

**Central Administrative Tribunal
Principal Bench
New Delhi**

**OA No.619/2020
MA No.803/2020**

This the 3rd day of March, 2020



Hon'ble Mr. Justice L. Narasimha Reddy, Chairman

Hon'ble Mr. A. K. Bishnoi, Member (A)

1. Sudhanshu Shekhar Singh, Sr. Acctt.,
S/o Rajendra Singh, Age 38 years,
R/o I-901, Samridhi Grand Avenue,
Tech Zone-IV, Greater Noida West,
UP-201306, working as Sr. Acctt. in
Pr.cumPAO, MNRE, B-4, 9th Floor,
Antyodaya Bhawan, CGO Complex,
New Delhi-110003.
2. S. Sasidharan Nair Sr. Acctt.,
S/o Late V. Sasidharan Nair, Age 52 years,
R/o Q.No.624, Sector-V, Pushp Vihar,
MB Road, New Delhi-110017
Working as AAO (Adhoc) in PAD BSF,
M/o Home Affairs, Pushpa Bhawan,
New Delhi.
3. Anshul Tosh Pathak, Sr. Acctt.,
S/o Sh. Shrichand Sharma, Age 36 years,
R/o RZ-H-78 (T/F), Near Tagore School,
Sagarpur West, New Delhi
Working as Sr.Acctt. Central Pension Accounting Office,
M/o Finance, D/o Expenditure, Trikoot-II,
BhikajiCamaPlace, New Delhi.
4. Vidhaya Bhushan Kumar, Sr. Acctt.
S/o Narayan Prasad, Age -34 years
R/o 43-D, PushpVihar, Sector-4 Delhi 110017.
Working as Sr.Acctt. PAO, LHMC& SSK Hospital, 2nd
Floor, Admin. Block Opposite Shivajee Stadium,
Connaught Place, New Delhi- 110001.



5. Manish Kumar, Data Entry Operator, (DEO)
S/o DevendraPrasad, Age About 30 years
R/o Qtr. 112-J, Sector-IV PushpVihar, New Delhi -110017
Working as DEO, at CPAO, M/o Finance Deptt.
of Expenditure, Trikoot-II, Bhikaji Cama Place,
New Delhi.
6. Harish, Sr. Acctt. S/o Sh. Jai Bhagwan, Age:31 years
R/o Flat No. 922-23, Sec. A6 Pkt. 7, Narela, Delhi 110040.
Working as Sr. Acctt. M/o Earth Sciences, Lodhi Road
New Delhi.
7. Anshu Bhatnaagar, Sr. Acctt.
Wife of Sh. Robin Bhatnagar, Age 56 years
R/o B-301, Platinum Heights, Ramprastha Green
Ghaziabad
Working as Sr. Acctt. O/o Pr. CCA, CBDT,
LokNayakBhawan, Khan Market, New Delhi
8. Manpal Singh S/o Sh. Rambabu, age : 33years
R/o10/4 Gali No 16 Black 16 Block B KamalpurBurari
New Delhi,
Working as Sr. Acctt.404, PrithviBhawan, Ministry of
Earth Sciences, Lodhi Road, New Delhi 110003.
9. Ashutosh Kumar Sr. Acctt.
S/o Shrikant Singh, Age 32 years
R/o MahavirNagar Sangam
Chowk Delha Gaya Bihar 823002
Working as Sr. Acctt. RPAO IB MHA Shillong, Old
DGAR LaitumujhrahShillong -793011
10. Vipin Sr. Acctt.
S/o Surender Singh Age 35 years
R/o VPO Dhour, the BeriDistt. Jhajjar, Haryana,
Working As Sr. Acctt. FPU, CBDT, Income Tax, Office,
Block B, New CGO Complex NH4 Faridabad.
11. Awadhesh Kumar Yadav, Sr. Acctt
S/oParasnath Yadav; Age: 42 Years
House No: 113, NirmalKunj, Madangir Village,
New Delhi-62
Working as Sr.Acctt at PAD, BSF, C-wing
PushpaBhawan,New Delhi-62



