

Lib

CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL
MUMBAI BENCH, MUMBAI.
ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.248/2020

DATE OF DECISION:-22.07.2020

CORAM:- R. VIJAYKUMAR, Member (A)
RAVINDER KAUR, MEMBER (J)

1. Mr. N. R. Rathod, Age 42 years, Working as Sr. Commercial Inspector, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : 9 B, Asthavinayak Colony, Near Tillu Bhai Garage, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.
2. Mr. Rahul Arun Dayama, Age 39 years, Son of Arun Dayama Working as CCOR - DRM (C), Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Bal Rajeshwar Nagar, 2nd Phase, Rahul Apartment, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.
3. Mr. Anand Anil Gangwde Age 36 years, Working as SGC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Bapu Bungalow, Jay Bhavani Gymkhana, Shivaji Nagar No. 1, Sangle Wasti, Manmad 423 104.
4. Mr. Kiransingh Ajabsingh Nikam, Age 33 years, Working as Chief Booking Clerk, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Amarnath Nagar, Janur Road, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.
5. Mr. Abraham Gulzar Tadal, Age 49 years, Working as CCOR / BSL, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Panchshil Nagar, Bhusawal, Tal. Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.
6. Mr. S. T. Sapkale, Age 39 years, Working as Commercial Inspector, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Mohit Nagar, Jalgaon Road, Bhusawal, Dist.
7. Mr. Dhanajay Majumdar, Age 30 years, Working as Sr. Goods Clerk, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Plot No. 9, Shambaji Nagar, Varangaon Road, Opp. Nahata Dal Mill, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.
8. Mrs. Swapnali S. Ghodke, Age 35 years, Wife of Sandip Ghodke , Working as CPC (Parcel

Office) B2, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Datta Nagar, Wanjola Road, Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon.

9. Rajendra S. Pa.... Age 45 years, Working as Commercial Instructor, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Plot No. 13, Bhusaval Colony, J. L. Road, Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon.

10. Mr. Yogesh P. Dongare Age 46 years, Son of Padmakar Dongare, Working as Sr. Commercial Inspector, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : 18th Ganesh Colony, Near Ganesh Temple, Jalgaon Road, Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon.

11. Mr. Tanveer Alam Mehmood Alam, Age 24 years, Working as Sr. Commercial Clerk, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Khadka Road, Gunjal Colony, Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon 425 201.

12. Mr. Rajesh Balu Joshi, Age 42 years, Son of Balu Joshi, Working as SGC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : 11 Gajanan Apartment, Near Prabhakar Hall, Bhalchandra Nagar, Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon 425 201.

13. Mr. Pritam N. Rane, Age 33 years, Son of Narendra Rane. Working as Commercial Inspector, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Gadkari Nagar, Khadka Road, Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon.

14. Mr. Kishor P. Chaudhari, Age 42 years, Son of Prakash Chaudhari, Working as CCOR, DRM (C), Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Municipal Park, Sawarkar Road, Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon.

15. Mrs. Vaishali B. Patil Age 33 years, Working as Commercial Inspector, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : C/o B. R. Patil, Mahendra Nagar, Pahur, Kasbe, Tal. Jamner, Dist. Jalgaon.

16. Ms. Priya Avinash Patole, Age 29 years, Working as SGC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Amogh Apartment, Sharda Nagar, Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon 425 201.

17. Ms. Vijaya S. Pandav, Age 33 years, Working as Sr. Parcel Clerk, Central Railway, Bhusaval,

Residing at : Ganesh Colony, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

18. Mr. S. T. Rane Age 58 years, Working as Chief Goods Clerk KMN, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Manali Nagar, Nandurg, Near Police Quarters, Dist. Buldhana.

19. Mr. Pramod B. Bharambe, Age 41 years, Working as Chief Parcel Clerk, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Behind Mali Bhavan, Tukaram Nagar, NH No. 6, Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon.

20. Mr. Chandansingh D. Varmu Age 32 years, Working as Booking Clerk, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon.

