

**CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL  
BANGALORE BENCH AT BANGALORE**

**ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.170/00678/2019**

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NOS.170/00678/2019, 679/2019, 680/2019, 681/2019,  
682/2019, 683/2019, 684/2019, 685/2019, 686/2019, 687/2019, 688/2019,  
689/2019, 690/2019, 691/2019, 692/2019, 693/2019, 747/2019, 544/2019 &  
545/2019,

**DATED THIS THE 26<sup>TH</sup> DAY OF FEBRUARY, 2020**

**HON'BLE DR K B SURESH....MEMBER (J)  
HON'BLE SHRI C V SANKAR .....MEMBER (A)**

J.Premkumar,  
S/o Late Jayaraj,  
Age: 58 years,  
Working as Senior Accountant,  
O/o the General Manager (PA&F)  
Karnataka Circle, Bangalore-560 001.  
R/at No.231, Chokalappa Layout,  
Kasturinagar, 5<sup>th</sup> Cross,  
1<sup>st</sup> A Main, Bangalore-560 043.

...Applicant in OA 170/00678/2019

B N Jyothi,  
Age: 58 years,  
W/o B S Narayana Rao  
Working as Senior Accountant,  
O/o G.M.(PA&F)  
Karnataka Circle, Bangalore-560 001.  
Residing at:  
No.94, first Main,  
First Stage, Basaveshwaranagar,  
Bangalore-560 079.

...Applicant in OA 170/00679/2019

Smt.Kannagi.M  
W/o Babu Bhaskar,  
Age: 59 years,  
Working as Senior Accountant,  
O/o the General Manager (PA&F)  
Karnataka Circle, Bangalore-560 001.  
R/o No.93, Adith Layout,  
N.N.Halli, Shivramkaranth Post,  
Bangalore-56007

...Applicant in OA 170/00680/2019

G.Girija  
W/o K.R.Rajanna  
Age: 58 years,  
Working as Senior Accountant,  
O/o The General Manager (PA&F)  
Karnataka Circle,  
Bangalore-560 001.  
R/at No.35/1, 001, 4<sup>th</sup> Cross,  
Kariappa layout, RMV IInd Stage,  
Bangalore-560 094.

...Applicant in OA 170/00681/2019

A Narayanaswamy  
S/o Anjinappa  
Age: 50 years,  
Working as Senior Accountant,  
O/O The General manager (PA&F),  
Karnataka Circle,  
Bangalore- 560001  
R/at No.46, Amma Nilaya,  
Gurunatha Layout, 4<sup>th</sup> Main Road,  
Hurulichikkanahalli,  
Hesaragatta Road, Bangalore- 560090

...Applicant in OA 170/00682/2019

Suresh K S  
S/o S S Pillai,  
Age: 59 years,  
Working as Senior Accountant,  
O/O The General manager (PA&F),  
Karnataka Circle,  
Bangalore- 560001  
R/at No.31-A, 19<sup>th</sup> D Main, I Block,  
Rajajinagar, Bangalore- 560010.

...Applicant in OA 170/00683/2019

SmtRadha Rajamani,  
W/o K S Natarajan,  
Age: 59 years,  
Working as Assistant Accounts Officer,  
O/O The General Manager (PA&F),  
Karnataka Circle,  
Bangalore- 560001  
R/o No.14, 10<sup>th</sup> Cross,  
5<sup>th</sup> Main,Krishnappa Block,  
Ganganagar Extension,  
(R.T.Nagar Post) Banaglore-560032

...Applicant in OA 170/00684/2019

Smt A Subhashini  
W/o P Pillaiyar,  
Age: 59 years,  
Working as Senior accountant,  
O/O The General manager (PA&F),  
Karnataka Circle, Banaglore-560001  
R/O No.24, II Main,  
III Cross, Kanaka Layout,  
Banashankari III Stage, Bangalore-560070.

...Applicant in OA 170/00685/2019

A.Sadananda Naik,  
Age: 57 years,  
S/o Babu Naik,  
Working as Senior Accountant,  
O/o G.M(PA&F)  
Karnataka Circle,  
Bangalore-560 001.  
Residing at  
I A Cross, Manjunatha Layout,  
Opp: Cavary Bakery,  
Chikka Devasandra,  
K.R.Puram, Bangalore-560 036.

...Applicant in OA 170/00686/2019

Mrs.Roseline,  
Aged 58 years,  
W/o K S Suresh,  
Working as Senior Accountant,  
O/o General Manager (PA&F)  
III Floor, Bangalore GPO-560 001  
Residing at  
31-A, 19<sup>th</sup> D Main,  
1<sup>st</sup> Block, Rajajinagar,  
Bangalore-560 010.

...Applicant in OA 170/00687/2019

Smt.Kothanayagi,  
W/o M.Kothandaraman,  
Age: 58 years,  
Working as Senior Accountant,  
O/o The General Manager (PA&F)  
Karnataka Circle,  
Bangalore-560 001,  
R/o No.12/1, Araliamara Street,  
Behind Panchamukhi Ganesha Temple,  
Maruthi Sevanagara P.O,  
Bangalore-560 033.

...Applicant in OA 170/00688/2019

Smt.C.T.Chelvi,  
W/o C.S.Shivaraman,  
Age: 57 years,  
Working as Senior Accountant,  
O/o the General Manager (PA&F)  
Karnataka Circle,  
Bangalore-560 001  
R/o 1-20 1<sup>st</sup> Cross,  
Thimmarayappa Garden,  
Cox Town, Bangalore-560 005.

