

(3)

Central Administrative Tribunal
Principal Bench

....
O.A. No. 1971/95

New Delhi, this the 20th day of Feb., 1996

Hon'ble Shri A.V. Haridasan, Vice-Chairman (J)
Hon'ble Shri R.K. Ahooja, Member (A)

1. Sh. V.C. Sharma son of Sh. Deena Nath Sharma
Telegraph Master (O) C.S. CTO,
New Delhi.
2. Sh. Som Datt s/o Sh. Chander Shan, Telegraph Master
(O) Office of C.S. C.T.O.,
New Delhi-110001.
3. Sh. N.N. Appan s/o Sh. Kishan Gopal
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.
4. Shri D.R. Hassija son of Sh. Kishan Chand
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.
5. Sh. P.P. Thinkar son of Sh. Umrao Singh
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.
6. Shri R.K. Sidana s/o Sh. Desh Raj
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.
7. Shri R.C. Sharma II s/o Neta Singh Sharma,
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.
8. Shri D.P.B. Singhodia s/o Sh. Kripal Singh
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.
9. Shri Mahavir Singh Arya s/o Sh. Chittar Mal
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.
10. Parveen Kumar son of Sh. Sardari Lal
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.
11. Sh. Ganda Lal s/o Sh. Halka Lal
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.
12. Ishwar Chand II s/o Sh. Khasana Ram
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.

contd-2-

- 5
12. Sh. Mohd Lal Das s/o Sh. R. S. Das,
Telegraph Master (C) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.
 14. Shri Mohinder Singh TIT s/o Sh. Ram Singh
Telegraph Master (C) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
 15. Sh. Kishya Lal Sharma son of Sh. Kishan Narain Sharma,
Telegraph Master (C) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
 16. Sh. Satya Parkash s/o Sh. Revti Saran
Telegraph Master (C) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
 17. Shri Ram Kanwar Sharma s/o Sh. Shor Singh Sharma
Telegraph Master (C) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
 18. Shri Mahi Pal Arora, son of Sh. Bhu Ram
Telegraph Master (C) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
 19. Shri Ramesh Lal IT son of Sh. Gada Ram
Telegraph Office (C) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.
 20. Shri Rajjan Kumar s/o Sh. Jal Kishan
Telegraph Master (C) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
 21. Smt. Janak Rani Manchanda w/o Sh. Trilok Singh
Telegraph Master (C) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
 22. Sh. Nand Lal Das s/o Sh. L. N. Chopra
Telegraph Master (C) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
 23. Sh. Nand Lal Das s/o Sh. T. H. Verma
Telegraph Master (C) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.

24. Smt. Rama Devi Sharma w/o Ashwani Kumar Sharma
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S., C.P.O.
New Delhi-110001.
25. Smt. Usha Wachwa w/o Sh. H.L. Wachwang
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S., CTO
New Delhi-110001.
26. Shrinati Sudesh Malhotra. w/o Sh. K.L. Malhotra
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S., CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
27. Sh. Ramesh Chand Wachwa s/o Sh. Gian Chand
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S., CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
28. Smt. Chander Kanta Gera w/o Sh. Kundan Lal Gera,
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S., CTO
New Delhi.
29. Shri Gurmeet Singh s/o Sh. Ajeet Singh
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S., CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
30. Shri Kewal Kishan Gossain w/o Sh. Mathura Dass Gossain
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S., CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
31. Shrinati Gwaran Durga w/o Sh. S.L. Durga
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S., CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
32. Sh. D.S. Pundhir s/o Sh. Malkhan Singh
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S., CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
33. Sh. Om Parkash Batra s/o Sh. P.R. Batra,
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S., CTO
New Delhi-110001.

भारत न्यायपालिका/CA T (P.B)
जाति विभाग/दस्ता

FIL ED TODAY

29-5-

1184

36. Sh. On Katan Lal Sharma s/o Sh. Babu Lal
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.

35. Sh. Gajesh Kumar s/o Sh. Surat Lal
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.

34. Sh. Achubir Singh s/o Sh. Baldev Singh
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.

37. Shri R.S. Mishra s/o Sh. Ram Nareish
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.

38. Shri S.D. Thukral son of Sh. Ram Lal
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.

39. Shri Santokh Singh s/o Sh. Charan Singh
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.

40. Shri Ganga Prasad Nimesh s/o Sh. Kundan Lal
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.

41. Sh. Munshi Lal s/o Sh. Chhittar Mal
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.

प्रधान न्यायाधीश/CA T (PB)
42. Shri Chet Ram Sharma s/o Sh. Shale Ram
FIL ED TODAY
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.

