

CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL PRINCIPAL BENCH, NEW DELHI

O.A. No. 3061/2017 & M.A./100/2066/2020, O.A./100/237/2019 & M.A./100/2075/2020, O.A./100/800/2017, O.A./100/2765/2017, O.A./100/3452/2017, O.A./100/241/2016, O.A./100/3452/2016, O.A./100/313/2016, O.A./100/314/2016, O.A./100/315/2016, O.A./100/317/2016, O.A./100/402/2016, O.A./100/404/2016, O.A./100/405/2016, O.A./100/407/2016, O.A./100/747/2016, O.A./100/838/2016, O.A./100/1093/2016, O.A./100/1099/2016, O.A./100/1138/2016, O.A./100/1139/2016, O.A./100/1429/2016, O.A./100/2583/2016, O.A./100/2758/2016, O.A./100/3142/2016, O.A./100/4443/2015, O.A./100/2758/2016, O.A./100/4663/2015, O.A./100/1631/2014

Date of reserve for orders:10-12-2020

Date of Pronouncement of orders: 02-02-2021

(Through Video Conferencing)

Hon'ble Mr. Justice L. Narasimha Reddy, Chairman Hon'ble Mr.A.K.Bishnoi, Member (A)

OA.No.3061/2017 & M.A./100/2066/2020

 A.K. Chauhan, Aged 59 years, S.S.O. (Group –B) S/o late Sh. Virendra Singh, R/o H.No. J-3137, Exten.-II, Sainik Colony, Sector-49, Faridabad.

> And 78 others (as per Memo of Parties)

> > ...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

 Union of India through its Secretary, Department of Expenditure, Ministry of Finance, North Block, New Delhi.



- 2. Ministry of Statistics & Programme Implementation, Through its Secretary, Sardar Patel Bhawan, New Delhi.
- National Sample Survey Office (Field Operation Division), Through Dy. Director General, NSSO (FOD), Block-II, Old CGO Complex, NH-4, Faridabad.

...Respondents

(Through Shri J.P.Tiwari, Shri Ashok Kumar, Shri Praveen Swaroop, Shri Manish Kumar, Shri Hanu Bhaskar, Shri N.D.Kaushik, Shri Rajeev Kumar, Shri G.S.Virk, Shri Gyanendra Singh, Shri H.K.Gangwani, Shri R.K.Sharma, Shri Y.P.Singh, Shri Ranjan Tyagi, Shri K.M.Singh, Shri Piyush Gaur, Dr.C.S.Khan, Shri R.P.Sharma, Shri Satish Kumar, Ms.Harvinder Oberoi, Shri Rajinder Nischal, Shri Shivan Tripathi, Dr.Ch.Shamsuddin Khan, Shri L.C.Singhvi, Shri Ravinder Kumar, Dr.L.C.Singhi, Ms.Ruby Sharma, and Shri Shivan TripathiCounsel for the Respondents)

OA No. 237/2019 & MA No. 2075/2020

 Rajesh Kumar, Age – 42 years, Post - SSO, Group –B S/o Late Sh. Sant Prasad Singh, R/o-Qtr. No. 32/III, NH-IV, Faridabad-121001.

and 11 others (as per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- Union of India through Secretary M/o Finance, Deptt. Of Expenditure North Block, N.Delhi
- Union of India through Secretary
 Ministry of Statistics & Programme Implementation,
 Sardar Patel Bhawan, New Delhi.

