



**CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL
PRINCIPAL BENCH**

**O.A. No. 3640/2019
M.A. No. 4032/2019**

New Delhi, this the 7th day of January, 2020

**Hon'ble Mr. Justice L. Narasimha Reddy, Chairman
Hon'ble Ms. Aradhana Johri, Member (A)**

1. N.K. Batra,
S/o Late Shri O.P. Batra,
Aged 56 years,
R/o 192-A, DDA Flats,
Paschim Vihar Extn.,
New Delhi-63. (Group 'B')
2. Ms. Mohinder Kaur,
D/o Shri A.S. Nanda,
Aged 57 years,
R/o T-29, First Floor,
Rajouri Garden,
New Delhi. (Group 'B')
3. Sarbari Sarkar,
S/o Late Moni Mohan Mukherjee,
Aged 57 years,
R/o 1/9, Nitya Gopal Chatterjee Lane,
Kolkata-37. (Group 'B')
4. Rajender Kumar,
S/o late Shri R.B. Gupta,
Aged 52 years,
R/o H.No.2473, Street No.13,
Goverdhan Bihari Colony,
Shahdra, Delhi-32 (Group 'B').
5. Ms. Geeta Madhavankutty Nair,
D/o Shri K. Madhavankutty Nair,
Aged 53 years,



R/o B-501, Shree Gajanan Heights,
ESIS Road, Nitin Junction,
Thane (W). (Group 'B')

6. Subrata Bhattacharjee,
S/o Late Shri A.C. Bhattacharjee,
Aged 57 years,
R/o 54/1A, Sura East Road,
Kolkata. (Group 'B')

7. Mrs. Vijay Mahajan,
W/o Shri Parmod Kumar Mahajan,
Aged 55 years,
R/o WZ-164, G Block,
Hari Nagar, New Delhi-110058. (Group 'B')

8. Sunil Goel,
S/o Shri Brij Mohan Goel,
Aged 57 years,
R/o Flat No.249, Metro Apartment,
DDA MIG Flats, Jahangir Puri,
Delhi-110 033. (Group 'B')

9. Anil Kumar Sharma,
S/o Late Sh. K.L. Sharma,
Aged 56 years,
R/o 7/315, Krishna Gali,
Shahdara, Delhi – 110 032. (Group-'B')

10. Naresh Kumar,
S/o Late Shri Ramkishan,
Aged 53 years,
R/o A-38, Phase-4,
Prem Nagar, Najafgarh,
New Delhi – 110 043. (Group-'B')

11. Suman Nagpal,
S/o Sh. R.K. Nagpal,
Aged 55 years,
R/o A-75, 1st Floor,
Lajpat Nagar-II,
New Delhi –110 024. (Group-'B')



12. Shivaguru H,
S/o Sh.C.S. Harish Kumar,
Aged 57 years,
R/o 641/44 CPWD Qtrs,
HSR Layout,
Bengaluru-560102. (Group-'B')
13. Ms. Anita Bisht,
D/o Late Sh. G.S. Bisht,
Aged 52 years,
R/o DG-2/102-D, Vikas Puri,
New Delhi- 110 018. (Group-'B')
14. Vinay Aggarwal,
S/o Shri M.K. Aggarwal,
Aged 53 years,
R/o H.No. 57, Sector-4,
R.K. Puram, New Delhi. (Group-'B')
15. Satpal,
S/o Late Sh.Bodh Raj,
Aged 54 years,
R/o H.No. 1130/21-A,
Gali No. 4, Krishna Colony,
Gurgaon (Haryana). (Group-'B')
16. Ajay Achuttan Kutty,
S/o Late Sh. K. Achuttan Kutty,
Aged 51 years,
R/o 351, Sector-12, R.K. Puram,
New Delhi – 110 022. (Group-'B')
17. Pramod Kumar Singh,
S/o Late Sh. Amar Nath,
Aged 57 years,
R/o WZ-440/5, Pal Factory Complex,
Gali No. 26, Sadh Nagar,
Palam Colony, New Delhi –45. (Group-'B')
18. Ms. Shampi Dhingra,
D/o Sh. Kishore Dhingra,



