

**CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL
CHENNAI BENCH**

OA/310/00481/2021

Dated the 08th day of July Two Thousand Twenty One

**CORAM : HON'BLE SHRI. S. N. TERDAL, Member (J)
HON'BLE SHRI. T. JACOB, Member (A)**

1. R.K.Selvam,
2. A.Vennivel,
3. G.Narayana Rao,
4. K.K.Ashokkumar,
5. V.N.Athiaman,
6. S.Venkatesan,
7. D.Nandakumar,
8. C.Anandan.

....Applicants

By Advocate M/s. Row & Reddy

Vs

1.Union of India, rep by,
The Chief Executive Officer,
Prasar Bharati, Broadcasting Corporation of India,
Doordarshan Bhavan, Phase III,
New Delhi 110001.

2.The Director General (Doordarshan),
Prasar Bharati, Broadcasting Corporation of India,
Doordarshan Bhavan, Copernicus Marg,
New Delhi 110001.

3.The Director (Disc & POSH),
Prasar Bharati Secretariat,
7th Floor, Prasar Bharati House,
Copernicus Marg, New Delhi 110001.

4.The Deputy Director General (E),
Doordarshan Kendra,
Chepauk, Chennai 600005.

....Respondents

By Advocate Mr. M. Kishore Kumar, SPC

ORDER**(Pronounced by Hon'ble Shri. S. N. Terdal, Member(J))**

The reliefs prayed for in this OA is as follows:

"i. To quash the Office Order No. 89/2021-PPC issued by the 3rd respondent in F. No. A-10011/16/2020-PPC dt. 12.04.2021 (Ann-6) reducing the strength of the Cameraman Grade-I and II contrary to the order dt. 14.02.2014 (Ann-1) issued by the office of the Director General and

ii. To pass such further orders or directions that this Hon'ble Tribunal deems fit in the interest of justice and award cost."

2. Heard Mr. N. G. R. Prasad, counsel for the applicants and Mr. M. Kishore Kumar, SPC, counsel for the respondents.

3. The relevant facts of the case are that the respondents effected rationalisation regarding the posts of all the Cameramen in their organisation based on their revised sanctioned strength by order dt. 14.02.2014 which is extracted below:-

“

PRASAR BHARATI
(India's Public Service Broadcaster)
DIRECTORATE GENERAL: DOORDARSHAN

New Delhi, Dated :14.02.2014

ORDER

The approval of the Competent Authority is hereby conveyed for Rationalization of Cameraman for their optimal utilization, based on the functional requirement at Kendras. The revised sanctioned strength of Cameraman cadre in various Doordarshan Kendras will be as under:-

| Sl. No. | Kendras | New sanctioned strength of Cameraman cadre in Doordarshan | | | | Total |
|---------|-----------|---|-------------------|--------------------|---------------------|-------|
| | | Video Executive | Cameraman Grade-I | Cameraman Grade-II | Cameraman Grade-III | |
| 1 | Agartala | 0 | 1 | 6 | 0 | 7 |
| 2 | Ahmedabad | 0 | 3 | 14 | 3 | 20 |