नवि

entd-5

43. Sh. Guresh Chand s/o Sh. Bishamber Dayal,
Telegraph Master (o) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.

44. Sh. Man Mohan s/o Sh. On pal
Telegraph Master (o) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.

45. Sh. Bharat Singh s/o Sh. Mukand Singh
Telegraph Master (o) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.

46. Shri Sunder Lal Sawanani s/o Sh. Devi Dass Sawanani
Telegraph Master (o) Office of C.S. C.T.O
New Delhi-110001.

47. Smt. Shakuntala Amar w/o V.D. Amar
Telegraph Master (o) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.

48. Sh. R.C. Singhal, s/o Sh. Birbal Dass,
Telegraph Master (o) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.

49- Shri V.P. Nachwa s/o Sh. Jasra Ram
Telegraph Master (o) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.

50. Smt. M. Namada w/o Sh. M. Pundari Kachua
Telegraph Master (o) Office C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.

न्यायवाह/CA T (PB)

मावतुखित किया

FILED TODAY

29 SEP 1965

NEW DELHI

TELEGRAPH MASTER

OFFICE OF C.S.

CTO

NEW DELHI-110001.

Shri Anand Lal son of Sh. Eshan Lal
Telegraph Master(o) office C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.

contd-6-

52. Sh. Prasad Sharma s/o Sh. Sardar Bahadur
Telegraph Master (0) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.

53. Sh. Satya Prakash Verma s/o Ram Jai Ram
Telegraph Master (0) Office of C.S. CTO.
New Delhi-110001.

54. Vijay Kumar Baidya s/o Sh. Bhagwan Das,
Telegraph Master (0) Office of C.S. CTO.
New Delhi-110001.

55. Shri Mulkh Raj Das s/o Sh. Ganesh Das Das
Telegraph Master (0) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.

56. Shri Surender Mohan s/o Sh. Manohar Lal
Telegraph Master (0) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.

57. Shri M.M.K. Moha s/o Sh. Amar Jeet Singh
Telegraph Master (0) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.

58. Shri Hira Singh s/o Sh. Munshi Ram
Telegraph Master (0) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.

59. Shri Lachman Singh Bedwal s/o Sh. Tej Chand
Telegraph Master (0) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.

60. Shri K.K. Nandwani s/o Sh. B.D. Nandwani
Telegraph Master (0) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.

61. Sh. Devi Dayal Gupta s/o Sh. Ganga Ram
Telegraph Master (0) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.

Contd-7

62. Krishan Lal Poojla s/o Sh. Lachman Dass,
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
63. Sh. S.K. Sharma II s/o Sh. R.A. Sharma,
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
64. Sh. P.L. Bains s/o Sh. Pala Ram
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.
65. Shri Manohar Lal LD s/o Sh. Lachman Dass,
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.
66. Sh. Manohar Lal LC s/o Sh. Lal Chand
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.
67. Shri Santosh Kumar s/o Sh. Shashi Bhushan
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
68. Shri R.S. Ram s/o Sh. Banwari Ram
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
69. Sh. Brij Lal RR s/o Sh. Rada Ram
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001.
70. Ms. Saroj Kumari s/o Sh. R.S. Kapila,
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.

71. Sh. G. J. Vrandani s/o Sh. J. J. Vrandani
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
72. Sh. N. C. Paul s/o Sh. N. L. Paul
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
73. Shri Mir Singh s/o Sh. Bhagwan Singh
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
74. Smt. Shashi Kanta Pushkarna w/o Sh. G. L. Pushkarna
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
75. Sh. Tara Chand Garg s/o Sh. Dev Dutt
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
76. Shri R. P. Malik s/o Sh. Chandagi Ram
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
77. Shri Anir Chand Malhotra s/o Sh. Sewa Ram
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
78. Shri Ashok Kumar Verma s/o Sh. S. K. Verma
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
79. Shri Om Parkash Kansal s/o Sh. Jai Parkash Kansal
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.

