

**Central Administrative Tribunal
Principal Bench**

**OA No.100/977/2020
MA No.1215/2020**

New Delhi, this the 17th day of August, 2020

**Hon'ble Mr. Justice L. Narasimha Reddy, Chairman
Hon'ble Ms. Aradhana Johri, Member (A)**

1. Shri Mahesh Chander Goyal, age about 58 Years,
Designation : Chief Telephone Supervisor (CTS),
Group-C, S/o Late Shri Rishikesh Goyal,
R/o D-145, Ashok Vihar, Phase-I,
Delhi-110052.
2. Jatinder Kaur Bhatia, age about 56 Years,
Designation : Sr.P.S., Group-B,
W/o Shri Daljeet Singh Bhatia,
R/o 42, IInd Floor, Narang Colony,
Janakpuri, New Delhi-110058.
3. Rajini Sharma, age about 59 Years,
Designation : Sr. Telephone Supervisor (STS),
Group-C, W/o Shri Sunil Dutt Sharma,
R/o A-I/39, Rajendra Park, Nangloi,
Delhi-110041.
4. Brajesh Babu Pippal, age about 60 Years,
Designation : Chief S.T. (CST),
Group-C, S/o Shri Lala Ram Pippal,
R/o H.No.1299, Gali No.37, B-Block,
Sant Nagar, Buari, Delhi-110084.
5. Kamlesh Suri, age about 58 Years,
Designation : CSS, Group-C,
W/o Late Sh.Ashok Suri,
R/o A-23, Hardev Nagar,

Gali No.1, Jharoda Mazra,
(Near Burari bypass), Delhi-110084.

6. Anuradha Gulati, aged about 58 years,
Designation : CSS, Group-C,
W/o Sh.Raj Kumar Gulati,
R/o 16/44, Ist Floor, Subhash Nagar,
New Delhi-110027.
7. Nirja Malik, age about 59 Years,
Designation : T.S., Group-C,
W/o Shri Des Raj Malik,
R/o E-404, Greater Kailash-2,
New Delhi-110048.
8. Pardeep Kumar, age about 60 Years,
Designation : Lorry Driver, Group-C,
S/o Lt.Sh.P.N.Bali,
R/o WZ-0/3, New Mahavir Nagar,
Gali No.20, New Delhi-110018.
9. Asha Tiku, age about 63 Years,
Designation : CTS, Group-C,
W/o Sh.Vinod Bhan,
R/o N-6, Kashmir Apartments,
Pitampura, Delhi-110034.
10. Rajender Krishan, age about 62 Years,
Designation : C.S.S., Group-C,
S/o Shri Bodh Raj,
R/o 370, Dr.Mukherjee Nagar,
Delhi-110009
11. Renu Bala Narang, age about 61 Years,
Designation : C.S.S., Chief Section Supervisor,
Group-C, W/o Shri Yatinder Narang,
R/o H.No.58, Block-O, Pratap Nagar,
Delhi-110007.

12. Champa Lekhi, age about 60 Years,
Designation : Chief S.T. (CST),
Group-C, W/o Shri Vinod Kumar Lekhi,
R/o 191, Raja Garden, New Delhi-110015.
13. Urmila Babbar, age about 61 Years,
Designation : Chief Telephone Supervisor,
Group-C, W/o Shri Ramesh Kumar Babbar,
R/o B-55, Rishi Nagar, Rani Bagh,
Delhi-110034.
14. Ritu, age about 62 Years,
Designation : Chief S.T. (CST),
Group-C, S/o Shri Madan Lal,
R/o B-108, Ashoka Enclave,
Peeragarhi, Delhi-110087.
15. Inder Jit Singh Banjara, age about 61 Years,
Designation : C.S.S. , Group-C,
S/o Shri Puran Singh,
R/o B-1A/56-B, DDA Flats,
Janakpuri, New Delhi-110058.
16. Sita Rawat, age about 58 Years,
Designation : Sec.Supervisor (O),
Group-C, W/o Shri Ram Singh Rawat,
R/o B-103, B.K.Dutt Colony,
Lodhi Road, New Delhi-110003.
17. Sarojini Rawat, age about 60 Years,
Designation : Chief Section Supervisor (CSS), Group-C,
W/o Shri P.S.Rawat,
R/o RZ-7A/24, Gali No.4, Puran Nagar,
Palam Colony, New Delhi-110077.
18. Veena Kumari Bhandari, age about 57 Years,
Designation : Sr.TOA (P), Group-C,
W/o Shri Anil Kumar Bhandari,
R/o Flat No.I-6/2, Plot No.6B,

Sapna Ghar CGHS Ltd., Sector-11,
Dwarka, New Delhi-110075.

