



**Central Administrative Tribunal  
Principal Bench, New Delhi**

**O.A. No.1347 of 2020  
M.A. No.1692 of 2020  
M.A. No.1693 of 2020**

**This the 23<sup>rd</sup> day of September, 2020**

(Through Video Conferencing)

**Hon'ble Mr. R.N. Singh, Member (J)  
Hon'ble Mr. Mohd. Jamshed, Member (A)**

1. Smt. Kanta, age about 58 years  
Designation : CS.S., Group-C,  
W/o Shri Gagan Bihari Lal,  
R/o 6173, Block-1, Gali No. 4,  
Dev Nagar, Karol Bagh, New Delhi
2. Premlata, age about 61 years,  
Designation : Sub. Divisional Engineer, Group-B,  
W/o Shri Jagdish Chander Sharma,  
R/o T-1, Appartment No. 802,  
Satya thehermitage, Sector-103,  
Gurugram, Haryana-122006.
3. Tapas Mitra, age about 60 years,  
Designation : C.SS., Group-C,  
S/o Late B.N. Mitra,  
R/o G-310, F.F., Sushant Floors,  
Sushantlok-II, Sec. 57, Gurugram.  
Also at : Sector-12/598, R.K. Puram,  
New Delhi-110022.
4. Vijay Kumar Sharma, age about 59 years,  
Designation : C.S.T., Group-C,  
S/o Late Shri Hari Ram Sharma,  
R/o 85, Saraswati Appartment,  
Sector-9, Rohini, Delhi-110085.
5. Meena Panwar, age about 59 years,  
Designation : S.S.T., Group-C,  
W/o Shri Naresh Kumar Panwar,  
R/o B-105, Panchsheel Appartment,  
Plot No. 9, Sector-10,  
Dwarka, New Delhi-110075.



6. Bimla Devi Kawalia, age about 60 yeras,  
Designation : Chief ST., Group-C,  
W/o Sh. Mahender Singh,  
R/o House No.53, Satya Niketan,  
New Delhi-110021.
7. Neelam Kumari Guliani, aged about 58 years,  
Designation : C.S.S., Group-C  
W/o Sh. Naresh Guliani,  
R/o BB-41-C, East Shalimar Bagh,  
Delhi-110088
8. Neelam Bhatia, age about 63 years,  
Designation : C.S.S., Group-C  
W/o Late Shri K.C. Bhatia,  
R/o H.No. 232, New Layalpur Colony,  
Chander Nagar, Krishna Nagar,  
Delhi-110051
9. Swaran Lata Wadhwa, age about 60 years,  
Designation : C.S.T., Group-C,  
W/o Sh. Jagdish Kumar,  
R/o Flat No. 44, Dhudial Appartment,  
Madhuban Chowk, Pitampura,  
Delhi-110034
10. Hemlata, age about 61 years,  
Designation : S.S.S., Group-C,  
W/o Shri Ajay Mohan Lathey,  
R/o D-2, A-27/D, Janakpuri,  
New Delhi-110058.
11. Daya Nand Pal, age about 62 years,  
Designation : C.S.S., Group – C  
S/o Shri Bishan Sarup,  
R/o H.No.60, Gali No. 4, Shiv Mandir,  
Wazirabad, Delhi-110054
12. Gurbir Singh Nagi, age about 63 years,  
Designation : T.T.A, Group-C,  
S/o Shri Pritam Singh Nagi,  
R/o B-130, First Floor, Fateh Nagar,  
New Delhi-110018
13. Neena Negi, age about 57 years,  
Designation : STOA (P) BCR-T, Group-C,  
W/o Shri Arjun Singh Negi,  
R/o C-51, First Floor, Front Side,  
Gurudwara Road, Mohan Garden,  
Uttam Nagar, New Delhi-110059



