

14

**CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL  
CHANDIGARH BENCH**

...  
**Order reserved on: 11.11.2014**

**ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 060/00122 of 2014  
Chandigarh, this the 14<sup>th</sup> day of November, 2014**

...  
**CORAM: HON'BLE MS. RAJWANT SANDHU, MEMBER (A)  
HON'BLE DR. BRAHM A. AGRAWAL, MEMBER (J)**

1. Ticket No. 2223, Narinder Singh son of Shri Ranbir Singh, aged 59 years, working in the office of 223 ABOD (Suranussi), Jalandhar, Punjab.

2. Ticket No. 2595, Pallar Ram son of Shri Sukhai Ram, aged 53 years, working in the office of 223 ABOD (Suranussi), Jalandhar, Punjab.

...APPLICANTS

BY ADVOCATE: SHRI ROHIT SETH

VERSUS

1. Union of India through the Secretary, Government of India, Ministry of Defence, New Delhi.

2. The Director General of Ordnance Services, Army Headquarters, New Delhi.

3. The Commandant, Advance Base Ordnance Depot, 223, Suranussi, Jalandhar.

P

...RESPONDENTS

BY ADVOCATE: SHRI K.P.S. DHILLON

ORDER

HON'BLE DR. BRAHM A. AGRAWAL, MEMBER(J):-

The two applicants are working as Tailors with the respondent no. 3 w.e.f. 01.04.1999 and 01.04.2002, respectively, claim their status as Skilled w.e.f. the said dates and further status as Highly Skilled on completion of eight years of regular service, i.e., w.e.f. 01.04.2007 and 01.04.2010, respectively, as well as consequential benefits flowing therefrom.

2. The earlier O.A. filed by the applicants along with another, i.e., O.A. No. 1341-PB-2013, was disposed of by this Tribunal with a direction to the respondent no. 2 'to take a final decision on the pending claim of the applicants expeditiously', vide the Order dated 30.09.2013 (Annexure A-11).

3. The 'Speaking Order' dated 24.01.2014 (Annexure A-12) is the outcome. The request of the applicants has been rejected along with the following observation:



"The tailor category has been recognized as skilled in terms of SRO-38 dt 18 Dec 2009. In compliance to above quoted SRO, all the tailors of this depot have been upgraded from semi skilled to skilled wef 27 Aug 2010 by convening DPC at unit level and further promotion as highly skilled will be carried out on completion of 08 years of regular service. Prior to receipt of SRO, the tailor category was semi skilled."

4. The above position as regards the date of according the status of Skilled, is being contested by the applicants through the instant O.A.
5. We have heard the learned counsel for the parties, perused the pleadings and the decisions cited by them, and given our thoughtful consideration to the matter.
6. We feel that the 'Speaking Order' (Annexure A-12) cannot be said to be just compliance with our Order dated 30.09.2013 (Annexure A-11) in that the same has not taken into consideration the Order dated 13.08.2012 passed by the Hon'ble High Court of Jammu and Kashmir in SWP No. 1917/2010 [Mansoor Ahmed Qadri and Ors. Vs. Union of India and Ors. ] (Annexure A-3), which seems to hold the field on the subject. Therefore, we set aside the said 'Speaking Order' (Annexure A-12) and direct the respondents to afresh consider the claim of the applicants and pass reasoned

✓

order within two months from the date of receipt of a copy of this Order.

7. This O.A. is disposed of with the above direction. No order as to costs.

**(DR. BRAHM A. AGRAWAL)  
MEMBER(J)**

**(RAJWANT SANDHU)  
MEMBER(A)**

**Dated: 14.11.2014**  
**'SK'**