R/o House No.B-2664, Netaji Nagar,
New Delhi-110023,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', NITI Aayog,
Parliament Street,
Sansad Marg, New Delhi-110001.
14. Gagandeep Singh, Aged about 28 years,
S/o Sarve Tej Singh,
R/o 447, Dr. Mukherjee Nagar,
Delhi-110009,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', UPSC, Shahjahan Road,
Dholpur House,
New Delhi-110069.
15. Sumit Bankoti, Aged about 25 years,
S/o Ganesh Singh Bankoti
R/o House No.595, Sector 12,
R.K. Puram, New Delhi-110022.
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Commerce and
Industry, Department of Industrial Policy and Promotion, Rafi
Marg,
New Delhi-110011.

16. Ajay Kumar, Aged about 32 years,
S/o Kishan Lal,
R/o A-37, 3rd Floor Anand Vihar,
Uttam Nagar,
New Delhi-110059,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Information and Broadcasting, Doordarshan Bhavan, Mandi House, New Delhi-110001.
17. Chander Prakash, Aged about 34 years,
S/o Ram Dular,
R/o D-91, Om Vihar, Phase 5,
Uttam Nagar,
New Delhi-110059,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Personnel, PG & Pensions, Department of Personnel and Training, North Block, New Delhi-110001.
18. Anil Kumar, Aged about 28 years,
S/o Sunder Lal,
R/o 65, Ghondli, Krishna Nagar,
New Delhi-110051,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', UPSC, Shahjahan Road, Dholpur House, New Delhi-110069.
19. Javed, Aged about 33 years,
S/o Shamshudein,
R/o House No.211, Teli Wali Gali,
VPO Salahpur, Majra Dabas,
New Delhi-110081,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Commerce and Industry, Department of Industrial Policy and Promotion, Rafi Marg, New Delhi-110011.
20. Garima Gambhir Lakhanpal, Aged about 30 years,
W/o Rajiv Lakhanpal,
R/o Flat No.277, Block No.9,
H Block, Kali Bari Marg,
Type 2 Quarters, New Delhi-110001,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises, Udyog Bhawan, New Delhi-110011.

21. Ritu Dutta, Aged about 28 years,
W/o Karan Dutta,
R/o House No.27/6, Old Rajinder Nagar,
New Delhi-110060,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Commerce and
Industry, Department of Commerce, Udyog Bhawan, New
Delhi-110011.
22. Beena Choudhary, Aged about 28 years,
D/o Ranveer Singh Choudhary,
R/o 1504, Sector-7,
Pushp Vihar,
New Delhi-110017,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Commerce and
Industry, Department of Commerce, Udyog Bhawan,
New Delhi-110011.
23. Sriram, Aged about 36 years,
S/o Mahendra Singh,
R/o 627, Kalpana Nagar,
Shibbanpura, Ghaziabad,
Uttar Pradesh-201001
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Environment,
Forest and Climate Change, Jor Bagh Road, Ali Ganj,
New Delhi-110003.
24. Anshu Sharma, Aged about 32 years,
S/o Ramber Sharma,
R/o 666, Bhowapur, Kaushambi,
Ghaziabad, Uttar Pradesh-201010,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Environment,
Forest and Climate Change, Jor Bagh Road,
Ali Ganj, New Delhi-110003.
25. Kapil Kumar, Aged about 36 years,
S/o Hari Chand,
R/o A1/146, Madangir,
New Delhi-110062,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Personnel,
P.G. & Pensions, Department of Personnel and Training,
North Block,
New Delhi-110001.
26. Som Dutt, Aged about 30 years,
S/o Dharam Bir,
R/o Quarter No.547, Sector 9,
R.K. Puram,

New Delhi-110022,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Finance,
Department of Expenditure, North Block,
New Delhi-110001.

27. Nidhi Kapil, Aged about 33 years,
W/o Vikas Kapil,
R/o House No.99-100,
3rd Floor, Pocket-9,
Sector 23, Rohini,
Delhi-110085,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Finance,
Department of Expenditure, North Block,
New Delhi-110001.
28. Harjot Singh, Aged about 26 years,
S/o Manjeet Singh,
R/o C-6/160A, Keshav Puram,
New Delhi-110035,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Personnel,
P.G. & Pensions, Department of Personnel and Training,
North Block, New Delhi-110001.
29. Pratap Paswan, Aged about 30 years,
R/o S-509, Shakarpur, Laxmi Nagar,
New Delhi-110092,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Home Affairs,
North Block,
New Delhi-110001.
30. Yashpal Arya, Aged about 29 years,
S/o Lalit Prasad Arya,
R/o House No.211,
Gangotri Apartment,
Sector 12, Dwarka,
New Delhi-110078,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Home Affairs,
North Block,
New Delhi-110001.
31. Himanshu Pal, Aged about 27 years,
S/o Moti Lal Pal,
R/o A/166, Moti Bagh-I,
New Delhi-110021,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Prima Minister Office,
South Block, New Delhi-110001.

32. Shiv Kumar, Aged about 28 years,
S/o Ajay Prakash Verma,
R/o 9/140, Khichripur,
Delhi-110091,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Defence, Sena
Bhawan,
New Delhi-110011.
33. Niranjani, Aged about 37 years,
W/o Ajeet Kumar,
R/o C-6A/30B, Janakpuri,
New Delhi-110058,
Working as Stenographer Grade 'D', Ministry of Finance,
Department of Economic Affairs, North Block,
New Delhi-110011.

...Respondents

(By Advocate : Shri Adarsh Kumar Tiwari for Ms. Aishwarya Bhatt)

ORDER (ORAL)

Mr. V. Ajay Kumar, Member (J) :

Heard the learned counsel for review applicant.

2. This Tribunal on 20.07.2017 having satisfied with the *prima facie* case made out by the applicants, directed the respondents to allow the applicants to participate in the LDCE, 2017 scheduled to be held on 30.07.2017 or any other date, provisionally, if they are otherwise eligible. The respondents were further directed not to declare their result until further order.
3. The respondents in the OA filed the instant Application seeking to review the aforesaid order dated 20.07.2017, by mainly submitting that the applicants are not eligible to participate in the examination and there are certain other persons also who are

identically placed like the applicants in the OA and if they proceed with the examination by allowing the applicants alone to participate leaving the other identically placed persons, the administration will face difficulties,

4. The issue involved is the interpretation of the Recruitment Rules. Basically when the *prima facie* case was made out, direction to permit the applicants to participate in the examination was issued that too provisionally and further it was directed not to declare the result. We do not find any error apparent on the face of the order dated 20.07.2017 and accordingly, the RA is dismissed.

(Shekhar Agarwal)
Member (A)

(V. Ajay Kumar)
Member (J)

‘rk’