12. Ajit Kumar, Sr.Acctt.
S/o Awadhesh Kumar Verma, Age-36
R/o F-629, Galaxy North Avenue II,
Gaur City II, NoiddaExtn.-201301
Working as Sr.Acctt at PrAO,M/o Health & Family Welfare,NirmanBhawan,New Delhi
13. Chandan Kumar Sah, Acctt.
S/o Late Prithwi Chandra Sah, Age-32 Years
R/o GPRA Type-II quarter, Quarter No:25,
Motinagar, Shillong,Meghalaya
Working as Acctt at PAO,AssamRifles, MHAShillong
14. Pooja Yadav, Acctt.
D/o Late Sh. Ram Prasad Yadav, Age 36
R/o 1472, Block-33, Sector-3, PushpVihar, New Delhi
Working as Acctt at CPAO,M/o Finance Deptt. Of Expenditure, Trikoot-II, Bhikaji kama Place, New Delhi
15. Rajesh Kumar Tiwari, Sr. Acctt.
S/o Ram Raj Tiwari, Age 35Years
R/o 114B1, Mohammadpur, R K Puram, New Delhi
Working as Sr.Acctt at CPAO, M/o Finance Deptt. Of Expenditure, Trikoot-II, Bhikaji kama Place, New Delhi
16. Manish kumar, Sr. Acctt.
S/o Satish Chandra Jha, Age :31Years
R/o Q.No.439, NH-4.NIT, Faridabad, Haryana
Working as Sr.Acctt at O/o CCA,
M/o Finance, North Block, New Delhi
17. Sukhbir Singh, Sr. Acctt
S/o LalanPrasad, Age: 32 Years
R/o H-61, AaliVihar, New Delhi-110067
Working as Sr.Acctt at Pr.com,PAO,MNRE,
B-4, 9th Floor, AntyodayaBhawan,
CGO Complex, New Delhi-110003.
18. Pintu Kumar Gupta , Sr. Acctt.
S/o Sh. Rajendra Prasad. Age 39
R/o Qr. 351, Income Tax Colony,
Pitampura, New Delhi 110034
Working as Sr. Acctt. O/o Pr. CCA, CBDT,

HQr, 9th Floor, LokNayakBhawan,
Khan Market, New Delhi

19. Sonam Chadha, Sr. Acctt.
W/o Sh. Arvind Chawla Age 32
R/o A-31, West Patel Nagar, New Delhi 110008.
Working as Sr. Acctt. O/o Pr. CCA,
CBDT, HQr, 9th Floor, LokNayakBhawan,
Khan Market, New Delhi

20. Navin Kumar, Sr. Acctt.
S/o Sh. Raj Kumar Age 46
R/o 21/7, Pocket-12 Sector-82, Noida Uttar Pradesh
Working as Sr. Acctt. O/o Pr. CCA, CBDT, HQr, 9th
Floor, LokNayakBhawan, Khan Market, New Delhi

21. Aruni Kumar, Sr. Acctt.
S/o Sh. AlakhDeo Narayan Age 35
R/o Qr. 441, Income Tax Colony,
Pitampura, New Delhi-34
Working as Sr. Acctt. O/o Pr. CCA,
CBDT, HQr, 9th Floor, LokNayakBhawan,
Khan Market , New Delhi

22. Aman Bahot, Sr. Acctt.
S/o Sh. Attar Singh Age 41
R/o Vill and PO:-KanganHeri, H. NO 255A,
Near S.K. Mother Dairy, New Delhi -71
Working as Sr. Acctt. O/o Pr. CCA,
CBDT, HQr, 9th Floor,
Lok Nayak Bhawan, Khan Market
New Delhi

23. Jagpal Singh Solanki, Sr. Acctt.
S/o Jai Ram Solanki Age :42
R/o Vill- Baprola, PO- Najafgarh, New Delhi-43.
Working as Sr. Acctt. O/o Pr. CCA,
CBDT, HQr, 9th Floor, Lok Nayak Bhawan,
Khan Market New Delhi

24. Aditya Godara, Sr. Acctt.
S/o Sh. Chetram Age :35
R/o AB 3801 Mapski Cosabella,
Sec- 82, Gurugram-122004
Working as Sr. Acctt. O/o Pr. CCA,