Aged 57 years,
R/o H.No. 1613, Sector-4,
Gurgaon. (Group-'B')

19. Ramesh Singh Malik,
S/o Sh. Pammi Lal Malik,
Aged 57 years,
R/o H.No. 106-D, Aram Bagh,
New Delhi. (Group-'B')

20. Ms. Gurmeet Kaur,
D/o S. Gurpreet Singh,
Aged 49 years,
R/o H.No.12-A, Sector-32 A,
Chandigarh. (Group-'B')

21. Ms. Gouri Biswas,
D/o Sh.Tapan Kumar Biswas,
Aged 53 years,
R/o 2886, Sector-3, Sadiq Nagar,
New Delhi. (Group-'B')

22. Ms. Purbi Banerji,
D/o Sh. S.K. Banerjee, ,
Aged 57 years,
R/o 7/713, Baba Kharak Singh Marg,
New Delhi – 110 001. (Group-'B')

23. Mrs. Kiran Vingiani,
W/o Sh. Kuldeep Kumar,
Aged 52 years,
R/o G-I/A, 701,
Samridhi Appartment,
Sector-18-B, Dwarka. (Group-'B')

24. Parveen Kumar Gandhi,
S/o Sh. Bachan Lal,
Aged 52 years,
R/o G.F-2, PH-2, Ashiana Complex,
Mansa Devi Road (MDC),
Panchkoola. (Group-'B')



25. Jagdamba Prasad,
S/o Sh. Chander Mani,
Aged 54 years,
R/o H.No. G-265, Nanak Pura,
South Moti Bagh, New Delhi. (Group-'B')
26. Yashpal Singh Nayyar,
S/o Sh. D.S. Nayyar,
Aged 53 years,
R/o 29, Karam Singh Colony,
Karnal – 132 001 (Haryana). (Group-'B')
27. Ms. Sushila Kuhar,
D/o Sh. R.C. Kuhar,
Aged 54 years,
R/o 433, Sector-9,
Faridabad. (Group-'B')
28. Ms. Sarita,
D/o Sh. Sanjay Aggarwal,
Aged 49 years,
R/o H.No. 3403, Sector-23 D,
Chandigarh. (Group-'B')
29. Ms. Shashi Bala,
D/o Sh. Inder Kumar,
Aged 50 years,
R/o H.No. 5270/1, MHC,
Manimajra, Chandigarh. (Group-'B')
30. Ms. Sneh Lata,
D/o Sh. Shri Sudarshan,
Aged 50 years,
R/o H.No. 4236/2, Suglan Street,
Near Ram Ashram, Patiala. (Group-'B')
31. Parkash Kumar,
S/o Sh. Dharampal,
Aged 53 years,
R/o # 154, Satya Niketan,
New Delhi. (Group-'B')



32. Ms. Suman Singh,
D/o Sh. M.P. Singh,
Aged 53 years,
R/o H.No. 354, Street No. 9,
Vill. Mandoli, Delhi – 110 093. (Group-'B')
33. Ms. Saroj Chaudhary,
D/o Sh. Subhash Chaudhary,
Aged 52 years,
R/o G-243, Type III, Nanak Pura,
New Delhi – 110 021. (Group-'B')
34. Raj Kumar,
S/o Sh. Hans Raj,
R/o HM-1238, Phase-I,
Urban Estate, Model Town,
Bathinda (Punjab). (Group-'B')
35. Hitter Pal Saini,
S/o Sh. Munshi Ram Saini,
Aged 53 years,
R/o H. No.12/B, Sector-32/A,
Chandigarh. (Group-'B')
36. Wilson K.D.
S/o Mrs. Mary Wilson,
Aged 53 years,
R/o Sector-3, CGS Quarters,
Bldg. No. 39, Room No. 441,
Antop Hill, Mumbai-37. (Group-'B')
37. Ms. Sonia,
D/o Shri Surinder Kumar Sethi,
aged 49 years,
R/o # 1542, Sector 50-B,
Progressive Enclave, Chandigarh. (Group-'B')
38. Subhash Babu,
S/o Sh. Dina Nath,
Aged 50 years,
R/o H. No. 2238/37,
Gali No. 6, Shanti Nagar,



