

**CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL
ERNAKULAM BENCH**

**OA No.180/00287/2020,
OA No.180/00906/2019,
OA No.180/00898/2019 and
OA No.180/00928/2019.**

Thursday, this the 10th day of September, 2020

CORAM:

**Hon'ble Mr. P.Madhavan, Judicial Member
Hon'ble Mr.K.V.Eapen, Administrative Member**

OA No.180/00287/2020

Thasleema K.P. (Employee Code No. 5110), aged 36 years,
W/o Firosh Kadakkat,
Senior Statistical Officer,
National Sample Survey Office, (FOD),
43, Sen Gupta Street, Ramnagar,
Coimbatore-641009, Tamil Nadu
and permanently residing at Chittethukudiyil,
Near Rayhan Eye Hospital,
Edappal, Vattamkulam-P.O.,
Malappuram District-679 578.
(Mobile No.9995314383).

Applicant

(Advocate: Mr.N.Unnikrishnan)

Versus

1. The Union of India represented by
the Secretary to Government of India,
Ministry of Personnel and Public Grievances,
Department of Personnel and Training,
North Block, New Delhi -110 001.
2. The Secretary to the Government of India,
Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation,
Subordinate Statistical Service, Room No. 528,
Sardar Patel Bhavan, Sansad Marg,
New Delhi- 110 001.
3. The Director General,
Subordinate Statistical Service (SSS),
National Sample Survey Office,
Union of India, New Delhi-110 001.

4. The Chairman, Screening Committee, Central Service Board, Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation, Sardar Patel Bhavan, Sansad Marg, New Delhi- 110 001.
5. The Deputy Director, National Sample Survey Office, (FOD), 43, Sen Gupta Street, Ramnagar, Coimbatore-641 009, Tamil Nadu.
6. The Deputy Director, National Sample Survey Office, (Field Operation Division), Sub Division Office Kerala South, CDO Complex, Poomkulam, Thiruvananthapuram-695 522.
7. The Assistant Director, National Sample Survey Office, (FOD), SRO, Shakthan Arcade, 5th floor, Thrissur-680 001.
8. The Assistant Director, National Sample Survey Office, (FOD), Sub Division Office, Salem, Tamil Nadu-626 001.
9. Smt. Lakshmi Venu, Senior Statistical Officer, National Sample Survey Office (FOD), Sub Division Office, Salem, Tamil Nadu-626 001.

Respondents

[Advocate: Mrs. Mini R. Menon, ACGSC (R1-8)]

OA No.180/00906/2019

Thasleema K.P. aged 35 years,
W/o Firosh Kodakkat,
Working as Senior Statistical Officer,
National Sample Survey Office, (FOD),
43, Sen Gupta Street, Ramnagar,
Coimbatore-641009, Tamil Nadu State.

Applicant

(Advocate: Mr. J. Abhilash)

Versus

1. The Union of India represented by the Secretary to Government of India, Ministry of Personnel and Public Grievances, Department of Personnel and Training, New Delhi -110 001.
2. The Secretary to the Government of India and Chief, Statistician of India, Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation, Subordinate Statistical Service, Room No. 528, Sardar Patel Bhavan, Sansad Marg, New Delhi- 110 001.
3. The Director General, Subordinate Statistical Service, National Sample Survey Office, Union of India, New Delhi-110 001.
4. The Additional Director General National Sample Survey Office FOD, East Block, Level 6-7, R.K.Puram, New Delhi-110 066.
5. The Development Commissioner, Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises, A-Wing, 7th Floor, Nariman Bhavan, New Delhi-110 001.
6. N.S.S.O (FOD), 43, Sengupta Street Ram Nagar, Coimbatore-641 009 (Tamil Nadu).
7. N.S.S.O (FOD)
4th Floor, Kendriya Bhavan
A-Block, Kallayi, Kozhikode-673 003.
8. Tausif N
4th Floor, Kendriya Bhavan
A-Block, Kallayi, Kozhikode-673 003. Respondents

[Advocate: Mr. Thomas Mathew Nellimoottil, Sr.PCGC (R1-7)]

OA No.180/00898/2019

Athira Sadhu (Employee Code No,5527), aged 37 years,
W/o Deepak,
Senior Statistical Officer,
National Sample Survey Office (Field Operation Division),
Tamil Nadu (West Region), Regional Office,
Building No. 43, Sengupta Street, Ramnagar,
Coimbatore-641 009
and permanently residing at Sreenilayam,

Mankayi Kadavu. Udayamperoor,
Ernakulam- 682 307.
(Mob: 9526835224).