...Applicant in OA 170/00689/2019

Smt.S.Vijaya,  
Age:59 years,  
D/o C Sampathkumarchar,  
Working as Senior Accountant,  
O/o G.M(PA&F)  
Karnataka Circle,  
Bangalore-560 001.  
Residing at:  
No.20, 5<sup>th</sup> Cross,  
A.Na-Subb Rao Road,  
Hanumanthanagar, Bangalore-560 019.

...Applicant in OA 170/00690/2019

Sri.K.Sampath  
S/o Kabali,  
Age: 59 years,  
Working as Senior Accountant,  
O/o The General Manager (PA&F),  
Karnataka Circle,  
Bangalore-560 001.  
R/o No.9/5, IIA Cross,  
Ajjappa Block, Dinnur, R.T.Nagar,  
Bangalore-560 032

...Applicant in OA 170/00691/2019

Smt.Mallika,  
Age: 56 years,  
W/o Mathialagan,  
Working as Senior Accountant,  
O/o G.M (PA&F)  
Karnataka Circle,  
Bangalore-560 001,  
Residing at:  
No.405, 2<sup>nd</sup> Main,  
6<sup>th</sup> Cross, M.C.E.H.C.H.S.Layout,  
Dr.Shivaram Karanth Nagar,  
Bangalore-560 077.

...Applicant in OA 170/00692/2019

Smt.M.Janakala,  
Age: 59 years,  
W/o C Suresh,  
Working as Senior Accountant,  
O/o G.M.(PA& F) Postal,  
Karnataka Circle,  
Bangalore-560 001.  
Residing at:  
23, 1<sup>st</sup> Cross, 2<sup>nd</sup> Block,  
Dr.Shanthakumar Layout,  
Nagana Palya,  
M.S.Nagar, Bangalore-560033.

...Applicant in OA 170/00693/2019

Smt P Premila,  
W/o Haridas,  
Age: 60 years,  
Retired as Senior Accountant,  
O/O The General Manager (PA&F),  
Karnataka Circle,  
Bangalore- 560001  
R/O No.121, 5<sup>th</sup> Cross,  
Kasturinagar,  
Bangalore- 560043.

Applicant in OA 170/00747/2019

(By Advocate Shri.P.Kamalesan)

Vs.

1. Union of India  
Represented by Secretary,  
Department of Post,  
(Postal & Accounts wing)  
Dak Bhavan,  
New Delhi-110 001.

2. General Manager (PA&F)  
Karnataka Circle, III Floor,  
Bangalore-560 001.

3. Chief Post Master General,  
Karnataka Circle,  
Bangalore-560 001.

...Respondents

(By Shri.N.Amaresh, Senior Panel Counsel)

M. Gopalakrishna,  
S/o Mallappa,  
Aged 60 years, retired as  
Senior Accountant,  
O/o General Manager (Postal Accounts & Finance),  
Director of Accounts (Postal),  
3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, G.P.O Building,  
Bengaluru-560 001,  
Residing at No.22 (68), 7<sup>th</sup> Cross,  
Shivananda Nagar, Moodulapalya,  
Bangalore- 560 072.

...Applicant in OA 170/00544/2019

Sandhya S Murthy,  
W/o Sreekanta Murthy H S,  
Aged 60 years, retired as  
Senior Accountant,  
O/o General Manager (Postal Accounts & Finance),  
Formerly Director of Accounts (Postal),  
3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, G.P.O Building,  
Bengaluru-560 001,  
Residing at No.211/48, Devarakere,  
ISRO Layout, 3<sup>rd</sup> Main,  
Bengaluru-560 078.

...Applicant in OA 170/00545/2019

(By Advocate Shri.A.R.Holla)

Vs.

1. Union of India,  
By Secretary,  
Department of Posts (Postal & Accounts Wing)  
Dak Bhavan,  
New Delhi-110 001.

2. General Manager (Postal Accounts & Finance)  
Karnataka Circle,  
3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, G.P.O.BUILDING,  
Bengaluru-560 001.

3.The Senior Accounts Officer (Admn)  
O/o General Manager (Postal Accounts & Finance),  
Karnataka Circle,  
3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, G.P.O Building,  
Bengaluru-560 001.

...Respondents

(By Shri.N.Amaresh, Senior Panel Counsel)

**ORDER (ORAL)****HON'BLE DR K B SURESH, MEMBER (J)**

We heard the matter in great detail. We note with apprehension that sometimes reason and logic get lost in the corridors of legal reasoning. Issue is between the direct recruitees and promotee officers. The direct recruitees were able to cross the barrier of ACP without any promotion and therefore got the benefits of ACP whereas promote officers were not granted this benefit at that point of time because they had got a promotion in between so as to extinguish the right for ACP.

2. But fortunately for them it was challenged in the Hon'ble Bench at New Delhi and the Bench held that the pay may be equalized. This equalization may be expressed which may have different elements in it for everybody to consider. However, this judgment was upheld by Hon'ble High Court of Delhi, thereafter by Hon'ble Apex Court also, and has been implemented.

