



**CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL
CHANDIGARH BENCH**

O.A.NO.060/01228/2019 ETC.

(Order reserved on: 19.02.2020)

Pronounced on: this the 5th day of June, 2020

HON'BLE MR. SANJEEV KAUSHIK, MEMBER (J)

(I) O.A.NO.060/01228/2019

1. MES No.372437, Gurmit Singh S/o Sh. Kewal Singh, aged 54 years, working as Elect-HS-II.
2. MES No.370844 Vijay Pal Singh S/o Sh. Nasib Singh, aged 56 years, working as FGM-HS-I.
3. MES No.373178 Sukhvinder Pal S/o Sh. Parkash Singh, aged 52 years, working as FGM-HS-II.
4. MES No.373867 Bias Dev S/o Sh. Malkiat Singh, aged 54 years, working as FGM-HS-II.
5. MES No.374992 Surinder Singh S/o Sh. Nasib Singh, aged 44 years, working as FGM-SK.
6. MES No.508213 Balbir Singh S/o Sh. Resham Singh, aged 52 years, working as FGM-HS-II.
7. MES no.337347 Gurjant Singh S/o Sh. Gurnek, aged 27 years, working as Mate Fitter
8. MES No.377349 Virender Singh S/o Sh. Jai Pal Singh, aged 26 years, working as Mate FGM.
9. MES No.370357 Willson S/o Sh. Ram Rashpal, aged 55 years, working as FGM-SK
10. MES No.374672 Sukhdev Singh S/o Sh. Phuman Singh, aged 40 years, working as FGM-SK.
11. MES No.375514 Arvind Kumar S/o Sh. Ram Sarup, aged 40 years, working as FGM-SK
12. MES No.375511 Francis S/o Sh. Parkash, aged 42 years, working as FGM-SK
13. MES No. 372436 Pervinder Singh S/o Sh. Charan Singh, aged 57 years, working as FGM-HS.
14. MES No.315935 Sarabjit Singh S/o Sh. Kuldip Singh, aged 38 years, working as Mate-FGM
15. A/No.86324008 Avtar Singh S/o Sh. Jarnail Singh, aged 52 years, working as Mate FGM.



16. MES No.316316 Perminder Singh S/o Sh. Avtar Singh, aged 38 years, working as Mate-FGM.
17. MES No.448233 Sat Pal S/o Sh. Amar Nath, aged 51 years, working as Painter SK.
18. T.No.1565 Balwinder Singh S/o Pritam Singh, aged 40 years, working as Mate FGM.
19. MES No.370358 Baru Ram S/o Sh. Bakshi Ram, aged 56 years, working as Carpenter.
20. MES No.371328 Balbir Chand S/o Sh. Bhag Singh, aged 53 years, working as Carpenter Mate.
21. MES No.368376 Gurnam Singh S/o Sh. Raj Singh, aged 59 years, working as MCM Ref/Mech.
22. MES No.377346 Jagsir Singh S/o Sh. Mukhtiar Singh, aged 34 years, working as Mate Refg/Mech.
23. MES No.377393 Nand Lal Yadav S/o Sh. Hari Yadav, aged 32 years, working as Mate FGM.
24. MES No.375672 Nirmal Singh S/o Sh. Opinder Singh, aged 37 years, working as Refg/Mech SK.
25. MES No.374990 Tilak Raj S/o Sh. Des Raj, aged 47 years, working as Mate Carpenter
26. MES No.368334 Amarjeet S/o Sh. Ram, aged 59 years, working as MCM Painter.
27. MES No.372322 Jatinder Mohan S/o Sh. Soma Nath, Working as Pipe Fitr-HS I.
28. MES No.370364 Gulshan S/o Sh. Sain Dass, aged 56 years, working as Mate Fitter Pipe
29. MES No.375148 Charanjit Kaur W/o Sh. Nirmal Singh, aged 58 years, working as Mate Mason.
30. MES No.374862 Kulveer Kaur W/o Sh. Harbans Lal, aged 52 years, working as Mate Mason
31. MES No.370365 Charan Dass S/o Sh. Ami Chand, aged 58 years, working as Mate Mason.
32. MES No.368708 William S/o Sh. Sohan Lal S/o Sh. Amar Nath, aged 59 years, working as Pipe Fitr SK.
33. MES No.372433 Tejinder Pal Singh S/o Sh. Ram Parkash, aged 59 years, working as Carp-HS-I.
34. MES No.368712 Surinder Pal S/o Sh. Banarsi Dass, aged 59 years, working as Pipe Fitr, MCM.
35. MES No.373595 Jagtar Singh S/o Sh. Vasdev Singh, aged 55 years, working as Mate.
36. MES No.373179 Tarsem Lal S/o Sh. Mangal Dass, aged 52 years, working as Mate.
37. MES No.370363 Prem Pal S/o Sh. Sohan Lal, aged 56 years, working as Mate Mason
38. MES No.600325 Kulwant Singh S/o Sh. Karan Singh, aged 56 years, working as Mate Mason.



39. A/No.1491017-H Sukh Pal Singh S/o Sh. Resham Singh, aged 45 years, working as Mate
40. MES No.372431 Kewal Singh S/o Sh. Malkiat Singh, aged 55 years, working as Mate
41. MES No.375422 Satnam S/o Sh. Rattna, aged 44 years, working as Mate Mason
42. A/No.188090-B John Patric S/o Sh. J.R. Ambrose, aged 58 years, working as Mate FGM.
43. MES No.370268 Amarjit Sharma S/o Sh. Shakti Ram aged 58 years, working as MCM FGM.
44. MES No.13746510 Gurmail Chand S/o Sh. Tulsi Ram, aged 59 years, working as Elect SK.
45. MES No.372432 Ram Lubhaya S/o Sh. Sant Ram, aged 58 years, working as FGM SK.
46. MES No.375692 Amarjit Singh S/o Sh. Bhulla Ram, aged 38 years, working as Mate Elect.
47. MES No.375517 Vikram S/o Sh. Kuku Raj, aged 40 years, working as FGM SK.
48. MES No.372435 Rash Pal Singh S/o Sh. Sadhu Singh, aged 57 years, working as Vehicle Mech-HS-I.
49. MES No.375513 Balwant Singh S/o Sh. Ajit Singh, aged 40 years, working as FGM SK.
50. A/No.1490241-H Harwinder Singh S/o Sh. Surjit Singh, aged 42 years, working as Mate Veh Mech.
51. A/No.1494115-N Satjinder Singh S/o Sh. Ranjit Singh, aged 43 years, working as Mate Veh Mech.
52. MES No. 316207 Amarjit Paul S/o Sh. Chaman Lal, aged 45 years, working as Mate FGM.
53. MES No.377348 Rahul Sharma S/o Sh. Rakesh Sharma, aged 28 years, working as Mate Elect.
54. MES No.375518 Girdhari Lal S/o Sh. Prem Chand, aged 40 years, working as Elect SK.
55. MES No. 370373 Satpal S/o Sh. Lal Chand, aged 57 years, working as Elect. SK.
56. MES No.1585363 Bagga Singh S/o Sh. Naranjan Singh, aged 53 years, working as Mate Elect.
57. MES No.372852 Ramjee S/o Sh. Mengha Ram, aged 54 years, working s Elect. SK.
58. MES No. 375516 Dharminder Kumar S/o Sh. Shanti Parkash, aged 40 years, working as FGM. SK.
59. MES No.374861 Avtar Singh S/o Sh. Jit Ram, aged 52 years, working as Elect. SK.
60. MES No. 370371 Jaswinder Singh S/o Sh. Swran Singh, aged 61 years C/o Parwinder Singh # 629/15, MES Colony, Adampur-144106.



61. MES No.373613 Sohan Lal S/o Sh. Pritam Chand, aged 61 years, C/o Parwinder Singh # 629/15, MES Colony, Adampur-144106.
62. A/No. 1089495 Keshav Singh S/o Sh. Narotam Singh, aged 50 years, working as FGM SK (All the applicants are Group-C employees) and working in the office of the Garrison Engineer (AF), Adampur-144106 except applicant No.60 & 61).

....

Applicants

Versus

1. Union of India through its Secretary, Ministry of Defence, South Block, New Delhi-110001.
2. Engineer-in-Chief, Military Engineer Service, Integrated HQs, Kashmir Gate, New Delhi-110011.
3. Chief Engineer, Head Quarters, MES, Western Command, Chandimandir-Panchkula-134107.
4. HQ, Commander Works Engineer, MES, Jalandhar-144001.
5. Garrison Engineer (Air Force), Adampur (Punjab)-144103.
6. Principal Controller of Defence Accounts (Western Command), Sector-9, Chandigarh-160009.

...

Respondents

**PRESENT: MR. K.B. SHARMA, ADVOCATE,
FOR APPLICANTS.
MR. SANJAY GOYAL, ADVOCATE,
FOR THE RESPONDENTS.**

(II) O.A.NO.060/1298/2019

1. MES No. 375950, Kamal Chugh, S/o Late Sh. Balkrishan Chugh, aged 32 years, working as RM SK, O/o Garrison Engineer, Air Force, MC, 3BRD, Chandigarh, Group-C.
2. MES No. 483929, Manoj Kumar, S/o Sh. Chander Singh, aged 32 years, working as FGMSK, O/o Garrison Engineer, Air Force, 12 Wing, Chandigarh, Group-C.



3. MES No. 376193, Rajesh Kumar, S/o Sh. Sabhajeet Singh, aged 28 years, working as Mate (Carpenter), O/o Garrison Engineer, Air Force, 12 Wing, Chandigarh, Group-C.
4. MES No. 4187672N, Dharmendar, S/o Sh. Ram Kumar, aged 44 years, working as FGM SK, O/o Garrison Engineer, Air Force, 12 Wing, Chandigarh, Group-C.
5. MES No. 3685852, Yoginder Nath, S/o Sh. Atma Ram Sharma, aged 59 years, working as Carpenter HS-I, Group-C.
6. MES No. 371311, Devi Dayal, S/o Sh. Niharkhu Ram, aged 58 years, working as FGM HS-I, Group-C.
7. MES No. 376876, Sanjeev Kumar, S/o Sh. Durga Ram, aged 39 years, working as Mate FGM, Group-C.
8. MES No. 376723, Rupinder Singh, S/o Sh. Kanwar Singh Kanwar, aged 32 years, working as Mate FGM, Group-C.
9. MES No. 376725, Manish Singh Hada, S/o Sh. Babu Singh Hada, aged 27 years, working as Mate Elect., Group-C.
10. MES No. 376726, Ravinder Kumar, S/o Sh. Babar Bhan, aged 27 years, working as Mate Elect., Group-C.
11. MES No. 376924, Brijesh Kumar Yadav, S/o Sh. Krishna Yadav, aged 32 years, working as Mate FGM, Group-C.
12. MES No. 1489856F, Jagat Ram, S/o Sh. Deewan Chand, aged 46 years, working as Mate Carp., Group-C.
13. MES No. 1490671M, Sanjeev Kumar, S/o Sh. Ranjeet Singh, aged 27 years, working as Mate P/Ftr, Group-C.
From Sr. No. 5 to 13, all are working in the O/o Assistant Garrison Engineer, B/R, Air Force, Kasauli, H.P.- 173204
14. MES No. 373769, Avtar Singh, S/o Sh. Bhagwan Singh, aged 58 years, working as Elect HS-I, Group-C.
15. MES No. 372556, Rajinder Singh, S/o Late Sh. Sher Singh, aged 55 years, working as Elect SK, Group-C.



16. MES No. 375192, Nirmal Singh, S/o Late Sh. Jeet Singh, aged 45 years, working as FGM SK, Group-C.
17. MES No. 375252, Ranjit Singh, S/o Late Sh. Sukhdev Singh, aged 48 years, working as FGM SK, Group-C.
18. MES No. 370511, Sucha Ram, S/o Late Sh. Mehar Chand, aged 57 years, working as FGM SK, Group-C.
19. MES No. 373123, Srujit Singh, S/o Sh. Rajender Singh, aged 55 years, working as Elect SK, Group-C.
20. MES No. 371056, Sum Massi, S/o Late Sh. Nisar Massi, aged 57 years, working as Elect SK, Group-C.
21. MES No. 376191, Dambarudhar Nayak, S/o Sh. Kusa Nayak, aged, 31 years, working as Mate Painter, Group-C.
22. MES No. 208848, Surender Singh, S/o Late Sh. Raj Kumar, aged 30 years, working as Mate Elect, Group-C.
23. MES No. 377235, Rishab Singh, S/o Sh. Waryam Singh, aged 26 years, working as Mate FGM, Group-C.
24. MES No. 208842, Ram Parkash, S/o Late Sh. Hardam Singh, aged 32 years, working as Mate FGM, Group-C.
25. MES No. 3755602, Harwinder Singh, S/o Sh. Gurdev Singh, aged 39 years, working as Elect SK, Group-C.
26. MES No. 376170, Namo Narayan Meena, S/o Sh. Maddu Ram Meena, aged 33 years, working as Mate Elect, Group-C.
27. MES No. 377246, Ravinder Verma, S/o Sh. Shyam Lal, aged 26 years, working as Mate, Group-C.
28. MES No. 120454K, Varinder Singh, S/o Sh. Diwan Chand Negi, aged 42 years, working as Mate, Group-C.
29. MES No. 377250, Rajeshwar Singh, S/o Sh. Parshotam Singh, aged 23 years, working as Mate, Group-C.
30. MES No. 371109, Naib Singh, S/o Sh. Ratan Singh, aged 56 years, working as Elect MCM, Group-B.
31. MES No. 370000, Mohinder Singh, S/o Sh. Narta Ram, aged 59 years, working as Elect HS-II, Group-C.



32. MES No. 370465, Rajpal, S/o Sh. Puran Chand, aged 54 years, working as Elect HS-II, Group-C.
33. MES No. 371438, Satish Kumar, S/o Sh. Birbal Dass, aged 54 years, working as Elect SK, Group-C.
34. MES No. 372608, Jangsher, S/o Sh. Din Mohammad, aged 54 years, working as P/Ftr SK, Group-C.
35. MES No. 376157, Amrik Singh, S/o Sh. Mukhtyar Singh, aged 35 years, working as FGM SK, Group-C.
36. MES No. 376168, Chetan Sarawata, S/o Sh. Gyana Ram, aged 32 years, working as FGM SK, Group-C.
37. MES No. 376159, Satish Kumar, S/o Sh. Shiya Ram, aged 30 years, working as Mate Elect, Group-C.
38. MES No. 140476, Sumit Kumar Mathur, S/o Sh. Sarvesh Kumar, aged 27 years, working as Mate Elect, Group-C.
39. MES No. 376207, Dharmendra Kumar Maurya, S/o Sh. Rajendra Prasad Maurya, aged 32 years, working as Mate Elect, Group-C.
40. MES No. 377247, Raju Parsad Maurya, S/o Sh. Shiv Prasad Maurya, aged 30 years, working as Mate FGM, Group-C.
41. MES No. 377226, Mohit Saini, S/o Sh. Gurcharan Singh, aged 27 years, working as Mate R/Mech, Group-C.
42. MES No. 376355, Hari krishan Rathore, S/o Sh. Uday Singh, aged 32 years, working as Mate Elect, Group-C.
43. MES No. 370509, Ramesh Kumar, S/o Sh. Chaman Lal, aged 57 years, working as Mason SK, Group-C.
44. MES No. 375105, Harnek Pal, S/o Sh. Lachman Dass, aged 43 years, working as Mate Carp., Group-C.
45. MES No. 373190, Pitamber Thapa, S/o Sh. Motilal Thapa, aged 56 years, working as Mate Painter, Group-C.
46. MES No. 376178, Sanjeev Kumar, S/o Sh. Satpal Singh, aged 35 years, working as FGM SK, Group-C.
47. MES No. 376194, Kamal Verma, S/o Sh. Nanku Verma, aged 32 years, working as FGM SK, Group-C.