21. Mr. Laxman P. Shelate, Age 53 years, Working as Parcel Office, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Bhusaval.

22. Mr. Milind B. Salunkhe Age 45 years, Working as CPC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Shantinath Nagar, Block No. 9/A, Behind Prabhat Colony, Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon.

23. Mr. G. Y. Rao Age 53 years, Working as CBC AK, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Gaddam Plot Last Lane, Near Chandak Mangal Karyalaya, Akola, Dist. Akola.

24. Mr. C. R. Fadnis, Age 32 years, Working as Sr. Goods Clerk, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Purshottam Nagar, Near Gayatri Mandir, Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon.

25. Mr. Hijha Bhaskar Koli, Age 34 years, Working as CBC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Tukaram Nagar, Behind Mali Bhavan, Near Jagrut Hanuman Mandir, Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon.

26. Ms. Sharda Parshram Waghmare, Age 40 years, Working as CBC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Jetvan Budha Vihar, Ambedkar Nagar, Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon.

27. Ashok Chokha More, Age 34 years, Working as

CBC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at :
Bhima Colony, Vihar, Bhusawal, Dist.
Jalgaon.

28. Rehna Asghari, Age 42 years, Working as CBC,
Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : RB II,
605 A, 15 Block, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

29. Miss. Sangita Nandlal Kaithwas Age 45 years,
Working as CBC, Central Railway, Bhusaval,
Residing at : Behind Ambedkar School, Near
Railway North Colony, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

30. Shaikh Ahmad Abdul Hamid, Age 37 years,
Working as TRC, Central Railway, Bhusaval,
Residing at : Sagar Park, Khadka Road, Bhusawal,
Dist. Jalgaon.

31. Lina S. Bonde, Age 33 years, Working as SBC,
Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at :
Sidheshwar Nagar, Near Anand Nagar, Bhusawal,
Dist. Jalgaon.

32. Dezmona Davza, Age 50 years, Working as CBS
(W), Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at :
Plot No. 48, Sambhaji Nagar, 15 Blocks,
Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

33. Rahul Ramkishan Purohit, Age .. years,
Working as SGC, Central Railway, Chalisgaon,
Residing at : Ballaleshwar Colony, Sahakar
Nagar, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

34. Vinayak Raghunath Awasaramal, Age 51 years,
Working as SGC, Central Railway, DRM, Bhusaval,
Residing at : 15th Block, RB II, 1078 E,
Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

35. Archana Yuvraj Patil, Age 36 years, Working
as CBC, Central Railway, DRM, Bhusaval, Residing
at : Block No. 7, New MHADA Colony, Wanjola
road, Near Mirchi Ground, Bhusawal, Dist.
Jalgaon.

36. Rajesh Madhukar Patil, Age 35 years, Working
as Sr. CBC, Central Railway, DRM Bhusaval,
Residing at : Yashdhara Nagar, Bhusawal, Dist.
Jalgaon.

37. Rupesh Kamalakar Jawale, Age 29 years,

Working as Central Railway, DRM Bhusaval,
Residing at : Near Bus Stand Bamnod, Tal. Yawal,
Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

38. Mukund P. Patil. Age 37 years, Working as
SGC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at :
Gandhi Nagar, Bajrang Colony, Patil Bldg., Plot
No. 21, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

39. Deepak S. Bhamere, Age 45 years, Working as
CGC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at :
Gadkari Nagar, Khadka Road, Bhusawal, Dist.
Jalgaon.

40. Vinay Ashok Ekhe, Age 45 years, Working as
CCOR, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at :
Professor Colony, Near Kal Bhairav Mandir,
Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

41. Manish Suresh Arak, Age 36 years, Working as
CCOR, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at :
New Idgah Muslim Colony, Khadka Road, Khadka
Shivar, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

42. Aman M.. Baste, Age 21 years, Working as
TRC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at :
Near Railway Hospital, Haddiwali Chawl, Qtr. No.
581 D Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

43. Kiran Ramesh Chabukswar, Age 58 years,
Working as BC, Central Railway, Bhusaval,
Residing at : HO Colony Kandri, Ambedkar Nagar,
Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

44. Arfa Sultana Md. Harun, Age 44 years,
Working as CBC, Central Railway, Bhusaval,
Residing at : Khadka Road, Near Raza Tawar,
Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

45. Smita P. Shelke, Age 54 years, Working as
SBC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at :
Samta Nagar, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

46. Aruna Sunil Patil. Age 39 years, Working as
....., Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at :
Ordnance Factory, Varangon.