3. National Sample Survey Office (Field Operations Division)
Through Deputy Director General
N.S.S.O. (F.O.D.), Block-II,
Old CGO Complex, N.H.-4, Faridabad (Haryana)

... Respondents

(Through Shri J.P.Tiwari, Shri Ashok Kumar, Shri Praveen Swaroop, Shri Manish Kumar, Shri Hanu Bhaskar, Shri N.D.Kaushik, Shri Rajeev Kumar, Shri G.S.Virk, Shri Gyanendra Singh, Shri H.K.Gangwani, Shri R.K.Sharma, Shri Y.P.Singh, Shri Ranjan Tyagi, Shri K.M.Singh, Shri Piyush Gaur, Dr.C.S.Khan, Shri R.P.Sharma, Shri Satish Kumar, Ms.Harvinder Oberoi, Shri Rajinder Nischal, Shri Shivan Tripathi, Dr.Ch.Shamsuddin Khan, Shri L.C.Singhvi, Shri Ravinder Kumar, Dr.L.C.Singhi, Ms.Ruby Sharma, and Shri Shivan TripathiCounsel for the Respondents)

OA No. 800/2017

Anil Kumar, Age-46 years
 Designation – Staff Car Driver, Group-C
 S/o Shri Mahendra Singh,
 Address: C-1100, Nend Gram, Ghaziabad.

and 25 others (as per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- Union of India, The Secretary
 Department of Expenditure, Ministry of Finance
 North Block, New Delhi 110 001
- The Secretary
 Department of Personnel & Training, GOI,
 North Block, New Delhi 110 001
- Council of Scientific of Scientific & Industrial Research Through The Joint Secretary, CSIR, Anusandhan Bhawan, 2 Rafi Marg, New Delhi – 110 001

... Respondents

(Through Shri J.P.Tiwari, Shri Ashok Kumar, Shri Praveen Swaroop, Shri Manish Kumar, Shri Hanu Bhaskar, Shri N.D.Kaushik, Shri Rajeev Kumar, Shri G.S.Virk, Shri Gyanendra Singh, Shri H.K.Gangwani, Shri R.K.Sharma, Shri Y.P.Singh, Shri Ranjan Tyagi, Shri K.M.Singh, Shri Piyush Gaur, Dr.C.S.Khan, Shri R.P.Sharma, Shri Satish Kumar, Ms.Harvinder Oberoi, Shri Rajinder Nischal, Shri Shivan Tripathi, Dr.Ch.Shamsuddin Khan, Shri L.C.Singhvi, Shri Ravinder Kumar, Dr.L.C.Singhi, Ms.Ruby Sharma, and Shri Shivan TripathiCounsel for the Respondents)

O.A./100/2765/2017

Atul Kumar Sahu (Aged about 29 years)
 S/o Sh. Ramesh Chandra, Inspector (Group 'C')
 R/o 38/III, NH-IV, Faridabad

and 109 others (As per Memo of Parties)

... Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- Union of India,
 Secretary,
 M/o Finance, North Block, New Delhi.
- Pr. Commissioner,
 Income Tax Office,
 N.H.-IV, Faridabad (Haryana)

... Respondents

O.A./100/3452/2017



Rajendra Kumar S/D/o Sh. Chandra Mani Aged about 37 years R/o L-120, St. No. 35, Sadat Pur Ext., Karawal Nagar, Delhi-110094. Working as: Inspector, Group 'C'

and 178 others (As per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- Union of India,
 Through Secretary,
 Ministry of Finance,
 North Block, New Delhi.
- Pr. Commissioner, Income Tax Office, HSIIDC Building, Udyog Vihar, Ph.-IV, Gurugram (Haryana)

... Respondents

O.A./100/241/2016



Jag Ram Meena, Aged-50 years, S/o Late Sh. Badrilal Meena, Working as Technical Officer In the Office of Regional office of Textile Commissioner, Noida, R/o E-197, Sector-15, Noida-201301

and 18 others (As per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- Union of India through the Secretary,
 Ministry of Finance, Department of Expenditure,
 Govt. of India, North Block, New Delhi.
- 2. The Deputy Secretary to the Govt. of India, Ministry of Finance, Department of Expenditure, Govt. of India, North Block, New Delhi.
- The Sr. Accounts Officer (Textiles),
 Central Pay & Accounts Office (Textiles),
 Ministry of Textiles, Room No. 536,
 Udyog Bhawan, New Delhi

... Respondents

O.A./100/242/2016

Sh. S.K. Verma,
Age 47 years,
S/o Sh. Bipin Bihari Verma,
R/o G-220, DELT A-2, Greater Noida,
Presently working as Asstt. Library & Information Officer

and 52 others (As per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- Union of India through Secretary,
 Department of Expenditure, Ministry of Finance,
 North Block, New Delhi.
- Secretary,
 Ministry of Labour & Employment,
 Shram Shakti Bhwan,
 New Delhi.