14. Rajni, age about 59 years,  
Designation : Sr. TOABCRT, Group – C,  
W/o Shri Ashwani Kumar Sarpal,  
R/o C-24B, K.NO. 110, First Floor,  
Anoop Nagar, Uttam Nagar,  
New Delhi-110059
15. Sunita Devi, age about 59 years,  
Designation : STOAPBCR-T, Group-C,  
W/o Shri Gurmeet Singh,  
R/o MPT-471, Sarojini Nagar,  
New Delhi-110023.
16. Mamta Vaish, age about 57 years,  
Designation : Sr. TOA-BCRT, Group-C,  
W/o Shri Davinder Kumar Vaish,  
R/o 62, Satya Niketan, Moti Bagh,  
Delhi- 110021.
17. Sumita Nautiyal, age about 60 years,  
Designation : Chief S.T., Group-C,  
W/o Shri Sushil Kumar Nautiyal,  
R/o D-1/92, Lodhi Colony,  
New Delhi-110003.
18. Lalita Devi Bisht, age about 61 years,  
Designation : Chief.S.T., Group-C,  
W/o Shri M.S. Bisht,  
R/o 654, Sector-6, R.K. Puram,  
New Delhi-110022.
19. Veena Kumari, age about 64 years,  
Designation : C.S.S., Group-C,  
W/o Shri Lokman,  
R/o BB-5C, East Shalimar Bagh,  
Delhi-110088.
20. Gursharan Kaur, age about 65 years,  
Designation : C.S.S., Group-C,  
W/o Shri Pritpal Singh Chadha,  
R/o C-14A, Ganesh Nagar,  
Tilak Nagar, New Delhi-110018.
21. Bharat Bhushan Sharma, age about 64 years,  
Designation : C.S.S., Group-C,  
S/o Late Shri S.D. Sharma,  
R/o C-2/3, Ganga Trivani Appartment,  
Sector-9, Rohini, Delhi-110085.



22. Meera Devi, age about 59 years,  
Designation : S.S.S.T., Group-C,  
S/o Late Shri Sushil Kumar,  
R/o Block-E, H.No. 45, Street No. 5,  
Rajiv Gali, Dayalpur, Delhi-110094.
23. Ram Rati, age about 58 years,  
Designation : S.S.S.T., Group – C,  
W/o Shri Naresh Kumar,  
R/o 7/23, Indira Gali No. 1A,  
Gamri Road, West Ghonda, Delhi-110053.
24. Indu Nayyar, age about 57 years,  
Designation : C.S.S., Group – C,  
W/o Shri Vinod Nayyar,  
R/o M-223, Sector-25, Noida-201301, U.P.
25. Ram Karan, age about 69 years,  
Designation : C.S.S., Group – C,  
S/o Shri Resal Singh,  
R/o H.No. 1566/30, Vijay Nagar,  
Kakroi Road, Sonapat, Haryana.
26. Baljit Singh, about 67 years,  
Designation: C.T.S. Group-C,  
S/o Shri Santa Singh,  
R/o Plot No. 45, Pratap Nagar  
Jail Road, Mayapuri, New Delhi-110064
27. Satbir Singh, age about 59 years  
Designation Dy. Manager, Group-B  
S/o Late Shri Dhanpal  
R/o A-2/13, Sector-4, Rohin, Delhi-110085
28. Promila Suri, age about 65 years  
Designation: C.C.S., Group C,  
W/o Shri Gursharan Singh,  
R/o I-147, First Floor, Ashok Vihar,  
Phase-I, Delhi-110052
29. Parshuram Prasad, age about 62 years  
Designation: C S S Group-C  
S/o Shri Jai Krishan Raut  
R/o G-3, Prem Nagar-I  
Kirari Suleman Nagar, Delhi-110086
30. Raj Rani Asodia, age about 62 years  
Designation: CST, Group-C,  
W/o Shri Naresh Kumar,

