

**CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL  
HYDERABAD BENCH**

**OA/020/238/2014**

HYDERABAD, this the 24<sup>th</sup> day of December, 2019

**Hon'ble Mr. Justice L. Narasimha Reddy, Chairman  
Hon'ble Mr. B.V. Sudhakar, Admn. Member**



- 1.. A.Raghupathi (CIN: 84299 ó R), Aged 57 years,  
S/o.A.R.Jagannadha Rao (Late),  
Working as UDC, ND(V),  
Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 14.
2. B.Gupteswar Rao (CIN: 83241 ó K) Aged 56 years,  
S/o.B.V.Ramana Rao,  
Working as UDC, ND(V),  
Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 14.
3. S. Kameswari, Aged 50 years,  
W/o.S.Lakshmana Murthy,  
Working as UDC, ND(V),  
Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 14.
4. P.Rajeswari (CIN : 84293) Aged 55 years,  
W/o.P.V.Babu Rao,  
Working as UDC, ND(V),  
Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 14.
5. Y.Venkateswar Rao (CIN: 84536 ó B), Aged 57 years,  
S/o.Bangarayya (Lsate)  
Working as UDC, ND(V),  
Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 14.
6. J.Syam Babu (CIN : 84298),Aged 56 years,  
S/o. J.Rama Rao (Late)  
Working as UDC, ND(V),  
Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 14.
7. M. Dharmayya (CIN: 83955 ó H), Aged 56 years,  
S/o. M.Kameswara Rao (Late)  
Working as UDC, ND(V),  
Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 14.



8. T.V.Apparao (CIN: 83082 ó Z), Aged 57 years,  
S/o.T.Dharma Rao (Late)  
Working as UDC, ND(V),  
Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 14.
9. NGVS Balaram (CIN: 1932), Aged 57 years,  
S/o.N.Sankara Sastry,  
Working as UDC, ND(V),  
Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 14.
10. P.V.Satyanarayana (CIN: 83250), Aged 57 years,  
S/o.Ramanaidu,  
Working as UDC, ND(V),  
Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 14.
11. A.V.Satyavathi (CIN: 83355 ó W), Aged 50 years,  
W/o.A.N.Rao,  
Working as UDC, ND(V),  
Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 14.
12. D.Sarada Devi (CIN: 84176 ó K), Aged 55 years,  
W/o.D.Varaha Narasimham,  
Working as UDC, ND(V),  
Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 14.
13. Polamarasetti Appa Rao (CIN: 83288 óT), Aged 56 years,  
S/o.P.Jagga Rao,  
Working as UDC, ND(V),  
Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 14.
14. R.Chandra Rao, (CIN : 83345) Aged 57 years,  
S/o.R.Kaliprasad,  
Working as UDC, ND(V),  
Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 14.
15. M.Surya Chandra Rao, (CIN: 83356 ó Y), Aged 56 years,  
S/o.M.V.Satyanarayana, (Late)  
Working as UDC, ND(V),  
Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 14.
16. Manju Sah(CIN: 84111 ó N), Aged 50 years,  
W/o.Bijay Kumar Sah  
Working as UDC, ND(V),  
Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 14.



17. DP Patnaik (CIN: 84888 ó B), Aged 54 years,  
S/o.R.Sanyasi Rao Patnaik (Late)  
Working as UDC, ND(V),  
Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 14.

18. K.Rama Shankar (CIN: 83380), Aged 57 years,  
S/o.K.Gavara Setti,  
Working as UDC, ND(V),  
Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 14.

19. B.V.Ramana Murthy (CIN: 84307 ó H), Aged 56 years,  
S/o.B.Kanaka Babu (Late),  
Working as UDC, ND(V),  
Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 14.

20. N.Mohan Rao (CIN ó 83480 ó B) Aged about 54 years,  
S/o.N.Bheshmudu (Late)  
Working as UDC, ND(V)  
Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 14.

1. Applicants

(By Advocate: Mr.K.Ram Murthy)

Vs.

1. The Union of India, Rep. by its Secretary,  
Ministry of Defence, South Block, New Delhi ó 110011..
2. The Chief of Naval Staff, Naval Headquarters,  
South Block, New Delhi ó 11011.
3. The Flag Officer Commanding- in-Chief  
Headquarters, Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 530 014.
4. The Chief Staff Officer (Personnel & Administration)  
Headquarters, Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 530 014.
5. The Command Civilian Personnel Officer,  
Headquarters, Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 530 014.
6. The Admiral Superintendent,  
Naval Dockyard,  
Eastern Naval Command,  
Visakhapatnam ó 530 014.

...Respondents

(By Advocate: Mr.M.Brahmna Reddy,  
Sr. PC to CG

## **O R D E R (ORAL)**

**Hon'ble Mr. Justice L. Narasimha Reddy, Chairman**



The applicants are working as Upper Division Clerks in the Civilian Establishment of Indian Navy. The Conference of Civilian Administrative Officers of Navy, which met in the year 2012, expressed the view that there is every justification for the direct recruit LDCs to be promoted to the post of Office Superintendent, on completion of 25 ó 30 years of service. The same was issued in the form of a statement on 24.06.2013. Recommendations were made for promoting the LDCs & UDCs, who have completed 25 ó 30 years of service, to the post of Office Superintendent. This O.A. is filed with a prayer to direct the respondents to implement the said recommendations, and to consider their representation made in this behalf.

2. The respondents filed a reply, stating that the representation of the applicants is under consideration. Thereafter, another counter affidavit is filed, stating that the proposals were forwarded to the Department of Personnel & Training, and that in turn, has rejected the same in the year 2015 itself.

3. We heard Sri K. Ram Murthy, learned counsel for the applicants and Sri M. Brahma Reddy, learned counsel for the respondents.

4. The applicants state that there is undue stagnation in the Civilian Establishment of the Navy and the Administrative Officers also felt the need to provide for promotion of LDCs & UDCs to the post of Office Superintendent, on completion of 25 ó 30 years of service. Howsoever

reasonable, the recommendation may appear to be, the fact remains that the employees are already compensated for stagnation, by extending the benefit of ACP & MACP. Obviously by taking that into account, the DOPT rejected the proposal for promotion. The applicants are not able to point out any specific provisions of law or Recruitment Rules that provide for such a promotion.



5. We do not find any merit in the O.A. and it is accordingly dismissed. There shall be no order as to costs.

**(B.V. SUDHAKAR)**  
**MEMBER (ADMN.)**

**(JUSTICE L. NARASIMHA REDDY)**  
**CHAIRMAN**

/pv/