Manimajra, Chandigarh. (Group-'B')

39. K. Sankarnarayanan,
S/o Sh. Late Shri Chinnan Nair,
Aged 49 years,
R/o F-203, Aaryan Pride,
Vandemataram, Gota,
Ahmedabad, Gujarat. (Group-'B')
40. Suman Shome,
S/o Sh. Late Sunil Kumar Shome,
Aged 52 years,
R/o 'The Bliss', Sukant Pally,
Siliguri-5 (West Bengal). (Group-'B')
41. Amarjeet Singh,
S/o Late Sh. Joginder Singh,
Aged 53 years,
R/o A/6, Apolo Park Society,
Girdhar Nagar, Shahibaug,
Ahmedabad, Gujarat. (Group-'B')
42. Noor Haider,
D/o Late Sh. Khurshed Haider,
Aged 53 years,
R/o Lucknow. (Group-'B')
43. Bikash Sarmadhikary,
S/o Sh. Late Sh Manash Sarmadhikary,
Aged 53 years,
R/o Pratiksha Apartment,
Bharat Nagar (N), Ward No. 24,
Siliguri, Distt.Darjeeling. (Group-'B')
44. Ms. Suma Wilson,
D/o Sh. Wilson Itty,
R/o Indira Niketan Working Girls Hostel,
Laxmi Bai Nagar, New Delhi. (Group-'B')
45. K.K. Anil,
S/o Sh. K.G. Kunju Kunju,
Aged 47 years,



R/o Type-II, SIB Housing Complex,
PO Raj Bhawan, Baluwakhani,
Gangtok, East District, Sikkim. (Group-'B')

46. Lal Mohan Sahani,
S/o Late Sh. Chander Sahani,
Aged 51 years,
R/o Debibari Nutan Para,
PO + Distt. Cooch Behar
(West Bengal). (Group-'B')
47. Mandavilli Durga Prasad,
S/o Late Sh. M. Subba Rao,
Aged 53 years,
R/o Door No. 21-10/5-41,
3rd Lane, Teachers Colony,
Mutyalampadu,
Vijayawada-520011. (Group-'B')
48. R. Nirupama,
S/o Sh. N.Ranganna,
Aged 53 years,
R/o 1244, 6th Cross, 1st Phase,
J.P. Nagar,LIC Colony,
Bengaluru-78. (Group-'B')
49. Daniel Singh,
S/o Sh. Jagdish Singh,
Aged 49 years,
38-A, Sector 32-A,
Chandigarh. (Group-'B')
50. Mohan Lal Sharma,
S/o Sh. Richh Pal Sharma,
Aged 53 years,
R/o SP House, TC-32/868,
GVRA 079, Vettucaud,
Trivandrum, Kerala. (Group-'B')
51. Surendra D. Gajbhiye,
S/o Late Sh. Dhaniram Gajbhiye,
Aged 49 years,



R/o C-202, Bhumiraj Meadows CHS,
Sector-19, Plot No. 42/43, Airoli,
Navi Mumbai – 400 708. (Group-‘B’)

52. K. Sunil Prasad,
S/o Sh. A. Jayabalan,
Aged 49 years,
R/o B-302, Shree Maruti Darshan CHS,
Cholegaon, MIDC Road,
Thakurli East, Dombivli Post,
Distt. Thane, Maharashtra. (Group-‘B’)
53. Navin Chandra Paul,
S/o Late Sh. Kamleshwari Mandal
Aged 49 years,
R/o 76/2-C, DIZ Area, Sector-2,
Kalibari Marg, New Delhi- 001. (Group-‘B’)
54. Ms. Seema Bhatt,
S/o Sh. Anil Kumar Bhatt,
Aged 46 years,
R/o 204, Sector-3, Ekta Appts.,
Dwarka, New Delhi. (Group-‘B’)
55. Gauri Shanker,
S/o Late Sh. Narain Dass,
Aged 49 years,
R/o H.No. 4, Gali No. 9A,
Aggarwal Flats, Bank Colony,
Mandoli, Delhi – 093. (Group-‘B’)
56. Ms. Priya Ajay Nair,
D/o Sh. K. Govindan Nair
Aged 49 years,
R/o C-10/2:1,
Deepagar CHS, Sector 18,
Nerul (W), Navi Mumbai – 706. (Group-‘B’)
57. Thota Jagga Rao,
S/o Vimla Rao,
Aged 49 years,
Quarter No. 77,