... Respondents

3. V.V. Giri National Labour Institute, Through its Director General Ministry of Labour & Employment, Sector-24, Noida (G.B. Nagar).

...Proforma Respondent

O.A./100/306/2016



Sh. Sanjeev Kumar Sharma, Aged about 31 years, S/o Sh. Shashi Bhushan Sharma, R/o E-2/18B, Gali No. 2, Chanakya Place-I, New Delhi.

and 10 others (As per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- Union of India through Secretary,
 Department of Expenditure, Ministry of Finance,
 North Block, New Delhi.
- Secretary,
 Ministry of Urban Development,
 Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi.
- Directorate of Estate,
 Ministry of Urban Development,
 Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi.
- Asstt. Estate Officer, CGO Complex, NH-4, Faridabad

... Respondents

O.A./100/313/2016



Sh. Braham Pal Singh, DOB 25.10.1956 (59 yrs) S/o Sh. Nanak Chand, R/o H. No. 49, Karnal Vihar, Bharat Colony, Neharpar, Faridabad (Working as A.P.P.O.)

and 202 others (As per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

Union of India through

- Union of India through Secretary,
 Department of Expenditure, Ministry of Finance,
 North Block, New Delhi.
- Secretary,
 Ministry of Agriculture & Farmer Welfare,
 Krishi Bhawan, New Delhi.
- Plan Protection Advisor,
 Directorate of PPQ&S,
 Ministry of Agriculture,
 CGO Complex, NH-4, Faridabad.

... Respondents

O.A./100/314/2016



Sh. H.S. Meena, Aged about 57 years, S/o Late B.L. Meena, R/o Q.No. 955, Type-IV, NH-4, Faridabad, (Working as Office Supdt.)

and 20 others (As per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- Union of India through Secretary,
 Department of Expenditure, Ministry of Finance,
 North Block, New Delhi.
- Secretary,
 Ministry of Agriculture & Farmer Welfare,
 Krishi Bhawan, New Delhi.
- 3. Director, Central Fertilizer, Quality Control & Training Institute, CGO Complex, NH-4, Faridabad.

... Respondents

O.A./100/315/2016



Mahesh Pal Singh S/o Late Sh. Jaikaran Singh R/o-H.No. K-4006, Sector-49, Sainik Colony, Faridabad-120001 (Haryana)

and 80 others (As per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- Union of India through Secretary,
 Department of Expenditure, Ministry of Finance,
 North Block, New Delhi.
- Secretary,
 Ministry of Statistics & Programme Implementation,
 Sardar Patel Bhawan, New Delhi
- National Sample Survey Office (Field Operation Division)
 Through Dy. Director General ,
 NSSO (FOD), Block-II,
 Old CGO Complex,
 NH-4, Faridabad

... Respondents

O.A./100/317/2016



Sh. Jagdish Kumar, Aged about 58 years, S/o Sh. Raj Kumar, R/o 143, Sector-18, Housing Board Colony, Faridabad (Working as UDC)

> and 80 others (as per Memo of Parties)

> > ...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

Union of India through

- Secretary, Department of Expenditure, Ministry of Finance, North Block, New Delhi.
- 2. Secretary, Ministry of Urban Development, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi.
- 3. Director General, Central Public Works Department, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi.,
- 4. Executive Engineer, CPWD, CGO Complex, NH-4, Faridabad.