48. MES No. 376183, Parveen Kumar, S/o Sh. Shiv Dass, aged 32 years, working as Mate Carp., Group-C.
49. MES No. 170003Y, Chander Mani Rana, S/o Sh. Gulab Singh Rana, aged 51 years, working as FGM SK, Group-C.
50. MES No. 1490306L, Pankaj Sharma, S/o Sh. Krishan Kumar, aged 43 years, working as R/Mech SK, Group-C.
51. MES No. 370269, Bhola Prasad, S/o Sh. Ram Lal, aged 59 years, working as Mason SK, Group-C.
52. MES No. 376189, Jaswant Singh, S/o Sh. Ramsharan Singh, aged 34 years, working as FGM SK, Group-C.
53. MES No. 376177, Jitender, S/o Sh. Om Parkash, aged 28 years, working as FGM SK, Group-C.
54. MES No. 376195, Suryakant Pandey, S/o Sh. Ram Nayak Pandey, aged 30 years, working as Mate Mason, Group-C.
55. MES No. 375591, Jasvir Singh, S/o Sh. Pal Singh, aged 39 years, working as Mate P/Ftr, Group-C.
56. MES No. 377243, Kismat, S/o Sh. Bikhu Ram, aged 28 years, working as Mate Mason, Group-C.
57. MES No. 374676, Mustakh, S/o Sh. Rukan Din, aged 57 years, working as Veh. Mech. SK, Group-C.
58. MES No. 373122, Vijay Kumar, S/o Sh. Buta Ram, aged 56 years, working as Elect MCM, Group-B.
59. MES No. 370289, Nirmal Singh, S/o Sh. Dhani Ram, aged 57 years, working as Elect HS II, Group-C.
60. MES No. 375603, Soni Lal, S/o Sh. Kura Singh, aged 39 years, working as Elect SK, Group-C.
61. MES No. 375604, Rajesh Kumar, S/o Sh. Jagdish, aged 39 years, working as Elect SK, Group-C.
62. MES No. 376155, Sunil Kumar, S/o Sh. Gharu Ram, aged 34 years, working as Mate Elect., Group-C.
63. MES No. 377238, Sonu, S/o Sh. Mahabir, aged 26 years, working as Mate FGM, Group-C.
64. MES No. 377228, Dharamvir, S/o Sh. Jagdish, aged 27 years, working as Mate FGM, Group-C.
65. MES No. 376200, Pardeep, S/o Sh. Multan Singh, aged 30 years, working as FGM SK, Group-C.
66. MES No. 372104, Sher Singh, S/o Sh. Dagar Singh, aged 57 years, working as FGM SK, Group-C.
67. MES No. 371879, Puran Singh, S/o Sh. Amar Singh, aged 55 years, working as Elect SK, Group-C.



68. MES No. 370896, Sant Ram, S/o Sh. Ratna Ram, aged 59 years, working as MCM Carp., Group-B.
69. MES No. 376154, Rajinder Kumar, S/o Sh. Satyanarain, aged 37 years, working as Mate Elect., Group-C.
70. MES No. 376357, Ranjan Kumar, S/o Sh. Ramesh Kumar, aged 26 years, working as FGM SK, Group-C.
71. MES No. 376202, Surendra Batham, S/o Sh. Tej Singh Batham, aged 28 years, working as Mate Carp., Group-C.
72. MES No. 376199, Pardeep Kumar, S/o Sh. Ran Singh, aged 27 years, working as Mate Carp., Group-C.
73. MES No. 376361, Kalyan Chand Sharma, S/o Sh. Krishan Kumar Sharma, aged 32 years, working as Mate R/Mech., Group-C.
74. MES No. 375016, Balwinder Singh, S/o Sh. Babu Lal, aged 46 years, working as Carp. SK, Group-C.
75. MES No. 373136, Ranjeet Singh, S/o Sh. Masta Singh, aged 58 years, working as Mason SK, Group-C.
76. MES No. 376160, Rajinder Sharma, S/o Sh. Chaman Lal, aged 29 years, working as FGM SK, Group-C.
77. MES No. 511369, Munna Lal, S/o Sh. Birender Singh, aged 31 years, working as Mate FGM, Group-C.
78. MES No. 375199, Nirmala Devi, W/o Sh. Bachan Bass Mistri, aged 50 years, working as Mate Painter, Group-C.
79. MES No. 377311, Lakshmi Devi, W/o Sh. Than Singh Verma, aged 42 years, working as Caneman, Group-C.
80. MES No. 376203, Parveen Kumar, S/o Sh. Gurnam Singh, aged 36 years, working as R/Mech. SK, Group-C.
81. MES No. 375162, Jasbir Singh, S/o Sh. Bakhtawar Singh, aged 48 years, working as Mate Carp., Group-C.
82. MES No. 370507, Hans Raj, S/o Sh. Sarwan, aged 59 years, working as P/FTR HS-II, Group-C.
83. MES No. 377229, Jitender Yadav, S/o Sh. Shubh Ram Yadav, aged 25 years, working as Mate FGM, Group-C.



84. MES No. 376197, Raj Kumar, S/o Sh. Kundan Lal, aged 31 years, working as FGM SK, Group-C.
85. MES No. 373378, Chander Prakash, S/o Sh. Babu Lal, aged 55 years, working as Mate Painter, Group-C.
86. MES No. 376162, Kulwinder Singh, S/o Sh. Maya Ram, aged 27 years, working as Mate R/Mech., Group-C.
87. MES No. 376181, Kuldeep, S/o Sh. Satender Kumar, aged 30 years, working as Mate Elect, Group-C.
88. MES No. 377237, Kuldeep Singh, S/o Sh. Chain Singh, aged 27 years, working as Mate Mason, Group-C.
89. MES No. 376169, Krishna Kumar Mourya, S/o Sh. Jagdamba Prasad Mourya, aged 28 years, working as FGM SK, Group-C.
90. MES No. 376182, Ajay Kumar, S/o Sh. Mahipal, aged 29 years, working as R/Mech. SK, Group-C.
91. MES No. 377249, Manoj Kumar, S/o Sh. Lal Chand, aged 24 years, working as Mate FGM, Group-C.
92. MES No. 376204, Dalip Kumar Jangir, S/o Sh. Ramesh, aged 26 years, working as FGM SK, Group-C.
93. MES No. 376174, Sandeep, S/o Sh. Rajender, aged 29 years, working as FGM SK, Group-C.
94. MES No. 376360, Dinesh Meena, S/o Sh. Hari Lal Meena, aged 28 years, working as Mate R/Mech., Group-C.
95. MES No. 377233, Sagar, S/o Sh. Rajender Kumar, aged 23 years, working as Mate R/Mech., Group-C.
96. MES No. 376187, Rinku Sharma, S/o Sh. Suresh Kumar, aged 28 years, working as FGM SK, Group-C.
97. MES No. 376156, Kuldeep Rathi, S/o Sh. Babu Ram, aged 26 years, working as R/Mech SK, Group-C.
98. MES No. 377242, Rohin Sharma, S/o Sh. Ram Lubhaya, aged 27 years, working as Mate FGM, Group-C.
99. MES No. 377239, Rohit Singh, S/o Sh. Karnail Singh, aged 30 years, working as Mate R/Mech., Group-C.
100. MES No. 376173, Manoj Kumar, S/o Sh. Subhash Kumar, aged 33 years, working as Mate B/Smith. Group-C.



101. MES No. 3988000Y, Kamal Deep, S/o Sh. Mansa Ram, aged 52 years, working as R/Mech SK, Group-C.
102. MES No. 376213, Rahul Kumar, S/o Sh. Balak Ram, aged 27 years, working as Mate R/Mech, Group-C.
103. MES No. 376161, Sajjan Singh, S/o Sh. Sohan Singh, aged 26 years, working as R/Mech. SK, Group-C.
104. MES No. 373878, Kashmir Singh, S/o Sh. Kehar Singh, aged 51 years, working as Elect SK, Group-C.
105. MES No. 373879, Bir Bahadur Rana, S/o Late Sh. Inder Bahadur Rana, aged 57 years, working as Elect SK, Group-C.
106. MES No. 374837, Harbansh Singh, S/o Sh. Surjeet Singh, aged 50 years, working as Elect SK, Group-C.
107. MES No. 376369, Mohit Sharma, S/o Sh. Mangal Sen Sharma, aged 31 years, working as Mate FGM, Group-C.
108. MES No. 376158, Lokesh Kumar, S/o Sh. Net Ram, aged 34 years, working as Mate Elect, Group-C.
109. MES No. 376212, Chaman Kumar, S/o Sh. Kishan Chand, aged 28 years, working as Mate Elect, Group-C.
110. MES No. A15358817, Karam Singh, S/o Sh. Dalip Singh, aged 54 years, working as FGM SK, Group-C.
111. MES No. 373141, Teja Singh, S/o Sh. Gurdial Singh, aged 54 years, working as MCM Elect, Group-B.
112. MES No. 376025, Ravi Shankar, S/o Sh. Kishori Singh, aged 30 years, working as Mate Elect, Group-C.
113. MES No. 375595, Ram Karan, S/o Sh. Ram Sukh, aged 39 years, working as Mate Elect, Group-C.
114. MES No. 373140, Hemraj, S/o Sh. Makhhan Lal, aged 54 years, working as MCM Elect, Group-B.
115. MES No. 377245, Prem, S/o Sh. Bhajan Singh, aged 25 years, working as Mate Elect, Group-C.
116. MES No. 376171, Sandeep, S/o Sh. Mange Ram, aged 31 years, working as Mate Elect, Group-C.
117. MES No. 373125, Davinder Singh, S/o Sh. Ranjeet Singh, aged 57 years, working as Elect SK, Group-C.



118. MES No. 376175, Manoj Kumar, S/o Sh. Jagga Singh, aged 37 years, working as Mate Elect, Group-C.
 119. MES No. 377234, Vinay, S/o Sh. Puran Singh, aged 26 years, working as Mate Elect, Group-C.
 120. MES No. 315403, Nek Ram, S/o Sh. Alam Ram, aged 47 years, working as FGM SK, Group-C.
 121. MES No. 15121506N, Rajesh Kumar, S/o Sh. Joginder Singh, aged 44 years, working as Mate Elect, Group-C.
 122. MES No. 372557, Gurmeet Singh, S/o Sh. Jigir Singh, aged 51 years, working as Elect SK, Group-C.
 123. MES No. 14860451F, Narinder Singh, aged 35 years, working as Mate R/Mech, Group-C.
 124. MES No. 376179, Amit Kumar, S/o Sh. Jagdish, aged 28 years, working FGM SK, Group-C.
 125. MES No. 376217, Hemant Kumar, S/o Sh. Suraj Bhan, aged 29 years, working as Mate Elect, Group-C.
 126. MES No. 373131, Balbir, S/o Sh. Dayal Ram, aged 57 years, working as FGM SK, Group-C.
 127. MES No. 376221, Sonu Kumar Ashutosh, S/o Sh. Dinesh Prasad, aged 25 years, working as Mate Elect, Group-C.
 128. MES No. 376190, Jai Parkash Pal, S/o Sh. Ram Chander Pal, aged 33 years, working as Mate Elect, Group-C.
 129. MES No. 376167, Khem Chand Meena, S/o Sh. Umraw Lal Meena, aged 33 years, working as R/Mech SK, Group-C.
- From Sr. No. 14 to 129 all are working in the O/o Garrison Engineer, Air Force, 12 Wing, Chandigarh-160003.
130. MES No. 373137, Harkesh Kumar S/o Sh. Sita Ram, aged 54 years, working as Refg Mech HS-I, Group C.
 131. MES No. 373135, Rulda Ram S/o Sh. Yad Ram, aged 55 years, working as RM HS-1, Group C.
 132. MES No. 373765, Shakti Ram S/o Late Sh. Amrit Lal, aged 32 years, working as Elect HS-I, Group C.
 133. MES No. 372718, Kuldeep Singh S/o Sh. Kehar Singh, aged 55 years, working as MCM Elect, Group B.
 134. MES No. 370504, Bansi Lal S/o Sh. Lekhraj, aged 59 years, working as Elect HS-I, Group C.



135. MES No. 373787, Takai Ram S/o Sh. Natay, aged 60 years, working as Elect SK, Group C.
136. MES No. 373782, Jarnail Singh S/o Sh. Gurdev Singh, aged 51 years, working as Elect SK, Group C.
137. MES No.373770, Karnail Singh, S/o Late Sh. Narata Ram , aged 57 years, working as Elect SK, Group C.
138. MES No. 371437, Nand Lal S/o Sh. Dwarka Prashad, aged 56 years, working as Elect SK, Group C.
139. MES No. 373786, Sushil Kumar S/o Sh. Ram Singh, aged 57 years, working as Elect SK, Group C.
140. MES No. 373138, Rajinder Singh S/o Sh. Amar Singh, aged 57 years, working as Elect SK, Group C.
141. MES No. 373788, Ram Asra S/o Sh. Yogeshwar Prasad, aged 56 years, working as Elect SK, Group C.
142. MES No. 373133, Ram Babu S/o Sh. Shri Pal, aged 57 years, working as Elect SK, Group C.
143. MES No. 374979, Tilak Raj S/o Late Sh. Manidutt, aged 46 years, working as Elect SK, Group C.
144. MES No. 374689, Dharam Pal S/o Sh. Hira Lal, aged 54 years, working as Elect SK, Group C.
145. MES No. 373761, Kuldip Singh S/o Sardar Sadhu Singh, aged 57 years, working as Pipe Ftr MCM, Group B.
146. MES No. 375599, Suresh Kumar S/o Sh. Lal Singh, aged 44 years, working as Pipe Ftr HS-II, Group C.
147. MES No. 373187, Avtar Singh S/o Sh. Sukhdev Singh, aged 54 years, working as Carp HS-II, Group C.
148. MES No. 375600, Harnek Singh S/o Sh. Gurdyal Singh, aged 42 years, working as Mate MTD, Group C.
149. MES No. 375442, Jaswant Singh S/o Sh. Shyam Singh, aged 53 years, working as Elect Mate, Group C.
150. MES No. 375592, Jagjit Singh S/o Sh. Jasbir Singh, aged 39 years, working as Elect SK, Group C.
151. MES No. 375622, Jarnail Singh S/o Sh. Ajmer Singh, aged 44 years, working as Mate Elect, Group C.