3. Thereafter, we feel quite rightly the audit has raised objection, the objection is stated in a statement by them which we quote:

*"2. That the applicant of OA 678 Shri.Premkumar (A1) was appointed as Lower Division Clerk (LDC) on 25.08.1983 on the basis of SSLC Qualification. An amount of Rs.260/- in the pay scale of 260-6-290-EB-6-326-8-366-EB-8-390-10-400 was fixed as his initial pay. He was promoted to the post of Junior Accountant (JA) on 31.10.1986 with pay of Rs.1200/- in scale 1200-30-1560-2040. Further he was promoted as Senior Accountant (SA) on 13.05.1993 with pay of Rs.1400/- in the scale of 1400-40-1600-EB-50-2300-EB-60-2600.*

*3. Further the applicant (A1) was granted MACP III on 01.09.2008 with pay of 16100+4600 (GP) = 20700. With this the applicant (A1) got 3 promotions in his entire career.*

*Junior of the applicant (A1) Shri.Mahanthappa was appointed as Junior Accountant (JA) on the basis Degree Qualification on 07.07.1982 with a pay of Rs.330/- in the scale of 330-10-380-EB-12-500-EB-15-560.*

4. Shri.Mahanthappa is a senior in the gradation list of Junior Accountant when compared to Applicant A1 as he (Mahanthappa-junior) was JA in 1982 and Shri Premkumar was promoted to the post of Junior Accountant in 1986.

Since Mahanthappa (Junior) was direct recruit to the post of JA, clearing confirmatory exam was mandatory to attain eligibility for promotion to the post of Senior Accountant.

5. Shri.Mahanthappa was given **first ACP upgradation** on completion of 12 years of service on 11.08.1999 with pay of Rs.5450/- in the pay scale of 5000-150-8000. On promotion to the post of SA during 2001 he was not given any financial benefit as he was already granted with ACP1.

6. Further he was granted with **2<sup>nd</sup> ACP** on completion of 24 years of service on 25.07.2006 with pay of **13890+4800 (Grade Pay)=18690** in the pay scale of 6500-10500 with grade pay of Rs.4800. He was granted with **3<sup>rd</sup> MACP** on **26.07.2012** on completion of 30 years of service with pay of **Rs.18210+5400 (Grade Pay)=23610** in the pay scale 9300-34800 with grade pay 5400. With this Junior Shri Mahanthappa was granted 3 financial upgradation in this entire career.

7. During 2015 orders of OA 2124 was implemented in this office. The order in the OA was for stepping up of PAY of the seniors on par with juniors. Hence the pay of the Senior/applicant was regulated by maintaining parity with the junior to whom they were compared with, year on year. While implementing the orders of OA 2124, during 2015, this office erroneously **stepped up the pay scale** instead of **pay** only.

8. Applicant/Senior of OA 678(A1) Shri Premkumars was drawing higher pay than his junior Shri.Mahanthappa until Junior received his 2<sup>nd</sup> ACP promotion on 26.07.2006.

**The pay of applicant/senior on the day before granting 2<sup>nd</sup> ACP promotion to the junior was 14360+4200=18560.**

On 26.07.2006 2<sup>nd</sup> ACP was granted to junior with pay 13890+4800 (grade pay)=18690. Senior/applicants pay along with grade pay was stepped up on par with his junior by taking the difference of pay plus grade pay i.e. (18690-18560=130) Rs.130 was added to the pay component of the Senior/applicant (14360+130)=14490+4200=18690).

9. Senior/Applicant started drawing higher pay from 01.09.2008 on grant of MACP III. Pay of the Senior/Applicant as on 25.07.2012 was 18712+4600+23310 and the pay of the junior was 17540+4800+22340.

10. On 26.07.2012 3<sup>rd</sup> MACP was granted to Junior Sh.Mahanthappa. With pay 18210+5400=23610. The Senior/Applicant



*Shri.Premkumar was given stepping up by taking the difference of pay plus grade pay (23610-23310=300) The difference was added to the pay in the pay band of the senior/applicant (18710+300+19010; 19010+4600=23610)*

11. *7<sup>th</sup> CPC came into effect from 01.01.2016 and the senior was fixed with pay of Rs.68000 in Level 7 and Junior retired on 30.04.2015 before 7<sup>th</sup> CPC. The notional pay of the junior as on 01.01.2016 would be 67200 in level 9.*

12. *In an Internal Audit during April 2019, the error in the methodology of stepping up was pointed out and the erroneous stepping up of Grade pay was ordered for recovery. Stepping up of PAY only was to be maintained separately as Personal Pay.*

13. *The pay of the Senior/Applicant was regulated. Only the pay component of the Seniors were compared to that of their juniors. Here in OA 678 Applicant's pay as on 26.07.2006 (day junior was granted 2<sup>nd</sup> ACP) was Rs.14360/4200=18560. The pay of the Junior on grant of 2<sup>nd</sup> ACP on 26.07.2006 was Rs.13890+4800-18690.*

*The pay of the Senior/Applicant was more than that of Junior. Hence senior/applicant was not eligible for any stepping up of pay. The excess paid pay and allowances was ordered for recovery. The senior/applicant approached the CAT and hence this OA.*

*Similar other cases where the pay of the senior was more than that of Junior are as under:*

1. A2 OA 679 Smt.Jyothi B N
2. A3 OA 680 Smt Kannagi
3. A4 OA 681 Smt Girija G
4. A5 OA 682 Shri.Narayana Swamy
5. A6 OA 683 Shri.Suresh K S
6. A7 OA 684 Smt Radha Rajamani
7. A9 OA 686 Shri.Sadanada Naik A
8. A11 OA 688 Smt.Kothanayagi
9. A12 OA 689 Smt.C T Chelvi
10. A13 OA 690 Smt.S Vijaya
11. A15 OA 692 Smt.S.Mallika
12. A16 OA 693 Smt.M.Janakala
13. OA 545 Shri.Gopalakrishna