47. Kamlakar Bhagwan Thakur, Age 43 years,
Working as CBC, Central Railway, Bhusaval,
Residing at : Ayodhya Nagar, Jalgaon Road,

Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

48. Swati S. Sonawane, Age 41 years, Working as CBC,

Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Lilai Nagar, ZBTI Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

49. Nitin Pratap Valvi, Age 44 years, Working as CBC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : E/5, Narayan Housing Soc., Behind Dr. Khachane Hall, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

50. Rohitkumar A. Mehra, Age 32 years, Working as CI, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Khandari Plot, Near Hanuman Temple, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

51. Shaikh Imran Shaikh Kadir, Age 36 years, Working as SBC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : 21/3, Plot No. 52, Aqsa Nagar, Khadka, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

52. Ranjeet R. Yadav, Age 31 years, Working as CCOR, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Gokul Nagar, Plot No. 27, Pooja Complex, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

53. Vaishali P. Kale, Age 39 years, Working as CGC, Central Railway, Jalgaon, Residing at : Mohit Nagar, Near Sai Baba Mandir, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

54. Umesh A. Wade, Age 32 years, Working as CGC, Central Railway, Jalgaon, Residing at : Plot No. 122, Pandu Narang Nath Nagar, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

55. Sunita M. Patil. Age 43 years, Working as CGC, Central Railway, Jalgaon, Residing at : Juna Nashirabad Road, Ganesh Apartment, Near Yogeshwar, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

56. B. M. Tulaskar, Age 33 years, Working as SBC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : 7, Radhakrishna Nagar, Jalgaon 425 001.

57. Nilesh Patil. Age 29 years, Working as SBC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Satyam Nagar, Plot No. 48/2, Jalgaon 425 001.

58. Pawan U Pardeshi. Age 25 years, Working as TRC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Near Loco Shed, Haldiwali Chawl, RB.I 649/D, Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon.

59. Harshal S. Sapkale, Age 27 years, Working as BC, Central Railway, Jalgaon, Residing at : Nivrutti Nagar, Plot No. 27, Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon.

60. Sanjay R. Ingale, Age 45 years, Working as CGC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Varangaon Road, Kandari Shiv, Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon.

61. Hemant P. Mehra, Age 30 years, Working as SBC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Shanti Nagar, Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon.

62. Jagdish Bhauraao Gurme, Age 52 years, Working as CBC, Central Railway, Jalgaon, Residing at : Sakegaon, Tal. Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon.

63. Bharat Ganesh Damade, Age 29 years, Working as TRC, Central Railway, Jalgaon, Residing at : Dwarka Nagar, Near Santosh Kirana Shop, Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon.

64. Nirmala D. Verma, Age 35 years, Working as TRC, Central Railway, Jalgaon, Residing at : 130, Pratappura Nagar, Jhansi.

65. Bhavna P. Chaudhari, Age 43 years, Working as TRC, Central Railway, Jalgaon, Residing at : Plot No. 16, G. 31/2, Muktai Nagar Colony, Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon.

66. Sunanda Darekar, Age 54 years, Working as CBC, Central Railway, Jalgaon, Residing at : Plot No. 314, Radhakrishna Nagar, New Kanalda Road, Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon.

67. D. S. Ambekar, Age 53 years, Working as CBC, Central Railway, Jalgaon, Residing at : 397 Jay Kishnwali, Navi Park, Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon.

68. Priti P. Bhavsar, Age 53 years, Working as SBC, Central Railway, Jalgaon, Residing at : Indraprasta Nagar, Onkar Apartment, Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon.