CBDT, HQr, 9th Floor, LokNayakBhawan,
Khan Market New Delhi



25. Rahul Rithesh, Sr. Acctt.
S/o Sh. Ram Dular Prasad, Age :32
R/o B-306 ASG Panache Appartment Ganga Nagar
Mawana Road, Meerut,
Working as Sr. Acctt. O/o ZAO CBDT,
CR Building, Bhansali Ground Meerut.
26. Amit Kumar Sr. Acctt.
S/o Sh. Roshan Lal Maurya Age 32
R/o RavechiJoyt Building, Plot No-6,
Sector 20, ULVE-410206.
Working as Sr. Acctt. O/o Aayakar Bhawan,
2nd Floor, Zonal Account Office, MK Road,
Church Gate, Mumbai -400020
27. Dheeraj Kumar Sr. Acctt.
S/o Sh. Rajendra Singh Age :40
R/o Rzf-102 Gali No. -31C Sadh Nagar,
Palam Colony, New Delhi-45.
Working as Sr. Acctt.,
Central Pension Accounting Office
ING Office, BhikajiCama Place, New Delhi-66.
28. Raj Kumar Sr. Acctt.
S/o Sh. Gurbachan Singh Age :50
R/o H. No. 45 B, Gali No. 6 Arya Nagar,
Delhi-110092.
Working as Sr. Acctt. FCRA(MHA)
MDC Stadium, India Gate Delhi.
29. Nitish Kumar, Sr. Acctt.
S/o Sh.Rajendra Prasad Age : 38
R/o 3rd Floor, house No. 36, Kh. No 870, Gali No.2,
Block-B1 Parvatiya Anchal,
Sant Nagar Burari, Delhi-84
Working as Sr. Acctt. PAO COAL,
3rd floor, Trikoot 2nd, BhikajiCama Place,
R. K Puram, Delhi.66
30. Trinatha Das, Sr. Acctt.



S/o Sh. Pramod Das, Age: 54
R/o H-32, Old AG Colony,
Bhubaneswar, Dist- Khurda, Odisha -751001.
Working as Sr. Acctt. O/o ZAO,
CBDT, Bhubaneswar

31. Jai Narayan Das, Sr.Acctt.
S/o Krishna Chandra Das Age: 29
R/o Plot No. 181, Saheed Nagar,
in Front of EPF Colony, Bhubaneswar,
Dist- Khurda, Odisha-751007.
Working as Sr. Acctt. O/o ZAO,
CBDT, Bhubaneswar Odisha.

32. Subhransu Kumar Mohanty, Sr. Acctt.
S/o Late Gour Kishore Mohanty, Age: 49
R/o Qr. No. 13, Type-C C.R. Colony,
Bhubaneswar Odisha -751007
Working as Sr. Acctt. O/o ZAO,
CBDT, Bhubaneswar Odisha

33. Bhole Shanker Sr. Acctt.
S/o Jagdish Singh Age : 36
R/o S-610, 3rd Floor Nehru Enclave,
School Block, Shankarpur, Delhi-92
Working as Sr. Acctt. O/o ZAO,
CBDT, New Delhi

34. Kiran Devi, Sr.Acctt.
D/o Vimal Singh Age : 32
R/o D-359, Shakur Pur, New Delhi-110034
Working as Sr.Acctt O/o PAO(DGW),
M/o H&UA,A-wing,Room No-236,
Nirman Bhawan,New Delhi

35. Shankar Saran Shukla, Sr. Acctt
S/o C. B. Shukla, Age :48
R/o House No A-627(AB), Ashray , Eldeco-2,
Raibareli Road , Lucknow-226025
Working as Sr. Acctt. O/o ZAO,CBDT, Lucknow,
Radha Kunti Bhawan, Madan Mohan Malviya Marg
Lucknow-226001

36. Ramendra Kumar Raman



S/o Shyam Lal Age : 37
R/o 135-F, PushpVihar, Sector-4
M B Road, New Delhi-17
Working as sr. Acctt. PAODGHS,
M/o Health & Family welfare
Room No.744 A, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi

37. Umesh Kumar
S/o Late Govardhan Prasad Age -48
R/o House No-4, EktaNagar, Chogitti,
Jalandhar, Punjab-144009
Working as Sr.Acctt. PAD, BSF,
Pushpa Bhawan, IIInd Floor
New Delhi-110062

38. Pinki Singh Acctt.
S/o Rajendra Singh, Age :37
R/o D-953, Street No 22 Bhajanpura Delhi-110053
Working as Acctt. Pr. Accounts Office F-wing 2nd Floor
Nirman Bhawan New Delhi

39. Abdul Hamid, Sr. Acctt
S/o Kutib Din, Age : 49
R/o H. No. 1522, Sector-7 PushpVihar
New Delhi-110017
Working as Sr. Acctt. O/o PAD BSF,
2ndFloor Pushpa Bhawn,
New Delhi-110062

40. Praveen Kaushik, Sr. Acctt.
S/o PremDutt Sharma Age :43
R/o H No. 32, BasantGaon, New Delhi-110057
Working a Sr. Acctt. O/o PAD BSF, 2nd Floor
PushpaBhawan New Delhi-110062