R/o 72, Basant Nagar, New Delhi-110057



31. Neelu J Sharma, age about 62 years,  
Designation: Chief S T Group C  
W/o Late Shri Jagdish Chand,  
R/o A-29B, DDA Flats, Munirka,  
New Delhi-110067
32. Prahalad Singh, age about 58 years  
Designation; C S T Group C  
S/o Shri Mahendra Singh,  
R/o B-2/269, Yamuna Vihar,  
Delhi-110053
33. Geeta, age about 58 years  
Designation: S.S.S.T., Group –C,  
W/o Shri Sudhir Kumar,  
R/o H.No.435, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, Ashoka Enclave,  
Part-3, Sector-35, Faridabad, Haryana-121003.
34. Neelam Sharma, age about 69 years,  
Designation: C.S.S., Group C  
W/o Shri S K Sharma  
R/o Flat No. 1-104, Tower-1, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor  
SPS Residency, Vaibhav Khand  
Indrapuram Near Windsor Market,  
Ghaziabad, U.P.
35. Raj Singh, age about 64 years  
Designation: C S S Group C  
S/o Late Shri Banwari Lal,  
R/o H.No. 290/11, Dayanand Nagar  
Bahadurgarh, Haryana
36. Shakuntla Mehra, age about 57 years  
Designation:SRPS, Group-B  
W/o Late Shri Jagdish Lal Mehra  
R/o 84-A, F-2, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor, Shanti Niwas,  
Arjun Nagar, Sat Enclave  
New Delhi-110029
37. Savitri Kataria, age about 61 years,  
Designation: CST, Group-C,  
W/o Shri B S Kataria,  
R/o D-36, Sarita Vihar, New Delhi-110076
38. Veena, age about 57 years,  
Designation: CST, Group-C  
W/o Shri Yashbir Singh Meena  
R/o EPT-27, P& T Quarter  
Dev Nagar, Karol Bagh,  
New Delhi-110005



38. Veena, age about 57 Years,  
Designation: C.S.T., Group-C  
W/o Sh. Yashbir Singh Meena,  
R/o EPT-27, P&T Quarter,  
Dev Nagar, Karol Bagh,  
New Delhi- 110005.
39. Sunil Sawhney, age about 64 years  
Designation: CSS, Group-C  
S/o Shri M L Sawhney  
R/o 26-A, Jhang Appartment,  
Sector-13, Rohini, Delhi-110085
40. Harbhajan Kaur, age about 66 years  
Designation: BSS, Chief CSC, Group C  
W/o Late Shri Prem Kumar,  
R/o D-76A, New Jankipuri, Gali No. 13  
Bindapur, Uttam Nagar, New Delhi
41. Gulsharan Kaur, age about 66 years  
Designation : CSS, Group-C  
W/o Late S. Bhupinder Singh  
R/o B-47/1, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor, Fateh Nagar,  
Jail Road, Tilak Nagar, New Delhi-110018
42. Asha Kumari, age about 68 years  
Designation: CST, Group C  
W/o Late Shri Arjan Das  
R/o D-6/319, Sector-6, Rohini, Delhi-110085
43. Charad Dev Arora, age about 65 years,  
Designation: CSS Group-C,  
S/o Late Shri Nebh Raj,  
R/o B-7/189, Sector-4, Rohini, Delhi-110085
44. Usha Chawla, age 57 years  
Designation: CSS, Group C,  
W/o Shri M M Chawla,  
R/o BG-6/33-B, Paschim Vihar,  
New Delhi-110063
45. Suresh Singh Yadav, age about 58 years  
Designation: CST, Group C,  
S/o Late Shri Jabar Singh Yadav,  
R/o E-252, Gali No. 12, Khajoori Khas  
Delhi-110090
46. Suman Lata Shukla, age about 62 years,  
Designation: CST Group C,



- W/o Shri Satish Kumar Shukla  
R/o WZ-237, Gali No 4, Sri Nagar,  
Rani Bagh, Delhi-110034
47. Poonam Saundal, age about 58 years,  
Designation: CST, Group-C  
W/o Shri Parmod Chand Saundal,  
R/o WZ-3139, Mohindra Park  
Rani Bagh, Delhi-110034
48. Nisha Chhabdra, age about 58 years  
Designation: CSS Group C  
D/o Late Shri M R Katyal  
R/o C-51, First Floor, Ashoka Enclave Part-II  
Sector-37, Faridabad, Haryana
49. Urmila Bisht, age about 62 years  
Designation: Chief S T, Group-C  
W/o Shri P S Bisht,  
R/o C-71A, Rajat Vihar, Sector-62,  
Noida, U P-201309
50. Virender Singh Verma, age about 62 years,  
Designation: CSS, Group-C  
S/o Shri Banshi Ram Verma,  
R/o B-222, Karan Vihar, Part-3  
Kirari Suleman Nagar, Delhi-110086
51. Saroj Madan, age about 66 years,  
Designation: CST, Group-C,  
W/o Shri Ashok Kumar Madan,  
R/o H.No. 1092, Sector-15,  
Sonapat, Haryana- 131001

