



**Central Administrative Tribunal  
Principal Bench**

**OA No.301/2016**

New Delhi, this the 19<sup>th</sup> day of February, 2020

**Hon'ble Mr. Ashish Kalia, Member (J)**  
**Hon'ble Mr. Mohd.Jamshed, Member (A)**

1. Murari Lal Meena (Aged about 43 years)  
S/o ShRamkaranMeena  
R/o Vill-Ishvana, Post – Babeli, Tehsil-Raini  
Distt.Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301408.
2. Suresh Chand Meena (Aged about 43 years)  
S/o Sh. Kanhaiya Lal Meena  
R/o Vill-PatrKhera, Post-Maudhera, Tehsil-Basva  
Distt.Dausa (Rajasthan).
3. RambabuMeena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. ManniramMeena  
R/o Vill-Ahmadpur, Post-KiilpurKhera, Tehsil-Rani  
Distt.Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301409.
4. GangaramMeena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh/. KishanLalMeena  
R/ Vill.& Post-KeelpurKhera, Tehsil-Rani  
Distt.Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin 301409.
5. RamprasadMeena (Aged about 43 years)  
S/o Sh. Gobinda Ram Meena  
R/o Vill-Hatoj, Post-Dera, Tehsil-Rani  
Distt.Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301409.
6. Amar Singh Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Ram KishanMeena  
R/o Vill.& Post-KeelpurKeelpurKhera, Tehsil-Rani  
Distt.Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin 301409.
7. JaiphoolMeena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. ParsadiMeena  
R/o Vill.-Edalpur, Post – Badavad, Tehsil-Mahua  
Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 321609.
8. RamprasadMeena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. BholaramMeena  
R/o Vill.& Post –Bhalatala, Tehsil – Laxamanghar  
Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301413.



9. RameshwarDayalMeena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Ramji Lal Meena  
R/o Vill. – Nagal Sumer Singh, Post-Mandawar  
Tehsil- Mahuva, Distt.-Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin-321609.
- 10.SiyaramMeena (Aged about 43 years)  
S/o Sh. Kanhaya Lal Meena  
R/o Vill& Post – Jaitpur, Tehsil-Laxamanghar  
Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301413.
11. GhanshyamMeena (Aged about 43 years)  
S/o Sh. SedyaramMeena  
R/o Vill.& Post-Jaitpur, Tehsil-Laxamanghar  
Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301413.
- 12.Bhgvan Sahay Meena (Aged about 43 years)  
S/o Sh. BadriramMeena  
R/o Vill.& Post-KeelpurKhera, Tehsil-Raini  
Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin-.
- 13.ShivlalMeena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. ChotelalMeena  
R/o Vill.-Khohra Chauhan, Post-Bairer  
Tehsil-Rajghar, Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin-301408.
- 14.PapuramMeena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Ramji Lal Meena  
R/o Vill. – Khohra Chauhan, Post-Bairer  
Tehsil – Rajghar, Distt.-Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin-301408.
- 15.Lehri Ram Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. MulyaramMeena  
R/o Vill. – KhoharaMakroda, Post-Bairer  
Tehsil-Rajghar, Distt.Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin-301408.
- 16.RamotarMeena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Hari Ram Meena  
R/o Vill-Khohara, Post – Jaitpur, Tehsil-Rajgarh  
Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301408.
- 17.RamnivasMeena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Narayan Meena  
R/o Vill.-Khari Ki Jhopari, Post-Higota, Tehsil-Basava  
Distt. – DausaVayaBivae (Rajasthan), Pin-303315.
- 18.Jagdish Prasad Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Narayan Meena  
R/o Vill.-Khari Ki Jhopri, Post-Higota, Tehsil-Basava  
Distt. – DausaVayaBivae (Rajasthan), Pin-303315.