*Applicants/Seniors whose pay was less than that of the juniors to whom they were compared with were given stepping up for the difference in **pay** only.*

14. *Applicant A8 of OA 685 Smt.A.Subhashini was given stepping up on 26.07.2006 as illustrated below.*

*Pay of the Applicant on 26.07.2006  $13680+4200=17880$   
Pay of the Junior Mahanthappa on 26.07.2006  
 $13890+4800=18690$   
Difference of pay  $13890-13680=210$  was given as that of  
personal pay. Hence the pay of the senior was regulated as  
 $13680+210PP+4200=18090$ .*

*Other applicants/seniors who were given stepping up are as under'*

- 1. A8 OA 685 Smt.A.Subhashini*
- 2. A10 OA 687 Smt Roseline*
- 3. A14 OA 691 Shri K Sampath*
- 4. OA 544 Sandhya Murthy*

*15. The pay regulation of all the applicants in the OA 678-691 OA  
544, 545 are enclosed herewith for reference.*

*From the above, it is clearly evident that the order of OA 2124  
was implemented and only the erroneous fixation benefit given  
was ordered for recovery. Hence the justice and equity is very  
well maintained.*

4. At this point of time Shri.A.R.Holla, learned counsel for the applicant would like to look into the impugned order. Therefore, we quote from the leading case in the matter, in OA No.678/2019 in which the Annexure A8, is the impugned order which we quote:-

*MINISTRY OF COMMUNICATION DEPARTMENT OF POSTS  
O/O THE G.M.(POSTAL ACCOUNTS & FINANCE)  
KARNATAKA CIRCLE, BANGALORE-560001.*

*To  
Sri.J Premkumar,  
Senior Accountant,  
Pension Section.*

*No.249/Admn/PerIV/CAT/OA2124/2011*

*Dated: 29.04.2019*

*Sub: Erroneous fixation of pay on implementation of OA  
2124/2011.*

*The is regarding erroneous fixation of your pay on implementation of  
orders of the Honourable CAT in OA 2124/2011. Your pay has been  
stepped up erroneously as mentioned below:*

- 1. The Tribunal order and the consequent clarification issued  
by Directorate was to maintain parity on grant of ACP to  
junior in the SA cadre. The court order was not for*

*maintaining parity during subsequent grant of MACP to the Senior.*

2. *The difference in the pay with junior was to be maintained as person pay.*

*Now your pay has been refixed as per clarification No.5 of Directorate letter 33(3)/10/PA-Admn.I/1509-1524 dated 19.03.2014. Wrong fixation of pay has resulted in excess payment of pay and allowances to the tune of Rs.1,30,661/- (Rupees one lakh thirty thousand six hundred and sixty one only). Hence it has been decided to effect recovery of the excess paid pay and allowances as detailed below:*

<i>Sl No.</i>	<i>Name of official with whom the pay was stepped up</i>	<i>Total excess paid pay and allowances</i>	<i>Recovery details</i>	<i>Remarks</i>
1	<i>Pay Stepped on par with Sri.L.Mahanthappa wef. 25.07.2006</i>	<i>Of Rs.1,30,661/- (wef 25.07.2006 to 31.03.2019. Pay to be revised at Rs.72,100/- wef. 01.04.2019</i>	<i>@ Rs.23,700/- for 5 months w.e.f 04/2019 to 08/2019 and balance Rs.12161/- to be recovered 09/2019</i>	<i>Recovery @ 1/3<sup>rd</sup> of Basic Pay in excess of Rs.1000/- as per Rule 87 of FHB Vol.I.</i>

*This issues with the approval of GM (P&F)*

*Sd/-  
Senior Accounts Officer/Administration.*

5. He would say that the reasoning of parity between the ACP and MACP and the financial upgradation is wrong. At this point of time he needs to consider one cardinal difference between the ACP and the MACP. The ACP relates to the trajectory in career advancement and the positions held therein where as MACP is limited to financial upgradation alone that by itself may not have any bearing in the matter as for stepping up of pay the only element to be looked into is that

- (1) The person who seeks stepping up must be actually the senior.  
(2) Parity would have been denied to him unjustifiably.

6. These two matters are to be examined on a person to person basis. Here in this case, Shri.N.Amaresh, learned counsel for the respondents would contend that even if that implementation order was held to be correct (We think that it is wrong even though they have actually implemented it because it defies logic and reason) But at the same time since a finality had been obtained, we do not want to interfere in this matter at that stage. But we will now remit the matter back to the respondents to consider the case of each of the applicant to find that whether he is actually senior or junior and then grant or not-grant stepping up of pay. We will also grant opportunity for the applicant to file a representation to justify their own cause within the next one month after they have received it within the next one month, the respondents shall take an appropriate decision in each of the matter. But then we also stipulate that we reserve the liberty to the applicant who had been adversely affected in their claims. OA stands disposed of. Recovery will not be commenced again till they pass an appropriate order.

7. But in the case of retired persons we will make an exemption that they need not be disturbed again if they have gained anything let that gain stay with them in accordance with the principles enunciated by the Hon'ble Apex Court in the White washer's case. OA is disposed of. No costs.