152. MES No. 375729, Naveen Kumar S/o Sh. Amar Singh, aged 35 years, working as Mate Elect, Group C.
153. MES No. 373958, Rachna Ram S/o Sh. Billu Ram, aged 59 years, working as Mate Plumb, Group C.
154. MES No. 374677, Rajesh Nahar S/o Sh. Banarsi Das, aged 49 years, working as Mate Carp, Group C.
155. MES No. 374807, Sanjay Kumar S/o Sh. Mohan Lal, aged 47 years, working as Mate Plum, Group C.
156. MES No. 375597, Sunil Kumar S/o Sh. Atma Ram, aged 49 years, working as P/Ftr (SS), Group C.
157. MES No. 370382, Raj Kumar S/o Sh. Ram Lubhaya, aged 57 years, working as RM MCM, Group B.
158. MES No. 373139, Yagyabahadur S/o Sh. Nav Bahadur, aged 55 years, working as Mason SK, Group C.
159. MES No. 375598, Sanjeev Kumar S/o Sh. Des Raj, aged 40 years, working as Mate P/Ftr, Group C.
160. MES No. A. No. 14860264H, Subhash Chand S/o Sh. Puran Chand, aged 38 years, working as, Group C.
161. MES No. 375972, Baljit Kaur D/o Sh. Surinder Pal, aged 31 years, working as FGM SK, Group C.
162. MES No. 375963, Chandan Kumar Prajapati S/o Sh. Narottam Ram, aged 33 years, working as FGM SK, Group C.
163. MES No. 375954, Vishu Madan S/o Sh. Baldev Raj, aged 31 years, working as Mate Elect, Group C.
164. MES No. 375969, Sukhdeep Singh S/o Sh. Harbhajan Singh, aged 37 years, working as FGM SK, Group C.
165. MES No. 375958, Vikash Kumar S/o Sh. Ramashish Singh, aged 28 years, working as Mate Elect, Group C.
166. MES No. 375951, Brijesh Meena S/o Sh. Ram, aged 30 years, working as Mate Elect, Group C.
167. MES No. 375964, Salman Khan S/o Sh. Salim Mohammad, aged 27 years, working as RM SK, Group C.
168. MES No. 375962, Hardeep Singh S/o Sh. Balwinder Singh, aged 30 years, working as Mate Elect, Group C.
169. MES No. 375965, Ajay Kumar S/o Sh. Balwant Ram, aged 29 years, working as RM SK, Group C.



170. MES No. 375971, Yadvender S/o Sh. Krishan Kumar, aged 26 years, working as FGM SK, Group C.
171. MES No. 375953, Pranav Kumar S/o Sh. Ram Dev Yadav, aged 31 years, working as FGM SK, Group C.
172. MES No. 15387751A, Ravendra Kumar Baghel S/o Sh. Raghuveer Singh, aged 44 years, working as FGM SK, Group C.
173. MES No. 14572364F, Achhar Muhammad S/o Sh. Dil Muhammad, aged 55 years, working as FGM SK, Group C.
174. MES No. 14387165F, Dharaminderjit Singh S/o Sh. Sarup Singh, aged 54 years, working as Mate P/Ftr, Group C.
175. MES No. 375952, Dharmendra Kumar S/o Sh. Kapil Dev Singh, aged 31 years, working as FGM SK, Group C.
176. MES No. 375960, Mohit Kumar S/o Sh. Subhash Chand, aged 27 years, working as Mate Elect, Group C.
177. MES No. 375968, Sandeep Kumar S/o Sh. Nityanand, aged 27 years, working as FGM SK, Group C.
178. MES No. 375955, Promod Kumar Nirala S/o Sh. Suresh Prasad Sahu, aged 35 years, working as Mate Elect, Group C.
179. MES No. 375970, Harkirat Singh S/o Sh. Karamkeet Singh, aged 33 years, working as Mate Elect, Group C.
180. MES No. 376923, Tejpal S/o Sh. Ramchander, aged 27 years, working as Mate FGM, Group C.
181. MES No. 376422, Abhishek S/o Sh. Raj Kumar, aged 28 years, working as Mate Elect, Group C.
182. MES No. 376424, Dhiraj Sharma S/o Sh. Tulsi Thakur, aged 27 years, working as Mate P/Ftr, Group C.
183. MES No. 377129, Surendra Kumar Meena S/o Sh. Babu Lal Meena, aged 31 years, working as Mate P/Ftr, Group C.
184. MES No. 370697, Harjinder Kaur, W/o Harbhajan Singh, aged 60 years, working as Painter SK, Group C.
185. MES No. 375966, Jitender Singh Meena S/o Sh. Rohitash Kumar, aged 30 years, working as Mate Elect, Group C.



186. MES No. 377131, Anil Kumar S/o Sh. Shriram Meena, aged 28 years, working as Mate P/Ftr, Group C.
187. MES No. 377143, Devinder Kumar S/o Sh. Anil Kumar, aged 25 years, working as Mate P/Ftr, Group C.
188. MES No. 377139, Rajat Khatri S/o Sh. Jaiprakash Khatri, aged 29 years, working as Mate P/Ftr, Group C.
189. MES No. 377150, Bikramjit Singh S/o Sh. Bhag Singh, aged 26 years, working as Mate P/Ftr, Group C.
190. MES No. 377152, Mukesh S/o Sh. Hari Nath, aged 27 years, working as Mate P/Ftr, Group C.
191. MES No. 377130, Harinder Pal Singh S/o Sh. Swaran Singh, aged 30 years, working as Mate REF MECH, Group C.
192. MES No. 377138, Kewal Singh S/o Sh. Chhotu Ram, aged 27 years, working as Mate REF MECH, Group C.
193. MES No. 377144, Arwinder Singh S/o Sh. Sudagar Singh, aged 25 years, working as Mate REF MECH, Group C.
194. MES No. 377142, Ravinder Singh S/o Sh. Krishan Singh, aged 31 years, working as Mate REF MECH, Group C.
195. MES No. 377145, Hardev Singh S/o Sh. Kashmir Singh, aged 25 years, working as Mate REF MECH, Group C.
196. MES No. 377146, Sahil Sharma S/o Sh. Arun Kumar, aged 24 years, working as Mate REF MECH, Group C.
197. MES No. 377147, Rajeev Kumar S/o Sh. Inderdeo Mandal, aged 31 years, working as Mate REF MECH, Group C.
198. MES No. 377151, Surinder Pal Singh S/o Sh. Jasbir Singh, aged 26 years, working as Mate REF MECH, Group C.
199. MES No. 377153, Jagraj Singh S/o Sh. Jeet Singh, aged 28 years, working as Mate REF MECH, Group C.
200. MES No. 377154, Sunil S/o Sh. Ramdiya, aged 24 years, working as Mate REF MECH, Group C.
201. MES No. 377133, Sonu Kumar S/o Sh. Gian Chand, aged 29 years, working as Mate Carp., Group C.



202. MES No. 377135, Jamil Ahmed, S/o Sh. Yamin Ahmad, aged 29 years, working as Mate Carp., Group C.
203. MES No. 377141, Sube Singh S/o Sh. Soji Ram, aged 29 years, working as Mate Carp., Group C.
204. MES No. 14410859, Jasmail Singh S/o Sh. Joginder Singh, aged 43 years, working as Mate Carp., Group C.
205. MES No. 377148, Gourav S/o Sh. Shanti Prakash, aged 28 years, working as Mate Carp., Group C.
206. MES No. 1582549W, Pritpal Singh S/o Sh. Kartar Singh, aged 48 years, working as Mate Carp., Group C.
207. MES No. 422003, Sanjay Singh Rawat S/o Sh. Kirpal Singh, aged 26 years, working as TT Elect SK, Group C.
208. MES No. 377136, Vinod Kumar Meena S/o Sh. Sita Ram Meena, aged 23 years, working as Mate FGM, Group C.
209. MES No. 377134, Sanjeev Kumar S/o Sh. Rajpal Saini, aged 36 years, working as Mate, Group C.
210. MES No. 373181, Balwinder Singh S/o Sh. Harbans Singh, aged 54 years, working as FGM (HS-II), Group C.
211. MES No. 375601, Vikas Chand Verma S/o Sh. Hukam Chand Verma, aged 41 years, working as FGM (HS-II), Group C.
212. MES No. 1566813P, Sukhdev Singh S/o Sh. Joginder Singh, aged 59 years, working as FGM (HS-II), Group C.
213. MES No. 377140, Krishan Kaushik S/o Sh. Rajender Kaushik, aged 25 years, working as Mate REF MECH, Group C.

From Sr. No. 130 to 213 all are working in the O/o Garrison Engineer, Air Force, MC, 3BRD, Chandigarh – 160003.

...Applicants

Versus

1. Union of India, through its Secretary, Ministry of Defense, South Block, New Delhi-110001.
2. Engineer in Chief, Military Engineer Service, Integrated HQ's, Kashmiri Gate, New Delhi-110001.



3. Chief Engineer, Head Quarters, MES, Western Command, Chandimandir, Panchkula, 134107.
4. Principal Controller of Defence Accounts, Western Command, Chandigarh, Jan Marg, 9-A, Sector 9, Chandigarh- 160009.
5. Head Quarter, Commander Works Engineer, (Air Force), Chandigarh-160003.
6. Head Quarter, Commander Works Engineer, (Air Force), Tughluqabad-110080.
7. Head Quarter, Commander Works Engineer, Hills Shimla, Jutogh Cantt. Shimla-171008.
8. Garrison Engineer (Air Force), 12 Wing, Chandigarh -160003.
9. Garrison Engineer (Air Force), MC, 3 BRD, Chandigarh-160003.
10. Assistant Garrison Engineer, B/R (Air Force), Kasauli-173204.

...RESPONDENTS

PRESENT : MR. RAJESH VERMA, ADVOCATE, FOR APPLICANTS.

MR. MUKESH KAUSHIK, COUNSEL FOR RESPONDENTS.

(III) O.A.NO.060/01301/2019

1. MES-375652 Rajiv Kumar S/o Sh. Darshan Pal, aged 41 years, FGM (SK).
2. MES-373856 Fulwinder Singh S/o Sh. Ajit Singh, aged 56 years, FGM (HS-II)
3. MES-371643 Jagir Singh S/o Sh. Bahadoor Singh, aged 55 years, Mate (Elect).
4. MES-372514 Surinder Singh S/o Sh. Gurbachan Singh, aged 55 years, Elect (SK).
5. MES-375255 Paramjit Singh S/o Sh. Amar Singh, aged 45 years, Elect (SK).
6. MES-371344 Sudesh Kumar S/o Sh. Malava Ram, aged 56 years, Mate (P/Ftr).
7. MES-371845 Hari Singh S/o Sh. Kapur Singh, aged 58 years, Mate (Mason)
8. MES-374548 Amrik Kaur W/o Sh. Balkar Singh, aged 55 years, Mate (Mason)
9. MES-374541 Ajay Kumar S/o Sh. Parkash Ram, aged 46 years, Mate (P/Ftr).



10. MES-370970 Balwinder Singh S/o Sh. Gurbachan Singh, aged 58 years, FGM (HS-I).
11. MES-376302 Kulvinder Singh S/o Sh. Randhir Singh, aged 33 years, Mate (Elect).
12. MES-376303 Ashish Kumar S/o Sh. Umed Singh, aged 29 years, Mate (FGM).
13. MES-376304 Kamaljeet Singh S/o Sh. Ranbir Singh, aged 31 years, Mate (FGM).
14. MES-376300 Dev Singh S/o Sh. Inder Singh, aged 34 years, Mate (V/Mech).
15. A.no. 1581251A Balbir Singh S/o Sh. Dalip Singh, aged 46 years, Mate (Carp.).
16. MES-370267 Amrik Singh S/o Sh. Bahadur Singh, aged 56 years, Elect (HS-I).
17. MES-373095 Varinder Kumar Singh S/o Sh. Laxman Singh, aged 55 years, Elect (HS-II).
18. MES-373092 S/o Sh. Amrit Singh S/o Sh. Sardar Karam Singh, aged 63 years, FGM (HS-II).
19. MES-507919 Kasturi Lal S/o Sh. Milkhee Ram, aged 58 years, FGM (HS-II).
20. MES-506072 Arvinder Singh S/o Sh. Pritam Singh, aged 56 years, FGM (HS-II).
21. MES-373084 Om Prakash S/o Sh. Veli Ram, aged 55 years, Elect (SK).
22. MES-373090 Mangal Singh S/o Sh. Dileep Singh, aged 55 years, Elect (SK).
23. MES-373091 Kashmir Singh S/o Sh. Hazara Singh, aged 55 years, Elect (SK).
24. MES-373093 Ashwani Kumar S/o Sh. Bihari Lal, aged 63 years, Elect (SK).
25. MES-315635 Jhirmal Singh S/o Sh. Lal Singh, aged 48 years, Mate (FGM).
26. MES-414018 Bhagwan Dass S/o Sh. Bant Ram, aged 39 years, Mate (R/Mech).
27. MES-376256 Narinder Kumar S/o Sh. Kartar Singh, aged 30 years, Mate Elect.
28. MES-376259 Sudarshan S/o Sh. Jamun Rawat, aged 27 years, Mate (Elect).
29. MES-376260 Ajay Rana S/o Sh. Mam Chand, aged 28 years, Mate (FGM).
30. A.No.1580404 M Dalvir Singh S/o Sh. Gurdial Singh, aged 47 years, Mate (FGM).
31. MES-376258 Naresh Kumar S/o Sh. Tilak Raj, aged 26 years, Mate (Elect).
32. A.No. 14269805H Rakesh Kumar S/o Sh. Onkar Singh, aged 52 years, Elect (SK).