19. Usha Rawat, age about 60 Years,
Designation : S.S.(O), Group-C,
W/o Shri Praphull Singh Rawat,
R/o 264, Great India Apartment,
Sector-6, Plot No.15, Dwarka,
New Delhi-110075.
20. Brajesh Kumar, age about 58 Years,
Designation : Sr.TOA(P), Group-C,
S/o Shri Baljit Singh,
R/o C-48, Bhagwati Garden Extn.,
Dwarka More, New Delhi-110059.
21. Poonam Arora, age about 59 Years,
Designation : C.S.S., Group-C,
W/o Shri Kewal Krishan,
R/o 3107/3, Gali No.5, Near Hanuman Chowk,
Ranjeet Nagar, New Delhi-110008.
22. Kuljeet Chopra, age about 58 Years,
Designation : C.S.S., Group-C,
W/o Shri Rajesh Chopra,
R/o B-28, Ram Nagar, Om Vihar,
Uttam Nagar, New Delhi.
23. Sunita Gupta, age about 59 Years,
Designation : C.S.S., Group-C,
W/o Shri Daya Kishan Gupta,
R/o A-2/149, Sector-3, Rohini,
Delhi-110085.
24. Robindar Gaur, age about 60 Years,
Designation : C.S.S., Group-C,
S/o Shri M.L.Gaur,
R/o C4C/258, Janakpuri,
Delhi-110058.

25. Sunanda Sarin, age about 60 Years,
Designation : C.S.S., Group-C,
W/o Shri Vijay Kumar Sarin,
R/o 751, Rishi Nagar, Shakur Basti,
Rani Bagh, Delhi-110034.
26. Amita Arora, age about 57 Years,
Designation : C.S.S., Group-C,
W/o Shri Bal Mukund Arora,
R/o WZ-1140, IIIrd Floor, Rani Bagh,
Delhi-110034.
27. Usha Rani Budhiraja, age about 63 Years,
Designation : C.S.S., Group-C,
W/o Shri Rajender Parshad,
R/o 1228-B, Rani Bagh, Delhi-110034.
28. Purnima Sharma, age about 59 Years,
Designation : Chief S.T., Group-C,
W/o Shri Manoranjan Sharma,
R/o D-24, Surya Apartment, Sector-13,
Rohini, Delhi-110085.
29. Veena Sharma, age about 57 Years,
Designation : C.S.S., Group-C,
W/o Shri Sailesh Sharma,
R/o Flat No.133, Priya Apartments,
Plot No.4, Sector-14, Rohini, Delhi-110085.
30. Rajender Kumar, age about 63 Years,
Designation : C.S.S., Group-C,
S/o Shri Kishan Chand,
R/o 195, Begumpur Village, Delhi-110086.
31. Kulbhushan Jain, age about 60 Years,
Designation : Chief S.T., Group-C,
S/o Late Shri S.L.Jain,
R/o B-601, MTNL Staff Quarters,

Pocket-4, Sector-3, Rohini, Delhi-110085.

32. Mahander Kumar, age about 60 Years,
Designation : Chief S.T., Group-C,
S/o Late Shri Parkash Lal,
R/o G & JU-122A, Green Apartments,
Pitampura, Delhi-110088.
33. Ajay Kumar Sharma, age about 58 Years,
Designation : C.S.S., Group-C,
S/o Shri Bhagwan Dutt Sharma,
R/o C-4/208, Sector-6, Rohini, Delhi-110085.
34. Sheodan Singh, age about 60 Years,
Designation : Chief S.T., Group-C,
S/o Shri Babu Ram,
R/o C-1/38, Budh Vihar,
Phase-I, Delhi-110086.
35. Usha Gupta, age about 67 Years,
Designation : C.S.S., Group-C,
W/o Shri Bhram Parkash Gupta,
R/o 73, New Delux Appartment, Plot No.11,
Sector-9, Rohini, Delhi-110085.
36. Dayanand Swami, age about 58 Years,
Designation : C.T.S., Group-C,
S/o Late Shri Balkishan Singh,
R/o D-5/40, Sector-15, Rohini, Delhi-110085.
37. Tilak Rani Santriwal, age about 60 Years,
Designation : C.S.T., Group-C,
W/o Late Shri Arvind Kumar Santriwal,
R/o D-175, Green Valley Appartment,
Sector-18, Rohini, Delhi-110085.
38. Santosh Rani Chawla, age about 57 Years,
Designation : C.S.S., Group-C,
W/o Shri Shyam Sunder Chawla,

R/o H.No.19A, New Nandwani Nagar,
Sonapat-131001, Haryana.