41. Hari Narain, Sr. Acctt.
S/o Sri Ram Surat Age37 years
R/o O-Block, H. No.139, Mangolpuri, New Delhi-83
Working as Sr. Acctt. Central Pension Accounting Office
ING Office, BhikhajiCama Place, New Delhi-66

42. Rakesh Singh, Sr. Acctt.
S/o Jaipal Singh Age :52 years
R/o House no. G, block 86, Sector 4,
Pushp Vihar New Delhi. Pin 110017



Working as Sr. Acctt.PAD BSF, 2nd Floor
Pushpa Bhawan New Delhi- 110062

43. Ashish Agarwal, Sr. Acctt.
S/o Satish Chand Agarwal Age: 34 Years
R/o House No A -44, back side,
Near Ram Mandir, Mohammadpur ,
BhikajiCama Place, New Delhi
Working as Sr. Acctt. CPAO, Depart. Of Expenditure,
Ministry of Finance, Trikkot -2,
Bhikaji Cama Place, New Delhi 110066
44. Nisha Yadav, Sr. Acctt.
D/o Ajit Kumar Yadav Age 33 Years
R/o H. No. 218, Poothkalan Gram Sabha,
Rohini Extn-110086
Working as Sr. AccttPAO, CRPFMHA, Rohini-86
45. Mihir Kumar, Sr. Acctt.
S/o DevendraJha Age-35
R/o B-18 Akashwani Staff Quarter,
Near Malwani Church HPT
Malad West Mumbai-400095
Working as Sr. Acctt. PAO,
All India Radio, Mumbai
46. Ajit HiramanVavhal, Sr. Acctt
S/o Hiraman ,Age 35 years
R/o Flat No 1, MahalaxmiDham, HSG Soc
Vaishali Nagar, Dasak,JailRoad,
Nasik Road-422101
Working as Sr. Acctt PAO,
Currency Note Press, Nasik road
47. Deepika Meena,Sr.Acctt
D/O Jai Prakash , Age 32
R/O 529, Pocket 5 ,MayurViharmPh-I,
New Delhi - 110091
Working as Sr.Acctt, PAO (NDZ),
M/O H &UA, I.P. Bhawan, New Delhi
48. Nipun Chandra, Sr. Acctt.
S/O Sh RAkesh Kumar Arun, age 32
R/O Road No. -3, Adarsh Nagar,
Phulwari Sharif, Patna- 801005

Working as SrAcctt. , PAO CBIC, Vadodara, 3rd Floor,
GST Bhawan, Race Course circle, Vadodara ,

49. Sh Yogendra Pal Meena, DEO
S/O Shri Mohal Pal Meena, age 39
R/O BhairuKaChabutra, Near Police Line, Alwar ,
Rajasthan-301001.
Working as AAO (Adhoc), CPAO, Trikoot-2,
Bhikaji Cama Place, New Delhi-110066

50. Sh Gopal Kumar,Sr.Acctt
S/O ShUmesh Singh, age 35
R/O B/12, Income tax colony, Khatwad Nagar,
Kamatwada, Nashik- 422008
Working as Sr.Acctt_ , Pr.CCA, ZAO,
CBDT, A/5 & A/6, Income tax colony,
Khatwad Nagar, Kamatwada, Nashik- 422008

51. Sh. Ashutosh Kumar Prajapati, Sr.Acctt
S/O Tulsi Ram Prajapati, Age 34
R/O New L.I.G-9 Barra-7, Kanpur (U.P) - 208027
Working as Sr.Acctt, PAO CBIC, Allahabad,
38 G Marg, Allahabad,

52. Sh Anuj Kumar, Sr.Acctt, S/O Dileep Kumar, age 29
R/O VPO - Kara Bazar, Near Post Office,
Distt- Kaushambi, UP - 212205
Working as Sr.Acctt, PAO CBIC, Allahabad,
38 G Road, Civil Line, Allahabad

53. Sh Pankaj Kumar, Sr.Acctt,
S/O Sh Shiv Shankar Prasad, Age :
R/o Akhara Road, Yaduvnshi Nagar,Digha Ghat,Patna
Working as Sr. Acctt. PAO,CBIC,Bhav Nagar
Siddhi Sadan, Plot No 6676/B-1
Satya Narayan Road,WaghWadi
Bhav Nagar-364001

54. Sh Santosh Jadav, Sr.Acctt,
S/O Sankar Rao Jadav, age 33
R/O 502 Siddnath residency Patel Colony 9,
Jamnagar, Gujarat
Working as Sr.Acctt, PAO Custom Preventive Jamnagar,
CBIC, 601 Milestone building Pachavati
Chowkbedibunder Road, Jamnagar, Gujarat.