Applicant

(Advocate: Mr.N.Unnikrishnan)

Versus

1. The Union of India represented .by
the Secretary to Government of India,
Ministry of Personnel and Public Grievances,
Department of Personnel and Training,
New Delhi -110 001.
2. The Secretary to the Government of India
and Chief Statistician of India,
Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation,
Subordinate Statistical Service,
Room No. 528, Sardar Patel Bhavan, Sansad Marg,
New Delhi-110 001.
3. The Director General,
Subordinate Statistical Service (SSS),
Government of India, Room No.528,
S.P Bhavan, Sansad Marg,
New Delhi-110 001.
4. The Deputy Director General (South Zone),
National Sample Survey Office,
Field Operations Division,
Kendriya Sadan , Koramangala,
Banglore -560 034.
5. The Director, National Sample Survey Office,
Field Operation Division, Regional Office,
Building No. 43, Sengupta Street, Ram Nagar,
Coimbatore 641 009 .
6. Smt. Deepa Raj, S.,
Senior Statistical Officer,
National Sample Survey Office,
Field Operation Division, Plot No. 60,
5th Cross Road, Sundaram Nagar,
Medical Collage Road, Thanjavur,
Tamil Nadu-613 004.
7. Smt. Maneesha, B,
Senior Statistical Officer,
National Sample Survey Office,
Field Operation Division,
Door No. 114/3/A4, Katcheri Road, NH-7,

4-Way Road, Opp. TNSTC,
Virudhunagar, Tamil Nadu-626 001.

8. K.R.Krishna Kumar (E.Code 4142), aged 48 years,
S/o Late K.K.Ramachandran,
Assistant Director, Micro, Small,
Medium Enterprise (Development Institute
(MSME)(DI), Kanjani Road, Ayyanthole,
Thrissur-680 003 and residing at Kallingal House,
Vakkat Road, Vennala P.O., Kochi-682 028.
9. Alby Annie George (E.Code No.5476), aged 39 years,
W/o Tony Varghese, Chakkiath,
Senior Statistical Officer,
National Sample Survey Office (Field Operation Division)
Regional Office, Building No.43, Sen Gupta Street,
Ram Nagar, Coimbatore-641 009
and permanently residing at Thomson Bhavan,
U.C. College P.O., Aluva-683 102.

Respondents

Advocates:

Mr.Thomas Mathew Nellimoottil, Sr.PCGC (R1-5)
Mr.T.C.Govindaswamy (R6&7)
Mr.Paulachan Iype (R8&9).

OA No.180/00928/2019

Alby Annie George (E.Code No.5476), aged 39 years,
W/o Tony Varghese, Chakkiath,
Senior Statistical Officer,
National Sample Survey Office (Field Operation Division)
Regional Office, Building No.43, Sen Gupta Street,
Ram Nagar, Coimbatore-641 009
and permanently residing at Thomson Bhavan,
U.C. College P.O., Aluva-683 102.

Mob No.8903209245

Applicant

(Advocate: Mr.N.Unnikrishnan)

Versus

1. The Union of India represented .by
the Secretary to Government of India,
Ministry of Personnel and Public Grievances,
Department of Personnel and Training,
New Delhi -110 001.
2. The Secretary to the Government of India
and Chief Statistician of India,
Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation,
Subordinate Statistical Service,

Room No. 528, Sardar Patel Bhavan, Sansad Marg,
New Delhi-110 001.

3. The Director General,
Subordinate Statistical Service (SSS),
Government of India, Room No.528,
S.P Bhavan, Sansad Marg,
New Delhi-110 001.
4. The Deputy Director General (South Zone),
National Sample Survey Organization,
Field Operations Division,
Kendriya Sadan , Koramangala,
Banglore -560 034.
5. The Director, National Sample Survey Organization,
Field Operation Division, Regional Office,
Building No. 43, Sengupta Street, Ram Nagar,
Coimbatore 641 009 (Tamil Nadu).
6. Smt. Deepa Raj, S.,
Senior Statistical Officer,
National Sample Survey Organization,
Field Operation Division, Plot No. 60,
5th Cross Road, Sundaram Nagar,
Medical Collage Road, Thanjavur,
Tamil Nadu-613 004.
7. Smt. Maneesha, B,
Senior Statistical Officer,
National Sample Survey Organization,
Field Operation Division,
Door No. 114/3/A4, Katcheri Road, NH-7,
4-Way Road, Opp. TNSTC,
Virudhunagar, Tamil Nadu-626 001. Respondents