**(C V SANKAR)**  
**MEMBER (A)**

**(DR K B SURESH)**  
**MEMBER (J)**

/rsh/

**Annexures referred to by the applicant in OA No.170/000678/2019**

Annexure A1	Copy of the CAT Principal Bench order dated 01.02.2013 in OA No.2124/2011 in MA No.1617-2011
Annexure A2	Copy of the Hon'ble Delhi High Court order dated 27.11.2013 in WP No.7421/2013
Annexure A3	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court order dated 26.03.2014 in SLP No.4952/2014
Annexure A4	Copy of the Memo dated 14.02.2014
Annexure A5	Copy of the memo dated 26/30.11.2015
Annexure A6	Copy of the Letter dated 24.04.2019
Annexure A7	Copy of the letter dated 25.04.2019
Annexure A8	Copy of the letter dated 29.04.2019
Annexure A9	Copy of the representation of applicant dated 2.5.2019
Annexure A10	Copy of the pay slip of the applicant for the month of April, 2019
Annexure A11	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court in Civil Appeal No.11527/2014 dated 18.12.2014

**Annexures referred to by the respondents**

Annexure R1	Copy of the CAT order dated 01.02.2013
Annexure R2	Copy of the order dated 14.02.2014
Annexure R3 to R6	Copy of the orders dated 18.03.2014, 19.03.2014, 09.04.2014 and 28.09.2015
Annexure R7	Copy of the order dated 03.03.2014
Annexure R8	Copy of the Table showing the Fixation of Pay
Annexure R9	Copy of the letter 45/PAMI/GI/Stepping up dated 25.04.2019
Annexure R10	Copy of the letter dated 24.05.2019
Annexure R11	Copy of the Order dated 30.11.2015
Annexure R12	Copy of the undertaking on implementation of 2124/2011

**Annexures referred to by the applicant in Rejoinder**

Annexure R1	Copy of the letter dated 16.12.2015
Annexure R2	Copy of the letter dated 12.9.2017
Annexure R3	Copy of the letter dated 10.07.1985
Annexure R4	Copy of the letter dated 08.05.2017
Annexure R5	Copy of the Hon'ble CAT Calcutta order dated 16.08.2004 in OA No.1148/2003
Annexure R6	Copy of the Hon'ble CAT Hyderabad order dated 31.07.2008
Annexure R7	Copy of the Hon'ble High Court of Telengana and Andhra Pradesh order dated 09.04.2015
Annexure R8	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court order dated 13.02.2017 in SLP (C) 35654/2015
Annexure R9	Copy of the Hon'ble High Court Karnataka order dated 15.04.2015 in WP No.55123/2014 (S-CAT)
Annexure R10	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Order in CA No.10692/1995 dated 09.10.2002

**Annexures referred to by the applicant in OA No.170/000679/2019**

Annexure A1	Copy of the CAT Principal Bench order dated 01.02.2013 in OA No.2124/2011 in MA No.1617-2011
Annexure A2	Copy of the Hon'ble Delhi High Court order dated 27.11.2013 in WP No.7421/2013
Annexure A3	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court order dated 26.03.2014 in SLP No.4952/2014
Annexure A4	Copy of the Memo dated 14.02.2014
Annexure A5	Copy of the Office order dated 26/30.11.2015
Annexure A6	Copy of the Letter dated 24.04.2019
Annexure A7	Copy of the letter dated 25.04.2019
Annexure A8	Copy of the letter dated 30.04.2019
Annexure A9	Copy of the representation of applicant dated 30.04.2019
Annexure A10	Copy of the pay slip of the applicant for the month of May, 2019
Annexure A11	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court in Civil Appeal No.11527/2014 dated 18.12.2014

**Annexures referred to by the applicant in OA No.170/000680/2019**

Annexure A1	Copy of the CAT Principal Bench order dated 01.02.2013 in OA No.2124/2011 in MA No.1617-2011
Annexure A2	Copy of the Hon'ble Delhi High Court order dated 27.11.2013 in WP No.7421/2013
Annexure A3	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court order dated 26.03.2014 in SLP No.4952/2014
Annexure A4	Copy of the Memo dated 14.02.2014
Annexure A5	Copy of the Office order dated 16.06.2014
Annexure A6	Copy of the Letter dated 24.04.2019
Annexure A7	Copy of the letter dated 25.04.2019
Annexure A8	Copy of the letter dated 29.04.2019
Annexure A9	Copy of the representation of applicant dated 30.04.2019
Annexure A10	Copy of the pay slip of the applicant for the month of May, 2019
Annexure A11	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court in Civil Appeal No.11527/2014 dated 18.12.2014

**Annexures referred to by the applicant in OA No.170/000681/2019**

Annexure A1	Copy of the CAT Principal Bench order dated 01.02.2013 in OA No.2124/2011 in MA No.1617-2011
Annexure A2	Copy of the Hon'ble Delhi High Court order dated 27.11.2013 in WP No.7421/2013
Annexure A3	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court order dated 26.03.2014 in SLP No.4952/2014
Annexure A4	Copy of the Memo dated 14.02.2014

Annexure A5	Copy of the Office order dated 16.06.2014
Annexure A6	Copy of the Letter dated 24.04.2019
Annexure A7	Copy of the letter dated 25.04.2019
Annexure A8	Copy of the letter dated 29.04.2019
Annexure A9	Copy of the representation of applicant dated 30.04.2019
Annexure A10	Copy of the pay slip of the applicant for the month of May, 2019
Annexure A11	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court in Civil Appeal No.11527/2014 dated 18.12.2014

