



**Central Administrative Tribunal
Principal Bench**

OA No.301/2016

New Delhi, this the 19thday of February, 2020

**Hon'ble Mr. Ashish Kalia, Member (J)
Hon'ble Mr. Mohd.Jamshed, Member (A)**

1. Murari Lal Meena (Aged about 43 years)
S/o ShRamkaranMeena
R/o Vill-Ishvana, Post – Babeli, Tehsil-Raini
Distt.Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301408.
2. Suresh Chand Meena (Aged about 43 years)
S/o Sh. Kanhaiya Lal Meena
R/o Vill-PatrKhera, Post-Maudhera, Tehsil-Basva
Distt.Dausa (Rajasthan).
3. RambabuMeena (Aged about 44 years)
S/o Sh. ManniramMeena
R/o Vill-Ahmadpur, Post-KiilpurKhera, Tehsil-Rani
Distt.Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301409.
4. GangaramMeena (Aged about 44 years)
S/o Sh/. KishanLalMeena
R/ Vill.& Post-KeelpurKhera, Tehsil-Rani
Distt.Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin 301409.
5. RamprasadMeena (Aged about 43 years)
S/o Sh. Gobinda Ram Meena
R/o Vill-Hatoj, Post-Dera, Tehsil-Rani
Distt.Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301409.
6. Amar Singh Meena (Aged about 44 years)
S/o Sh. Ram KishanMeena
R/o Vill.& Post-KeelpurKeelpurKhera, Tehsil-Rani
Distt.Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin 301409.
7. JaiphoolMeena (Aged about 44 years)
S/o Sh. ParsadiMeena
R/o Vill.-Edalpur, Post – Badavad, Tehsil-Mahua
Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 321609.
8. RamprasadMeena (Aged about 44 years)
S/o Sh. BholaramMeena
R/o Vill.& Post –Bhalatala, Tehsil – Laxamanghar
Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301413.



9. Rameshwar Dayal Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. Ramji Lal Meena
 R/o Vill. – Nagal Sumer Singh, Post-Mandawar
 Tehsil- Mahuva, Distt.-Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin-321609.
10. Siyaram Meena (Aged about 43 years)
 S/o Sh. Kanhaya Lal Meena
 R/o Vill& Post – Jaitpur, Tehsil-Laxamanghar
 Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301413.
11. Ghanshyam Meena (Aged about 43 years)
 S/o Sh. Sedyaram Meena
 R/o Vill.& Post-Jaitpur, Tehsil-Laxamanghar
 Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301413.
12. Bhgvan Sahay Meena (Aged about 43 years)
 S/o Sh. Badriram Meena
 R/o Vill.& Post-KeelpurKhera, Tehsil-Raini
 Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin-.
13. Shivlal Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. Chotelal Meena
 R/o Vill.-Khohra Chauhan, Post-Bairer
 Tehsil-Rajghar, Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin-301408.
14. Papuram Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. Ramji Lal Meena
 R/o Vill. – Khohra Chauhan, Post-Bairer
 Tehsil – Rajghar, Distt.-Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin-301408.
15. Lehri Ram Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. Mulyaram Meena
 R/o Vill. – Khohara Makroda, Post-Bairer
 Tehsil-Rajghar, Distt. Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin-301408.
16. Ramotar Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. Hari Ram Meena
 R/o Vill-Khohara, Post – Jaitpur, Tehsil-Rajgarh
 Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301408.
17. Ramnivas Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. Narayan Meena
 R/o Vill.-Khari Ki Jhopari, Post-Higota, Tehsil-Basava
 Distt. – Dausa Vaya Bivae (Rajasthan), Pin-303315.
18. Jagdish Prasad Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. Narayan Meena
 R/o Vill.-Khari Ki Jhopri, Post-Higota, Tehsil-Basava
 Distt. – Dausa Vaya Bivae (Rajasthan), Pin-303315.



19. Hari Prasad Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. RamhetMeena
 R/o Vill.& Post-SalvariVayaRonija, Tehsil-Kathumar
 Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin-301035.

20. Kamala Singh Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. KumbharamMeena
 R/o Vill.-KotvaleKa Bas, Post-Bivae, Tehsil-Bsava
 Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin-303315.

21. Karan Singh Meena (Aged about 43 years)
 S/o Sh. KumbharamMeena
 R/o Vill.-KotvalonKa Bas, Post-Bivae, Tehsil-Basava
 Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin-303315.

22. BhikharamMeena (Aged about 43 years)
 S/o Sh. Bhajni Ram Meena
 R/o Vill-Pali, Post-Bahdko, Tehsil-Raini
 Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301413.

23. Bachchoo Ram Meena (Aged about 43 years)
 S/o Sh. ChangaramMeena
 R/o Vill.-Pali, Post-Beharko, Tehsil-Raini
 Distt.-Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301413.