33. MES-9804046 Roshan Lal S/o Sh. Batan Chand, aged 59 years, Mate (P/Ftr).
34. MES-375276 Avjinder Singh S/o Sh. Gurmej Singh, aged 46 years, Mate (Carp).
35. MES-374423 Vinod Kumar S/o Sh. Mathara Dass, aged 49 years, Mate (P/Ftr).
36. MES-314701 Surinder S/o Sh. Parkash, aged 49 years, Mate (P/Ftr).
37. MES-374540 Ashok Kumar S/o Sh. Om Parkash, aged 54 years, Mate (Carp).
38. MES-374543 Surinder Kumar S/o Sh. Madan Lal Gill, aged 52 years, Mate (P/Ftr).
39. MES-WC-5950 Tarsem Lal S/o Sh. Sohan Lal, aged 53 years, Mate (P/Ftr),
40. A/No.1492506A Lakhwinder Singh S/o Sh. Sarup Singh, aged 50 years, Mate (Mason).
41. A/No.1492006H Lakhwinder Singh S/o Sh. Surjeet Singh, aged 46 years, Mate (Mason)
42. A/No.1583371X Gurmeet Singh S/o Sh. Kaka Singh, aged 49 years, Mate (Carp).
43. MES-369437 Satish Kumar S/o Sh. Mehar Singh, aged 58 years, MCM 9painter).
44. MES-376257 Vinay Kumar Sharma S/o Sh. Veshnu Dutt aged 32 years, Mate (FGM).
45. A/No.1584198L Kala Singh S/o Sh. Ujagar, aged 48 years, Mate (Painter).
46. A/No.1582224H Gurmeet Singh Pawar S/o Sh. Dev Singh, aged 49 years, Mate (Carp.).
47. MES-315745 Dial Chand S/o Sh., Sohan Singh, aged 41 years, Sohan Singh
48. MES-369842 Sapan Kumar S/o Sh. T K Bhattacharya, aged 59 years, R/M (HS-I).
49. MES-369764 Rajpal S/o Sh. Hans Raj, aged 58 years, Elect (SK).
50. MES-370960 Kuldeep Singh S/o Sh. Ram Sharan, aged 56 years, Elect HS-II.
51. MES-368951 Sham Lal S/o Sh. Daulat Ram, aged 58 years, Elect (SK).
52. MES-375816 Vijay Kumar S/o Sh. Mehnga Ram, aged 44 years, FGM (SK).
53. MES-371337 Narinder Pal S/o Sh. Harnam Das, aged 57 years, Elect Mate.
54. MES-373896 Surinder pal S/o Sh. Tersem Lal, aged 53 years, FGM 9HS-I).
55. MES-369845 Sudhir Kumar S/o Sh. Lakshmi Narayan, aged 57 years, R/M (HS-II).



56. MES-369388 Deep Singh S/o Sh. Rattan Chand, aged 58 years, R/M (HS-I).
57. MES-506006 Balwinder Singh Randhawa S/o Sh. Geja Singh, aged 59 years. R/M (HS-II).
58. MES-376331 Balwinder Singh S/o Sh. Jasvir Singh, aged 26 years, Mate (R/M).
59. MES-376332 Rajeev Kumar S/o Sh. Man Chand, aged 32 years, Mate (R/M).
60. MES-376333 Shiv Kumar S/o Sh. Sham Lal, aged 27 years, Mate ()Elect).
61. A/No.15336284L Hardeep Singh S/o Sh. Ram Singh, aged 41 years, Mate (V/Mech).
62. MES-373075 Narinder Singh S/o Sh. Dillbag Singh, aged 54 years, MCM (B/Smith).
63. A/No.1441923 Ram Lal S/o Sh. Pratap Singh, aged 59 years, Mate (P/Ftr).
64. MES-375072 Ram Chandar S/o Sh. Kartara Ram, aged 51 years, Mate (P/Ftr).
65. MES-372438 Brij Bhushan S/o Sh. Harbans Singh, aged 59 years, Carp (HS-I).

(All the applicants are Group-C employees, working under the office of the Garrison Engineer (P), Kapurthala-144103).

....

Applicants

Versus

1. Union of India through its Secretary, Ministry of Defence, South Block, New Delhi-110001.
2. Engineer-in-Chief, Military Engineer Service, Integrated HQs, Kashmir Gate, New Delhi-110011.
3. Chief Engineer, head Quarters, MES, Western Command, Chandimandir-Panchkula-134107.
4. HQ, Commander Works Engineer, MES, jalandhar-144001.
5. Garrison Engineer (P), Kapurthala (Punjab)-144103.
6. Principal Controller of Defence Accounts (Western Command), Sector-9, Chandigarh-160009.

....

Respondents

**PRESENT : MR. K.B. SHARMA, ADVOCATE,
FOR APPLICANTS.
MR. SANJAY GOYAL, ADVOCATE
FOR THE RESPONDENTS.**

(IV) O.A.NO.060/01335/2019

1. MES No.375135, Harbans Singh son of Sh. Sampurn Singh, aged 55 years, working as FGM HS-II in the office of Garrison Engineer (North), MES, Sangrur Road, Patiala.
2. MES No.372631, Kulwinder Singh son of Sh. Kirpal Singh, FGM HS-I.
3. MES No.372629, Jaskewal Singh son of Sh. Gurdeep Singh, FGM HS-I.
4. MES No.372419, Karnail Singh son of Sh. Ram Rattan, MCM (Elect.).
5. MES no.375676, Jagseer Singh son of Ram Singh, Mate (SSK).
6. MES No. 374866, Balbir Singh son of Sh. Dyal Singh, Elect (SK).
7. MES No. 374816, Jaswinder Singh son of Sh. Sant Singh, FGM (SK).
8. MES No. 376008, Mukesh Kumar Gupta son of Sh. Gauri Shankar Prasad Gupta, Mate (SSK).
9. MES No.A/No.3392403H, Kulwinder Singh son of Sh. Charan Singh, FGM (SK).
10. MES No.375995, Brajesh Kumar Singh son of Sh. Bindeshwari Singh, Ref.Mech (SK).
11. MES No.370349, Bupinder Singh son of S. Foujdar Singh, Elect. HS-I.
12. MES No.373777, Karm Chand son of Sh. Amar Nath, Elect HS-I.
13. MES No.375770, Jaspreet Singh son of Sh. Shamsher Singh, Mate (Elect.)
14. MES no. 372418, Devender Singh S/o Sh. Mohidner Singh, MCM (Elect).
15. MES No.375991, Manish Pareek Son of Sh. Krishan Dutt Sharma, Mate (Elect).
16. MES No. 376425, Harwinder Singh son of S. Lakhwinder Singh, Mate (Elect).
17. MES No. 375846, Amrit Singh son of Sh. Labh Singh, FGM (SK).
18. MES No. 373540 Dalbir Singh son of Sh. Ikbali Singh, Elect (SK).
19. MES No. 370350, Audesh Ram son of Sh. Lakh Chand Ram, Elect (SK).
20. MES No. 376000, Mahesh Kumar son of Sh. Gauri Shankar, Mate (Elect).
21. MES No. 377164, Sandeep son of Sh. Parshottam Lal, Mate (SSK).



22. MES No. 375993, Kulwinder Singh son of Sh. Dilbagh Singh, R/M (SK).
23. MES No. 375996, Sh. Surjit Singh son of Sh. Manjit Singh, FGM (SK).
24. MES No. 370344, Amar Singh son of Sh. Mohidner Singh, P/F, HS-I.
25. MES No. 375997, Sudhanshu Kumar son of Sh. Uidesh Prashad, Mate (SSK).
26. MES No. 376001, Prabhakar Kumar son of Sh. Binju Sahu, Mate (SSK).
27. MES No. 701092, Akshat Duhan son of Shri Ram Kumar, Mate (SSK).
28. MES No. 376427, Subhash son of Sh. Bala Ram, FGM (SK).
29. MES No. 373539, Satpal son of Sh. Ganga Ram, Elect (SK).
30. MES No. 375130, Balbir Singh son of Sh. Tulsi Ram, Elect (SK).
31. MES No. A/No.9804049, Manjit Singh son of Sh. Ajaib Singh, Carp. HS-I.
32. MES No. 375137, Des Raj son of Sh. Jai Singh, Mate (SSK).
33. MES No. 375129, Suresh Singh son of Sh. Amrik Singh, Mate (SSK).
34. MES no. 375999, Ramavata Meena son of Sh. Ramesh Chand, Mate (SSK).
35. MES No. 370346, Karam Singh son of Sh. Iesher Singh, P/F (SK).
36. MES No. 374811, Kishori Lal son of Sh. Shab Sharan, MCM.
37. MES No. 373762, Ramesh Kumar son of Sh. Ram Sarup, MCM (P/F).
38. MES No. 375511 Jagmohan Singh son of Sh. Bishamber Lal, Mate (SSK).
39. MES No. 369816, Chota Singh son of Sh. Munshi Ram, Crpt. (SK).
40. MES No. 506187, Sh. Babu Singh son of Sh. Ajaib Singh, MCM.
41. MES No. 373775, Sh. Barkha Singh son of Sh. Naranjan Singh, FGM HS-I.
42. MES No. 373776, Sh. Harpal Singh son of Sh. Ajmer Singh, FGM HS0I.
43. MES No. 372420, Sh. Raminder Singh son of Sh. Karnail Singh, FGM HS-I.
44. MES No. 3737463, Sh. Sukhwant Singh son of Sh. Gurdev Singh, Elect (SK).



45. MES No. 14908904 Sh. Joginder Singh son of Sh. Swarn Singh, FGM (SK).
46. MES No. 370339, Sh. Gurmail Singh son of Sh. Maghaz Singh, Elect. (SK).
47. MES No. 374940, Shammi Raj son of Sh. Tilak Raj, Elect (SK).
48. MES No. 373546, Devinder Singh son of Sh. Sham Lal, Mate (P/F).

(All the applicants are Group-C employees)

Applicants No.1 to 39 are working in the o/o GE, MES (N), Patiala-147001 and applicants No. 40-48 are working in the office of GE, MES (S), Patiala-147001.

... Applicants

Versus

1. Union of India through its Secretary, Ministry of Defence, South Block, New Delhi-110001.
2. Engineer-in-Chief, Military Engineer Service, Integrated HQs, Kashmir Gate, New Delhi-110011.
3. Chief Engineer, Head Quarters, MES, Western Command, Chandimandir-Panchkula-134107.
4. HQ, Commander Works Engineer, MES, CWE, Patiala-147001.
5. Garrison Engineer (North), Patiala-147001. Kapurthala (Punjab)-144103.
6. Garrison Engineer (South), Patiala-147001.
7. Principal Controller of Defence Accounts (Western Command), Sector-9, Chandigarh-160009.

.... Respondents

PRESENT : **MR. D.R. SHARMA, ADVOCATE,**
FOR APPLICANTS.
MR. SANJAY GOYAL, ADVOCATE
FOR THE RESPONDENTS.

(V)O.A.NO.060/01336/2019

1. MES Civilian Workers and Employees Union (Regd.) through its General Secretary, MES No. 372979, Sh. Rajesh Kumar son of Sh. Jagdish Kumar, aged 55 years, present working as FGM Highly Skilled Grade-II, Office of Garrison Engineer (West), MES, Ferozepur (Pb).
2. MES No. 371092 Pardeep Kumar son of Sh. Lotan Ram, FGM, HS-II, O/o GE 9West), MES, Ferozepur (Pb).

Both the applicants are Group-C employees).

... Applicants

Versus

1. Union of India through its Secretary, Ministry of Defence, South Block, New Delhi-110011.
2. Engineer-in-Chief, Military Engineer Service, Integrated HQs, Kashmir Gate, New Delhi-110011.
3. Chief Engineer, Head Quarters, MES, Western Command, Chandimandir-Panchkula-134107.
4. HQ, Commander Works Engineer, MES, Ferozepur-147001.
5. Garrison Engineer (West), Ferozepur Cantt-147001.
6. Garrison Engineer (East), Ferozepur Cantt-147001.
7. Principal Controller of Defence Accounts (Western Command), Sector-9, Chandigarh-160009.

....

Respondents

**PRESENT : MR. D.R. SHARMA, ADVOCATE,
FOR APPLICANTS.
MR. SANJAY GOYAL, ADVOCATE
FOR THE RESPONDENTS.**

(VI) O.A.NO.060/01338/2019

1. MES No.376856, Jaspreet Singh son of Sh. Surjit Singh, Mate (SSK), aged 26 years
2. MES no.372573, Manjit Kumar son of Sh. Amarnath Puri, Elect. 9HS-I).
3. MES No. 372574 Resham Singh son of Sh. Harnek Singh, Elect. (HS-I).
4. MES No. 372572 Jagjit Singh son of Sh. Bachan Singh, Elect (HS-I).
5. MES No. 372576, Jasbir Singh son of Sh. Ujagar Singh, Elect (HS-I).
6. MES No.372569, Sushil Kumar son of Sh. Dev Raj, FGM (HS-I).
7. MES No. 506566, Gurmit Singh son of Sh. Lachhman Singh, FGM (HS-I).
8. MES No. 372577, Gurjit Singh son of Sh. Tarlochan Singh, FGM (HS-I).
9. MES No.371465, Ram Kumar son of Sh. Dal Bahadur, FGM (HS-II).
10. MES No.370579, Mangat Singh son of Sh. Lal Chand, Elect (SK).
11. MES No. 371577, Prem son of Sh. Bau Lal, Elect (SK).
12. MES No.314364, Ashok son of Sh. Sohan Lal, Elect (SK).
13. MES No.375404, Shakuntala wife of Sh. Bhagwan Dass, FGM (SK).
14. MES no.315779, Rajesh Kumar son of Sh. Gulzar, FGM (SK).
15. MES No.T-3311, Hari Singh son of Sh. Karnail Singh, Elect. (SK)
16. MES No. T-3319, Joginder Singh son of Sh. Phuman Singh, Elect (SK).
17. MES No.T-3302, Sunder son of Sh. Pyare Lal, Elect (SK).
18. MES No.373301, Gurcharan Singh son of Sh. Kundan Singh, Carpt. (HS-II).
19. MES No.371469, Hari Ram son of Sh. Nathu Ram, Carpt. (HS-II).
20. MES No.369049, Asgar Masih son of Sh. Danial, Mason (HS-I).
21. MES No. 372579, Nand Lal son of Sh. Ganga Bishan, Mate (Mason).
22. MES No. 369839, Jogjiwan Prasad son of Sri pal (Shree-Pal), B/Smith (HS-II).