**Annexures referred to by the applicant in OA No.170/000682/2019**

Annexure A1	Copy of the CAT Principal Bench order dated 01.02.2013 in OA No.2124/2011 in MA No.1617-2011
Annexure A2	Copy of the Hon'ble Delhi High Court order dated 27.11.2013 in WP No.7421/2013
Annexure A3	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court order dated 26.03.2014 in SLP No.4952/2014
Annexure A4	Copy of the Memo dated 14.02.2014
Annexure A5	Copy of the Office order dated 16.06.2014
Annexure A6	Copy of the Letter dated 24.04.2019
Annexure A7	Copy of the letter dated 25.04.2019
Annexure A8	Copy of the letter dated 29.04.2019
Annexure A9	Copy of the representation of applicant dated 30.04.2019
Annexure A10	Copy of the pay slip of the applicant for the month of May, 2019
Annexure A11	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court in Civil Appeal No.11527/2014 dated 18.12.2014

**Annexures referred to by the applicant in OA No.170/000683/2019**

Annexure A1	Copy of the CAT Principal Bench order dated 01.02.2013 in OA No.2124/2011 in MA No.1617-2011
Annexure A2	Copy of the Hon'ble Delhi High Court order dated 27.11.2013 in WP No.7421/2013
Annexure A3	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court order dated 26.03.2014 in SLP No.4952/2014
Annexure A4	Copy of the Memo dated 14.02.2014
Annexure A5	Copy of the Office order dated 16.06.2014
Annexure A6	Copy of the Letter dated 24.04.2019
Annexure A7	Copy of the letter dated 25.04.2019
Annexure A8	Copy of the letter dated 29.04.2019
Annexure A9	Copy of the representation of applicant dated 30.04.2019
Annexure A10	Copy of the pay slip of the applicant for the month of May, 2019
Annexure A11	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court in Civil Appeal No.11527/2014 dated 18.12.2014

**Annexures referred to by the applicant in OA No.170/000684/2019**

Annexure A1	Copy of the CAT Principal Bench order dated 01.02.2013 in OA No.2124/2011 in MA No.1617-2011
Annexure A2	Copy of the Hon'ble Delhi High Court order dated 27.11.2013 in WP No.7421/2013
Annexure A3	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court order dated 26.03.2014 in SLP No.4952/2014
Annexure A4	Copy of the Memo dated 14.02.2014
Annexure A5	Copy of the order where in the applicant was stepped up on par with a K.Shivashankar with w.e.f. 21.5.2005
Annexure A6	Copy of the Letter dated 24.04.2019
Annexure A7	Copy of the letter dated 25.04.2019
Annexure A8	Copy of the letter dated 29.04.2019
Annexure A9	Copy of the representation of applicant dated 30.04.2019
Annexure A10	Copy of the pay slip of the applicant for the month of May, 2019
Annexure A11	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court in Civil Appeal No.11527/2014 dated 18.12.2014

**Annexures referred to by the applicant in OA No.170/000685/2019**

Annexure A1	Copy of the CAT Principal Bench order dated 01.02.2013 in OA No.2124/2011 in MA No.1617-2011
Annexure A2	Copy of the Hon'ble Delhi High Court order dated 27.11.2013 in WP No.7421/2013
Annexure A3	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court order dated 26.03.2014 in SLP No.4952/2014
Annexure A4	Copy of the Memo dated 14.02.2014
Annexure A5	Copy of the Office order dated 26/30.11.2015
Annexure A6	Copy of the Letter dated 24.04.2019
Annexure A7	Copy of the letter dated 25.04.2019
Annexure A8	Copy of the letter dated 30.04.2019
Annexure A9	Copy of the representation of applicant dated 30.04.2019
Annexure A10	Copy of the pay slip of the applicant for the month of May, 2019
Annexure A11	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court in Civil Appeal No.11527/2014 dated 18.12.2014

**Annexures referred to by the applicant in OA No.170/000686/2019**

Annexure A1	Copy of the CAT Principal Bench order dated 01.02.2013 in OA No.2124/2011 in MA No.1617-2011
Annexure A2	Copy of the Hon'ble Delhi High Court order dated 27.11.2013 in WP No.7421/2013
Annexure A3	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court order dated 26.03.2014 in SLP No.4952/2014



Annexure A4	Copy of the Memo dated 14.02.2014
Annexure A5	Copy of the Office order dated 26/30.11.2015
Annexure A6	Copy of the Letter dated 24.04.2019
Annexure A7	Copy of the letter dated 25.04.2019
Annexure A8	Copy of the letter dated 29.04.2019
Annexure A9	Copy of the representation of applicant dated 27.05.2019
Annexure A10	Copy of the pay slip of the applicant for the month of May, 2019
Annexure A11	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court in Civil Appeal No.11527/2014 dated 18.12.2014

**Annexures referred to by the applicant in OA No.170/000687/2019**

Annexure A1	Copy of the CAT Principal Bench order dated 01.02.2013 in OA No.2124/2011 in MA No.1617-2011
Annexure A2	Copy of the Hon'ble Delhi High Court order dated 27.11.2013 in WP No.7421/2013
Annexure A3	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court order dated 26.03.2014 in SLP No.4952/2014
Annexure A4	Copy of the Memo dated 14.02.2014
Annexure A5	Copy of the Orders for stepping up of pay of applicant at par with A.R.Ramprakash
Annexure A6	Copy of the Letter dated 24.04.2019
Annexure A7	Copy of the letter dated 25.04.2019
Annexure A8	Copy of the letter dated 29.04.2019
Annexure A9	Copy of the representation of applicant dated 30.04.2019
Annexure A10	Copy of the pay slip of the applicant for the month of April, 2019
Annexure A11	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court in Civil Appeal No.11527/2014 dated 18.12.2014