24. MansinghMeena (Aged about 43 years)
 S/o Sh. Badri Prasad Meena
 R/o Vill.-Pali, Post-Beharko, Tehsil-Raini
 Distt.Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301413.

25. Ghamandi Lal Meena (Aged about 43 years)
 S/o Sh. Khera Ram Meena
 R/o Vill. – Jaisingh Pura, Post – Karanpura, Tehsil – Raini
 Distt.Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301413.

26. RamkripalMeena (Aged about 43 years)
 S/o Sh. Kanhaiya Lal Meena
 R/o Vill.-Patarkhera, Post – Maukhera, Tehsil – Basva
 Distt.-Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 303315.

27. Kalu Ram Meena (Aged about 43 years)
 S/o Sh. SugreevMeena
 R/o Vill. – Balahera, Post – Balahera, Tehsil – Basva
 Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 303315.

28. Kailash Chand Meena (Aged about 43 years)
 S/o Sh. RamkishorMeena
 R/o Vill.& Post – Alipur, Tehsil – Basva
 Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 303315.



29. Banvari Lal Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. RamjeewanMeena
 R/o Vill. – Nayalibas, Post – Kalvari, Tehsil – Kathumar
 Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin-321606.

30. Bhavan Sahay Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. Ram Karan Meena
 R/o Vill. – Ghorala, Post – Saloli, Tehsil – Raini
 Distt.-Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301409.

31. RamkishorMeena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. DharmpalMeena
 R/o Vill.& Post – PundarvadaTaniGhadrolyaVayaManpur
 Tehsil – Basva, Distt. – Dausa, (Rajasthan), Pin – 303309.

32. Bhagvan Sahay Meena (Aged about 43 years)
 S/o Sh. RanglalMeena
 R/o Vill.& Post – Bhooleri, Tehsil – Raini
 Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301409.

33. ShivdayalMeena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. RamkumarMeena
 R/o Vill.-Kathhaira, Post-KheraKilanpura, Tehsil – Kathumar
 Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301035.

34. ShambhuDayalMeena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. Ganga Ram Meena
 R/o Vill.-Kathhaira, Post-KheraKilanpura, Tehsil – Kathumar
 Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301409.

35. Ramji Lal Meena (Aged about 43 years)
 S/o Sh. Kanhaiya Lal Meena
 R/o Vill.-Ukeri, Post-Bhura, Tehsil – Raini
 Distt.-Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301409.

36. Shri Ram Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. MoolchandMeena
 R/o Vill.-Ukeri, Post-Bhoora, Tehsil-Raini
 Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301409.

37. RamjivanMeena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. NayansukhMeena
 R/o Vill.-Manyaka Bas, Post – Ronija, Tehsil – Kathumar
 Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301035.

38. SitaramMeena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. SoorajmalMeena
 R/o Vill.-ManyaKa Bas, Post – Ronija Thana, Tehsil – Kathumar
 Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301035.



39. Harikishan Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. Hariram Meena
 R/o Vill.- ManyaKa Nara, Post – Roneeja Thana, Tehsil – Kathumar
 Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301035.

40. Indraj Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. Herati Lal Meena
 R/o Vill.- Rupavas, Post- Ralavta, Tehsil – Basva
 Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin -303313.

41. Laxamin Narayan Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. Shyochan Meena
 R/o Vill. – Jopara, Post – Thikricho, Tehsil – Sikraj
 Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 303509.

42. Sodan Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. Gangasahay Meena
 R/o Vill. – Buchpuri, Post – Saloli, Tehsil – Raini
 Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301409.

43. Banwari Lal Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. Rameshwar Dayal Meena
 R/o Vill.- Pali, Post – Beharko, Tehsil – Raini
 Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301413.

44. Latoor Mal Meena (Aged about 43 years)
 S/o Sh. Siya Ram Meena
 R/o Vill.- Khoran Ka Bas, Post- Keelpur Khera, Tehsil- Raini
 Distt.- Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301409.

45. Khemraj Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. Harsahay Meena
 R/o Vill.- Sudharanpara, Post – Sudharanpara
 Tehsil – Basva Vaya Bivae, Distt.- Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin-303315.

46. Rambhrosi Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. Somotya Ram Meena
 R/o Vill. & Post – Jaitpur, Tehsil – Laxmanghar
 Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 301413.

47. Shibrat Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. Gangasahay Meena
 R/o Vill. – Roopvas, Post – Ralavta, Tehsil- Basva
 Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 303315.

48. Shivram Meena (Aged about 42 years)
 S/o Sh. Harlal Meena
 R/o Vill. – Paran, Post- Gijghar, Tehsil – Sikray
 Distt. Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 303502.