| | | | | | | |
|----|--------------|---|---|----|----|----|
| 3 | Aizwal | 0 | 1 | 5 | 1 | 7 |
| 4 | Allahabad | 0 | 0 | 4 | 1 | 5 |
| 5 | Bangalore | 1 | 4 | 17 | 3 | 25 |
| 6 | Bareilly | 0 | 0 | 4 | 1 | 5 |
| 7 | Bhawnipatna | 0 | 0 | 4 | 1 | 5 |
| 8 | Bhopal | 1 | 3 | 14 | 3 | 21 |
| 9 | Bhubaneswar | 1 | 2 | 13 | 4 | 20 |
| 10 | Chandigarh | 0 | 1 | 4 | 2 | 7 |
| 11 | Chennai | 1 | 4 | 17 | 7 | 29 |
| 12 | Calicut | 0 | 0 | 4 | 1 | 5 |
| 13 | Coimbatore | 0 | 0 | 4 | 0 | 4 |
| 14 | CPC, Delhi | 1 | 3 | 10 | 2 | 16 |
| 15 | DD News | 1 | 7 | 23 | 2 | 33 |
| 16 | DDK Delhi | 2 | 9 | 23 | 10 | 44 |
| 17 | Dibrugarh | 0 | 1 | 5 | 1 | 7 |
| 18 | Dehradun | 0 | 1 | 8 | 0 | 9 |
| 19 | Daltonganj | 0 | 0 | 4 | 0 | 4 |
| 20 | Gangtok | 0 | 1 | 4 | 1 | 6 |
| 21 | Gorakhpur | 0 | 1 | 4 | 2 | 7 |
| 22 | Guwahati | 0 | 2 | 13 | 4 | 19 |
| 23 | PPC Guwahati | 0 | 1 | 10 | 2 | 13 |
| 24 | Gulbarga | 0 | 1 | 4 | 0 | 5 |
| 25 | Gwalior | 0 | 0 | 4 | 1 | 5 |
| 26 | Hisar | 0 | 0 | 4 | 1 | 5 |
| 27 | Hyderabad | 1 | 3 | 14 | 4 | 22 |
| 28 | Imphal | 0 | 1 | 6 | 0 | 7 |
| 29 | Indore | 0 | 0 | 4 | 1 | 5 |
| 30 | Itanagar | 0 | 1 | 5 | 1 | 7 |
| 31 | Jagdalpur | 0 | 1 | 4 | 0 | 5 |
| 32 | Jaipur | 1 | 3 | 12 | 5 | 21 |
| 33 | Jalandhar | 1 | 3 | 13 | 6 | 23 |
| 34 | Jalpaiguri | 0 | 0 | 4 | 0 | 4 |
| 35 | Jammu | 0 | 1 | 4 | 4 | 9 |
| 36 | Kohima | 0 | 1 | 5 | 1 | 7 |
| 37 | Kolkata | 1 | 4 | 18 | 6 | 29 |
| 38 | Leh | 0 | 1 | 5 | 1 | 7 |
| 39 | Lucknow | 1 | 3 | 14 | 6 | 24 |
| 40 | Mau | 0 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 2 |

| | | | | | | |
|----|--------------------|----|----|-----|-----|-----|
| 41 | Madurai | 0 | 0 | 4 | 0 | 4 |
| 42 | Mathura | 0 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 2 |
| 43 | Mumbai | 2 | 5 | 20 | 8 | 35 |
| 44 | Muzaffarpur | 0 | 0 | 3 | 1 | 4 |
| 45 | Nagpur | 0 | 0 | 4 | 1 | 5 |
| 46 | Panaji | 0 | 1 | 5 | 1 | 7 |
| 47 | Patiala | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| 48 | Patna | 1 | 3 | 12 | 4 | 20 |
| 49 | Port Blair | 0 | 1 | 4 | 0 | 5 |
| 50 | Pudducherry | 0 | 1 | 4 | 1 | 6 |
| 51 | Pune | 0 | 1 | 3 | 1 | 5 |
| 52 | Raipur | 0 | 1 | 8 | 2 | 11 |
| 53 | Rajkot | 0 | 1 | 3 | 1 | 5 |
| 54 | Ranchi | 0 | 1 | 6 | 2 | 9 |
| 55 | Sambalpur | 0 | 0 | 4 | 1 | 5 |
| 56 | Santiniketan | 0 | 0 | 3 | 1 | 4 |
| 57 | Shillong | 0 | 1 | 5 | 1 | 7 |
| 58 | Shimla | 0 | 1 | 8 | 2 | 11 |
| 59 | Silchar | 0 | 1 | 6 | 0 | 7 |
| 60 | Srinagar | 1 | 2 | 10 | 5 | 18 |
| 61 | Thiruvananthapuram | 0 | 2 | 9 | 6 | 17 |
| 62 | Thrissur | 0 | 1 | 4 | 1 | 6 |
| 63 | Tirupati | 0 | 1 | 3 | 0 | 4 |
| 64 | Tura | 0 | 0 | 5 | 1 | 6 |
| 65 | Varanasi | 0 | 0 | 4 | 1 | 5 |
| 66 | Vijaywada | 0 | 0 | 4 | 1 | 5 |
| 67 | Warangal | 0 | 1 | 4 | 0 | 5 |
| | | 17 | 93 | 484 | 131 | 725 |

2. This issues with the Competent Authority.

--sd--
(Dileep Kumar Bhat)
Dy. Director (Admn)
Tele/Fax-23097501”

4. Then, in the year 2021 by another office order dt. 12.04.2021, the respondents made temporary reallocation of the posts of Cameraman Grade-I

and Grade-II. The said reallocation is extracted below:-

“

Prasar Bharati Secretariat
7th Floor, Prasar Bharati House,
Copernicus Marg, New Delhi