69. Mamta Parag Sarode, Age 37 years, Working as CPC, Central Railway, Jalgaon, Residing at : 30/5, Saraswati Nagar, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

70. Hemraj Divakar Badh.... Age 48 years, Working as CBC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Janer Road Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

71. Pradeep Manohar Sawale, Age 40 years, Working as CCOR, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : 15th Block, RB II 1061 (H), Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

72. Archana Nilesh Temburnikar, Age 42 years, Working as CCOR, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : ANS Services, In front of Vikas Photo Studio, Yawal Road, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

73. Pravin J. Sharma, Age 33 years, Working as CBC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : RB II, 1013, B 15 Block, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

74. Pravin Ramesh Bhalerao, Age 37 years, Working as CC Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : 370/9, Mahadev Nagar, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

75. S. D. Naitam, Age 57 years, Working as CBC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Row House No. B -2, Near Rajrajeshwari Hall, Kruishna Park, Jail Road, Nasik Road, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

76. Ganesh Bhimrao Jadhav, Age 27 years, Working as CBC, Central Railway, Patil Galli Nandagaon, Nashik 423 106.

77. Akash Dilip Kumre, Age 21 years, Working as CC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : HUDCO, Sanarkar Nagar, Bhagyadeep Colony, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

78. Sonali Bharat Aher, Age 25 years, Working as CC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Filter House, Rly Colony, RBI 783, Manmad 423 104.

79. K.T. Narian, Age 40 years, Working as CPC,

Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at :
Durgeshwari Aprt., UP Nagar, Nasik Road.

80. Siddeshwar Ulhas Shaharkar, Age 32 years,
Working as CPC, Central Railway, Bhusaval,
Residing at : Near Cholta Gurudwara, Manmad 423
104, Dist. Nasik.

81. Upendra Kumar Sah, Age 35 years, Working as
TRC Comm. Clerk, Central Railway, Bhusaval,
Residing at : Shantinagar, Manmad, Dist. Nasik.

82. Manoj D. Borse, Age 30 years, Working as CC,
Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : At Post
Sakane Teh, Nandagaon, Dist. Nasik.

83. Jitendra Laxman Jadhav, Age 34 years,
Working as CBC, Central Railway, Manmad,
Residing at : C -01, Balaji Twin Buglow, Parijat
Nagar, Jail Road, Nasik Road .

84. Ritesh Ramdas Palshkar, Age 32 years,
Working as CPC, Central Railway, Bhusaval,
Residing at : Near St. Xavier High School, Camp
No. 1, Yeola Road, Tal. Ngn, Dist. Nasik.

85. Vivek S. Bhalerao, Age 47 years, Working as
Chief Comm. Inspector, Central Railway,
Bhusaval, Residing at : 26, Sanjeet HO, SO
Manmad, Dist. Nasik.

86. Mahesh Suresh Mali, Age 36 years, Working as
SPC, Central Railway, Manmad, Residing at :
Swami Vivekanad Nagar, Nandgaon, Pin 423 106.

87. Prabhat K. Raikwar, Age 47 years, Working as
:Sr. GC MMR, 11/101 Bldg. Vidhi Complex,
Gauripada Road, Kalyan (West) .

88. Ganesh S. Pawar, Age 26 years, Working as
TRC, Central Railway, Manmad, Residing at : Shri
Harinaman Appt., B/h Prakash Traders, Jail Road,
Nasik 422 101.

89. Rajesh P. Sapkale, Age 45 years, Working as
CPC MMR, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing
at :Radhakrishna Nagar, Near S. Koli Mill,
Shivaji Nagar, Dist. Jalgaon.

90. Umesh W. Madhe, Age 40 years, Working as

CBC, Central Railway, Manmad, Residing at :
Manke Compound, Manmad, Dist. Nasik.

91. Anesh P. Rajput, Age 30 years, Working as
CC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at :
Nasik Road Jail Road.