... Respondents

O.A./100/402/2016



Sh. Shanti Swroop, Aged about 51 years, S/o Sh. Tota Ram, R/o FCA No. 1389C, SGM Nagar, NIT, Faridabad (working as Pharmaesist)

and 11 others (As per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

Union of India through

- Secretary, Ministry of Finance, Department of Expenditure, North Block, New Delhi.
- Additional Director (CGHS), Ministry of Health (Hqrs), R.K. Puram, Sector – 12, New Delhi

... Respondents

O.A./100/404/2016



Sh. Baljeet Singh, Aged about 43 years, S/o Late Ratti Ram R/o Qtr No. 271/II, NH-IV, Faridabad (working as LDC)

and 90 others (As per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

Union of India through

- Secretary, Ministry of Finance, Department of Expenditure, North Block, New Delhi.
- Secretary,
 Ministry of Urban Development & PA,
 Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi.
- Chief Engineer, NDZ-III, CWPD, R.K. Puram, New Delhi.

... Respondents

O.A./100/405/2016



Sh. K.M. Tripathi, Aged about 45 years, S/o Sh. T.P. Tiwari, R/o H. No. 1179/47, Molarband Exten, New Delhi (Working as Sorting Asstt.)

and 22 others (As per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

Union of India through

- Secretary, Ministry of Finance, Department of Expenditure, North Block, New Delhi.
- Secretary, Ministry of Communication & IT, Department of Posts, Dak Bhawan, New Delhi.
- 3. The Chief Post Master General, Haryana Circle, Ambala Cantt., Ambala.
- Sh. Supdt. Of RMS,
 D Division, Railway Mail Services,
 New Delhi 21

... Respondents

O.A./100/407/2016



All India Central Ground Water Board Employees Association through its Chairman Sh. Nityanand, BEC, Faridabad Central Ground Water Board, Bhujal Bhawan, NH-IV, Faridabad

Sh. Nityanand
 S/o Late Rattan Lal,
 R/o Qtr No. 1962/III,
 NH-IV, Faridabad
 (Working as Office Supdt.)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- Union of India through Secretary,
 Department of Expenditure, Ministry of Finance,
 North Block, New Delhi.
- 2. Secretary, Ministry of Water Resources, River Development & Ganga Rejuvination, Shram Shakti Bhawan, New Delhi.
- Chairman,
 Central Ground Water Board,
 Bhujal Bhawan, NH-IV, Faridabad.
- Director (Administration),
 Central Ground Water Board,
 Bhujal Bhawan, NH-IV, Faridabad.

... Respondents

O.A./100/747/2016



Jhabbar Singh, Aged – 50 years S/o Sh. Jot Ram, Working to the post of Fireman, In the office of Air Force Station, Gurgaon R/o V.P.O. Kadipur, Gurgaon (Haryana)

and 174 others (as per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- Union of India through the Secretary, Ministry of Finance, Department of Expenditure, Govt. of India, North Block, New Delhi.
- 2. The Deputy Secretary to the Govt. of India, Ministry of Finance, Department of Expenditure, Govt. of India, North Block, New Delhi.
- The Air Officer in Commanding (Accounts),
 Air Force Central Accounts Office,
 Subroto Park, Delhi 10
- 4. The Commanding Officer,54 ASP, Air Force Station,Old Delhi Road, Gurgaon (Haryana).

... Respondents

O.A./100/838/2016



Daya Chand, Age-58 years S/o Late Sh. Chandra Plate Maker, Presently posted at Govt. of India Press, Faridabad

and 3 others (as per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- 1. Union of India through it's Secretary, Ministry of Finance, New Delhi.
- The Secretary,
 Ministry of Urban Development,
 Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi.
- 3. The Director of Printing, 'B' Wing, Ministry of Urban Development, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi
- 4. Senior Pay & Accounts Officer (PTG)
 Ministry of Urban Development
 13/3, Jamnagar House, New Delhi.
- 5. The Manager, Govt. of India Press, Faridabad, Haryana.