23. MES No. 372584 Daljit Singh Khosa son of Sh. Kirpal Singh, P/fitter (HS-I).
24. MES No. 371102, Om Prakash son of Sh. Froji Lal, P/Fitter (SK).
25. MES No. 375007, Dalbir son of sh. Deputy Lal, P/Fitter (SK).
26. MES no.372581, Raj Kumar son of Sh. Ram Labhan, Mate (mason).
27. MES no. 375367, Nirmala Devi son of Sh. Karnail Singh, Mate (Carpenter).
28. MES No.372998, Rajesh Kumar son of Sh. Baldev Raj, FGM (SK).
29. MES No. 373844, Balbir Singh son of Lal Singh, Elect. (SK).
30. MES No.WC-5847, Tulsi son of Sh. Munshi Ram, Elect (SK).
31. MES No,.WC-5845, Harbans Singh son of Sh. Dalip Singh, Elect (SK).
32. MES No.370419, Mangal Singh son of Sh. Bhan Singh, FGM (SK).
33. MES No.314630, Budh Ram son of Sh. Bhule, FGM (SK).
34. MES No.370520, Lazar Son of Michael, B/Smith (SK).
35. MES No. WC-6140, Roop Lal son of Sh. Jodhi Ram, FGM (SK).
36. MES No. 372030, Ashok Kumar son of Sh. Mohan Lal, Painter (HS-I).
37. MES No. 371048, Sampson Anthony son of Sh. Francis, Elect (SK).
38. MES No. 316250, Kala son of Sh. Khaun, R/Mech (SK).
39. MES No. 314631, Ashok Kumar son of Sh. Chhote Lal, Elect (SK).
40. MES No.372568, Ravi son of Sh. Budh Ram, Elect (SK).
41. MES No. T-3280, Saravpal Singh son of Sh. Sukhdial Singh, Elect (SK).
42. MES No. 375795, Manoj Kumar son of Sh. Rama Kant, R/Mech (SK).
43. MES No.376859, Mandeep Singh son of Sh. Mahil Singh, Mate (SSK).
44. MES No.376857, Maninder Singh son of Hardev Singh, Mate (SSK).
45. MES No.376861, Ramandeep Singh son of Sh. Surjit Singh, Mate (SSK).



46. MES No.376858, Harpal Singh son of Sh. Kuldeep Singh, Mate (SSK).
47. MES No.376863, Kaushal Vats son of late Sh. Balwan Singh, Mate (SSK).
48. MES No.15336318N, Baljit Singh son of Sh. Joginder Singh, Mate.
49. MES No.15563843X, Gurmail Singh son of Nachhattar Singh, Mate
50. MES No.15563819F, Rashpal Singh son of Sh. Sher Singh, Mate.
51. MES no. 15563804, Jaswinder Singh son of Piyara Singh, Mate
52. MES No.376860, Sanjay Kumar son of Tulsi Ram, Mate (SSK).
53. MES No.372118, Baljit Singh son of Gurpal Singh, Carp. (HS-I).
54. MES No. 373304, Kailash Rani wife of Balwant Singh, Carp. (HS-I).
55. MES No. 376862, Anil Kumar son of Hardayal Singh, Mate (SSK).
56. MES No. 370430, Raj Kumar son of Shamar Mashi, FGM (SK).
57. MES No.T-77, Mohinder Singh son of Harman Singh, Elect (HS-I).
58. MES No. 388603, Raju son of Chhote Lal (Retd.), Elect. (HS-II).
59. MES No. 371457, Surjit Singh son of Jivan Singh, Elect (SK).
60. MES No.369242, Jectan Shah son of Sukhdev Shah, Elect (HS-I).
61. MES No. 315762, Rajesh Kumar son of Sh. Kishan Lal, Elect (SK).
62. MES No.371096, Balbir Singh son of Sh. Surinder Singh, Elect (SK).
63. MES No. 372984, Som son of Buta Ram, R/Mech (SK).
64. MES No.372024, Kanhayia Lal son of Ram Surap, R/Mech (SK).
65. MES No.372983, Radhey Sham son of Jageswar Ram, R/Mech (SK).
66. MES No.315659, Pawan Kumar son of Ravinder Kumar, R/Mech (SK).
67. MES No.373785, Sudesh Kumar son of Pyare Lal, Mate (Mason).
68. MES No.T-3301, Sohi son of Ditt, Mate (Pipe Fitter).



69. MES No.372094, Mangal Singh son of Puran Singh, P/Fitter (MCM).
70. MES No.315731, Lakhvir Singh son of Beant Singh, FGM (SK).
71. MES No.375813, Parminder Singh son of Hari Singh, R/Mech (SK).
72. MES No.376740, Manoj Kumar son of Surinder Kumar, Mate (Ref/Mech).
73. MES No. 371577, Harish Kumar son of Khan Chand, MCM. Painter.

(all the applicants are Group-C employees).

Applicants No.1 to 58 are working in the O/O GE (East), Ferozepur-147001.

Applicants No.59 to 73, are working in the O/O GE (West), Ferozepur-147001.

....

Applicants

Versus

1. Union of India through its Secretary, Ministry of Defence, South Block, New Delhi-110011.
2. Engineer-in-Chief, Military Engineer Service, Integrated HQs, Kashmir Gate, New Delhi-110011.
3. Chief Engineer, Head Quarters, MES, Western Command, Chandimandir-Panchkula-134107.
4. HQ, Commander Works Engineer, MES, Ferozepur-147001.
5. Garrison Engineer (West), Ferozepur Cantt-147001.
6. Garrison Engineer (East), Ferozepur Cantt-147001.
7. Principal Controller of Defence Accounts (Western Command), Sector-9, Chandigarh-160009.

....

Respondents

PRESENT : **MR. D.R. SHARMA, ADVOCATE,**
FOR APPLICANTS.
MR. SANJAY GOYAL, ADVOCATE
FOR THE RESPONDENTS.

(VII) O.A.NO.063/1339/2019

1. MES NO.507545 Vinod Kumar S/o late Sh. Jagdish Singh, aged 55 years, working as Painter-HS-I.
2. MES No. 369864 Hans Raj s/o late Sh. Mohan Lal, aged 58 years, working as Elec. SK
3. MES No. 370352 Chatro Ram s/o late Sh. Sant Ram, aged 60 years, working as FGM-SK.
4. MES No. 507532 Madan Lal s/o Sh. Puran Chand, aged 57 years, working as Elec. SK.
5. MES No. 507407 Prakash Chand s/o Late Sh. Rasalu Ram , aged 55 years, working as Elec SK
6. MES No. 507473 Tikak Raj s/o Late Sh. Bali Ram, aged 55 years, working as Valveman.
7. No. 006 Surinder Pal s/o Late Sh. Puran Chand , aged 50 years, working as Mate FGM
8. No. 766 Rajinder Kumar s/o Sh. Gian Chand, aged 49 years, working as Elec SK.
9. MES No. 20169 Karam Chand s/o Late Sh. Ghusnu Ram, aged 58 years, working as Mate Fitter Pipe.
10. MES No. 508236 Inderjeet s/o Late Sh. Sarwan, aged 57 years, working as FGM SK.
11. MES No. 508242 Subhash Chand, s/o Sh. Chedo Ram, aged 56 years, working as FGM-HS II.
12. MES No. 508234 Ranjeet Singh s/o Late Sh. Joti Ram 51 years, working as Fitter Pipe HS-II .
13. MES No. 508857 Sarvjeet Singh s/o Late Sh. Gian Singh, aged 57 years, working as FGM HS I.
14. MES No. 509225 Sanjay Kumar s/o late Sh. Budhi Singh, aged 45 years, working as FGM SK.
15. MES NO. 509939 Raj Kumar s/o Late Sh. Raj Kishor aged 49 years, working as Valveman .
16. MES No. 507410 Girdhari Lal, s/o Late Sh. Bhillo Ram, aged 57 years, working as Elec. SK .
17. MES No. 509858 Suraj Kumar s/o Sh. Mulkh Raj, aged 41 years, working as FGM SK.
18. MES No. 376446 Pankaj Bhardwaj s/o Sh. Pritam Singh, aged 35 years, working as Mate Elec.
19. MES No. 376448 Varinder Singh s/o Sh. Uttam Chand, aged 33 years, working as Mate Fitter Pipe
20. MES No.376451 Arvind Singh s/o Sh. Janak Raj, aged 31 years, working as Mate Elec.
21. MES No. 375919 Rajesh Kumar s/o Sh. Des Raj, aged 33 years, working as Mate Elec.
22. MES No. 512121 Kailash Gupta s/o Sashi Gupta, aged 27 years, working as Mate SSK..



23. MES No. 512120 Ritish Sharma s/o Sh. Vinod Sharma, aged 29 years, working as Mate SSK.
24. MES No. 512119 Rahul Sharma s/o Sh. Rakesh Sharma, aged 28 years, working as Mate SSK.
25. MES No. 512124 Vinod Kumar s/o Sh. Joginder Pal, aged 23 years, working as Mate SSK.
26. MES No. 512126 Vikas Kumar s/o Sh. Bishan Dass, aged 31 years, working as Mate SSK.
27. MES No. 512123 Mohit s/o Sh. Anup, Aged 26 years working as Mate SSK.
28. MES No. 507398 Kishan Singh s/o Sh. Chando Ram, aged 56 years, working as Mate Fitter Pipe.
29. MES No. 507404 Hari Ram S/o Late Sh. Chando Ram, aged 56 years, working as Mason SK.
30. MES No. 507399 Parmodh Kumar s/o Late Sh. Vansu Ram, aged 57 years, working as Mason SK.
31. MES No. 507405 Mohinder Singh s/o Late Sh. Mansa Ram aged 55 years, working as Black Smith SK.
32. MES No. 507402 Kunj Lal s/o Late Sh. Dhani Lal aged 57 years, working as Mate Mason .
33. MES No. 507400 Kalu Ram s/o late Sh. Jai Kishan, aged 55 years, working as Mate Mason
34. MES No. 507412 Inderjit Singh s/o Late Sh. Shabu Ram, aged 54 years, working as Blacksmith SK.
35. MES No. 508238 Ramesh Kumar s/o late Sh. Bansi Ram, aged 57 years, working as Mate Fitter Pipe
36. NC No. 30387 Smt. Nirmala Devi w/o Late Sh. Tilak Raj, aged 46 years, working as Mate Painter.
37. T No. 830 Raj Kumar s/o late Sh. Dullu Ram, aged 52 years, working as Mate Mason.
38. NC 20386 Subhash Chand s/o late Sh. Amar Nath aged 49 years, working as Mate FGM
39. T No. 854 Lal Chand s/o late Sh. Julti Ram, aged 55 years, working as Mate Fitter Pipe
40. T No. 831 Sahib Singh s/o late Sh. Dullu Ram, aged 57 years, working as Mate Carpenter
41. MES No. 507406 Kala Ram s/o late Sh. Hoshiara, aged 54 years, working as Carpenter SK.
42. MES No. 510193 Smt. Shiksha Devi w/o late Sh. Sadhu Ram, aged 52 years, working as C Weaver
43. T No. 1502 Nagin Chand s/o late Sh. Dullu Ram aged 60 years, working as Mate Carpenter.
44. MES No. 376452 Gagan Kaushal s/o Sh. Subhash Chand, aged 28 years, working as Mate Carpenter



45. MES No. 512122 Chetan s/o Sh. Pritam Chand, aged 30 years, working as Mate SSK.
46. MES No. 368146 Roshan Lal s/o Sh. Frangu Ram, aged 60 years, working as Elec HS II
47. MES No. 507206 Vijay Kumar s/o Sh. Joginder Singh, aged 59 years, working as Valveman.
48. MES No. M.K.Mattoo s/o Sh. Raghu Nath, aged 57 years, working as FGM HS II .
49. MES No. 507460 Som Raj s/o Sh. Manso Ram, aged 54 years, working as Valveman
50. NC No. 50385 Raj Kumar s/o Sh. Chajju Ram, aged 51years, working as Elec SK.
51. MES No. 508239 Yogeshwar Singh s/o Sh.Karam Singh, aged 56 years, working as FGM HS II.
52. MES NO. 508231 Narinderjit Singh s/o Bhagat Singh, aged 57 years, working as FGM HS I.
53. MES No. 508422 Karnail Singh s/o Sh. Munshi Ram, aged 52 years, working as Valveman
54. MES No. 509864 Joginder Singh s/o Sh. Balku Ram, aged 44 years, working as FGM SK
55. T No. 832 Naresh Kumar s/o Dhani Ram, aged 54 years, working as Elec. SK
56. MES No. 506746 Vijay Kumar s/o Sh. Saran Dass, aged 57 years, working as Valveman.
57. MES No. 313546 James s/o Sh. Martin, aged 57 years, working as Valveman.
58. MES No. 376447 Shyam Kumar s/o Sh. Tilak Raj, aged 31 years, working as Mate Fitter Pipe.
59. T No. 833 Kishan Chand s/o Sh. Amar Singh, aged 52 years, working as FGM SK.
60. T No. 1095 Man Singh s/o Sh .Jagto Ram, aged 56 years, working as Mate Fitter Pipe
61. MES No. 509661 Parveen Singh s/o Sh. Rattan Chand, aged 44 years, working as Mate FGM
62. MES No. 509858 Sarjeevan Singh s/o Sh. Piar Singh, aged 42 years, working as Mate FGM .
63. T.No. 1464 Surinder Kumar s/o Sh. Gian Chand, aged 56 years, working as Mate Elec.
64. MES NO. 511521 Sashi Kumar S/o Sh. Ramesh Chand Aged 29 years working as Mate Elec.
65. MES No. 377083 Arun Chandel S/o Sh. Jaswant Singh, Aged 26 years working as Mate FGM
66. MES NO. 512125 Babit Kumar Thakur S/o Sh. Bidhi Chand Thakur Aged 31 years working as Mate Fitter Pipe



67. MES No. 377089 Ajay Sharma S/o Sh. Surinder Kumar Aged 32 years working as Mate FGM

All Working in the office of Assistant Garrison Engineer (I) Dalhousie Cantt Distt. Chamba (HP)- 176305

(All the applicants are Group-C employees)

.....Applicants

Versus

1. Union of India through its Secretary Ministry of Defence, South Block, New Delhi.-110001.
2. The Engineer in Chief, Military Engineer Service, Army HQs, Kashmir House, Rajaji Marg New Delhi-110011.
3. The Chief Engineer, HQ Western Command, Chandimandir-134107
4. HQ, Commander Works Engineer, MES, Yol Cantt, Distt. Kangra (HP)
5. Assistant Garrison Engineer (I), Dalhousie Cantt Distt. Chamba (HP)- 176305
6. Principal Controller of Defence Accounts (Western Command) Sector-9, Chandigarh-160009.
7. Assistant Accounts Officer, Assistant Garrison Engineer (I), Dalhousie Cantt Distt. Chamba (HP)- 176305

...Respondents

**Present :MR. SHALENDER SHARMA, ADVOCATE
FOR APPLICANTS.**

**MR. K.K. THAKUR, ADVOCATE, FOR
RESPONDENTS.**

(VII) O.A.NO.060/01353/2019

1. MES No.375589 Sh. Harvinder Singh, aged 43 years, S/o Sh. Balbir Singh, Mate (Elect).
2. MES no.377230, Mukesh Kumar son of Sh. Prem Kumar, Mate.
3. MES No. 609426, Krishan Kumar son of Sh. Fakir Chand, Mate P-Fitter.
4. MES no.283694, Sandeep Singh son of Sh. Suresh Kumar, M/Elect.
5. MES No. 377236, Mukesh Kumar Ray son of Sh. Satyanarayan Ray, Mate FGM.
6. MS No. 375074, Naresh Kumar son of late Sh. Dharam Pal, FGM HS-II.
7. MES No.375590, Satpal son of Late Sh. Ramdhir Singh, Mate P/Ftr.
8. MES no. 376190, Jay Prakash Pal Son of late Sh. Ram Chander Pal, Mate Elect.
9. MES no.371559, Manjeet Singh son of late Sh. Aaha Ram, mason (SK).
10. MES No. 373621, Munishwar Prasad son of late Sh. Durga Parsad, Mason (SK).
11. MES No. 376188, Namo Narayan Meena son of Sh. Hem Singh Meena, Mate Electrician.
12. MES no. 369980, Sh. Megh Raj son of Sh. Malkhan Singh, Elect. HS-I.
13. MES No. 372109, Sh. Rambir Singh son of Sh. Amar Singh, Elect (SK).
14. MES No. 510657, Sukhdeep Singh son of Sh. Pritam Singh, Mate/FGM.
15. MES No. 377251, Rajeev Kumar son of Sh. Satish Kumar, Mate FGM.
16. MES No. 376184, Rakesh Kumar son of Sh. Ram Pal, Mate.
17. T.No. 1515, Sh. Manoj Kumar son of Sh. Krishan Chand, Mate (Ref/Mech).
18. T.No. 1797, Sh. Vipin Son of Sh. Kapoor Singh, Mate (Ref/Mech).
19. MES No. 14860451, Sh. Narinder Singh son of Sh. Ganesh Singh, Mate (Ref/Mech).
20. MES No. 377253, Sh. Sanjeev Kumar son of Sh. Chaman Lal, Mate (SSK).
21. MES No. 375439, Sh. Raju son of Mahima Singh, Mate (P/Ftr).
22. MES No. 375594, Sh. Surjit Pal son of Sh. Bhag Singh, FGM HSII.