F.No. A-10011/16/2020-PPC

Dated: 12 April, 2021

OFFICE ORDER No. 89/2021-PPC

The Competent Authority has approved the following temporary re-allocation of posts of Cameraman Grade I and Grade II at various establishments of Doordarshan, with immediate effect and until further orders:

| Sl. No. | Name of the Kendra | Stations | Re-allocated strength of Cameraman Grade I | Re-allocated strength of Cameraman Grade II |
|-----------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--|---|
| <u>MAJOR KENDRAS</u> | | | | |
| 1 | DD Kashir (J&K UT) | Jammu | 1 | 2 |
| | | Srinagar | 1 | 3 |
| | | Leh | 0 | 2 |
| 2 | DD Punjabi | Jalandhar | 1 | 6 |
| 3 | DD-UP | Lucknow | 2 | 6 |
| 4 | DD-Rajasthan | Jaipur | 2 | 6 |
| 5 | DD-Saptagiri | Vijaywada | 1 | 6 |
| 6 | DD-Yadagiri | Hyderabad | 2 | 6 |
| 7 | DD-Chandana | Bangalore | 2 | 6 |
| 8 | DD-Malyalam | Thiruvananthapuram | 2 | 6 |
| 9 | DD-Podhigai | Chennai | 2 | 7 |
| 10 | DD-Bangala | Kolkatta | 2 | 7 |
| 11 | DD-Odia | Bhubneshwar | 2 | 6 |
| 12 | DD-Bihar | Patna | 1 | 6 |
| 13 | DD-Assam | Guwahati | 2 | 6 |
| 14 | DD-Sahyadri | Mumbai | 2 | 7 |
| 15 | DD-Madhya Pradesh | Bhopal | 2 | 6 |
| 16 | DD-Girnar | Ahmedabad | 2 | 6 |
| 17 | DD-Arunprabha | Itanagar | 1 | 6 |
| <u>OTHER KENDRAS</u> | | | | |

| | | | | |
|---------------------------|---------------------------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|----|
| 1 | DD Goa | Panaji | 1 | 3 |
| 2 | DD Haryana | Hissar | 1 | 3 |
| 3 | DD Himachal Pradesh | Shimla | 1 | 3 |
| 4 | DD Uttarakhand | Dehradun | 1 | 3 |
| 5 | DD Jharkhand | Ranchi | 1 | 3 |
| 6 | DD Manipur | Imphal | 0 | 3 |
| 7 | DD Chattisgarh | Raipur | 1 | 3 |
| 8 | DD Meghalaya | Shillong | 0 | 3 |
| 9 | DD Tripura | Agartala | 0 | 3 |
| 10 | DD Mizoram | Aizwal | 0 | 3 |
| 11 | DD Nagaland | Kohima | 0 | 3 |
| <u>DELHI</u> | | | | |
| 1 | DD-News, Delhi | | 8 | 22 |
| 2 | DDK Delhi | | 8 | 22 |
| 3 | CPC Delhi | | 4 | 11 |
| <u>PGFs</u> | | | | |
| | 12 PGFs | | 0 | 0 |
| <u>COMMON POOL</u> | | | | |
| | Common Pool for DDK Delhi and DD News | All the remaining posts | All the remaining posts | |

2. The remaining posts of Cameraman Grade-I and Grade-II at all above Kendras and PDFs shall be temporarily shifted to the Common Pool at Delhi. The officers under the Common Pool for DDK Delhi and DD News shall be under the Administrative Control of DD News.

--sd--
(Rajesh Kumar Vashishtha)
Director (Disc. & POSH)
2nd L.O. To Director (Pers.)
Phone No.- (011)23118410

”

5. The counsel for the applicant vehemently and strenuously submitted pointing to the reallocation made with respect to Chennai station and he submitted that in the order dt. 14.02.2014, Chennai station was allocated 04

posts of Cameraman Grade-I and 17 posts of Cameraman Grade-II whereas in the reallocation only 02 posts of Cameraman Grade-I and only 07 posts of Cameraman Grade-II were allocated to Chennai station. He further submitted that the applicants who are working in Chennai as Cameraman Grade-I and Grade-II are adversely affected by the said impugned order dt. 12.04.2021 and that the said impugned order is arbitrary, capricious, unfair and unreasonable and that consequently they would be facing the threat of being transferred to other stations and hence the said impugned order dt. 12.04.2021 be set aside.