19. Hari Prasad Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Ramhet Meena  
R/o Vill. & Post-Salvari Vaya Ronija, Tehsil-Kathumar  
Distt. – Alwar (Rajasthan), Pin-301035.
20. Kamala Singh Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Kumbharam Meena  
R/o Vill.-Kotvale Ka Bas, Post-Bivae, Tehsil-Bsava  
Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin-303315.
21. Karan Singh Meena (Aged about 43 years)  
S/o Sh. Kumbharam Meena  
R/o Vill.-Kotvalon Ka Bas, Post-Bivae, Tehsil-Basava  
Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin-303315.
22. Bhikharam Meena (Aged about 43 years)  
S/o Sh. Bhajni Ram Meena  
R/o Vill-Pali, Post-Bahdko, Tehsil-Raini  
Distt. – Alwar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301413.
23. Bachchoo Ram Meena (Aged about 43 years)  
S/o Sh. Changaram Meena  
R/o Vill.-Pali, Post-Beharko, Tehsil-Raini  
Distt.-Alwar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301413.
24. Mansingh Meena (Aged about 43 years)  
S/o Sh. Badri Prasad Meena  
R/o Vill.-Pali, Post-Beharko, Tehsil-Raini  
Distt. Alwar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301413.
25. Ghamandi Lal Meena (Aged about 43 years)  
S/o Sh. Khera Ram Meena  
R/o Vill. – Jaisingh Pura, Post – Karanpura, Tehsil – Raini  
Distt. Alwar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301413.
26. Ramkripal Meena (Aged about 43 years)  
S/o Sh. Kanhaiya Lal Meena  
R/o Vill.-Patarkhera, Post – Maukhera, Tehsil – Basva  
Distt.-Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 303315.
27. Kalu Ram Meena (Aged about 43 years)  
S/o Sh. Sugreev Meena  
R/o Vill. – Balahera, Post – Balahera, Tehsil – Basva  
Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 303315.
28. Kailash Chand Meena (Aged about 43 years)  
S/o Sh. Ramkishor Meena  
R/o Vill. & Post – Alipur, Tehsil – Basva  
Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 303315.



29. Banvari Lal Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Ramjeewan Meena  
R/o Vill. – Nayalibas, Post – Kalvari, Tehsil – Kathumar  
Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin-321606.
30. Bhavan Sahay Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Ram Karan Meena  
R/o Vill. – Ghorala, Post – Saloli, Tehsil – Raini  
Distt.-Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301409.
31. Ramkishor Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Dharmpal Meena  
R/o Vill.& Post – Pundarvada Tani Ghadrolya Vaya Manpur  
Tehsil – Basva, Distt. – Dausa, (Rajasthan), Pin – 303309.
32. Bhagvan Sahay Meena (Aged about 43 years)  
S/o Sh. Ranglal Meena  
R/o Vill.& Post – Bhooleri, Tehsil – Raini  
Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301409.
33. Shivdayal Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Ramkumar Meena  
R/o Vill.-Kathhaira, Post-Khera Kilanpura, Tehsil – Kathumar  
Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301035.
34. Shambhu Dayal Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Ganga Ram Meena  
R/o Vill.-Kathhaira, Post-Khera Kilanpura, Tehsil – Kathumar  
Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301409.
35. Ramji Lal Meena (Aged about 43 years)  
S/o Sh. Kanhaiya Lal Meena  
R/o Vill.-Ukeri, Post-Bhura, Tehsil – Raini  
Distt.-Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301409.
36. Shri Ram Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Moolchand Meena  
R/o Vill.-Ukeri, Post-Bhoora, Tehsil-Raini  
Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301409.
37. Ramjivan Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Nayansukh Meena  
R/o Vill.-Manyaka Bas, Post – Ronija, Tehsil – Kathumar  
Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301035.
38. Sitaram Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Soorajmal Meena  
R/o Vill.-Manyaka Bas, Post – Ronija Thana, Tehsil – Kathumar  
Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301035.



39. Harikishan Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Hariram Meena  
R/o Vill.-Manyaka Nara, Post – Roneeja Thana, Tehsil – Kathumar  
Distt. – Alwar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301035.
40. Indraj Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Herati Lal Meena  
R/o Vill.-Rupavas, Post-Ralavta, Tehsil – Basva  
Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin -303313.
41. Laxamin Narayan Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Shyochan Meena  
R/o Vill. – Jopara, Post – Thikricho, Tehsil – Sikraj  
Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 303509.
42. Sodan Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Gangasahay Meena  
R/o Vill. – Buchpuri, Post – Saloli, Tehsil – Raini  
Distt. – Alwar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301409.
43. Banwari Lal Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Rameshwar Dayal Meena  
R/o Vill.-Pali, Post – Beharko, Tehsil – Raini  
Distt. – Alwar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301413.
44. Latoor Mal Meena (Aged about 43 years)  
S/o Sh. Siya Ram Meena  
R/o Vill.-KhoranKa Bas, Post-KeelpurKhera, Tehsil-Raini  
Distt.-Alwar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301409.
45. Khemraj Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Harsahay Meena  
R/o Vill.-Sudharanpara, Post – Sudharanpara  
Tehsil – Basva Vaya Bivae, Distt.-Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin-303315.
46. Rambhrosi Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Somotya Ram Meena  
R/o Vill.& Post – Jaitpur, Tehsil – Laxmanghar  
Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 301413.
47. Shibrām Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Gangasahay Meena  
R/o Vill. – Roopvas, Post – Ralavta, Tehsil-Basva  
Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 303315.
48. Shivram Meena (Aged about 42 years)  
S/o Sh. Harlal Meena  
R/o Vill. – Paran, Post-Gijghar, Tehsil – Sikray  
Distt.Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 303502.