**Annexures referred to by the applicant in OA No.170/000688/2019**

Annexure A1	Copy of the CAT Principal Bench order dated 01.02.2013 in OA No.2124/2011 in MA No.1617-2011
Annexure A2	Copy of the Hon'ble Delhi High Court order dated 27.11.2013 in WP No.7421/2013
Annexure A3	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court order dated 26.03.2014 in SLP No.4952/2014
Annexure A4	Copy of the Memo dated 14.02.2014
Annexure A5	Copy of the Office order dated 16.06.2014
Annexure A6	Copy of the Letter dated 24.04.2019
Annexure A7	Copy of the letter dated 25.04.2019
Annexure A8	Copy of the letter dated 29.04.2019
Annexure A9	Copy of the representation of applicant dated 03.05.2019
Annexure A10	Copy of the pay slip of the applicant for the month of April, 2019
Annexure A11	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court in Civil Appeal No.11527/2014 dated 18.12.2014

**Annexures referred to by the applicant in OA No.170/000689/2019**

Annexure A1	Copy of the CAT Principal Bench order dated 01.02.2013 in OA No.2124/2011 in MA No.1617-2011
Annexure A2	Copy of the Hon'ble Delhi High Court order dated 27.11.2013 in WP No.7421/2013
Annexure A3	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court order dated 26.03.2014 in SLP No.4952/2014
Annexure A4	Copy of the Memo dated 14.02.2014
Annexure A5	Copy of the Office order dated 26/30.11.2015
Annexure A6	Copy of the Letter dated 24.04.2019
Annexure A7	Copy of the letter dated 25.04.2019
Annexure A8	Copy of the letter dated 29.04.2019
Annexure A9	Copy of the representation of applicant dated 30.04.2019
Annexure A10	Copy of the pay slip of the applicant for the month of May, 2019
Annexure A11	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court in Civil Appeal No.11527/2014 dated 18.12.2014

**Annexures referred to by the applicant in OA No.170/000690/2019**

Annexure A1	Copy of the CAT Principal Bench order dated 01.02.2013 in OA No.2124/2011 in MA No.1617-2011
Annexure A2	Copy of the Hon'ble Delhi High Court order dated 27.11.2013 in WP No.7421/2013
Annexure A3	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court order dated 26.03.2014 in SLP No.4952/2014
Annexure A4	Copy of the Memo dated 14.02.2014
Annexure A5	Copy of the Office order dated 26/30.11.2015
Annexure A6	Copy of the Letter dated 24.04.2019
Annexure A7	Copy of the letter dated 25.04.2019
Annexure A8	Copy of the letter dated 30.04.2019
Annexure A9	Copy of the representation of applicant dated 09.05.2019
Annexure A10	Copy of the pay slip of the applicant for the month of May, 2019
Annexure A11	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court in Civil Appeal No.11527/2014 dated 18.12.2014

**Annexures referred to by the applicant in OA No.170/000690/2019**

Annexure A1	Copy of the CAT Principal Bench order dated 01.02.2013 in OA No.2124/2011 in MA No.1617-2011
Annexure A2	Copy of the Hon'ble Delhi High Court order dated 27.11.2013 in WP No.7421/2013
Annexure A3	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court order dated 26.03.2014 in SLP No.4952/2014
Annexure A4	Copy of the Memo dated 14.02.2014
Annexure A5	Copy of the Orders wherein the applicant was stepped up on par with Shri.Chandrashekar w.e.f. 4.7.2007

Annexure A6	Copy of the Letter dated 24.04.2019
Annexure A7	Copy of the letter dated 25.04.2019
Annexure A8	Copy of the letter dated 29.04.2019
Annexure A9	Copy of the representation of applicant dated 30.04.2019
Annexure A10	Copy of the pay slip of the applicant for the month of May, 2019
Annexure A11	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court in Civil Appeal No.11527/2014 dated 18.12.2014

**Annexures referred to by the applicant in OA No.170/000692/2019**

Annexure A1	Copy of the CAT Principal Bench order dated 01.02.2013 in OA No.2124/2011 in MA No.1617-2011
Annexure A2	Copy of the Hon'ble Delhi High Court order dated 27.11.2013 in WP No.7421/2013
Annexure A3	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court order dated 26.03.2014 in SLP No.4952/2014
Annexure A4	Copy of the Memo dated 14.02.2014
Annexure A5	Copy of the Office order dated 26/30.11.2015
Annexure A6	Copy of the Letter dated 24.04.2019
Annexure A7	Copy of the letter dated 25.04.2019
Annexure A8	Copy of the letter dated 29.04.2019
Annexure A9	Copy of the representation of applicant dated 30.04.2019
Annexure A10	Copy of the pay slip of the applicant for the month of April, 2019
Annexure A11	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court in Civil Appeal No.11527/2014 dated 18.12.2014

**Annexures referred to by the applicant in OA No.170/000693/2019**

Annexure A1	Copy of the CAT Principal Bench order dated 01.02.2013 in OA No.2124/2011 in MA No.1617-2011
Annexure A2	Copy of the Hon'ble Delhi High Court order dated 27.11.2013 in WP No.7421/2013
Annexure A3	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court order dated 26.03.2014 in SLP No.4952/2014
Annexure A4	Copy of the Memo dated 14.02.2014
Annexure A5	Copy of the Office order dated 26/30.11.2015
Annexure A6	Copy of the Letter dated 24.04.2019
Annexure A7	Copy of the letter dated 25.04.2019
Annexure A8	Copy of the letter dated 29.04.2019
Annexure A9	Copy of the representation of applicant dated Nil
Annexure A10	Copy of the pay slip of the applicant for the month of April, 2019
Annexure A11	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court in Civil Appeal No.11527/2014 dated 18.12.2014