39. Shashi Bala, age about 58 Years,
Designation : Sr.Tel.Supervisor (STS), Group-C,
W/o Shri Gurjeet Chhabra,
R/o H.No.830, Sector-15, Sonapat, Haryana.
40. Sushila Rani Taneja, age about 58 Years,
Designation : C.S.T., Group-C,
W/o Shri Subhash Chander Taneja,
R/o H.No.253, Sector-15, Sonapat, Haryana.
41. Rakesh Gauba, age about 56 Years,
Designation : C.S.T., Group-C,
W/o Shri Ram Saran Dass,
R/o H.No.848, Sector-15,
Sonapat-131001, Haryana.
42. Chander Kanti, age about 59 Years,
Designation : Sr.TOA(D), Group-C,
W/o Shri Hukam Singh Choudhary,
R/o C-160, New Janakpuri,
Uttam Nagar, New Delhi-110059.
43. Indu Kapoor, age about 59 Years,
Designation : C.S.T., Group-C,
W/o Late S.Paramjit Singh,
R/o J-77, West Patel Nagar,
New Delhi-110008.
44. Sunita, age about 56 Years,
Designation : Sr.T.O.A.(P), Group-C,
W/o Shri Shailender Chadha,
R/o D-166, 3rd Floor, West Patel Nagar,
New Delhi-110008.
45. Kavita Arora, age about 56 Years,

Designation : STOAPBCR-T, Group-C,
W/o Shri Ajay Arora,
R/o 27/25, Block-27, 3rd Floor,
Shakti Nagar, Delhi-110007.

46. Reha Rani Budhwar, age about 58 Years,
Designation : C.S.S., Group-C,
W/o Shri Krishan Mohan,
R/o C-103, MTNL Staff Quarters,
Sector-III, Rohini, Delhi-110085.
47. Neelam, age about 53 Years,
Designation : C.S.S., Group-C,
W/o Shri Anand Savroop,
R/o E-104, Plot No.4,
Kaveri Apartment, Sector-6,
Dwarka, New Delhi-110075.
48. Krishna Devi Kathuria, age about 59 Years,
Designation : C.S.T., Group-C,
D/o Shri Bhajan Dass,
R/o O-202, Arya Apartment,
Sector-15, Rohini, Delhi-110085.
49. Isha Kakkar, age about 58 Years,
Designation : C.S.S., Group-C,
W/o Shri Sunil Kumar Kakkar,
R/o B-36-F, Vijeta Vihar,
Delhi Police Society, Sector-13,
Rohini, Delhi-110085.
50. Bhupinder Kaur, age about 60 Years,
Designation : Sr.T.O.A(P) BCR-T, Group-C,
W/o Shri Kanwaljeet Singh,
R/o Flat No.8, Lehna Singh Market,
Malka Ganj, Delhi-110007.
(BY ADVOCATE SHRI B.S.SHARMA)

...APPLICANTS

VERSUS

1. UNION OF INDIA,
MINISTRY OF HEALTH & FAMILY WELFARE,,
THROUGH ITS SECRETARY,
IST FLOOR, NIRMAN BHAWAN,
NEW DELHI.
2. MAHANAGAR TELEPHONE NIGAM LIMITED,
THROUGH ITS CHAIRMAN-CUM-MANAGING DIRECTOR,
5TH FLOOR, MAHANAGAR DOOR SANCHAAAR SADAN,
9, CGO COMPLEX,
NEW DELHI.
3. DEPARTMENT OF TELECOMMUNICATIONS,
THROUGH ITS SECRETARY,
MINISTRY OF COMMUNICATIONS AND I.T.,
SANCHAR BHAWAN, 20, ASHOKA ROAD,
NEW DELHI.

(By Advocate : Shri Gyanenda Singh)

: O R D E R (ORAL) :**Justice L. Narasimha Reddy, Chairman:**

The applicants, retired from the service of Mahanagar Telephone Nigam Limited (MTNL). In the context of availing medical facilities, they submitted representations stating that on surrender of MTNL medical facilities, they are entitled to be extended the benefits under the Central Government Health Scheme (CGHS). It is also stated that the issue was decided by this Tribunal in OA No.2515/2015. They claim similar relief, in this OA.

2. The OA was taken up for admission on 05.08.2020 and time was granted to Shri Gyanendra singh, learned standing counsel for the respondents to obtain instructions. Today, he submitted that the representations of similar nature were rejected by the respondents through order dated 31.01.2020.

3. We heard Shri M. K. Bhardwaj, learned counsel for the applicants and Shri Gyanendra Singh, learned counsel for the respondents.

4. The relief claimed in this OA is as regards the nature of the medical facilities which are required to be extended to the applicants who are retired employees. The respondents are said to have taken a particular stand on this issue, while considering the representations of similarly situated persons. It is for them to pass orders on the representations made by the applicants also.

4. We, therefore, dispose of the OA directing the respondents to pass orders on the representations submitted by the applicants within a period of two months from the date of receipt of copy of this order. There shall be no order as to costs.

(Aradhana Johri)
Member (A)

(Justice L. Narasimha Reddy)
Chairman

/pj/sd