



**CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL  
PRINCIPAL BENCH**

**OA No.4397/2015  
MA No.4021/2015**

**New Delhi, this the 23<sup>rd</sup> Day of January, 2020**

**Hon'ble Mrs. Justice Vijay Lakshmi Member(J)  
Hon'ble Ms. Aradhana Johri, Member (A)**

1. Mangat Ram Arora  
S/o Late Sh. Jagannath  
R/o III 18, AG Colony, Bajaj Nagar, Jaipur  
Aged about 48 years
2. Surendra Kumar Sharma  
S/o Sh. Hanuman Sahai Sharma  
R/o A-8/1, Tulsi, Nagar Shastri Nagar, Jaipur  
Aged about 52 years
3. Sanjay Bhatt  
S/o Sh. Ramesh Chand Bhatt  
R/o 133 A, Mahatma Gandhi Nagar,  
Ajmer Road, Jaipur  
Aged about 48 years
4. Om Prakash Sharma  
S/o Late Sh. Deen Dayal Sharma  
R/o 97 A, Gayatri Nagar Ext. Shipra Path, Jaipur  
Aged about 50 years
5. Subhash Chandra Sharma  
S/o Sh. Jagdish Prasad Sharma  
R/o III 15, AG Colony, Bajaj Nagar, Jaipur  
Aged about 51 years
6. Ajay Matta  
S/o Late Sh. S.L. Matta  
R/o 6 gh 36, Jawahar Nagar, Jaipur  
Aged about 47 years
7. Khem Chand Tiwari  
S/o Late Sh. Prem Narayan  
R/o 103, Ashok Vihar Ext.



Gopalpura Bypass, Jaipur,  
Aged about 48 years

8. Lala Ram Meena  
S/o Sh. Mool Chand Meena  
R/o V & P Nangal Susawatan  
Tehsil Amer, Distt. Jaipur-302028  
Aged about 49 years
9. Kapoor Singh  
S/o Sh. Dharam Pal  
R/o III-195 AG Colony Bajaj Nagar, Jaipur  
Aged about 53 years
10. Murli Dhar Bhagat  
S/o Sh. Daya Ram Bhagat,  
R/o 5/271 Malviya Nagar, Jaipur  
Aged about 53 years
11. Sita Ram Mali  
S/o Sh. Udai Ram Mali  
R/o 51-52, Balaji Vihar-7  
Macheda Road, Jaipur  
Aged about 44 years
12. Banshi Lal Muhana  
S/o Sh. Bhanwar Lal Muhana  
R/o 175, Sachivalaya Vihar,  
New Sanganer Road, Jaipur  
Aged about 50
13. Govind Singh  
S/o Late Sh. Kartar Singh  
R/o 77/34, Aravali Marg,  
Mansarover, Jaipur  
Aged about 51 years
14. Ram Charan Gupta  
S/o Sh. Gulab Chand Gupta  
R/o E-22, Bank Colony,  
Murlipura Scheme, Jaipur  
Aged about 49 years
15. Hanuman Gupta  
S/o Sh. Ram Gopal



R/o 77/32, Aravali Marg,  
Mansarover, Jaipur  
Aged about 49 years

16. Sharad Kumar Jain  
S/o Sh. Amolak Chand Jain  
R/o 615 Gajendra Path,  
Mahavir Nagar-1<sup>st</sup> Tonk Road Jaipur  
Aged about 49 years
17. Raj Kumar Jain  
S/o Sh. Ganesh Lal Jain  
R/o A 33, Chatri Yojna Vaishali Nagar, Ajmer  
Aged about 48 years
18. Karam Veer Yadav  
S/o Sh. Net Ram Yadav  
R/o Plot No. 24A, D.K. Nagar  
Khatipura Road, Jhotwara, Jaipur,  
Aged about 52 years
19. Man Prakash  
S/o Sh. Budh Ram Mahawar  
R/o 225 A, Mahadev Nagar,  
Ramnagariya Road, Jagatpura, Jaipur  
Aged about 45 years
20. Babu Lal Sharma  
S/o Sh. Murli Dhar Sharma  
R/o 74, Kanak Vihar, Sirsi Road,  
Kanakpura, Jaipur  
Aged about 49 years
21. Shesh Narayan Sain  
S/o Sh. Gaindi Lal  
R/o Vill. Peepla Bharat Singh,  
Post Madau via Bhankrota  
Ajmer Road, Jaipur  
Aged about 48 years
22. Narendra Kumar Mishra  
S/o Sh. Shiv Parsad Mishra  
R/o 93A, Govindpuri, Opposite Rainbow Restaurant  
Amer Road, Jaipur,  
Aged about 54 years