... Respondents

O.A./100/993/2016



Sh. Vijay Singh, S/o Sh. Niader Singh Aged about 55 years, R/o VPO Bharsa Patti Kilhore, Gurgaon (Working as SA)

and 33 others (as per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- Union of India through Secretary,
 Department of Expenditure, Ministry of Finance,
 North Block, New Delhi.
- Secretary, Ministry of Communication & IT, Department of Posts, Dak Bhawan, New Delhi.
- 3. The Chief Post Master General, Haryana Circle, Ambala Cantt., Ambala.
- Sh. Supdt. Of RMS,
 D Division, Railway Mail Services,
 New Delhi 21

... Respondents

(Through Shri J.P.Tiwari, Shri Ashok Kumar, Shri Praveen Swaroop, Shri Manish Kumar, Shri Hanu Bhaskar, Shri N.D.Kaushik, Shri Rajeev Kumar, Gyanendra Singh, Shri H.K.Gangwani, G.S.Virk. Shri R.K.Sharma, Shri Y.P.Singh, Shri Ranjan Tyagi, Shri K.M.Singh, Shri Piyush Gaur, , Dr.C.S.Khan, Shri R.P.Sharma, Shri Satish Kumar, Shri Shivan Ms. Harvinder Oberoi, Shri Rajinder Nischal, Tripathi, Shri L.C.Singhvi, Shri Ravinder Kumar, Dr.Ch.Shamsuddin Khan, Dr.L.C.Singhi, Ms.Ruby Sharma, and Shri Shivan TripathiCounsel for the Respondents)

O.A./100/1093/2016



Preetam Bhardwaj, Aged-44 years, S/o Sh. Parmanand, Working as Postal Assistant in the Office of Mini Secretariat, Gurgaon. R/o V.P.O. Ghamroj Distt. Gurgaon.

and 170 others (as per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- Union of India through the Secretary, Ministry of Finance, Department of Expenditure Govt. of India, North Block, New Delhi.
- 2. The Deputy Secretary to the Govt. of India, Ministry of Finance, Department of Expenditure, Govt. of India, North Block, New Delhi.
- 3. The Senior Supdt. of Post Office, Gurgaon Division, Gurgaon. (Har).

... Respondents

O.A./100/1099/2016



Rajesh Chander Singh S/o Sh. Tilak Raj Sharmaaged D.T.P. Operator, age 59 years Presently posted at Govt. of India Press, Faridabad

and 432 others (as per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- 1. Union of India through it's Secretary, Ministry of Finance, New Delhi.
- The Secretary,
 Ministry of Urban Development,
 Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi.
- 3. The Director of Printing, 'B' Wing, Ministry of Urban Development, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi
- 4. Senior Pay & Accounts Officer (PTG)
 Ministry of Urban Development
 13/3, Jamnagar House, New Delhi.
- 5. The Manager, Govt. of India Press, Faridabad, Haryana.

... Respondents

O.A./100/1138/2016



Sri R.A. Kaloria Father's Name – Bishambar Dyal Designation – Assistant Age – 57 years Group – 'B' (N.G.) 445/II, NH-IV, N.I.T. Faridabad (Haryana)-121001

and 57 others (as per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- Union of India through Secretary, Ministry of Finance, Department of Expenditure, North Block, New Delhi.
- Secretary,
 Ministry of Water Resources,
 Shram Shakti Bhawan,
 N. Delhi
- Chairman, Central Water Commission, Sewa Bhawan, R.K. Puram, New Delhi.

... Respondents

O.A./100/1139/2016

Sh. JN Sharma,

Father's Name: Sh. Murari Lal Sharma,

Design.: CGO (E)

Group – B

D.O.B. - 01.01.58

Address: Vill. Mandhawali, Ballabhgarh

and 116 others (as per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- Union of India through Secretary, Ministry of Finance, Department of Expenditure, South Block, New Delhi-03.
- Union of India through Secretary,
 M/o Defence, South Block, New Delhi.
- Chief of the Air Staff
 Air Head qtr.
 Vayu Bhawan, New Delhi 06