49. Somotilal Meena (Aged about 43 years)  
S/o Sh. Ramkishan Meena  
R/o Vill. & Post – Nihalpura, Tehsil – Basva  
Distt. – Alwar (Rajasthan), Pin – 303315.
50. Ramsvaroop Meena (Aged about 43 years)  
S/o Sh. Shri Chand Meena  
R/o Vill. & Post – Bhuleri, Tehsil – Raini  
Distt. – Alwar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301409.
51. Babu Lal Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Ranglal Meena  
R/o Vill. & Post – Karaudi, Tehsil – Sikray  
Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 303509.
52. Jal Singh Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Nathuva Ram Meena  
R/o Vill. & Post – Planhera, Tehsil – Mahua  
Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 321612.
53. Mohan Lal Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Dhani Ram Meena  
R/o Vill. – Khera Paharpur, Post – Theekariya  
Tehsil – Sikray, Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin-303509.
54. Omprakash Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Mulya Ram Meena  
R/o Vill. & Post – Karauri, Tehsil – Sikray  
Distt.-Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 303509.
55. Happu Ram Meena (Aged about 44 years)  
S/o Sh. Chote Lal Meena  
R/o Vill. & Post-Bhika Hedi, Vaya Gadi, Sawai Ram  
Distt. Alwar, Raj. -301413.
56. Mohar Singh Meena (Aged about 42 years)  
S/o Sh. Jal Dhari Meena  
R/o Vill. Manapara  
Distt. Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 303509.

...Applicants

(By Advocates: Mr. A.K. Behra with Mr. T.N. Tripathi)

### **Versus**

1. C.P.W.D.  
Through its Superintendent Engineer  
Block – 1, Level – 7, R.K. Puram, New Delhi – 110066.
2. The Executive Engineer  
PWD, Room No. B-409  
Indraprastha Bhawan, Indraprastha Estate (ITO), New Delhi.





3. The Assistant Engineer C.P.W.D.  
2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Kendriya Sadan, Sector-9-A, Chandigarh.
4. Sh. Malkhan Meena  
S/o Sh. Prabhu Dayal Meena, Working as Beldar.
5. Sh. Jagdish Prasad Meena  
S/o Sh. Ganga Sahai Meena, Working as Khallasi.
6. Ram Singh Meena, (Khalasi)  
(Aged about 45 years)  
S/o Sh. Sawal Ram, R/o 2-C, 304, Vasundera, Ghaziabad (U.P.)

(Both Respondents No. 4 & 5 may be served through Respondent No. 1 & 2)

..... Respondents

(By Advocates :Mr. Vijender Singh for UOI and Mr. Sachin Chauhan for  
R-4 & 5)

### **ORDER (ORAL)**

**Mr. Ashish Kalia:**

In this OA filed under section 19 of the AT Act, the following reliefs are sought :

- “(i) call for the entire selection process adopted by the respondents for the post of Beldar, Khalasi, Safai Karamchari etc. under special Recruitment Dribs-2006 to fill up the backlog vacancies of ST candidates.
- (ii) Direct the respondents to act upon the inquiry report dt.11.8.2015 & cancel the selection/appointment of the candidates who are given selection on the basis of false affidavit list for the post of Beldar, Khalasi, Safai Karamchari etc., under the backlog vacancies of ST candidates and direct the respondents to initiate the selection process a fresh for the aforesaid posts, and consider the applicants in fair and impartial manner.
- (iii) Pass any other order which this Hon’ble Tribunal may deem-fit and proper in the interest of justice.”

2. After hearing the matter at length, this Tribunal directed the respondents to produce the reports of the Central Bureau of



Investigation which are stated to have been received by saying that they have no jurisdiction to deal with such matters. The short question put forth by the 56 applicants before this Tribunal is whether their case will be considered for appointment in view of the certain anomalies found during the course of selection in regard to date of birth. The applicants are claiming that they are having genuine certificates. The selection took place in the year of 2006.

4. As informed by Mr. Vijendra Singh, counsel for the respondents at the bar, no further selection thereafter has taken place.

5. The short solution could be found observing that pending disposal of this original application, if the department chooses to fill up these vacancies, they may consider the case of the applicants and pass a reasoned and speaking order in case of non-selection. If appointments are given, there shall not be any grievance for the applicants in regard to seniority or promotion. It is also clarified that settled position of seniority shall not be unsettled and in case the department found the applicants eligible, they shall be put at the bottom of seniority.

6. With the above observations, we dispose of the present original application. The exercise shall be completed within a period of 90 days. In case, any grievance still subsists, the applicants may re-approach this Tribunal. There shall be No order as to costs.

**(Mohd. Jamshed)**  
**Member (A)**

**(Ashish Kalia)**  
**Member (J)**