55. Ms. Vandana Bisht, Sr.Acctt.
D/o Late Sh Mohan Singh Bisht, age 33
R/O D-15/6, DLF ankurVihar, UP -201102
Working as Sr. Acctt. , PAO RMLH, M/O Health & Family welfare , New Delhi
56. Milind Jadhav, Sr. Acctt,
S/o Balasaheb Shankar Jadhav Age 42 years
R/o 7, Mangaldeep Rao House,
Zail Road, Nashik-422101
Working as Sr. Acctt., ZAO, CBDT, Income Tax Colony, Khutwadnagar, Nasik.
57. Jitender Yadav, Sr. Acctt
S/o Sh. Ram Mehar Singh Age 34 yrs.
R/o 48, New Customs colony,
E-Block, Ranjit Avenue,
Amritsar, Punjab-143001
Working as sr. Acctt PAO Customs, C.R. Building,
Mall Road, Amritsar, Punjab-143001
58. Suman Kumar, Acctt. S/o Chandra Kishor Kumar
Age 34 yrs., R/o Flat No.105, Shakti Khand-2,
Indira Puram, Ghaziabad-201014
PAO, Revenue, M/o Finance,
Church Road, New Delhi.
59. Manish Kumar, Acctt.
S/o Abhimanyu Prasad Singh, Age-36 years,
R/o 35/06, Sec-1, Pushp Vihar, New Delhi
Working as Sr. Acctt., at CPAO, M/o Finance Deptt. of Expenditure, Trikoot-II,
Bhkiajikama Place, Dehi.
60. Gokaran Singh, Acctt. S/o Shri Kulo Singh, Age 37 Yrs.
Residence Address:- House no. 56-R, DIZ Area, Raja Bazar, Goal Market, New Delhi – 110001.
Office Address: PAO LHMC & SSK Hospital, 2nd floor, Admin Block, Opposite Shivaji Stadium, Connaught Place, New Delhi – 110001.



61. Seema Keshav, Personal Assistant
D/o Amar Chand, Age 36 years,
R/o F-22A, Om Vihar Extn, Uttam Nagar, Delhi
Working as PA, O/o chief Controller of Accounts,
M/o Agriculture & F.W., Krishi Bhawan,
New Delhi.

62. Alka Ravi, Sr. Acctt.
D/o Chander Prakash, Age 48 years,
R/o A-79, FFB, Ashok Enclave-II,
Sector-37, Faridabad-121003
Working as Sr. Acctt PAO, Room N0.54,
Vth Floor Wing-G, Krishi Bhawan,
New Delhi.

63. Manoj Kumar, Sr. Acctt.
S/o Shri Balwan Singh, Age 31yrs
R/o 32, New Custom Colony, E-block, Ranjit Avenue
Amritsar,Punjab-143001
Working as Sr.Acctt PAO, CBIC,
Customs CR Building,
Mall Road, Amritsar-143001

... Applicants

(By Shri D. P. Sharma, Advocate)

Versus

1. Union of India through Secretary, Ministry of Finance, Deptt. of Expenditure, North Block, New Delhi-110001.
2. The Controller General of Accounts, Department of Expenditure, M/o Finance, Mahalekha Niyantark Bhawan, GPO Complex, Block E, Aviation Colony, INA Colony, New Delhi ... Respondents

(By Shri R. K. Jain, Advocate)

O R D E R

Justice L. Narasimha Reddy, Chairman :

The applicants are working as Senior Accountants in the various offices, attached to the Controller General of Accounts, the 2nd respondent herein. Some of them are said to be holding the post of Assistant Accounts Officer (AAO) on *ad hoc* basis.



2. The promotion from the post of Senior Accountant is to AAO, on clearance of the AAO (Civil) Examination. The Examination comprises of eight papers. It is stated that relaxation was given to the participants in the Examination to the effect that in case a candidate scores certain percentage of marks in a paper, he need not repeat that, when he appears in the next Examination, to clear the remaining papers.