6. Counsel for the respondents also vehemently and strenuously submitted that the rationalisation of 2014 was based on the total sanctioned strength and he further submitted that as the actual working strength is far less than the sanctioned strength and that until recruitments are made to fill up the complete sanctioned strength, taking into account the actual available strength and based on the requirement of all the stations, a conscious decision was taken to reallocate the available Cameraman. He further submitted that depending upon the work load of various stations, the said reallocation on temporary basis has been effected. In this regard, he drew our attention to the averments made in reply statement by the respondents at paras (vi) to (x) which are extracted below:-

“vi. There is a shortage of Cameraman in some of the DDKs, where production/coverage activities are comparatively on higher side and therefore Cameramen have to be deputed on tour to such Kendras to cover the events, from other Kendras where there are surplus Cameramen. The frequent tours put extra stress on Prasar Bharati's finances. On the other hand at some DDKs, there are large pools of cameramen. This required rationalisation of deployment Cameramen, to correct the situation across the network. The details of available manpower Vs sanctioned strength are as below:

| Post | Sanctioned Strength | Filled | Vacant |
|----------------|---------------------|--------|--------|
| Cameraman Gr-I | 93 | 56 | 37 |
| Cameraman Gr-2 | 484 | 194 | 290 |
| Cameraman Gr-3 | 131 | 45 | 86 |

vii. A rationalisation exercise of Cameramen deployment had been carried out in 2014 considering the Sanctioned Strength of 725 {Video Executive : 17, Cameraman Gr-I : 94, Cameraman Gr-II : 485 Cameraman Gr-III 131} at that time. About 13 to 23 Cameraman GR-II were distributed at medium to large Kendras in 2014 taking into account the Sanctioned Strength at that time.

viii. Rationalization of Cameraman cadre in 2014 was limited to Sanctioned Strength only, whereas physically available resources were less than the sanctioned strength. Over the period, in the absence of fresh recruitments and retirement of Cameramen, available resources have significantly reduced. DDKs have been requesting for posting of more Cameramen due to shortage at their ends. Additionally, 11 Kendras have started 24 Hr channel service since last year and their content generation has to be increased, for which cameramen are required at such Kendras.

ix. To address this situation and after considerable deliberations & discussions at the Zonal and National levels, it was decided to rationalise available resources (and not the Sanctioned Strength) and a report was prepared by a committee of Senior Officers. Then the proposal was put up for consideration of the Management Committee of Prasar Bharati. Among the 17 Major Kendras, it was decided to post 6 Cameraman Gr-II at Jalandhar, Lucknow, Jaipur, Vijaywada, Hyderabad, Bangalore, Thiruvananthapuram, Bhubaneswar, Patna, Guwahati, Bhopal, Ahmedabad, Itanagar which are running 24X7 operations and do significantly large number of productions. At 3 Metros namely Chennai, Kolkata, Mumbai, 7 Cameraman Gr-II were proposed. At DD Kashir also (Jammu, Srinagar & Leh) 7 Cameraman Gr-II were proposed. At 11 Kendras where programme production is comparatively less, 3 Cameraman Gr-II are proposed to be posted. Considering high output of News and Programme Production by three Kendras namely DD News at Delhi, Central Production Centre (CPC), Dehi and DDK Delhi, more number of Cameramen Gr-II have been proposed at Delhi.

x. It is submitted that no posts have been abolished at any Kendra. Only temporary shifting of vacant posts have been carried out at Delhi. The distribution of available manpower has been done equitably. In future whenever there will be sufficient cameramen, the posts will be redistributed back at Kendras keeping in view the requirement and the availability of manpower.”

7. We have perused both the above extracted orders of 2014 and 2021 and we have perused the averments made by the respondents which are extracted above. The said temporary reallocation has not been done only with respect to Chennai station but the reallocation is done of the available Cameraman of

Grade-I and Grade-II with respect to all the stations. When we perused for Bengaluru, Bhopal, Guwahati, Hyderabad, etc., it is seen that depending upon the requirement and availability of the working strength, the respondents have reduced the strength of the said Cameraman with respect to all the stations. From the perusal of the above said orders dt. 14.02.2014 and impugned order dt. 12.04.2021, we do not find any arbitrariness, unreasonableness or any discriminatory treatment with respect to the applicants. As stated by the counsel for the respondents and in view of the averments made by the respondents, we are of the view that the impugned order does not calls for interference.

8. Accordingly, OA is dismissed. No costs.

(T.Jacob)
Member(A)

(S.N.Terdal)
Member(J)

08.07.2021

SKSI