

37
64

**CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL
PRINCIPAL BENCH**

RA No. 325/2005 in OA 2543/2004

With

RA 326/2004 in OA 2549/2004, RA 328/2005 in

OA 2539/2004, RA 333/2004 in OA 2292/2004

and

RA 334/2004 in OA 2548/2004

New Delhi this the 11th day of February, 2008.

**Hon'ble Mr. Justice M. Ramachandran, Vice Chairman (J)
Hon'ble Mrs. Chitra Chopra, Member (A)**

1. RA 325/2005 in OA 2543/2004

1. Smt. Kamla Devi,
W/o late Shri Dwarika Prasad,
Working as Khallasi,
Under Section Engineer (Works),
Northern Railway, Delhi Kishan Ganj -I,
Delhi.
2. Smt. Malti Devi,
W/o Late Shri Jai Narain,
Working as Mali,
Under Section Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, New Delhi.
3. Smt. Gaytri Devi,
W/o Late Shri Som Dutt,
Working as Peon, Under Divisional Personnel Officer,
State Entry Road, Northern Railway,
New Delhi.
4. Smt. Dhanwanti,
W/o Late Shri Shiv Poojan Tiwari,
R/o 31 /473, Trilok Puri, Delhi-110 091
5. Shri Rakesh Kumar,
S/o Late Shri Ram Lakhan,
R/o 3/G-2, Champsford Road,
New Delhi-110055.
6. Shri Parvati Devi,
W/o Late Shri Hari Charan,
R/o Mali Hut No.7, Inder Puri Halt,
New Delhi- 110 028
7. Smt. Shobhavati,
W/o Late Shri Lal Chand,
R/o V&PO Inchhapuri,
Distt - Gurgaon (Haryana).

38
645

2

8. Smt. Asha Rani,
W/o Late Shri Ram Sanehi, Working as Water Woman,
Under Sr. Station Manager,
Northern Railway, New Delhi.
9. Smt. Ram Pati,
W/o Late Shri Banarasi, Working as Mali,
Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
10. Smt. Kamta Devi,
W/o Late Shri Ram Bahadur
R/o House No. 25/A, Gali No.2, Gazipur,
Delhi-110 096.
11. Smt. Shiv Devi,
W/o Late Shri Babu Lal,
Khallasi, Under PWI, Tughlakabad,
New Delhi.
12. Smt. Shyamo Devi,
W/o Late Shri Om Parkash,
R/o 1707/123, Shanti Nagar,
New Delhi-110 035.
13. Smt. Bimla Devi,
W/o Late Shri Pooran Chand,
R/o A-2/67, New Seema Puri,
Delhi-110095.
14. Smt. Lado Devi,
W/o Late Shri Manohar Lal,
Mali, Under Section Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, New Delhi.
15. Smt. Sushila Devi,
W/o Late Shri Mohinder Singh,
C/o Shri Bharat Lal,
349, Ward No.8, Nai Basti,
Palwal (Haryana)

.. Applicants in OA
and Respondents in RA

(By Advocate Shri Manjeet Singh Reen Proxy for Shri Amit Anand)

VERSUS

Union of India through:

1. The General Manager,
Northern Railway, Baroda House,
New Delhi.

65

2. The Divisional Railway Manager,
Northern Railway, State Entry Road,
New Delhi.
3. The Sr. Divisional Finance Manager,
Northern Railway, State Entry Road,
New Delhi.

.. Respondents in OA and
Petitioners in RA.

(By Advocate Shri R.L. Dhawan)

2. RA 326/2004 in OA 2549/2004.

1. Shri Ghanshyam Prasad,
S/o Shri Vishwanath,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
2. Shri Basakhi Ram,
S/o Shri Matvar Ram,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
3. Shri Gulab,
S/o Shri Zilmir Ram,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
4. Shri Ramji Lal,
S/o Shri Bhola Ram,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
5. Shri Dukhi Ram,
S/o Shri Ram Phal,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
6. Shri Ram Kishore,
S/o Shri Prem Singh,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
7. Shri Ram Sevak,
S/o Shri Kolahal.
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.

40
65-A

4

8. Shri Ram Sukh,
S/o Shri Ram Avtar,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
9. Shri Sita Ram,
S/o Shri Jogi,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
10. Shri Kishan Pal Singh,
S/o Shri Phool Singh,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
11. Shri Daya Ram,
S/o Shri Mathai,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
12. Shri Ram Pal,
S/o Shri Tej Ram,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
13. Shri Ram Lagan,
S/o Shri Ram Kishan,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
14. Shri Pahila Jagmayia,
S/o Shri Pahila Barragi,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
15. Shri Sohan Lal,
S/o Shri Gyarsha Ram,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
16. Shri Jivan,
S/o Shri Hamraj,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.

66

17. Shri Satrendra Prakash Patel,
S/o Shri Baij Nath Patel,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
18. Shri Jawala Prasad,
S/o Shri Lekh Raj,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
19. Shri Ali Hasan,
S/o Shri Illashi,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
20. Shri Bali Ram,
S/o Shri Krishanu Ram,
SOM, Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
21. Smt. Asha Rani,
D/o Shri Piarey Lal,
Typist,
Under O.S./W. Estate,
DRM Office, Northern Railway,
New Delhi.