प्राप्त न्यायदीप/

आम दाखिल किया

FILED TODAY

29 SEP

श्री ७९

श्री ७९

11

12

80. Shri T.R. Shalla, s/o Sh. Topan Datta,
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
81. Sh. Krishan Lal IV s/o Sh. Davi Ram
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
82. Shri R.D. Ram s/o Sh. K.P. Ram
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
83. Shri That Singh s/o Sh. Netra pal Singh
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
84. Shrimati Usha Bhatia w/o Sh. H.K. Bhatia,
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
85. Sh. Pyara Singh s/o Sh. Veer Singh
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
86. Shri K.D. Sharma. s/o Sh. Khirana Ram
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.
87. Sh. Prem prakash sharma s/o B.R. Sharma,
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi.
88. Sh. Rattan Lal s/o Sh. Hira Lal
Telegraph Master (O) Office of C.S. CTO,
New Delhi-110001.

NEW DELHI.

FIL ED TODAY

29

REGD/Dy. Registrar

12

13

89. Shri I.N.Kapur s/o Sh.B.D.Kapur,
Telegraph Master (O) Office of Ch.S. CTO.
New Delhi-110001.

90. Shri P.K.Nathur son of Sh.W.L.Nathur,
Telegraph Master (O) Office of Ch.S. CTO
New Delhi-110001

All the applicants

C/o Office of Chief Superintendent,
Central Telegraph Office,
New Delhi-110001.

.....Applicants /Petitioners.

(By Shri Chander Shekhar, Advocate)

VERSUS

1. The Director General of Tele Communications
Department of Tele Communications,
T-2, section, SANCHAR BHAWAN
RAN SAD MARG,
New Delhi-110001.
2. Union of India
through secretary
Ministry of Communications, "SANCHAR BHAWAN"
Ransad Marg, New Delhi-110001.
3. The secretary
Department of Personnel & Training
North Block,
New Delhi.
4. secretary,
Ministry of Finance, Department of Expenditure
New Delhi.
5. The Chief General Manager,
Northern Telecom Region,
KIDWAI BHAWAN,)
New Delhi.

..... Respondents.

(By None)

contd-11-

13

O R D E R (ORAL)

By Hon'ble Shri A.V. Haridasan, Vice-Chairman(J)

1. The applicants who are working as Telegraph Master in the department of Telecommunication, are aggrieved by the fact that in implementation of the Report of the Fourth Pay Commission, they have been given the pay scale of Rs. 1400-2300/- in replacement of the pre-revised pay scale of Rs. 425-600/- while, according to them, persons who were in the lower pay scales, have been given a higher pay scale of Rs. 1640-2900/- which act is violative of the principle of equality enshrined in Articles 14 & 16 of the Constitution. The applicants have, therefore, prayed that the respondents may be directed to extend to them higher pay scale of Rs. 1640-2900/-. It has been alleged in the application that the applicants are in no way performing the duties of ^{less serious} ~~grave~~ nature than that of those who have been placed in the scale of Rs. 1640-2900/-, ^{and hence} therefore, it is inequitable not to extend to them the higher pay scale of Rs. 1640-2900/-.

2. This application has been filed by 90 applicants. A Misc. Petition for joining together and seeking relief in one single application has been filed. Since all the applicants have brought common cause of action, the Misc. Petition for joining together is allowed. But on a perusal of the pleadings in this application and after hearing the learned counsel of the applicants, we find that this is not a matter in which the Tribunal should intervene. It is for the Expert Bodies like the Pay Commission to go into the degree of responsibility and nature of duties attached ^{to} ~~with~~ each post and to ^{be concerned} ~~prescribe~~ the pay scale for such posts.

....12p/-

14

3. It was because of implementation of the Report of the Fourth Pay Commission that the applicants have been given the scale of Rs. 1400-2300/-. If the applicants are aggrieved by the revised pay scales given to them, the proper remedy for them is to approach the Fifth Pay Commission which is now considering ^{revising pay scales} this aspect.

4. With the above observations, finding no reason to admit this application and to deal with further, this O.A. is rejected under Section 19(3) of the Administrative Tribunal's Act.

There is no order as to costs.


(R.K. Ahooja)
Member (A)


(A.V. Haridasan)
Vice-Chairman (J)

na.