... Respondents

(Through Shri J.P.Tiwari, Shri Ashok Kumar, Shri Praveen Swaroop, Shri Manish Kumar, Shri Hanu Bhaskar, Shri N.D.Kaushik, Shri Rajeev Kumar, Gyanendra Singh, Shri H.K.Gangwani, G.S.Virk. Shri R.K.Sharma, Shri Y.P.Singh, Shri Ranjan Tyagi, Shri K.M.Singh, Shri Piyush Gaur, , Dr.C.S.Khan, Shri R.P.Sharma, Shri Satish Kumar, Shri Shivan Ms. Harvinder Oberoi, Shri Rajinder Nischal, Tripathi, Shri L.C.Singhvi, Shri Ravinder Kumar, Dr.Ch.Shamsuddin Khan, Dr.L.C.Singhi, Ms.Ruby Sharma, and Shri Shivan TripathiCounsel for the Respondents)

O.A./100/1429/2016



Ratan Singh Age – 56 yrs., Designation – SSO II S/o Late Shri Ishwari Prasad, R/o H. No. 1102, Sector – 3, Vasundhra, Ghaziabad, U.P.

and 21 others (as per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- Secretary,
 Ministry of Finance,
 Department of Expenditure,
 New Delhi.
- Controller of Defence Accounts (Army)
 Meerut Cantt.
 Meerut, U.P.

... Respondents

O.A./100/2583/2016



Satheesh Kumar T, (Asstt. Commissioner), Group - A S/o Sh. Venkaiah, Aged about 29 years, R/o A-26, Alaknanda Hoster, Naveen Faridabad, Haryana.

and 56 others (as per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- Union of India through its Secretary, Ministry of Finance, Department of Expenditure, South Block, New Delhi-03.
- Pay & Accounts Office,
 I P Estate, AGCR Building,
 New Delhi.
- Director General,
 National Academy of Customs Excise & Narcotics,
 Sector 29, Faridabad.

... Respondents

O.A./100/2758/2016



Gulshan Kumar S/o Late Sh. Ram Prakash Age 58 yrs. Chief Accounts Officer Gr. A R/o House No, 2009 Jawahar Colony, Faridabad.

and 54 others (as per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- Union of India through Secretary, Ministry of Finance, North Block, New Delhi.
- Pay & Accounts Office,
 IP Estate, AGCR Building,
 New Delhi.
- Director General
 National Academy of Customs Excise & Narcotics,
 Sector 29, Faridabad

... Respondents

O.A./100/3142/2016

1. Madan Lal S/o Kanhiya Lal (Chowkidar)
Age 55 years
Presently posted at
Govt. of India Press. Faridabad

and
7 others
(as per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- 1. Union of India, Through it's Secretary, Ministry of Finance, New Delhi.
- 2. The Secretary, Ministry of Urban Development, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi.
- 3. The Director of Printing, 'B' Wing, Ministry of Urban Development, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi.
- Senior Pay & Accounts Officer (PTG)
 Ministry of Urban Development,
 13/3, Jamnagar House, New Delhi.
- 5. The Manager, Govt. of India Press, Faridabad, Haryana

... Respondents

O.A./100/4443/2015

Jayan A General Secretary, Mint Shramik Sangh Noida D-2, Sector – 1, Noida.

...Applicant

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- Union of India
 Ministry of Finance,
 Department of Expenditure,
 Govt. of India North Block,
 New Delhi, Through its Secretary.
- C.M.D.
 Security Printing and Minting
 Corporation of India,
 16th Floor, Jawahar Vyapar Bhawan
 Kasturba Gandhi Marg, New Delhi.
- General Manager,
 India Govt. Mint
 D-2, Sector-1, Noida

... Respondents

O.A./100/4663/2015



Sh. Ram Sewak Yadav, Age 59 years, S/o Late Sh. Chaturi Singh, R/o J-122, Sector – 4, Pushp Vihar, M.B. Road, New Delhi. (Presently working as Multi Tasking Staff) and 36 others (as per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- Union of India through Secretary,
 Department of Expenditure, Ministry of Finance,
 North Block, New Delhi.
- Union of India through Secretary, Ministry of Agriculture & Co-operation, Krishi Bhawan, New Delhi
- Pay & Accounts Officer, Directorate of Extension, Ministry of Agriculture & Co-operation, Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi.
- Soil & Land use Survey Officer, through its Soil Survey Officer, IARI Building, PUSA, New Delhi.
- 5. Soil & Land Use Survey of India, Soil Survey Officer, C-4, Sector – 1, Noida.