.. Applicants in OA
and Respondents in RA

(By Advocate Shri Manjeet Singh Reen Proxy for Shri Amit Anand)

VERSUS

Union of India through:

1. The General Manager,
Northern Railway, Baroda House,
New Delhi.
2. The Divisional Railway Manager,
Northern Railway, State Entry Road,
New Delhi.
3. The Sr. Divisional Finance Manager,
Northern Railway, State Entry Road,
New Delhi.

.. Respondents in OA and
Petitioners in RA.

(By Advocate Shri R.L. Dhawan)

42
62

3. RA 328/2005 in OA 2539/2004

1. Shri Desh Raj Sharma,
S/o Shri Sita Ram Sharma,
Office Khallasi,
Under Sr.Section Engineer (Estate),
Northern Railway, DRM Office,
New Delhi.
2. Shri Jai Dev Panda,
S/o Shri Ghanshyam Panda,
Office Khallasi, Under D.S.E.Estate,
Northern Railway, New Delhi.
3. Shri Ran Pal Singh,
S/o Shri Shayam Lal Singh,
Office Khallasi, Under Office Supdt/W.E/
Northern Railway, DRM Office,
New Delhi.
4. Shri Kamta Prasad,
S/o Shri Jagropan,
Peon, Under Superintendent Establishment,
Chief Personnel Office,
Northern Railway, Baroda House,
New Delhi.
5. Shri Likh Ram,
S/o Shri Nanak Chand,
Mali/Fitter, Under EMU Car Shed,
Northern Railway, Ghaziabad.
6. Shri Ram Raj Prasad,
S/o Shri Shebha Prasad,
Senior Peon, Under G.Branch Headquarter Office,
Baroda House, Northern Railway, New Delhi.
7. Shri Tej Bahadur,
S/o Shri Mathrua Prasad,
Senior Peon Under G.Branch Headquarter Office,
Baroda House, Northern Railway, New Delhi.
8. Shri Ram Sahai,
S/o Shri Nankoo,
Mali, Under Sr. Section Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, New Delhi.
9. Shri Malkhey,
S/o Shri Sarupa Mali,
Under Section Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, New Delhi.

43
JL

7

10. Shri Ram Prasad,
S/o Shri Net Ram,
Mali, under Section Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, New Delhi.
11. Shri Murari Lal,
S/o Shri Nanwa,
Mali, Under Section Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Hazrat Nizamuddin, New Delhi.
12. Shri Rajinder,
S/o Shri Baroo,
Mali, Under Section Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Hazrat Nizamuddin, New Delhi.
13. Shri Dev Narain,
S/o Shri Kanti Ram,
Mali, Under Section Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Hazrat Nizamuddin, New Delhi.
14. Shri Ram Kishore,
S/o Shri Hub Lal,
Mali, Under Section Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Hazrat Nizamuddin, New Delhi.
15. Shri Ram Padarath,
S/o Shri Raj Bahadur Singh,
J.E. Drawing, Under Sr. D.M.E.,
Northern Railway, Tughlakabad, New Delhi.
16. Shri Satya Dev,
S/o Shri Raj Ball,
Mali, Under Section Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, New Delhi.
17. Shri Sita Ram,
S/o Shri Nankoo,
Khallasi, Under Section Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, New Delhi.

.. Applicants in OA
and Respondents in RA

(By Advocate Shri Manjeet Singh Reen Proxy for Shri Amit Anand)

VERSUS

Union of India through:

1. The General Manager,
Northern Railway, Baroda House, New Delhi.

169

2. The Divisional Railway Manager,
Northern Railway, State Entry Road,
New Delhi.
3. The Sr. Divisional Finance Manager,
Northern Railway, State Entry Road,
New Delhi.

.. Respondents in OA and
Petitioners in RA.

(By Advocate Shri R.L. Dhawan)

4. RA 333/2004 in OA 2292/2004

1. Shri Mahender Singh,
S/o Shri Jai Singh,
Senior Clerk,
Under Section Engineer (Works),
Northern Railway, Transit Camp,
New Delhi.
2. Shri Nalla Mutu,
S/o Shri Arumugam,
Fitter,
Under Section Engineer (Works),
Northern Railway, Transit Camp,
New Delhi.
3. Shri Nirmal Dass,
S/o Shri Hari Dass,
Khallasi,
Under Section Engineer (Works),
Northern Railway, Transit Camp,
New Delhi.
4. Shri Rajender Pd.,
S/o Shri Ram Asrey,
Khallasi,
Under Section Engineer (Works),
Northern Railway, Delhi Kishan Ganj-1, Delhi.
5. Shri Daya Ram,
S/o Shri Suraj Pal,
Khallasi,
Under Section Engineer (Works),
Northern Railway, Delhi Kishan Ganj- 1,
Delhi.
6. Shri Virender Kumar Singh,
S/o Shri Radhey Shyam Singh,
Khallasi, Under Section Engineer (Works),
Northern Railway, Delhi Kishan Ganj-1,
Delhi.