Advocates:

[Mr.M.K.Padmanabhan Nair, ACGSC (R1-5)]
[Mr.T.C.Govindaswamy (R6&7)]

These OAs having been heard together on 19th August, 2020, the Tribunal delivered the following common order on 10.09.2020:

ORDER**P.Madhavan, Judicial Member**

OA No.287 of 2020 and OA No.906 of 2019 are filed by the same applicant Smt. Thasleema K.P., who is presently posted at Coimbatore Office of National Sample Survey Office. In OA No.287/2020, the applicant seeks a declaration that she is entitled to be posted at Thrissur in preference to the 9th respondent. In OA No.906 of 2019, she seeks a declaration that she is entitled to get a transfer to Kozhikode. In OA No.898 of 2019, the applicant - Smt.Athira Sadhu - who is similarly posted at Coimbatore, seeks a declaration that she is entitled to be posted at Ernakulam in preference to respondents 6 & 7. In OA No.928 of 2019, the applicant – Smt. Alby Annie George, similarly posted at Coimbatore, seeks a declaration that she is entitled to be posted at Kochi or at Thrissur.

2. When the matter came up for consideration, the respondents had raised a question of jurisdiction and it was heard as preliminary issue.

3. The applicants in these cases are working as Senior Statistical Officers at the Coimbatore office of National Sample Survey, in Tamil Nadu State. The applicants in these cases had sought for a transfer to Trissur, Ernakulam and Kozhikode offices. But the respondents had not considered their requests in accordance with the transfer guidelines and had arbitrarily granted transfer to their juniors and issued impugned order dated 4.12.2019 (Annexure A5) in OA 928/2019.

4. According to them, the impugned order is patently illegal and arbitrary in nature. The applicants had arrayed the private respondents who got transfer to the places where the applicants sought transfer and this Tribunal on initial hearing had stayed the transfer of private respondents in these cases until further orders.

5. The private respondents had filed MAs for vacating the interim order and R1 to R5 (official respondents) had filed a detailed reply. The respondents mainly

oppose the OAs on grounds of jurisdiction and hence the question of jurisdiction is considered as preliminary point.

6. The point for consideration is whether this Tribunal has jurisdiction in entertaining these OAs?

7. We had perused the pleadings, documents and heard the arguments put forward by both sides. Before going to discussion, it will be worthy if we go to Rule 6 of CAT (Procedure) Rules:

6. ***Place of filing application:*** (1) *An application shall ordinarily be filed by an applicant with the Registrar of the Bench within whose jurisdiction -*

- (i) *the applicant is posted for the time being, or*
- (ii) *the cause of action, wholly or in part, has arisen:*

Provided that with the leave of the Chairman the application may be filed with the Registrar of the Principal Bench and subject to the orders under section 25, such application shall be heard and disposed of by the Bench which has jurisdiction over the matter.

(2) *Notwithstanding anything contained in sub-rule (1), a person who has ceased to be in service by reason of retirement, dismissal or termination of service may at his option file an application with the Registrar of the Bench within whose jurisdiction such person is ordinarily residing at the time of filing of the application.*

8. Learned counsel appearing for the applicants would contend that a part of the cause of action had fallen at Thrissur, Ernakulam and Kozhikode since the applicants were denied a transfer to those places and Annexure A5 order was issued. On the other hand, the counsels appearing on the side of official respondents and private respondents would contend that the cause of action had arisen at Coimbatore where the applicants are working and these OAs ought to have been filed before the Chennai Bench of the Tribunal. They mainly rely upon the judgment rendered by the Hon'ble High Court of Kerala in **Registrar, Indian Maritime University, Chennai vs. Dr.K.G. Viswanathan & another**, reported in 2014 (4) KHC 451 (FB) and the order of Principal Bench in **Mukesh Kumar**

Meena vs. Union of India & 20 Others in OA 2833/2010 dated 15.3.2011.