... Respondents

O.A./100/1631/2014

Kanchan Singh, Binder,
President, G I P Workers Union (Regd.)
S/o Shri Balram
Presently posted at Govt. of India Press, Faridabad
and
3 others
(as per Memo of Parties)

...Applicants

(Through Shri Shrigopal Aggarwal, Shri Yogesh Sharma, Shri S.K.Gupta, Shri Kiran Singh, Shri S.C.Soren and Shri Mohan kumar, Counsel for the Applicants)

Versus

- 1. Union of India through its Secretary, Ministry of Finance, New Delhi.
- The Secretary,
 Ministry of Urban Development,
 Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi
- 3. The Director of Printing, 'B Wing' Ministry of Urban Development, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi
- 4. Senior Pay & Accounts Officer (PTG)
 Ministry of Urban Development
 13/3, Jamnagar House, New Delhi.
- 5. The Manager, Govt. of India Press, Faridabad, Haryana.

... Respondents

ORDER



Justice L.Narasimha Reddy, Chairman

In this batch of OAs, OM dated 26.10.2015, issued by the Department of Expenditure, Ministry of Finance, is challenged. The subject matter of OM is the payment of Transport Allowance (TA) to the Central Government employees, posted in the offices located at Faridabad, Ghaziabad, Gurgaon and Noida.

- 2. The applicants in the OAs are the Central Government employees posted in the offices in the four places referred to above. While some may be continuing in those places, and others may have been transferred to different places.
- 3. The applicants state that the transport allowance was being paid to the employees in the places referred to above, on par with the rates applicable to the employees working in the offices within Delhi, till the year 2006. It is stated that when a change was sought to be in the arrangement, through an order dated 02.08.2006, a batch of OAs was filed and that the OAs were decided in favour of the employees. They contend that the transport allowance was linked to the City Compensatory Allowance (CCA) or HRA, as the case may be, after 2006.



- 4. The applicants contend that a different form of transport allowance was brought into existence consequent upon the recommendation of the VI CPC and even thereafter the employees are being paid the transport allowance as was done earlier. They contend that on 01.08.2002, an OM was issued proposing to withdraw the allowance, and thereupon, OA.No.2080/2012 & batch was filed and through an order dated 04.10.2013, this Tribunal allowed the OAs and remanded the matter to the Ministry of Finance for fresh consideration and disposal. They submit that stating to be in compliance of the order in the OAs, the respondents issued OM dated 07.03.2014, rejecting the claim and that in turn was challenged in OA.Nos.996/2014 & batch, and that, this Tribunal passed order dated 18.03.2015, directing the respondents to re-examine the matter in its entirety.
- 5. The applicants contend that the respondents issued the impugned OM dated 26.10.2015 stating to be in compliance with the direction issued by this Tribunal, but the illegality and infirmity pointed out earlier, still remains. They contend that the transport allowance is one of the prominent parts of pay structure and having regard to the fact that the four places, referred to above have become virtually extensions of National Capital Territory of Delhi (NCT), the deferential treatment accorded to such employees, compared to those working in the offices in Delhi, cannot be sustained in law. The applicants made reference to the origin of the grant of allowances and urged that the



view taken in the impugned order is discriminatory and contrary to the observations made by the Tribunal.