23. MES No.373189, Sh. Rajinder Kumar son of Sh. Balwant Rai, FGM HS-I.
24. MES No. 375650, Sh. Hardeep Singh son of Sh. Labh Singh, Valveman.
25. MES No. 371753, Sh. Mewa Singh son of Sh. Ajit Singh, FGM (SK).
26. MES No.375083, Sh. Amrik Singh son of Sh. Teja Singh, Veh. Mech. HS-II.
27. MES No.1482812, Sh. Sooba Singh son of Sh. Harbans Singh, Veh Mech (SK).
28. MES No.375219 Sh. Avdesh Giri S/o Late Sh. Bhagwant Giri, Elect. (SK).
29. MES no.3774463, Sh. Jagdish Singh S/o Late Sh. Mehtab Singh, FGM (SK).
30. MES No. 376217, Sh. Hemant Kumar S/o Sh. Suraj Ban, Mate (SK).
31. MES No. 370385 Sh. Jagtar Singh S/o Late Sh. Mehar Singh, MCM Elect.
32. MES No. 374852, Sunil Rana S/o Sh. Sujit Singh, FGM H.
33. MES No. 376221 Sh. Sonu Kumar S/o Sh. Ganesh Prasad, Mate (SSK).
34. MES No.374065 Sh. Charan Singh S/o Late Sh. Pyara Singh, Elect. (SSK).
35. MES No. 377312 Sh. Sumeet Kalgotra S/o Sh. Banarsi Dass, Mate (FGM).
36. MES No. 376180 Sh. Jankar Singh S/o Sh. Manohar Lal, FGM (SK).
37. MES No. 375021, Sh. Gurinder Singh S/o Sh. Kartar Singh, Blacksmith.
38. MES No. 373902, Sh. Anil Kumar Sharma S/o Sh. Proshotam Sharma, MCM Blacksmith.
39. MES no. 377227 Sh. Lovedeep Uppal S/o Sh. Rakesh Kumar Uppal, Mate (SSK).
40. MES No. 505069 Sh. Avtar Singh S/o Sh. Pal Singh, Mate Maso.
41. MES No.375596 Sh. Rajesh Kumar Sharma S/o Sh. Pokh Raj Sharma, R/M HS-II.
42. MES No.T-1457 Sh. Sukhdev Singh S/o Sh. Ram Singh, Mate R/M.
43. MES No. T-1854, Sh. Jagpal Chadhary S/o Late Sh. Kala Ram, Mate R/M.
44. MES No. 377231-Sandeep Kumar S/o Sh. Rattan Chand, Mate FGM.
45. MES No.37240, Malwinder Singh S/o Ajaib Singh Mate SSK



46. MES No. 377244, Mahesh Kumar S/o Sh. Ved Parkash, Mate SSK.
47. MES No. 377232 Bindu S/o Sh. Bali Ram, Mate SSK.

Applicants No. 1 to 47 are working in the office of Garrison Engineer, (AF), Chandigarh-160003.

48. MES No.373766, Hardeep Singh son of Sh. Ram Singh, Elect HS-I.
49. MES No.377255, Ashish Kashyap son of Sh. Jai Singh Kashyap, Mate (SSK).
50. MES No.377254, Narayan Kumar son of Sh. Ramesh Kumar Srivastava, Mate (SSK).
51. MES No.375400, Jasvir Singh son of Sh. Gurmehar Singh, FGM (SK).
52. MES no.375581, Rakpal Singh son of Sh. Prem Singh, FGM (SK).
53. MES No.370976, Raghubir Singh son of Sh. Murkhyala Singh, Elect (SK).
54. T.No.1625, Shubh Karan son of Sh. Dharampal, Mate (FGM).
55. MES No.375973, Pradeep Son of Sh. Rajender, Mate (Elect).
56. MES No.376371, Budh Ram son of Sh. Surjit Kumar, Mate (R/M).
57. MES No. 375811, Anil Kumar son of Sh. Bhadur Singh, Mate (Elect).
58. MES No.375988, Gaurav Singh son of Sh. Vedpal Singh, FGM (SK).
59. MES No.372954, Jagpal Singh son of Sh. Faqir Chand, Elect (SK).
60. MES No.375975 Amrinder Singh son of Sh. Chanchal Singh, Ref. Mech (SK).
61. MES No.377263, Lakhveer Singh son of Sh. Ranjeet Singh, Mate (SSK).
62. MES No.370262, Jarnail Singh son of Sh. Bhag Singh, Elect (SK).
63. MS No.375156, Sukhwinder Singh son of Sh. Bachan Singh, Mate (Elect).
64. MES No.371264, Beant Singh son of Sh. Mohinder Singh, Elect (SK).
65. MES No.373581, Gurmail Singh son of Sh. Balwant Singh, Elect (SK).
66. MES No.375858, Parveen Kaur Wife of Sh. Balwant Singh, Mate
67. MES no.315777, Gursewak Singh son of Late Sh. Karam Singh, FGM (SK).



68. MES No.2476948, Bhajan Singh son of Sh. Arjan Singh, FGM HS-II.
69. MES No.377259, Simranjeet Singh son of Sh. Kuldip Singh, Mate (SSK).
70. MES No.377269, Amit son of Sh. Ved Pal, Mate (SSK).
71. MES No.370886, Surjit Singh son of Sh. Dayal, Elect (SK).
72. MES No.370261, Harpal Singh son of Sh. Jeet Singh, Elect (SK).
73. MES No.375733, Ashwani Kumar son of Sh. Mohan Lal, FGM (SK).
74. MES No.370605, Ashok Kumar son of Sh. Asha Nand, Elect (SK).
75. MES No.9806642, Sh. Amarjit Singh son of Sh. Jiwa Singh, Mate Elect.
76. MES No.371777, Sh. Amarik Singh son of Sh. Gurbachan Singh, Elect,. SK.
77. MES No.372634, Sh. Som Nath son of Sh. Ram Saroop, Elect,. SK.
78. MES No.369283, Sh. Mohinder Singh son of Sh. Bhagwan Singh, Elect. HS-I.
79. MES No.375157, Sh. Som Nath son of Sh. Roop Chand, FGM SK.
80. T.No.1396, Bikram Singh son of Sh. Kishan Lal, P/Fitter HS-II.
81. MES No.371573, Sh. Hari Chand son of Sh. Banarsi Dass, FGM (MCM).
82. MES No.373352, Jamil Mohamad son of Gulam Mohamad, Elect HS-I.
83. MES No.370155, Sohan Singh son of Sh. Bachan Singh, FGM HS-II.
84. MES No. 372409, Hemant Kumar son of Sh. Amar Nath, FGM HS-II.
85. MES No.372607, Tarlochan Singh son of Sh. Balbir Singh, FGM HS-II.
86. MES No.9806738, Narender Kumar son of sh. Rameshwar Dass, FGM HS-II.
87. MES No.371665, Satpal son of Sh. Sohan Lal, Elect. (SK).
88. MES No.371778, Jatender Mehta son of Sh. Raj Kumar, Elect (SK).
89. MES No.375524, Amrik Singh son of Sh. Karam Singh, FGM HS-II.
90. MES No.370284, Param Singh son of Sh. Ajit Singh, Elec5t HS-II.



91. MES No.372059, Suresh Kumar son of Sh. Krishan Lal, Elect (SK).
92. MES No.375989, Narinder Singh son of Sh. Mohan Singh, Elect (SSK).
93. MES No.375990, Shalider Rana son of Sh. Jung Bhadur, Elect (SSK).
94. MES No.377256, Rahul Gondi son of Sh. Pawan Kumar, Elect (SSK).
95. MES No.377268, Sandeep Kumar son of Sh. Bhoop Singh, Elect. (SSK).
96. MES No.377266, Jaswinder Pal Singh son of Sh. Jasbir Singh, Elect (SSK).
97. MES No.1577658Y, Harbans Singh son of Sh. Dalip Singh, FGM (SSK).
98. MES No.15462782K, Bhim Singh son of Sh. Deva Singh, FGM (SSK).
99. MES No.371878, Sh. Inderjit Singh son of Sh. Baldev Singh, Carp. HS-I.
100. MES No.370922, Sh. Som Nath son of Sh. Maghi Ram, Carp. SK.
101. MES No.372633, Sh. Raj Kumar son of Sh. Chander Bahador, P/Fitter SK.
102. MES No.,371186,k Sh. Bishamber Parsad son of Sh. Ram Singh, P/Fitter SK.
103. MES No.374550, Sh. Swaran Singh son of Sh. Jaspal Singh, P/Fitter Mate.
104. MES No.372161, Sh. Karam Singh son of Sh. Uttam Singh, Carp. SK.
105. MES No.375884, Sh. Robin Kumar son of Sh. Pawan Kumar, Mate SSK.
106. MES No.372062, Sh. Gian Chand son of Sh. Atwar, p/Fitter SK.
107. MES No.1486056, Devinder Kumar son of Sh. Bakhshi Ram, Mate SSK.
108. MES No.370948, Sh. Jagdish Singh S/o Sh. Balwant Singh, Pipe Fitter (SK).
109. MES No. 372157, Sh. Hemraj S/o Sh. Ramanth, Carpenter (SK).
110. MES No. 313951, Sh. Manjit Singh S/o Sh. Bahadur Singh, Pipe Fitter (SK).
111. MES No.375974 Sh. Prayas Rathi S/o Sh. Yogendra Singh, REF mechanic (SK).
112. MES No.370483, Sh. Hemraj S/o Faqir Chand, Pipe Fitter (SK).
113. MES No.375132, Sh. Lachman Singh S/o Kahair Singh, Mate (Carpenter) (SSK).



114. MES No.313952, Sh. Harnek Singh S/o Sh. Arjun Singh, Pipe Fitter (SK).
115. MES No.,372408, Sh. Avtar Singh S/o Sh. Ronak Singh, Pipe Fitter (SK).
116. MES No.372610, Sh. Ajmer Singh S/o Sh. Sarup Singh, Pipe Fitter (SK).
117. MES No.375234 Sh. Man Bahadur S/o Sh. Kanshi Ram, mason (SK).
118. MES No.372584 Sh. Tarsem Lal S/o Sh. Dilui Ram, Mason (Mate)
119. MES No.372403 Sh. Harnek Singh S/o Sh. Lachhman Singh, MCM (Pipe Fitter)
120. MES No.376222 Sh. Avtar Singh S/o Naib Singh, Mate (SSK).
121. MES No. WC 6212 Sh. Rajinder S/o Sh. Tulsi, Mate (Mason).
122. MES No.372624 Sh. Balbir Singh S/o Sh. Kehar Singh, Mate (Carpenter).
123. MES No.371832 Sh. Natha Ram S/o Sh. Puran Ram, Carpenter H.S.I.
124. MES No.9806727 Sh. Charanjit Singh S/o Sh. Puran Chand, Elect. (SSK).
125. MES No.413698 Smt. Bimla Devi W/o Sh. Ball Kishan, Carpenter (SSK).
126. MES No.315478, Sh. Balwinder Singh S/o Balwant Singh, FGM HS-I.
127. MES No.375235 Smt. Preeto W/o Sh. Prem, MATE.
128. MES No.511374, Sh. Sukhchain S/o Sh. Kirpal Singh, FGW (SSK).
129. MES No.375981 Sh. Ranjeet Kumar S/o Sh. Ram Chander Prasad, Elect. (SSK).
130. MES No.377258 Sh. Abhishek S/o Sh. Sahdev Singh, Mate (SSK).
131. MES No.377264, Sh. Ajay S/o Sh. Ranbir Singh, FGM (SSK).
132. MES No.377265, Sh. Vijender S/o Nihal Singh, Carpenter (SSK).
133. MES no. 374424 Smt. Krishana Devi W/o Sh. Amar Singh, Mason (SK).
134. NC-20494 Smt. Babita Kaushal W/o Sh. Surinder La, Mate P/Ftr.
135. MES No.315906, Smt. Maya Devi W/o Sh. Mohan Lal, Mate mason.



Applicant No.48 to 135 are working in the office of Garrison Engineer, 'N' Area, Chandigarh-160003.

136. MES No.373767, Mohan Lal Son of Sh. Ram Rattan, SK(Elect.).
137. MES No.372583, Nirmal Singh son of Sh. Raja Ram, SK (Elect).
138. MES No.377301, Vinod Verma son of Sh. Radhey Sham, Mate (GM).
139. T.No.1458, Ranjodh Son of Sh. Sohan Lal, Mate (RAC).
140. MES No.373129, Balbir Singh son of Sh. Prem Singh, Carpenter.
141. MES No.372295, Guljar Singh son of Sh. Bachan Singh, SK (Elect.).
142. MES No.372156, Picha Ram son of Muni Lal, Pipe fitter
143. MES No.373547, Surinder Singh son of Ram Singh, Pipe Fitter
144. MES No.372173, Avtar Singh son of Sh. Babu Singh, SK (Elect).
145. MES No.313473, Gurmeet Singh son of Sh. Hans Raj, HS-II (FGM).
146. MES No.372956, Mahipal Son of sh. Darwari Lal, Mate painter.