...Applicants

(By Advocate: M.K. Bhardwaj)

### VERSUS

1. Union of India  
Ministry of Health & Family Welfare.  
Through its Secretary,  
1<sup>st</sup> Floor, Nirman Bhawan
2. Mahanagar Telephone Nigam Limited,  
Through its Chairman-Cum-Managing Director,  
5<sup>th</sup> Floor, Mahanagar Door Sanchar Sadan,  
9, CGO Complex, New Delhi.
3. Department of Telecommunications,  
Through its Secretary,

Ministry of Communications and IT.,  
Sanchar Bhawan, 20, Ashoka Road,  
New Delhi.



(By Advocate: Y.P. Singh)

...Respondents

### **ORDER (Oral)**

#### **Hon'ble Mr. R.N. Singh, Member (J):**

The present Application under Section 19 of the Administrative Tribunals Act, 1985, has been filed by the applicants, 51 in number, seeking the following reliefs:-

“(a) the Respondents No. 1&2 i.e. Secy., Ministry of Health & Family Welfare And CMD MTNL may kindly be directed to revise/calculate the rate and ward facility of the Applicants on or after retirement, on the basis of correct CDA pay corresponding to the last IDA Pay, on surrendering of MTNL medical facility by the applicants and grant the CGHS rate and ward entitlement accordingly.

The directions may kindly be given to the respondent No.2 to issue the revised LPC by mentioning the corresponding CDA Pay, CDA Pay Scale Level and on the basis of revised LPC the CGHS contribution and Ward entitlement may be upgraded by Respondent No. 1 in terms of its own order.

(b) any other further relief which this Hon'ble Court deems fit and proper may also be given in favour of the Applicants and against the respondents.”

2. Shri Bhardwaj, learned counsel for the applicants, submits that in OA No.2515/2017 an identical issue was raised by the applicants therein and this Tribunal vide Order/Judgment dated 12.9.2019 has disposed of the said OA. The operative portion of the said Order dated 12.9.2019 reads as under:-



“8. In view of the facts and circumstances involved in the case, we direct the respondents to treat the representations filed in the OA as such and to consider each case of the applicants separately on the basis of their representations and pass a reasoned and speaking order within a period of 90 days of receipt of a certified copy of this order. In case they find a case made out for any revision of category of entitlement of CGHS facility in service/retirement, the respondents shall pass order accordingly revising their entitlement of CGHS facility.

9. With the above directions, the OA is disposed off. No order as to costs.”

3. Learned counsel for the applicants further argues that for redressal of the grievance, the applicants have preferred their representations and the same are still lying pending consideration of the respondents.

4. Issue notice.

5. Shri Y.P. Singh, learned senior Central Govt. standing counsel, who appears on advance service, accepts notice on behalf of the respondents.

6. At this stage, Shri Bhardwaj, learned counsel for the applicants submits that the present OA may be disposed of at this very stage with direction to the respondents to consider the pending representations of the applicants and to dispose of the same by passing an appropriate reasoned and speaking order. To such request of the learned counsel of the applicant, learned counsel for the respondents has no objection.

7. In view of the aforesaid, without going into the merit of the claim of the applicants, the present OA is disposed of with direction to the respondents to consider the pending representations of the applicants keeping in view the



Order/Judgment of this Tribunal dated 12.9.2019 in OA No.2515/2017 and to dispose of the same by passing an appropriate reasoned and speaking order as expeditiously as possible and in any case within eight weeks of receipt of a copy of this Order.

8. The pending MAs also stand disposed of accordingly. However, in the facts and circumstances, no order as to costs.

**(Mohd. Jamshed)**  
**Member (A)**

**(R.N. Singh)**  
**Member (J)**

/ravi/akshaya/neetu