- 6. The respondents filed a detailed counter affidavit. It is stated that earlier the transport allowance used to be paid, corresponding to the CCA and HRA, and the payment of TA to the employees working in the offices in Faridabad etc., on par with the employees working in Delhi, was at a time when the issue was not finally decided.
- 7. According to the respondents, the VI CPC submitted a comprehensive report touching on every aspect of the pay structure of the Central Government employees and in the context of the transport allowance, it recommended the classification of the cities into X, Y and Z categories, with certain parameters. They contend that once the cities are classified as mentioned in the report, the recommendations of the VI CPC were accepted with immediate effect and were incorporated in the relevant office memorandum. They submitted that the plea of the applicant as regards contiguity of four places to Delhi, cannot be accepted inasmuch as the cities are classified according to certain parameters and one cannot go on adding areas to the places already defined.
- 8. We heard the arguments of the learned counsel for the Applicants and learned counsel for the Respondents in the respective OAs.



- 9. As is the case with the different kinds of allowances such as HRA, Transport Allowance was also allowed for the past several years. Much of the dispute was about the rates thereof. It is true that the employees working in the Central Government offices in Faridabad etc., were extended the benefit of TA on par with their counter parts in Delhi. That, however, was at a time when there did not exist any specific rule or OM in this behalf, and when the situation was almost fluid. The VI CPC addressed the issue of TA pointedly and it recommended the classification of cities into X, Y and Z categories. Once a city or town is classified, it did not provide for expanding, or adding areas, on the grounds of contiguity or otherwise. Each office is identified, with reference to the city or town, which is clearly defined and classified. That having taken place, the comparison with neighbouring towns or cities, becomes inpermissible.
- 10. In its adjudication on two earlier rounds, this Tribunal did undertake some discussion on the history of payment of transport allowance. Ultimately, the matter was required to be dealt with by the Ministry. The setting aside of the earlier orders was mostly on the ground that the Ministry did not bestow its attention to certain aspects. However, on a careful reading of the orders in this OA, we find that the attention of the Tribunal was not pointedly drawn to the fact that the cities came to be classified as X, Y and Z categories on



the recommendation of the VI Pay Commission and that the fixation of TA was a sequel to that.

- 11. Things would have been different altogether, had the entire recommendations of the VI CPC in the matter relating to TA, or the resultant OM issued by the Government, been challenged and set aside by the Tribunal. Even in this batch of OAs, the applicants are not able to point out any specific provision of law, which can be said to have been violated. Just, as the pay structure of an employee, is not static and keeps on undergoing changes with the passage of time, so is the case with TA. It can be in terms of rates or parameters. The applicants, who got the benefit of a substantial revision of their pay structure on the basis of the recommendation of the VI CPC, cannot selectively separate the component of TA and claim it on the basis of the pre-existing rules. Further, there existed a facility of anomalies committee under the VI CPC itself. No steps were taken to point out any anomaly. Thereafter, in the recent past, the VII CPC was also constituted.
- 12. In case, there existed a serious anomaly as regards the transport allowance, the association of the employees would have canvassed it before the VII CPC. The Tribunal cannot substitute its views, once the matter was dealt with by the Government and successful pay commissions. It is only when the recommendations or the consequent orders are shown to be in conflict with any superior

36



legislation, that a scope would exist for interference. No such provision is brought to our notice.

- 13. If the plea of the applicants about the contiguity is to be accepted, there would not be any end to it. Due to rapid urbanization in the recent times, tens and hundreds of villages are becoming parts contiguous cities. The claims would be unending, if one does not go by strict classification or delimitation of towns. Further, if the places surrounding the Metropolitan cities such as Mumbai, Chennai, Kolkata and Bangalore, would also become comparable to the Faridabad, Ghaziabad, Noida and Gurgaon. Howsoever attractive arguments in this behalf may be, the Tribunal cannot take upon itself, such a complex exercise, that too, when there does not exist any specific provision of law in this behalf.
- 14. We do not find any merit in the OAs and the same are accordingly dismissed. There shall be no order as to costs.

(A.K.Bishnoi) Member (A) (Justice L. Narasimha Reddy)
Chairman

Dsn./akshaya/