

**CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL  
ERNAKULAM BENCH**

**ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 180/00692 of 2015**

**Thursday, this the 16<sup>th</sup> day of January, 2020**

**CORAM**

**Hon'ble Mr.Ashish Kalia, Judicial Member**

Benny Chinnappan, aged 49 years  
S/o.M.K.Chinnappan  
Director, O/o CCA, Department of Telecommunications  
Trivandrum, Permanent Resident of TC XIII/265(4),  
Bethel, Umbavu Avenue, Nallankara  
Nattissery P.O, Trichur, Kerala ... Applicant

(By Advocate Mr.Shafik M.A)

**Versus**

1. Union of India represented by its Secretary  
Department of Telecommunications  
Sanchar Bhawan, 20 Ashoka Road  
New Delhi – 110 001
2. The Director (Policy)  
Department of Telecommunications  
Sanchar Bhawan, 20 Ashoka Road,  
New Delhi – 110 001
3. The Chairman cum Managing Director  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited  
New Delhi – 110 001
4. The Deputy Secretary (BP)  
Department of Telecommunications  
Sanchar Bhawan  
20, Ashoka Road, New Delhi – 110 001
5. The Controller of Communication Accounts  
Kerala Circle, Department of Telecommunications  
Door Sanchar Bhawan, PMG Junction  
Trivandrum – 695 033 ..... Respondents

(By Advocate, Mr.N.Anilkumar,SCGSC for R 1,2,4 & 5 and Mr.Thomas Mathew Nellimootil for R3)

.2.

This application having been heard on 16<sup>th</sup> January, 2020, the Tribunal on the same day delivered the following :

**O R D E R (ORAL)**

**HON'BLE Mr.ASHISH KALIA, JUDICIAL MEMBER**

As the reliefs prayed for in this Original Application has already been granted to the applicant, the Original Application is closed. No costs.

**(ASHISH KALIA)  
JUDICIAL MEMBER**

**sv**

**List of Annexures**

Annexure A1 - True copy of the Order No.A-11013/7/2013-Abs.Cell dated 21.8.2015 issued by the 4<sup>th</sup> respondent

Annexure A2 - True copy of the order No.400-165/2011-Pers.I (Pt) dated 24.8.2015 issued by the Jt.General Manager (Pers) of the 3<sup>rd</sup> respondent

Annexure A3 - True copy of the letter No.A-11013/33/2011-Absorption Cell dated 3.11.2011 issued by the 1<sup>st</sup> respondent

Annexure A4 - True copy of judgement dated 17.4.2012, of the Hon'ble High Court of Delhi in WP(C) Nos.22515-22518/2015 and CM No.14692-14694/2005

Annexure A5 - True copy of the letter No.A-11013/64/2012-Abs.Cell dated 11.3.2013 issued by the 1<sup>st</sup> respondent

Annexure A6 - True copy of the letter No.A-11013/64/2012-Abs.Cell(V) dated 11.3.2013 issued by the 1<sup>st</sup> respondent

Annexure A7 - True copy of the letter A.11013/64/2012-Abs.Cell(I) dated 11.3.2013 issued by the 1<sup>st</sup> respondent

Annexure A8 - True copy of the letter A-11013/64/2012-Abs.Cell (II-A) dated 11.3.2013 issued by the 1<sup>st</sup> respondent

Annexure A9 - True copy of the judgement dated 18.12.2014 in Cont.Case (c) No.243/2013 of the Delhi High Court

Annexure A10 - True copy of the order No.A-11013/7/2013-Abs.Cell dated 24.7.2015 issued by the 1<sup>st</sup> respondent

Annexure A11 - True copy of the representation dated 3.8.2015 submitted by the applicant

Annexure A12 - True copy of the representation dated 5.8.2015 submitted by the applicant

Annexure A13 - True copy of the representation dated 11.8.2015 submitted by the applicant

Annexure A14 - True copy of the OM No.AB-14017/2/07-Estt(RR) dated 29.2.2008 issued by the DoPT

.4.

Annexure A15 - True copy of the Order dated 31.3.2015 in O.A 050/00913/2014 of the Patna Bench of this Hon'ble Tribunal

Annexure R1 - True copy of the Affidavit filed in CCP No.243/2013 in W.P(C) No.22515/2005

Annexure R2 - True copy of the Order dated 21.5.2015.

---