23. Suresh Kumar Dangayach  
S/o Sh. Rameshwar Lal Dangayach  
R/o 3 MB/437, Indira Gandhi Nagar,  
Jagatpura, Jaipur  
Aged about 49 years
24. Makhan Lal Gupta  
S/o Late Sh. Hazari Lal  
R/o 31/97, Krishna Nagar,  
Jorawarsingh Gate, Jaipur,  
Aged about 54 years
25. Kailash Chand Bunkar  
S/o Sh. Nanu Ram  
R/o 47, Suraj Nagar, near Bypass Murlipura, Jaipur  
Aged about 49 years
26. Shyam Babu Vyas  
S/o Late Sh. Madan Lal Vyas  
R/o 55/29, Panchvati Marg, Rajat Path,  
Mansarovar, Jaipur  
Aged about 59 years
27. Usha Jain  
D/o Late Sh. Jagdish Prasad  
R/o A 400, Triveni Nagar,  
Gopalpura Bypass, Jaipur  
Aged about 59 years
28. Inderbir Singh Hora  
S/o Sh. Sunder Singh Hora  
R/o Plot No. 445, Flat No.8  
Rajshree Apartment, Gali No.4  
Raja Park, Jaipur  
Aged about 53 years
29. Shiv Ram Meena  
S/o Late Sh. Ramjeevan Meena  
R/o 9A, Shivram Colony, Jagatpura, Jaipur  
Aged about 52 years
30. Himmat Singh Chauhan  
S/o Sh. Ram Lal Chauhan  
R/o III-48, A.G.Colony, Bajaj Nagar, Jaipur



Aged about 60 years

31. Madan Lal Gothwal  
S/o Late Sh. Pema Ram  
R/o C-139, Singhbhumi, Khatipura, Jaipur  
Aged about 60 years
32. Swami Parsad  
S/o Late Sh. Nand Ram  
R/o House No.355, Balanandji Ki Mori,  
Purani Basti, Jaipur  
Aged about 49 years
33. Smt. Vibha Tandon  
D/o Sh. S.S. Kapoor  
R/o 4/14, A.G. Colony Bajaj Nagar, Jaipur  
Aged about 58 years
34. Ansar Ahmed Qureshi  
S/o Late Sh. N A Qureshi  
R/o 42 A-1, Behind Geejgarh Vihar Road No.3,  
K B Colony, 22 Godam, Jaipur  
Aged about 61 years
35. Tara Chand  
S/o Late Sh. Thakur Dass Saini  
R/o Plot No. 236, Rani Sati Nagar,  
Ajmer Road, Jaipur  
Aged about 47 years
36. Prabhu Lal Kayat  
S/o Late Sh. Babu Lal  
R/o Plot No. 17, Katewa Nagar,  
New Sangane Road, Jaipur  
Aged about 55 years
37. Chandra Lekha Tiwari  
W/o Sh. Dinesh Tiwari  
R/o 3474, Nahargarh Road,  
Chhoti Choper, Jaipur,  
Aged about 64 years
38. Davinder Singh Chadha  
S/o Late Sh. H.S. Chadha  
R/o A-84A, Fateh Nagar, New Delhi-18



Aged about 48 years

39. Mahendra Kumar Sharma  
S/o Sh. Sanwal Ram Sharma  
R/o Plot No.71, Prem Nagar,  
Gurjarki Thadi, Jaipur  
Aged about 61 years.

...Applicants

(By Advocate: Shri Ajesh Luthra)

Versus

1. The Comptroller &  
Auditor General of India  
9, Deen Dayal Upadhyay Marg,  
New Delhi.
2. Union of India  
Through its Secretary  
Department of Personnel & Training,  
Ministry of Personnel, Public  
Grievances and Pension,  
North Block, New Delhi.

...Respondents

(By Advocate: Ms. Priya Barua for Shri Gaurang Kanth)

### **Order (Oral)**

**Hon'ble Ms. Aradhana Johri, M(A)**

### **MA No.4021/2015**

MA for joining together in a single OA application  
is allowed.

### **OA No.4397/2015**

Ms. Priya Barua, proxy counsel for Shri Gaurang  
Kanth, counsel for the respondents has filed order



dated 07.01.2020 in OA No.3651/2015 (**Anand Mohan Bhatia and Ors. v. The Director General of audit**

**and Ors.)** which is similar to the instant OA. In the said matter this Tribunal passed the following Order:-

"5. The relevant observations about the grievances and the operative part of the judgement in OA No. 4465/2014 dated 20.08.2019 is reproduced below:-

*"5. As a result of extension of benefit of MACP Scheme, some of the Senior Accountants and Auditors are put in the grade pay of Rs. 5400/-. The seniors to such employees who did not have the occasion to avail the benefit of MACP either on account of their having got promotion or other reasons, are feeling aggrieved. This very aspect is under consideration before the Hon'ble Supreme Court. The question, as to whether, an employee can seek parity with his junior, who has been extended the benefit of MACP Scheme was dealt with by the Tribunal and High Courts earlier and, as of now, it is pending adjudication in SLP (C) Nos. 14918-19/2016. We are of the view that no useful purpose would be served by the keeping the O.A. pending or by issuing directions at this stage.*

*6. We, therefore, close the O.A., leaving it open to the applicants to pursue the remedies, depending upon the outcome of SLP (C) Nos. 14918-19/2016 and other connected matters. The fresh O.A., if any, filed after the adjudication of the matter before the Hon'ble Supreme Court shall be treated*



*as continuation of the prevalent O.A. Pending M.A.s, if any, shall stand disposed of. There shall be no order as to costs."*

6. In view of the foregoing, the instant OA is also disposed of in terms of order passed in OA No. 4465/2014 (para 5 supra). Pending MA is also disposed of accordingly."

2. In view of the above, the instant OA is disposed of in terms of the aforementioned directions passed in OA No.4465/2014. Pending MAs, if any, are also disposed of accordingly. There shall be no order as to costs.

**(Aradhana Johri)**  
**Member(A)**

**(Justice Vijay Lakshmi)**  
**Member(J)**

/vb/