Applicant No.136 to 146 are working in the office of GE (I) R&D Chandigarh-160036.

All the applicants are Group-C employees.

....

Applicants

Versus

1. Union of India through its Secretary, Ministry of Defence, South Block, New Delhi-110011.
2. Engineer-in-Chief, Military Engineer Service, Integrated HQs, Kashmir Gate, New Delhi-110011.
3. Chief Engineer, Head Quarters, MES, Western Command, Chandimandir-Panchkula-134107.
4. HQ, Commander Works Engineer (AF), Chandigarh-'N' Area, Chandigarh-160003.
5. Garrison Engineer (I), R&D, MES, Sector-37, Chandigarh-160036.
6. Garrison Engineer, MES, Chandigarh, 'N' Area, Chandigarh-160003.



7. Garrison Engineer (AF), 12 Wing, 'N' Area, Chandigarh -160003.
8. Principal Controller of Defence Accounts (Western Command), Sector-9, Chandigarh-160009.

....

Respondents

**PRESENT : MR. D.R. SHARMA, ADVOCATE,
FOR APPLICANTS.
MR. SANJAY GOYAL, ADVOCATE
FOR THE RESPONDENTS.**

(IX) O.A.NO.063/1357/2019

1. MES NO.506964 Swaroop Singh S/o Sh. Partap Singh, aged 58 years, working as Painter-SK.
2. MES No. 509510 Jarnail Singh s/o Sh. Saab Singh, aged 46 years, working as Elec. SK
3. MES No. 507076 Karam Chand s/o Sh. Moti Ram, aged 58 years, working as FGM-HS I
4. MES No. 509890 Balwinder Soni s/o Sh. Ram Soni, aged 46 years, working as FGM SK.
5. MES NO.507855 Parveen Kumar s/o Sh. Karam Chand, aged 53 years, working as Elect SK
6. MES No. 505882 Sat Pal s/o late Sh. Ran Singh aged 59 years, working as FGM HS (I)
7. MES NO 507075 Uttam Chand s/o Sh. Salahu Ram, aged 54 years, working as Mate Mason
8. NC 20410 Surjit Kumar s/o Sh. Amar Singh, aged 47 years, working as Mate Mason
9. MES No. 508835 Kali Dass s/o Sh. Puran Chand, aged 53 years, working as Mate Mason.
10. MES No. 510398 Abhimanyu Saini s/o Sh. Gopal Dass Saini aged 42 years, working as Mate Fitter Pipe.
11. MES No. 376520 Sanjeev Kumar, s/o Sh. Sridhar, aged 37 years, working as Fitter Pipe SK.
12. MES No. 376519 Chaman Lal s/o Sh. Trilok Chand Aged 535 years, working as Mate Fitter Pipe
13. MES No. 510397 Satpal s/o Sh. Harbans Lal, aged 42 years, working as FGM SK
14. T No. 45 Vinod Kumar s/o Sh. Achhar Singh, aged 39 years, working as Mate FGM.
15. MES NO. 376521 Anil Kumar s/o Sh. Baldev Singh aged 35 years, working as Mate FGM .



16. MES No.376517 Pankaj Dhiman s/o Sh. Suraj Parkash, aged 35 years, working as Mate FGM.
 17. MES No. 506969 Tulsi Ram S/o Sh. Panju Ram, aged 60 years, working as Mate Carpenter.
 18. MES No. 376516 Anoop Kumar s/o Sh. Uttam Chand, aged 35 years, working as Mate Carpenter.
 19. A No. 1578964 Onkar Chand s/o Sh. Tulsi Ram, aged 56 years, working as Mate Carpenter .
 20. MES No.376513 Kartar Singh s/o Sh. Puran Chand, aged 33 years, working as Mate Electrician.
 21. MES No. 376514 Ashish Kumar s/o Sh. Tarlok Chand, aged 30 years, working as Mate Electrician.
 22. MES No. 376518 Rakesh Kumar s/o Kali Dass, aged 34 years, working as Mate Electrician.
 23. MES No. 376512 Vikram s/o Sh. Prem Chand, aged 32 years, working as Mate Electrician.
 24. MES No. 701119 Kamal Deen s/o Sh. Jaan Mohd, aged 36 years, working as Mate Refg.
 25. MES No. 377048 Karan Rana s/o Sh. Piar Singh , aged 30 years, working as Mate Pipe Fitter.
 26. MES No. 377047 Naveen Chand s/o Sh. Godhi Ram, aged 32 years, working as Mate Pipe Fitter.
 27. MES No. 377049 Manish Kumar s/o Sh. Vijay Kumar, Aged 30 years working as Mate FGM.
 28. MES No. 377126 Amit Kumar s/o Sh. Reloo Ram, aged 296 years, working as Mate Fitter Pipe.
- All Group C Employees C/o Assistant Garrison Engineer (I), Dharamshala Cantt, Distt. Kangra (HP)- 176216

.....Applicants

Versus

1. Union of India through its Secretary Ministry of Defence, South Block, New Delhi.-110001.
2. The Engineer in Chief, Military Engineer Service, Army HQs, Kashmir House, Rajaji Marg New Delhi-110011.
3. The Chief Engineer, HQ Western Command, Chandimandir-134107
4. HQ, Commander Works Engineer, MES, Yol Cantt, Distt. Kangra (HP)- 176052
5. Assistant Garrison Engineer (I), Dharamshala Cantt Distt. Kangra (HP)- 176216



6. Principal Controller of Defence Accounts (Western Command) Sector-9, Chandigarh-160009.
7. Senior Accounts Officer, GE (Kangra Hills) Yol Cantt-Distt. Kangra -176052

...Respondents

**Present :MR. SHALENDER SHARMA, ADVOCATE
FOR APPLICANTS.
MR. SANJAY GOYAL, ADVOCATE, FOR
RESPONDENTS.**

(X) O.A.NO.060/01362/2019

1. MES Workers Union (Area Committee) Ambala Branch Chandimandir Cantt. Distt. Panchkula (Haryana)-134107 through its Secretary Ashok Kumar, Aged 60 years son of late Sh. Surat Ram
2. Mahavir Rana, aged 60 years son of late Sh. D.S. Rana, Q.No. 157 Type III, MES Command Colony Chandimandir Cantt. Distt. Panchkula (Haryana-134107), Group C.

.....Applicants

Versus

1. Union of India through its Secretary Ministry of Defence, South Block, New Delhi.-110001.
2. The Engineer in Chief, Military Engineer Service, Army HQs, Kashmir House, Rajaji Marg New Delhi-110011.
3. The Chief Engineer, HQ Western Command, Chandimandir-134107
4. HQ, Commander Works Engineer, Chandimandir, Panchkula-134107.
5. Principal Controller of Defence Accounts (Western Command) Sector-9, Chandigarh-160009.
6. Senior Accounts Officer, Garrison Engineer Chandimandir, District Panchkula-134107.

...Respondents

**Present: MR. SHALENDER SHARMA, ADVOCATE
FOR APPLICANTS.
MR. SANJAY GOYAL, ADVOCATE, FOR
RESPONDENTS.**



(XI) O.A.NO.060/01369/2019

1. Vinod Kumar, MES No.372628 S/o Late Sh. Shiv Lal, aged 57 years, working as FGM HS-I O/O Garrison Engineer (N), MES, Sangrur Road, Patiala-147001.
2. Amarjeet Singh, MES No.374490 S/o Late Sh. Khazan Singh, aged 57 years, working as FGM-HS-II O/O Garrison Engineer (N), MES, Sangrur Road, Patiala-147001.
(Both are Group-C employees).

... Applicants
Versus

1. Union of India through its Secretary, Ministry of Defence, South Block, New Delhi-110011.
2. Chief Engineer, Head Quarters, MES, Western Command, Chandimandir-Panchkula-134107.
3. HQ, Commander Works Engineer (MES), Patiala-147001.
4. Garrison Engineer, MES (north), Patiala-147001.
5. Principal Controller of Defence Accounts (Western Command), Sector-9, Chandigarh-160009.

.... Respondents

**PRESENT : MR. D.R. SHARMA, ADVOCATE,
FOR APPLICANTS.
MR. SANJAY GOYAL, ADVOCATE
FOR THE RESPONDENTS.**

(XII) O.A.NO.060/1372/2019

1. MES No. 369438, Satish Kumar, S/o Sh. Om Parkash, aged 58 years, working as MCM (FGM), Group-C.
2. MES No. 370466, Tarsem Singh, S/o Sh. Ramnath, aged 57 years, working as MCM (FGM), Group-C.
3. MES No. 373764, Gurmeet Singh, S/o Sh. Mohinder Singh, aged 58 years, working as Elect (HS-I), Group-C.
4. MES No. 374843, Satpal, S/o Sh. Rajpal, aged 53 years, working as Elect (SK), Group-C.
5. MES No. 374126, Ramesh Kumar, S/o Late Sh. Wilati Ram, aged 51 years, working as Ref Mech (HS-II), Group-C.
6. MES No. 425630, Jatinder Singh, S/o Sh. Apar Singh, aged 53 years, working as Ref Mech (HS-I), Group-C.
7. MES No. 375461, Sarabjit Singh, S/o Late Sh. Labh Singh, aged 42 years, working as Mate (Elect), Group-C.
8. MES No. 377393, Ashwani Kumar Meena, S/o Sh. D.S. Meena, aged 30 years, working Mate (Elect), Group-C.
9. MES No. 377287, Mahender Kumar, S/o Sh. Babulal, aged 27 years, working as Mate (FGM), Group-C.
10. MES No. 377289, Harsh Meena, S/o Sh. Sharvan Lal Meena, aged 30years, working as Mate (Elect), Group-C.
11. MES No. 377297, Shamsheer Singh, S/o Sh. Zile Singh, aged 30 years, working as Mate (FGM), Group-C.
12. MES No. 377298, Praveen Kumar, S/o Sh. Madan Lal, aged 28 years, working as Mate (Ref Mech), Group-C.
13. MES No. 377299, Rajesh Kumar, S/o Sh. Gaje Singh, aged 27 years, working as Mate (FGM), Group-C.
14. MES No. 377303, Yogesh, S/o Sh. Umed Singh, aged 28 years, working as Mate (FGM), Group-C.
15. MES No. 377304, Sunil Kumar, S/o Sh. Rajender Singh, aged 28 years, working as Mate (Ref Mech), Group-C.
16. MES No. 377305, Pawan Kumar, S/o Sh. Surender Kumar, aged 23years, working as Mate (Elect), Group-C.
17. MES No. A/N 14411827A, Ajay Kumar, S/o Sh. Ramesh Chand, aged 46 years, working as Mate (FGM), Group-C.



18. MES No. 377295, Rajiv Chaudhary, S/o Sh. Jitender Singh Chaudhary, aged 23 years, working as Mate (F/Pipe), Group-C.
19. MES No. 377296, Rahul Yadav, S/o Sh. Kaptan Singh, aged 23 years, working as Mate (Ref Mech), Group-C.
20. MES No. 376025, Satish Kumar, S/o Sh. Manphool Singh, aged 31years, working as Mate (SSK Elect), Group-C.
21. MES No. 370903, Jasvir Singh, S/o Sh. Atma Singh, aged 52 years, working as Mason (HS-I), Group-C.
22. MES No. EX 1494946M, Devender Singh, S/o Sh. Bhajan Singh, aged 39years, working as Mate (Vech/Mech) Group-C.
23. MES No. A/N 1579814W, Vasiuddin, S/o Sh. Hafiz Jamiluddin, aged 51 years, working as Mate (FGM), Group-C.
24. MES No. 377294, Manpreet, S/o Sh. Manjit Singh, aged 28 years, working as Mate (Ref/Mech), Group-C.
25. MES No. 377288, Sourabh Aggarwal, S/o Sh. Joginder Aggarwal, aged 26 years, working as Mate (Ref/Mech), Group-C.
26. MES No. 377302, Yogesh Pal, S/o Sh. Pawan Kumar, aged 24 years, working as Mate (FGM), Group-C.
27. MES No. 377290, Gurvinder Singh, S/o Sh. Sukhdev Singh, aged 28 years, working as Mate (FGM), Group-C.
28. MES No. T-114, Ravinder Kumar, S/o Sh. Gauri Shankar, aged 39 years, working as Mate (Vech/Mech), Group-C.
29. MES No. Ex 15561158N, Harvinder Singh, S/o Sh. Gurmail Singh, aged 42 years, working as Carp (SK), Group-C.
30. MES No. 376192, Rajendra Kumar, S/o Sh. Prabhu Dayal, aged 32 years, working as Mate (Pipe Ftr), Group-C.
31. MES No. 377300, Jarnail Singh, S/o Sh. Bhura Singh, aged 32 years, working as Mate (FGM), Group-C.
32. MES No. 372400, Gianchand, S/o Sh. Bachna Ram, aged 57 years, working as FGM (SK), Group-C
33. MES No. 374890, Jaswant Singh, S/o Sh. Dev Singh, aged 57years, working as Ref Mech (HS-II), Group-C.



All are Group C Employees and working in the O/o Garrison Engineer (I), R & D, Chandigarh – 160036.

...Applicants

Versus

1. Union of India, through its Secretary, Ministry of Defence, South Block, New Delhi-110001.
2. Engineer in Chief, Military Engineer Service, Integrated HQ's, Kashmiri Gate, New Delhi-110001.
3. Chief Engineer, Head Quarters, MES, Western Command, Chandimandir, Panchkula, 134107.
4. Principal Controller of Defence Accounts, Western Command, Chandigarh, Jan Marg, 9-A, Sector 9, Chandigarh- 160009.
5. Head Quarter, Commander Works Engineer, (Air Force), Chandigarh-160003.
6. Garrison Engineer (I), G & D, Chandigarh - 160036.

...RESPONDENTS

PRESENT : MR. RAJESH VERMA, ADVOCATE, FOR APPLICANTS.
MR. SANJAY GOYAL, COUNSEL FOR RESPONDENTS.

(XIII) O.A.NO.060/00069/2020

1. MES No. 423250, Baljeet Singh aged 56 years S/o Sh. Santokh Singh, working as MCM (Refrigerator Mechanic), Group-C.
2. MES No. 508969, Jarnail Singh Sidhu, aged 53 years S/o Lamber Singh Sidhu, working as MCM, Group-C.
3. MES No. 15563714, Parwinder Singh, aged 39 years S/o Rajinder Pal Singh, working as Mate Elect., Group-C.
4. MES No. 485231, Suneel Kumar, aged 49 years S/o Ramesh Chand, working as Mate Elect., Group-C.
5. MES No. 372063, Ram Milan, aged 56 years S/o Baijnath, working as Pipe Fitter, Group-C.
6. MES No. 377261, Subhash aged 29 years, S/o Sh. Raj Pal Meena, working as FGM, Group-C.
7. MES No. 377257, Sandeep, aged 29 years, S/o Sh. Mohan Swaroop Meena, working as FGM, Group-C.
8. MES No. 375982, Mohammed Sephi Alam, aged 35years, S/o Sh. Zamadar Ansari, working as Mate Pipe Fitter, Group-C.
9. MES No. 371305, Lakhan Singh, aged 57 years S/o Late Sh. Raltu Ram, aged 52 years, working as Lift Operator, Group-C.
10. MES No. 372560, Shamsheer Singh, S/o Sh. Nasib Singh, working as SK Carpenter, Group-C.