49. Somotilal Meena (Aged about 43 years)
 S/o Sh. Ramkishan Meena
 R/o Vill.& Post – Nihalpura, Tehsil – Basva
 Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 303315.

50. Ramsvaroop Meena (Aged about 43 years)
 S/o Sh. Shri Chand Meena
 R/o Vill.& Post – Bhuleri, Tehsil – Raini
 Distt. – Alvar (Rajasthan), Pin – 301409.

51. Babu Lal Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. Ranglal Meena
 R/o Vill.& Post – Karaudi, Tehsil – Sikray
 Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 303509.

52. Jal Singh Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. Nathuva Ram Meena
 R/o Vill.& Post – Planhera, Tehsil – Mahua
 Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 321612.

53. Mohan Lal Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. Dhani Ram Meena
 R/o Vill. – Khera Paharpur, Post – Theekariya
 Tehsil – Sikray, Distt. – Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin-303509.

54. Omprakash Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. Mulya Ram Meena
 R/o Vill.& Post – Karauri, Tehsil – Sikray
 Distt.-Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 303509.

55. Happu Ram Meena (Aged about 44 years)
 S/o Sh. Chote Lal Meena
 R/o Vill.& Post-Bhika Hedi, Vaya Gadi, Sawai Ram
 Distt. Alwar, Raj. -301413.

56. Mohar Singh Meena (Aged about 42 years)
 S/o Sh. Jal Dhari Meena
 R/o Vill. Manapara
 Distt. Dausa (Rajasthan), Pin – 303509.

...Applicants

(By Advocates: Mr. A.K. Behra with Mr. T.N. Tripathi)

Versus

1. C.P.W.D.
 Through its Superintendent Engineer
 Block – 1, Level – 7, R.K. Puram, New Delhi – 110066.
2. The Executive Engineer
 PWD, Room No. B-409
 Indraprastha Bhawan, Indraprastha Estate (ITO), New Delhi.



3. The Assistant Engineer C.P.W.D.
2nd Floor Kendriya Sadan, Sector-9-A, Chandigarh.
4. Sh. Malkhan Meena
S/o Sh. Prabhu Dayal Meena, Working as Beldar.
5. Sh. Jagdish Prasad Meena
S/o Sh. Ganga Sahai Meena, Working as Khalasi.
6. Ram Singh Meena, (Khalasi)
(Aged about 45 years)
S/o Sh. Sawal Ram, R/o 2-C, 304, Vasundera, Ghaziabad (U.P.)

(Both Respondents No. 4 & 5 may be served through Respondent No. 1 & 2)

..... Respondents

(By Advocates :Mr. Vijender Singh for UOI and Mr. Sachin Chauhan for R-4 & 5)

ORDER (ORAL)

Mr. Ashish Kalia:

In this OA filed under section 19 of the AT Act, the following reliefs are sought :

- “(i) call for the entire selection process adopted by the respondents for the post of Beldar, Khalasi, Safai Karamchari etc. under special Recruitment Dribs-2006 to fill up the backlog vacancies of ST candidates.
- (ii) Direct the respondents to act upon the inquiry report dt.11.8.2015 & cancel the selection/appointment of the candidates who are given selection on the basis of false affidavit list for the post of Beldar, Khalasi, Safai Karamchari etc., under the backlog vacancies of ST candidates and direct the respondents to initiate the selection process a fresh for the aforesaid posts, and consider the applicants in fair and impartial manner.
- (iii) Pass any other order which this Hon’ble Tribunal may deem-fit and proper in the interest of justice.”

2. After hearing the matter at length, this Tribunal directed the respondents to produce the reports of the Central Bureau of



Investigation which are stated to have been received by saying that they have no jurisdiction to deal with such matters. The short question put forth by the 56 applicants before this Tribunal is whether their case will be considered for appointment in view of the certain anomalies found during the course of selection in regard to date of birth. The applicants are claiming that they are having genuine certificates. The selection took place in the year of 2006.

4. As informed by Mr. Vijendra Singh, counsel for the respondents at the bar, no further selection thereafter has taken place.

5. The short solution could be found observing that pending disposal of this original application, if the department chooses to fill up these vacancies, they may consider the case of the applicants and pass a reasoned and speaking order in case of non-selection. If appointments are given, there shall not be any grievance for the applicants in regard to seniority or promotion. It is also clarified that settled position of seniority shall not be unsettled and in case the department found the applicants eligible, they shall be put at the bottom of seniority.

6. With the above observations, we dispose of the present original application. The exercise shall be completed within a period of 90 days. In case, any grievance still subsists, the applicants may re-approach this Tribunal. There shall be No order as to costs.

(Mohd. Jamshed)
Member (A)

(Ashish Kalia)
Member (J)

'anjali'