3. The 2nd respondent proposed to change the pattern of the Examination completely, and issued OM dated 15.01.2020 in this behalf. The detailed pattern of the Examination is also mentioned therein. In this pattern also, exemption is provided from re-appearing in a paper in which the candidate has secured 50% or 45% marks, as the case may be. The grievance of the applicants is that they are not permitted to carry forward the papers in which they have passed in the previous pattern of Examination. It is also stated



that the facility of extending the grace marks up to 10, is also done away with. This OA is filed challenging the OM dated 15.01.2020, to the extent it has disallowed carrying forward of the performance in the Examination conducted earlier, on the basis of the circular dated 08.06.2006. Direction is also sought for continuing the facility of addition of 10 grace marks.

4. The applicants contend that the AAO (Civil) Examination is a tough one, and hardly there are instances where a candidate cleared eight papers, at a time. They contend that realising the difficulty in clearing the Examination, the facility of carrying forward the cleared papers, as well as awarding grace marks, was provided, and it is being discontinued without any basis.

5. We heard Shri D. P. Sharma, learned counsel for the applicants, and Shri R. K. Jain, learned counsel for the respondents.

6. The Regulations for conducting of the Examination for appointment to the post of Junior Accounts Officer (JAO), which has since been re-designated as AAO, were framed in the year 2006. Regulations 7 and 8 thereof are relevant for the purpose of this OA. The same read as under:



“7. RESULTS/PASS MARKS:

A candidate who has passed all 8 papers and also qualifies the examination on Computers will be declared as Passed and will be eligible for promotion as Junior Accounts Officer. In order to pass in a paper a candidate should secure 55% (50% in the case of Paper-1 and Paper-4) where upon he/she will be exempt from reappearing in that paper. For SC/ST candidates the pass mark will be 50% (45% in the case of Paper-1 and Paper-4).

8. EXEMPTIONS:

Consequent to the introduction of the revised syllabus for the examination to be conducted from the year 2006 onwards, the exemption allowed to be carried from the existing subject of the old syllabus to the new papers in the revised syllabus will be as brought out in Annexure-III. Candidates who have passed the final examination of the Institute of Cost and Works Accountant/Institute of Chartered Accountants of India will be exempted from appearing in paper 8 on “Commercial and Management Accounts” of the Junior Accounts Officer (Civil) Examination Regulation 2006.”

7. From the above, it is evident that in case a candidate did not clear all the papers in an attempt, he need not repeat those papers which he has cleared earlier. Similar exemption, which existed prior to 2006, was also continued. The respondents have also provided for the grant of grace marks, in case that helped the candidates to clear a paper or the examination.



8. The respondents intended to change the pattern of the Examination in a substantial manner. The details thereof were furnished in OM dated 15.01.2020. Here again, the facility of exempting the candidates from re-appearing in the papers in which they have passed, is provided for under clauses 10.1 and 10.2. The grievance of the applicants is that the exemptions secured under the Regulations of 2006, are treated as not valid. Clauses 10.1 and 10.2 read as under:

“10.1 A candidate who passes any paper of the examination by securing 50% or 45%, as the case may be, will be exempted from re-appearing in that paper subject to the condition that such exemption will be valid for the duration of the permissible 6 attempts counted from the candidate's first appearance in any paper of the examination.

10.2 Exemptions secured under the Assistant Accounts Officer (Civil) Examination Regulations 2006 and/or earlier regulations will not be valid in the examinations to be conducted under the Assistant Accounts Officer (Civil) Examination Regulations 2020.”

9. It hardly needs any mention that it is always for the concerned Department, to evolve the scheme of the examination, and the Courts would loathe to interfere in such matters. When the pattern of the examination is completely changed, it would be difficult for the respondents to extend the benefit of exemption under the old pattern. Across the bar, the



learned counsel for the respondents has stated that some of the applicants are appearing in the Examinations for almost past two decades, and they were not able to clear them. We do not intend to delve deep into that.

10. It is not as if the facility of exemption from passing the papers is not provided under the new system. Once there is a radical transformation in the pattern of the Examination, the performance in the earlier Examinations cannot be assimilated into the new one. The applicants do not have a vested right to insist that they must be permitted to continue their appearance in the same examination for decades together. The respondents have every right, and in fact, are under obligation to step up the levels of efficiency. Acceding to the request of the applicants would lead to rewarding non performance.

11. We do not find any merit in the OA. The same is accordingly dismissed. There shall be no order as to costs.

Pending MAs also stand disposed of.

(A. K. Bishnoi)
Member (A)

(Justice L. Narasimha Reddy)
Chairman

/as/