9. We accordingly considered the rival contentions put forward by both sides. Both sides admit that the applicants are at present working in Tamil Nadu. Learned counsel for the applicants would contend that the applicants had requested for a transfer to Thrissur, Ernakulam & Kozhikode and the respondents had not granted the same and posted some other officers in these vacancies. On a perusal of the pleadings, what we find is that the applicants in these OAs had requested for transfer to various stations in Kerala and the respondents had not granted them a transfer. So the main cause of action is denial of transfer to the applicants who are now working at Coimbatore. So the cause of action arose at Coimbatore, in Tamil Nadu State and not in Kerala. As per Rule 6 (1)(i), the applicants ought to have filed these OAs in the CAT Bench of the State where they are working. We are not impressed by the arguments of the counsel for the applicants that since the applicants had sought a transfer to Thrissur, Ernakulam and Kozhikode, this Tribunal will get jurisdiction to decide the matter. Since the applicants are working at Coimbatore, showing their permanent residence in Kerala cannot confer any jurisdiction. The existence of vacancies in Kerala has no nexus with the cause of action in this case. The bundle of facts which constitute the cause of action in this case is denial of a request transfer given by the applicants from the office at Coimbatore. There cannot be any part cause of action in these cases. The request for getting a posting at Thrissur or Ernakulam or Kozhikode does not have a close nexus to the main cause of action in these cases. The impugned transfer order was issued by the Deputy Director (SSS), New Delhi. So there is no merit in the contentions raised by the applicants. No integral part of cause of action has arisen in this State.

10. So we find that there is no jurisdiction for this Tribunal to entertain these OAs and these are liable to be dismissed. **The OAs are accordingly dismissed. The Registry will keep a copy of the OAs and return the copy of documents produced for approaching the jurisdictional bench if they desire so. The interim order of stay passed in these OAs will stand vacated forthwith.**

(K.V.Eapen)
Administrative Member

(P.Madhavan)
Judicial Member

aa.

Annexures filed by the applicant in OA No.287/2020:

Annexure-A1: True copy of order No.12016/1/2014/SSS dated 06.04.2015.

Annexure-A2: True copy of the Order 11015/1/2018-SSS dated 26.06.2020.

Annexure-A3: True copy of Office Memorandum No. 12039/03/2019-SSS dated 11.3.2020 and relevant pages of Final Seniority List of Senior Statistical Officers, relating to applicant and contesting Respondent.

Annexure-A4: True copy of Minutes of Minutes of Meeting of the Civil Service Board (CSB) for Subordinate Statistical Services (SSS) held on 28.11.2019 at 10.30 hours at Sankhiyi Bhavan, New Delhi.

Annexure A5: True copy of Representation dated 11.12.2019 and Transfer Application.

Annexure-A6: True copy of Certificate dated 24.04.2019 issued by Dr. Paul T. Antony, Head of Department and Assistant Professor, Department of Clinical Immunology & Rheumatology, Amala Institute of Medical Sciences, Thrissur.

Annexure-A7: True copy of O.P. Ticket No. 814091 dated 30.12.2017 in respect of Qays Usman, son of the applicant.

Annexure-A8: True copy of Discharge Summary dated 02.04.2018 issued by the Department of Orthopaedics of Aster Malabar Institute of Medical Sciences Ltd., Kozhikode in respect of mother of the applicant.

Annexure-A9: True copy of Representation dated 03.02.2020 along with the transfer application.

Annexures filed by the applicant in OA No.906/2019:

Annexure A1: True copy of the order No.12016/1/2014 S.S.S. Dated 06.04.2015.

Annexure A2: True copy of the transfer request made by the applicant dated 13/2/2019.

Annexure A3: True of the representation for transfer dated 28/5/2019.

Annexure A4: True copy of the transfer order dated 4/12/2019.

Annexure A5: True copy of the medical report of the applicant dated 24/4/2019.

Annexure A6: True copy of the medical report of the applicant dated 3/1/2018.

Annexure A7: True copy of the medical certificate of the mother-in-law of the petitioner dated 2.04.2018.

Annexure A8: True copy of the representation dated 2/12/17.

Annexure A9: True copy of the OM No.12015/6/2004 SSS dated 09.05.2005.

Annexure A10: True copy of OM No.11025/2/2003-ISS, dated 15.02.2005.

Annexure A11: True copy of transfer order F.No.12016/01/2018-SSS dated 9.12.2019.

Annexures filed by the respondents

Annexure R1: True copy of the minutes of the Civil Service Board meeting dated 5.7.2019.