92. Ananta Puna Patil. Age 43 years, Working as
CPC, Central Railway, MMR, Residing at :
Nilambari Appt., Flat No. 07, Jail Road, Nasik
Road, Nasik.

93. Kapil Dnyandev Atravalkar, Age 32 years,
Working as TRC, Central Railway Manmad, Residing
at : Dropadi Nagar, Near Primpvla Road, Jalgaon,
Dist. Jalgaon.

94. Yogita Paul Cato, Age 34 years, Working as
CBC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at :
Camp No. 2, Opp. Old Post Office, Yeola Road,
Manmad.

95. Snehal Keada Sonawane, Age 35 years, Working
as CPC, Central Railway, MMR, Residing at : A/P
Dugaon, Tal. Chandwad, Dist. Nasik.

96. P.D. Sonawane, Age 51 years, Working as CGC,
Central Railway, Shirud, Residing at : suwarna
Thani Nagar, Chalisgaon, Pawarwadi, Chalisgaon.

97. Roque Anebrew Davids Age 27 years, Working
as SBC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at :
Qtr. No. G-105, Behind Saerad Heart Church,
Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

98. Nishikant M. Chaudhari, Age 48 years,
Working as Sr. BC, Central Railway, Bodwad,
Residing at : Shanti Nagar, Plot No. 09,
Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

99. Nitin M. Gandhi, Age 44 years, Working as
Chief Goods Clerk, Central Railway, Bhusaval,
Residing at : Megh Malhar Society, Opp. Navnath
Temple, Varangaon Road, Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

100. Ashwin M. Ingle, Age 35 years, Working as
SPC, Central Railway: Savda, Residing at :
Sahakar Nagar, Behind Technical High School,
Bhusawal, Dist. Jalgaon.

101. Vidya Y. Pardeshi Age 43 years, Working as CPC, Central Railway, Bhusaval, Residing at : Plot No. 3, Gandhi Nagar, Bhusaval, Dist. Jalgaon.

...Applicants

(By Advocate Shri Vicky Nagrani)

Versus

1. Union of India, Through the Secretary, Ministry of Railways Railway Board Rail Bhawan, New Delhi - 110 001

2. The General Manager Central Railway CSTM H.O. Mumbai - 400 001.

3. Divisional Railway Manager Central Railway Bhusaval Division Bhusaval - 425 20

4. Ashish kumar Mishra CVI CSMT BSL Division Central Railway Bhusaval.

5. Pankaj Kumar CBC KNW BSL Division Central Railway Bhusaval. 425201

6. S B Jadhav CBS Nasik Road BSL Division Central Railway Bhusaval. 425201

7. N. K. Sharma CCI KNW BSL Division Central Railway Bhusaval. 425201

...Respondents

(By Advocate Shri R.R. Shetty for official respondents)

ORDER (ORAL)

PER: R. VIJAYKUMAR, MEMBER (A)

Present:

Shri Vicky Nagrani, learned counsel for the applicant.

Shri R. R. Shetty, learned counsel for the official respondents. Nobody appeared for the private respondents.

Heard learned counsel for applicant and learned counsel for official respondents at length through video conference, with consent of both parties. Both counsels were heard at length on the implementation of the VII Pay Commission recommendations that merged three cadres while conferring certain benefits and making them distinct from the Inspector cadre to prepare the Railways for the trend towards internet purchase of tickets rather than at the railway booking counters and the consultations that the Railways had made with the respective Unions before implementing the scheme and the staff had accordingly accepted the resulting benefits. During the course of hearing, learned counsel for applicant was queried on the supporting documents in relation to the staff strength fixed for the various cadres and on the impact on promotion opportunities for the different

cadres that could potentially result in a cause of action for the Applicants arising from the separation of the Inspectors as a separate cadre from the Commercial clerks cadre. On this basis, learned counsel for the applicant has been permitted to withdraw his application and file a better application within two weeks. In these circumstances, the OA is dismissed as withdrawn. No order as to costs.

(Ravinder Kaur)
Member (J)

(R.Vijaykumar)
Member (A)

gm.