**Annexures referred to by the applicant in OA No.170/000747/2019**

Annexure A1	Copy of the CAT Principal Bench order dated 01.02.2013 in OA No.2124/2011 in MA No.1617-2011
Annexure A2	Copy of the Hon'ble Delhi High Court order dated 27.11.2013 in WP No.7421/2013
Annexure A3	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court order dated 26.03.2014 in SLP No.4952/2014
Annexure A4	Copy of the Memo dated 14.02.2014
Annexure A5	Copy of the order wherein the applicant was stepped up on par with A.Chandrashekar w.e.f.24.4.2019
Annexure A6	Copy of the Letter dated 24.04.2019
Annexure A7	Copy of the letter dated 25.04.2019
Annexure A8	Copy of the letter dated 29.04.2019
Annexure A9	Copy of the representation of applicant dated 30.04.2019
Annexure A10	Copy of the pay slip of the applicant for the month of March, 2019
Annexure A11	Copy of the Hon'ble Apex Court in Civil Appeal No.11527/2014 dated 18.12.2014

**Annexures referred to by the respondents**

Annexure R1	Copy of the letter dated 14.02.2014
Annexure R2	Copy of the order dated 03.03.2014
Annexure R3	Copy of the letter dated 18.03.2014
Annexure R4	Copy of the letter dated 19.03.2014
Annexure R5	Copy of the letter dated 9.4.2014
Annexure R6	Copy of the letter dated 28.09.2015
Annexure R7	Copy of the Comparative Statement of Shri.Chandrashekar
Annexure R8	Copy of the Table showing the Fixation of Pay
Annexure R9	Copy of the Office order dated 03.03.2014
Annexure R10	Copy of the letter dated 29.04.2019
Annexure R11	Copy of the letter dated 24.05.2019
Annexure R12	Copy of the CAT Principal Bench order dated 01.02.2013 in OA No.2124/2011 in MA No.1617-2011
Annexure R13	Copy of the Form of Option
Annexure R14	Copy of the letter dated 28.09.2015

**Annexures referred to by the applicant in OA No.170/000544/2019**

Annexure A1	Copy of the order dated 31.12.1987
Annexure A2	Copy of the order dated 25.5.2010
Annexure A3	Copy of the order dated 01.02.2013 of the CAT, Principal Bench in OA No.2124/2011
Annexure A4	Copy of the order dated 14.02.2014
Annexure A5	Copy of the order dated 03.03.2014
Annexure A6	Copy of the order dated 16.06.2019
Annexure A7	Copy of the order dated 28.03.2019

Annexure A8 Copy of the representation of applicant dated 02.04.2019  
Annexure A9 Copy of the order dated 03.04.2019

**Annexures referred to by the respondents**

Annexure R1 Copy of the letter dated 14.02.2014  
Annexure R2 Copy of the letter dated 18.03.2014  
Annexure R3 Copy of the letter dated 19.03.2014  
Annexure R4 Copy of the letter dated 9.4.2014  
Annexure R5 Copy of the letter dated 28.09.2015  
Annexure R6 Copy of the Comparative Statement of Shri.N.Veeresh.SA  
Annexure R7 Copy of the Table showing the Fixation of Pay  
Annexure R8 Copy of the letter dated 28.03.2014  
Annexure R9 Copy of the sanction letter dated 03.04.2019  
Annexure 10 Copy of the OM dated 18.09.2009  
Annexure R11 Copy of the Pay drawal from time to time of Shri.M.Gopalkrishna OA 170/544/2019.

**Annexures referred to by the applicant in OA No.170/000545/2019**

Annexure A1 Copy of the order dated 15.07.1983  
Annexure A2 Copy of the order dated 01.07.1988  
Annexure A3 Copy of the order dated 25.05.2010  
Annexure A4 Copy of the order dated 01.02.2013 of the CAT, Principal Bench in OA No.2124/2011  
Annexure A5 Copy of the order dated 14.02.2014  
Annexure A6 Copy of the order dated 03.03.2014  
Annexure A7 Copy of the order dated 30.04.2019  
Annexure A8 Copy of the order dated 2.04.2019  
Annexure A9 Copy of the LPC of the applicant dated 13.11.2018  
Annexure A10 Copy of the order dated 09.04.2019

**Annexures referred to by the respondents**

Annexure R1 Copy of the letter dated 14.02.2014  
Annexure R2 Copy of the letter dated 18.03.2014  
Annexure R3 Copy of the letter dated 19.03.2014  
Annexure R4 Copy of the letter dated 9.4.2014  
Annexure R5 Copy of the letter dated 28.09.2015  
Annexure R6 Copy of the Statement of Shri.A.Chandrashekar  
Annexure R7 Copy of the Table showing the Fixation of Pay of Smt.Sandya.S.Murthy  
Annexure R8 Copy of the letter dated 02.04.2019  
Annexure R9 Copy of the sanction letter dated 09.04.2019  
Annexure 10 Copy of the OM dated 18.09.2009  
Annexure R11 Copy of the Pay drawal from time to time of Smt.Sandya.S.Murthy OA 170/678/2019.