

**Central Administrative Tribunal  
Lucknow Bench, Lucknow**

R.A.No.41/2008 in O.A.No.456/2007

Friday, this the 5<sup>th</sup> day of December 2008

**Hon'ble Shri Shanker Raju, Member (J)**  
**Hon'ble Dr. Veena Chhotray, Member (A)**

1. Union of India through the General Manager  
Northern Railway, Head Quarters Office  
Baroda House, New Delhi
2. The Divisional Railway Manager  
Northern Railway, Hazratganj, Lucknow
3. The Financial Advisor & Chief Accounts Officer  
Northern Railway, Head Quarters Office  
Baroda House, New Delhi

..Applicants

Versus

M.C. Joshi aged about 67 years  
Son of late Shri N.D. Joshi  
R/o 548/309, Mohani Sadan,  
Surya Nagar, Rajajipuram  
Lucknow-226017

..Respondent

**O R D E R (in circulation)**

**Shri Shanker Raju:**

The respondents in RA try to re-agitate the issue. The contentions having been taken into consideration and erroneosity in law is a subject matter of appropriate proceeding. Accordingly, RA is dismissed in circulation in the light of decision of Apex Court in **State of West Bengal v. Kamal Sen Gupta**, 2008 (9) SCALE 509.

*h h h o t r a y*

**( Dr. Veena Chhotray )  
Member (A)**

*S. Raju*

**( Shanker Raju )  
Member (J)**

/sunil/

*of*  
*cutting hand*  
*05*  
*12/28*  
*19-12-28*