7. Shri Raja Ram,
Pointsman,
Under Chief Yard Master.
8. Shri Bipat Ram,
S/o Shri Mathura,
Under Section Engineer (Works),
Northern Railway, Delhi Kishan Ganj-1,
Delhi.
9. Shri Om Prakash,
S/o Shri Pinja Ram,
Carpenter,
Under Section Engineer (Works),
Northern Railway, Delhi Kishan Ganj-1,
Delhi.
10. Smt. Shilla,
W/o Shri Joginder Singh,
Mali Khallasi,
Under Section Engineer (Works),
Northern Railway, New Delhi.
11. Shri Nanhal,
S/o Shri Jahoor,
Train Lighting (Khallasi),
Under Train Lighting, S.K.Line,
Northern Railway, Delhi Junction, Delhi.
12. Shri Lalit Mohan,
S/o Shri Karmi Mali,
Mali,
Under Section Engineer (Works),
Northern Railway, New Delhi.
13. Shri Mahesh,
S/o Shri Chaneshwar,
Mali,
Under Section Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, New Delhi.

.. Applicants in OA
and Respondents in RA

(By Advocate Shri Manjeet Singh Reen Proxy for Shri Amit Anand)

VERSUS

Union of India through:

1. The General Manager,
Northern Railway, Baroda House,
New Delhi.

2. The Divisional Railway Manager,
Northern Railway, State Entry Road,
New Delhi.
3. The Sr. Divisional Finance Manager,
Northern Railway, State Entry Road,
New Delhi.

.. Respondents in OA and
Petitioners in RA.

(By Advocate Shri R.L. Dhawan)

5. RA 334/2004 in OA 2548/2004

1. Shri Chiranjee Prasad,
S/o Shri Innar Prasad,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
2. Shri Ashok Kumar,
S/o Shri Tilak Ram,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
3. Shri Ramakant Sharma,
S/o Shri Munni Lal,
Carpenter, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
4. Shri Satya Narain,
S/o Shri Jagannath,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
5. Shri Dashrath Prasad,
S/o Shri Shitla Prasad,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
6. Shri Ganga,
S/o Shri Ram Dhanni,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.
7. Shri Kanthayee,
S/o Shri Dhury Lal,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, S.P. Marg, New Delhi.

8. Shri Jeet Singh
S/o Shri Deva Ram,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, S.P. Marg,
New Delhi.

9. Shri Rajan,
S/o Shri Dayal Singh,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, S.P. Marg,
New Delhi.

10. Shri Ashruddin,
S/o Shri Rehmat,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Hazrat Nizamuddin,
New Delhi.

11. Shri Grevenhichal Hardass,
S/o Shri Mayical Mangal,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, S. P. Marg,
New Delhi.

12. Shri Hira Lal,
S/o Shri Chottee Lal,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, S.P. Marg,
New Delhi.

13. Shri Satram,
S/o Shri Bhasin,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, S.P. Marg,
New Delhi.

14. Shri Hari Narayan,
S/o Shri Ram Kare Ram,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, S.P. Marg,
New Delhi.

15. Shri Daya Shanker,
S/o Shri Sahai,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, S. P. Marg, New Delhi.

16. Shri Ram Chander Singh,
S/o Shri Matabadal Singh,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar,
New Delhi.

48
V23
17. Shri Jagannath,
S/o Shri Sahai,
Mali, Under Junior Engineer (Horticulture),
Northern Railway, Sarojini Nagar, New Delhi.

Applicants in OA
and Respondents in RA

(By Advocate Shri Manjeet Singh Reen Proxy for Shri Amit Anand)

VERSUS

Union of India through:

1. The General Manager,
Northern Railway, Baroda House, New Delhi.
2. The Divisional Railway Manager,
Northern Railway, State Entry Road, New Delhi.
3. The Sr. Divisional Finance Manager,
Northern Railway, State Entry Road, New Delhi.

Respondents in OA and
Petitioners in RA.

(By Advocate Shri R.L. Dhawan)

O R D E R (ORAL)

(Hon'ble Mr. Justice M. Ramachandran, Vice Chairman (J):

Although there is great opposition about the maintainability of the applications because of limitation, since the issues require to be gone into, in general interest, and errors or oversights require to be attended to as suggested, the RAs are allowed. Original Applications are restored to its original position. Registry is directed to list all these pending cases before the Larger Bench as the self same issue is pending before the Tribunal. As pointed out by the Hon'ble Supreme Court, procedures are handmaids to justice and hurdles, if any posed because of the presence of procedural rules could be appropriately explained, whether they are urged by the applicants or the respondents.

2. Let a copy of this order be placed in RA 326/2004, RA 328/2004, RA 333/2004 and RA 334/2004.

(Chitra Chopra)
Member (A)

(M. Ramachandran)
Vice Chairman (J)