A-Block, CGS Colony, Near Wadala PO,
Wadala West, Mumbai – 031. (Group-‘B’)

58. Ms.Gayathri K.,
D/o Shri Keshava B. Salian/
Shri Sudarshan Devadiga
Aged 44 years,
R/o 2-28/2, “Sri Ramanugraha”,
Mooduperara Church Road,
Ganesh Nagar, Ganjimata Post,
Mangalore- 575 144. (Group-‘B’)
59. Ms.Manju Malhotra,
D/o Sh. Saurabh Malohotra,
Aged 43 years,
R/o 6/23-B, Tilak Nagar,
New Delhi – 110 018. (Group-‘B’)
60. Ms.Jaya Nair,
D/o Shri T.A. Nair,
Aged 46 years,
R/o F-42, IB Colony,
Manas Marg, Chanakyapuri,
New Delhi. (Group-‘B’)
61. Deepak Kumar,
S/o Shri Suresh Chand,
Aged 43 years,
R/o WZ-93A, Mohan Nagar,
Pankha Road,
New Delhi – 110 046. (Group-‘B’)
62. Manoj Khurana,
S/o Late Sh. Vir Bhan Khurana,
Aged 45 years,
R/o A-39, New Lahore Colony,
Street No.-11-B, Shastri Nagar,
Delhi – 110 031. (Group-‘B’)
63. V Padmavathi,
W/o Sh. R.M. Venkatachalan,
Age about 52 yrs.



R/o 373, Duomarvel Layput,
Awantpura Road, Yelananka
Bangalore- 560069. (Group-'B')

64. Kamal Kishore Wadhwa,
S/o Late Sh. K.K. Wadhwa,
Aged 43 years,
R/o B-4/63, Sector-7, Rohini,
Delhi – 110 085. (Group-'B')
65. P.P. Bharathi,
S/o Sh. K. Parthasarathy,
Aged 44 years,
R/o Sudha Aishvarya Flats,
D-104/105, Hindu Colony,
22nd Cross Street, Nanganallur,
Chennai – 600 061. (Group-'B')
66. Kashina Soma Sekharam,
D/o Sh. K.Bhaskara Rao,
R/o 7th Floor, Plot No. B-2,
First Cross Road, CGO Complex,
Auto Nagar, Vijayawada. (Group-'B')
67. Surinder Kumar,
S/o Sh Megh Nath,
R/o 261, Chhabra Colony,
Ludhiana. (Group-'B')

All the applicants have worked or are working in the Intelligence Bureau as Personal Assistants except applicant at sr.no.2, 36, 54 and 64 who are working as Private Secretaries and are posted in various locations in the office of respondent No.2.

.. Applicants

(By Advocate: Shri Raman Sharma)

Versus

1. Union of India,
Ministry of Home Affairs,



North Block, New Delhi
through its Secretary.

2. Intelligence Bureau,
IB Headquarters,
North Block, New Delhi
through its Director.

.. Respondents

(By Advocate : Shri Y.P. Singh)

O R D E R (ORAL)

Justice L. Narasimha Reddy, Chairman

After arguing the O.A. at some length, learned counsel for the applicants sought permission of the Tribunal to withdraw the O.A., with liberty to file a better O.A.

2. Permission is accorded. The O.A. is dismissed as withdrawn. It shall be open to the applicants to pursue their remedies, in accordance with law. There shall be no order as to costs.

(Aradhana Johri)
Member (A)

(Justice L. Narasimha Reddy)
Chairman

/jyoti/