All are Group C Employees and working in the O/o Garrison Engineer, Airport Road, N-Area, Chandigarh – 160003.

...Applicants

Versus

1. Union of India, through its Secretary, Ministry of Defence, South Block, New Delhi-110001.
2. Engineer in Chief, Military Engineer Service, Integrated HQ's, Kashmiri Gate, New Delhi-110001.
3. Chief Engineer, Head Quarters, MES, Western Command, Chandimandir, Panchkula, 134107.
4. Principal Controller of Defence Accounts, Western Command, Chandigarh, Jan Marg, 9-A, Sector 9, Chandigarh- 160009.
5. Head Quarter, Commander Works Engineer, (Air Force), Chandigarh-160003.
6. Garrison Engineer, Airport Road, N-Area, Chandigarh -160003.

...RESPONDENTS

PRESENT : MR. RAJESH VERMA, ADVOCATE, FOR APPLICANTS.
MR. SANJAY GOYAL, COUNSEL FOR RESPONDENTS.



ORDER
[HON'BLE SANJEEV KAUSHIK, MEMBER (J)]

1. This order shall dispose of a bunch of above captioned thirteen (13) Original Applications, as these involve identical questions of facts and law and minor variation in facts, here and there, would not make any difference on ultimate outcome of the cases and like wise is also requested by the learned counsel for the parties. For reference, the facts are being taken from O.A.No.060/01362/2019 – **MES WORKERS UNION ETC. VS. UNION OF INDIA & OTHERS.**

2. The applicants lay challenge to the letter dated 15.11.2019 (Annexure A-5) and 18.12.2019 (Annexure A-6), whereby the respondents have decided to recover the amount of Dress Allowance paid to them, during the years 2017-18, 2018-19 and 2019-20 and they have also sought for a declaration that the Industrial employees are also entitled to Dress Allowance in terms of the OM dated 31.8.2017 (Annexure A-1) issued by Department of Personnel & Training (DoP&T) and 2.8.2017 (Annexure A-2) issued by Ministry of Finance, Department of Expenditure, New Delhi.



3. Before addressing the arguments raised by the learned counsel for the parties, the facts may be recapitulated in the first instance. The applicants are working in the Military Engineer Service (MES) on various posts like Fitter General Mechanic (FGM), Highly Skilled Grade-I, Elect. Mate, Carp, Painter, master Craftsman (MCM) etc. They fall within the term "Industrial Employees" and belong to Group-C.

4. Prior to implementation of the 7th Central Pay Commission Report, the industrial employees (applicants) were provided 'Dangri' (dress) on yearly basis, with washing allowance per month. On the recommendations of the 7th CPC, the respondents stopped providing same to the applicants w.e.f. 1.1.2016. The Government of India, Ministry of Finance, issued OM dated 2.8.2017 (Annexure A-11), whereby a decision was taken that existing orders relating to uniform related Allowance, Clothing Allowance, Initial Equipment allowance Kit Maintenance Allowance, Robe Allowance, Robe Maintenance Allowances, shoe Allowance, Uniform Allowance and Washing Allowance are subsumed in a single Dress Allowance of Rs.5000/-per annum, w.e.f. 1.7.2017.



Subsequently, a clarification was issued by Government of India, DoPT, vide memo dated 31.8.2017, indicating that all the existing orders relating to admissibility of Uniform allowance/Washing allowance/Stitching Charges/Shoe Allowance etc. to common categories of Group-C and erstwhile Group-D employees of various Ministries/Department including attached / subordinates offices who are supplied uniform and are required to wear them regularly, shall be paid Dress Allowance @ Rs.5000/- per year. In para 2 of the O.M. it was also mentioned that the Uniform allowance/Washing Allowance/Stitching Charges/Shoe Allowance have been subsumed in Dress Allowance.

5. Pursuant to the Office Memorandums dated 2.8.2017 and 31.8.2017, respondent No.6 [Principal Controller of Defence Accounts (Western Command), Sector-9, Chandigarh], (for short "PCDA, Chandigarh") issued letter dated 5.6.2018, intimating that the benefit of Dress Allowance, as per DoPT OM dated 2.8.2017, may be extended to the Civilian employees of MES, including industrial personnel. PCDA, Chandigarh, issued another circular dated 2.8.2018 (Annexure A-4), vide which all the subordinate offices



were directed to grant Dress Allowances to the Industrial/non-industrial employees, who were wearing uniform and / or drawing washing allowances, w.e.f. 1.7.2017. In compliance thereof, the respondents granted Dress Allowance to the applicants for the year 2018-19 vide order dated 1.9.2018 (Annexure A-6). Sanction was also granted on 7.8.2019 (Annexure A-7), for grant of Dress Allowance, for the year 2019-20 as well and applicants were released this benefit also.

6. However, vide letters dated 15.11.2019 issued by PCDA and then by Defence Accounts Department, it was decided that amount of dress allowance paid, if any, to MES industrial employees, during the years 2017-18, 2018-19 and 2019-20, may be recovered immediately, as entitlement of Dress Allowance to industrial employees of MES is yet to be decided and presently, they are not entitled to dress allowance. The recovery orders were also issued on 18.12.2019. Against these orders, the applicants are before this Tribunal, challenging the same. They have taken various grounds for invalidation of the impugned orders of stoppage of Dress Allowance and recovery of payment already made to them.



7. On notice of motion, the respondents filed written statement wherein they do not dispute about the factual accuracy. However, it is submitted that since payment of washing allowance to category of applicants was made wrongly, it is permissible for the administration, under the law, to rectify its mistake and make recovery, from such persons who have been granted benefit due to wrong interpretation of the policy decisions. Till date no decision has been taken to grant the benefit of Dress Allowance to the category of the applicants and as such they are not entitled to it, in terms of the OM dated 2.8.2017 and 31.8.2017. On clarification / directions issued by PCDA, the orders of recovery have been passed. Therefore, it is submitted that there is nothing wrong in withdrawing the benefit from the applicants, to which they are not entitled to.

8. The learned counsel for the applicants vehemently argued that the orders of withdrawal and recovery of Dress Allowance is in violation of principles of natural justice as the applicants were neither put on notice nor heard before passing the impugned orders, thus, the same are illegal. It is further argued that the orders of recovery are also in violation of the decision of the



Hon'ble Apex Court in the case of **STATE OF PUNJAB AND OTHERS VS. RAFIQ MASIH**, 2015 (1) SCT 195.

Thus, it is pleaded that the impugned orders be quashed and set aside. Lastly it is pleaded that in terms of the Memorandums dated 2.8.2017 and 31.8.2017, even the applicants are entitled for grant of Dress Allowance, which was correctly granted to them in implementation of the 7th CPC recommendations which cannot be taken away from them arbitrarily.

9. Per contra, learned counsel for the respondents argued and submitted that since the applicants have wrongly been given the benefit under the directions of PCDA and on realising that it was a mistake, the same was rectified and as such they have rightly withdrawn the benefit from the applicant and ordered orders of recovery. It has also been argued by learned counsel for the respondents that the decision in the case of Rafiq Masih (supra) would not help the applicants as they had given undertakings that if it is found that there is some error in making the payment, then same may be recovered from them.



10. I have given my thoughtful consideration to the entire matter and have perused the record with the able assistance of learned counsels for the parties.

11. The two office memorandums dated 2.8.2017 and 31.8.2017, which are relevant for decision on the issue of grant of Dress Allowance, in this case, are reproduced as under :-

"New Delhi, 2nd August 2017

OFFICE MEMORANDUM

Subject: Implementation Of the recommendations of the Seventh Central pay — Dress Allowance

Consequent upon decisions by Central Government on the recommendations of the Seventh Central pay Commission, in supersession of the existing orders relating to Uniform related Allowances viz Clothing Allowance, Initial Equipment Allowance, Kit Maintenance Allowance, Robe Allowance, Robe Maintenance Allowance, Shoe Allowance, Uniform Washing Allowance which have been subsumed in a single Dress Allowance, the President is pleased to decide the rates of Dress Allowance in r/o the following categories of Central Government employees as under:

S.No.	Category of employee	Rate per annum (In Rs.)
1.	Special Protection Group (SPG) operational	27,800/-
	Special Protection Group (SPG) Non-operational	21,225/-
2.	Officers of Army/IAF/navy/CAPFs/CPOs RPF/RPSF/IPS/Coast Card	20,000'-
3	MNS officers, officers of DANIPS/ACP of Delhi Police/Other Union Territories.	15,000/-
4	Executive Staff of Customs, Central Excise and Narcotics Department (both in summer and summer-cum-winter, Indian Corporate Law Service (ICLS) officers, legal officers in nIA, Bureau of Immigration personal (In Mumbai, Chennai, Delhi, Amritsar, Kolkata and all check points of Bureau of Immigration) PBORs of Defence Services/CAPFs/RPF/Police Forces of union Territories and Indian Coast	10,000/-



	Guard, Station Masters of Indian Railways.	
5	Other categories of staff who were supplied Uniforms and are required to wear them regularly like Trackmen, running staff of Indian Railways, Staff Car Drivers, MTS, Canteen Staff of Non-Statutory Departmental Canteens, etc.	5,000/-
6	Nurses	1800/- per month

2. Allowances related maintenance, washing of Uniforms are subsumed in Dress Allowance and will not be payable separately.

3. Further categories of staff were earlier being provided Uniforms, will hence forth not be provided With uniforms.

4. The amount of Dress Allowance shall be credited to the salary of employees directly once a year in the month of July.

5. This allowance covers only the basic uniform of the employees. Any special clothing like that provided at Siachen Glacier or inside submarine or fluorescent clothing provided to Trackmen or Indian Railways or to IB personnel posted at high altitudes will continue to be provided by concerned Ministry as per existing norms.

6. Outfit Allowance paid to Indian Foreign Service officers and employees will continue to be provided as before, is enhanced by 50%.

7. The rates of Dress Allowance go up by 25% each time Dearness Allowance rise by 50%.

8. These orders shall take effect from 01st July, 2017.
xxx."

The office memorandum dated 31.8.2017 is reproduced as under:-

"Dated: August 31, 2017

OFFICE MEMORANDUM

Subject: Implementation of recommendations of the Seventh Central Pay Commission on Dress Allowance – regarding.

The undersigned is directed to state that in pursuance of the decisions taken by the Government on the recommendations of Seventh Central Pay Commission, and in supersession of the existing orders relating to admissibility of Uniform Allowance/ Washing allowance/ Stitching Charges /Shoe allowance, etc to common



categories of Group 'C' and erstwhile Group 'D' employees of various Ministries/Departments, including attached/ subordinate offices, who are supplied uniform and are required to wear them regularly, they shall be paid Dress Allowance at the rate of Rs. 5000/- per year.

2. The Uniform Allowance / Washing Allowance / Stitching Charges / Shoe Allowance, etc. have been subsumed in Dress Allowance.

3. The categories of Staff who were earlier being provided uniforms if any, shall henceforth not be provided with uniform.

4. Allowance related to maintenance and washing of uniform is subsumed under Dress Allowance, and will not be payable separately.

5. The amount of Dress Allowance shall be credited to the salary of employees directly once a year in the month of July.

6. The rate of Dress Allowance shall be, as mentioned in para-1 above, Rs.5000/- per year. The rate of Dress Allowance shall go up by 25% every time the Dearness Allowance rises by 50%.

7. This allowance covers only the basic uniform of the employees. Any special clothing will continue to be provided by the concerned Ministry as per existing norms.

8. This order shall take effect from 1st July, 2017."

12. A perusal of the OM dated 2.8.2017 would disclose that Ministry of Finance has taken a conscious decision that in supersession of earlier orders relating to various allowances viz. Clothing, Initial Equipment, Kit maintenance, Robe, Robe maintenance, Show, Uniform and Washing etc. Dress Allowance was sanctioned and category of staff, who was to be supplied uniforms and were required to wear them regularly like Trackmen, Running Staff Railways, Staff Car Drivers, MTS, Canteen Staff of Non-Statutory Departmental Canteens



etc. was sanctioned a sum of Rs.5,000/- per annum and these various allowances were subsumed, no other allowance was to be paid. Pursuant to this memo, the DoP&T, nodal Department, also issued Office memo dated 31.8.2017, which clearly provides that Uniform Allowance/Washing allowance/Stitching Charges/Show Allowance etc. have been subsumed in Dress Allowance which shall be Rs.5,000/- per annum. which shall be credited to the salary of employees directly once a year in the month of July. As per para 7, this allowance covers only the basic uniform of the employees and any special clothing will continue to be provided by the concerned Ministry, as per existing norms. In compliance thereto, the PCDA, Chandigarh, vide decision dated 5.6.2018 (Annexure A-3), clearly indicated that benefit of OM dated 2.8.2017, may be extended to the civilian of MES including industrial personnel. Again there is a letter dated 2.8.2018 (Annexure A-4), indicating that competent authority has clarified that Dress Allowance is payable to industrial/non industrial employees w.e.f. 1.7.2017. Thereafter, the applicants were granted the benefit of Dress Allowance for the years 2017-18 to 2019-20.



13. It is quite surprising that all of a sudden, the respondents have passed the impugned orders conveying that there is not even a decision as yet for grant of Dress Allowance to the category of the applicants and as such the payment of allowance already made may be recovered, as clarified by PCDA, Chandigarh, and as such impugned orders of recovery were passed, that too in violation of the principles of natural justice. A perusal of both reproduced OMs would make it clear that a conscious decision was taken by the Ministry of Finance, Department of Expenditure, New Delhi and then DoP&T (Nodal Department), pursuant to implementation of the 7th CPC recommendations, for grant of Composite Dress Allowance, instead of various allowances, which were discontinued, @ Rs.5,000/- per annum. The respondents have also not rebutted the averments made by the applicants that they stopped receiving the washing allowances from the date they started getting Dress Allowance @ Rs.5000/-per annum. Be that as it may, the fact remains that since a specific clarification has already been issued by the nodal Department of Personnel & Training, for grant of such allowance to the



entitled categories, therefore, the view taken by respondents in withdrawing the same from the applicants and making recovery thereof cannot be sustained and as such the impugned orders in all these cases are quashed and set aside. The applicants are held entitled to grant of Dress Allowance and if any recovery has been made, the same be refunded to the relevant individuals involved in these cases. No costs.

(SANJEEV KAUSHIK)
MEMBER (J)

Place: Chandigarh
Dated: 05.06.2020

HC*