Annexure R2: True copy of the minutes of the Civil Service Board meeting dated 28.11.2019.

Annexures filed by the applicant in OA No.898/2019:

Annexure-A1: True copy of Medical Certificate dated 11.12.2019 issued by Dr. Jiss Joy, Junior Consultant, Oncologist Ernakulam. Reg No.40931, General Hospital, Ernakulam.

Annexure-A2: True copy of the MRI Report dated 25.05.2019 of the applicant's mother issued by Dr. Sravanthi Kasam, Consultant Radiologist, General Hospital, Ernakulam.

Annexure-A3: True copy of Representation dated 23.09.2019 made by the applicant to the 3rd respondent.

Annexure-A4: True copy of Office Memorandum No.12039/03/2019-SSS dated 05.02.2019 along with Final Seniority List.

Annexure-A5: True copy of Own Cost Transfer Application dated 30.05.2019 submitted by the Applicant to the 2nd respondent.

Annexure-A6: True copy of Medical Certificate dated 11.12.2019 issued by Dr. Shalini Vinod, Consultant Pulmonologist, Ernakulam Medical Centre.

Annexure-A7: True copy of forwarding letter No.2(3)/TNW/ADMN/2019-20/POSTING and letter TRANS dated 31.05.2019.

Annexure-A8: True copy of letter No.2(3)/TNW/ADMN/2019-20/POSTING and TRANS dated 30.09.2019.

Annexure-A9: True copy of common transfer order No.11015/1/2018-SSS dated 04.12.2019.

Annexure-A10: True copy of Representation dated 10.12.2019.

Annexure-A11: True copy of e-mail dated 11.12.2019 sent to 3rd respondent.

Annexure-A12: True copy of Order dated 10.12.2019 in O.A No. 180/00877/2019.

Annexure-A13: True copy of letter dated 12.12.2019 submitted by Shri K.R. Krishnakumar to the Central Public Information Officer, Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation, New Delhi.

Annexure-A14: True copy of Reply Letter No.11011/01/(04) /2019-SSS dated 10.01.2020 received by Shri K.R. Krishnakumar.

Annexure-A15: True copy of Weight-for-age GIRLS (Birth to 2 years) (percentiles) released by WHO.

Annexure-A16: True copy of office memorandum No.11015/1/2018-SSS dated 14.03.2019 issued by the SSS.

Annexure-A17: True copy of the Order No.11015/1/2014- SSS dated 18.12.2015.

Annexure-A18: True copy of Memorandum No.5/49/09-Estt/1903 dated 29.01.2016.

Annexure-A19: A specimen copy of Transfer Application Proforma (Annexure-1A and 1B) appended with Office Memorandum No.A-32016/7/2014-E.II dated 03.03.2015.

Annexure-A20: True copy of letter No.11011/01/(03)/2019-SSS dated 28.1.2020 issued by the Deputy Director & CPIO (SSS).

Annexure-A21: True copy of Letter No.11011/01(04)/2019- SSD dated 20.01.2020 including Minutes of Meeting held on 28.11.2019 along with relevant pages of Statement appended with this letter.

Annexure-A22: True copy of Representation dated 10.07.2019 filed by the applicant.

Annexures filed by respondents:

Annexure R1: True copy of the minutes of the Civil Service Board meeting dated 5.7.2019.

Annexure R2: True copy of the minutes of the Civil Service Board meeting dated 28.11.2019.

Annexure R6(a): True copy of the office memorandum, issued by the 2nd respondent under No.11015/2/2015-SSS dated 30th November, 2015.

Annexure R6(b): True copy of the representation dated 14.02.2019.

Annexure R6(c) series: True copies of of the representations dated 24.06.2019 & 13.11.2019.

Annexure R6(d): True copy of the representation dated 13.12.2019.

Annexure R6(e): True copy of the medical certificate indicating the health condition of the applicant's second child.

Annexure R6(f): True copy of the representation dated 29.08.2019.

Annexure R6(g): True copy of the representation dated 29.08.2019.

Annexure R6(h): True copy of the birth certificate of the applicant's son now aged about one year and 11 months,

Annexure R6(i): True copy of the representation dated 13.12.2019.

Annexure-R8(A): True copy of Letter dated 11.12.2019 issued by the Counsel for the Applicant.

Annexure-R8(B): True copy of Postal Receipts No.EL439443938 IN; No.EL43944391 IN; ELA394439551 IN and No.EL439443969 IN.

Annexure-R8(C): True copy of Order dated 16.12.2019 in O.A. No.898/2019 (Athira Sadhu Vs. The Union of India and Others).

Annexure-R8(D): True copy of Interim Order dated 26.12.2019 in M.A. No.1267/2019 in O.A. No.180/00928/2019.

Annexure-R8(E): True copy of Order dated 02.01.2020 in O.A. No.898/2019.

Annexure R9(A): True copy of interim order dated 26.12.2019 in Ma No.1267/2019 in OA No.928/2019.

Annexure R9(B): True copy of order dated 16.12.2019 in OA No.898/2019.

Annexure R9(C): True copy of order dated 2.1.2020 in OA No.898/2019.

Annexure-MA1: True copy of Interim order in OA.No. 180/00898/2019 dated 16.12.2019 issued by this Tribunal.

Annexure-MA2: True copy of interim order in OA.No.180/00898/2019 dated 2.1.2020 issued by this Tribunal.

Annexure-MA3: True copy of Interim order in OA.No.180/00898/2019 dated 27.07.2020 issued by this Tribunal.

Annexures filed by the applicant in OA No.928/2019:

Annexure-A1: Disability Certificate for Physically Handicapped Person No.555/2010 dated 19.02.2010 issued by the District Medical Board, Ernakulam.,

Annexure-A2: Identity Card for persons with Disabilities bearing No.EKM MIO 1670072 dated 13.08.2015 issued by the Social Justice Department, Government of Kerala in respect of her brother, Shri Aldrin George.

Annexure-A3: True copy of the Representation dated 30.05.2019 submitted by the applicant through proper channel with transfer application to the third respondent.

Annexure-A4: Representation dated 26.9.2019 submitted to the third respondent.

Annexure-A5: Common transfer order No.11015/1/2018-SSS dated 04.12.2019.

Annexure-A6: Office Memorandum No.12039/03/2019-SSS dated 05.02.2019 and relevant pages of Final Seniority List of Senior Statistical Officers (SSSOs) of Subordinate Statistical Service.

Annexure-A7: Representation dated 16.12.2019.

Annexure-A8: E-mail dated 16.12.2019 (08.14 PM) sent to the third respondent.

Annexure-A9: Office Memorandum No.F.No.28034/9/2009-Estt (A) dated 30.09.2009.

Annexure-A10: Order dated 10.12.2019 in OA No.180/00877/2019.

Annexure-A11: Interim Order dated 16.12.2019 in O.A.No.00180/898/2019.

Annexure A12: True copy of the interim order dated 20.12.2019 in OA No.928/2019.

Annexure-A12(A): True copy of Office Memorandum No.11015/1/2018-SSS dated 14.03.2019 issued by the SSS.

Annexure-A13: True copy of Annexure-R6(b)/3 and 4 Representation dated 24.06.2019 filed by the Respondent No.6 in her Reply Statement in O.A. No.898/2019.

Annexure-A14: True copy of Transfer Application dated 22.11.2019 of Respondent No.6 produced in Reply Statement of Respondents No.6 and 7 in O.A. No.898/2019.

Annexure-A15: True copy of a specimen copy of Transfer Application Proforma (Annexure-1A and 1B) appended with Office Memorandum No.A-32016/7/2014-E.II dated 03.03.2015.

Annexure-A16.: True copy of Letter No.11011/01/(03)/2019-SSS dated 28.01.2020 issued by the Deputy Director & CPIO (SSS).

Annexure-A17: True copy of Letter No.11011/01(04)/2019-SSD dated 20.01.2020 including Minutes of Meeting held on 28. 11.2019 along with relevant pages of Statement appended with this letter.

Annexure-A18: True copy of Transfer Application dated 29.08.2019 of Respondent No.7 produced as Annexure-R6(g) in O.A. No.898/2019 in their Reply Statement.

Annexure-MA1: True copy of Interim order in OA No.180/00928/2019 dated 26.12.2019 issued by this Tribunal.

Annexure-MA2: True copy of Interim order in OA No.180/00928/2019 dated 27.07.2020 issued by this Tribunal.

Annexures filed by respondents:

Annexure R1: True copy of the minutes of the meeting dated 5.7.2019.

Annexure R2: True copy of the minutes of the meeting dated 28.11.2019.