

**CENTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL  
AHMEDABAD BENCH, AHMEDABAD**

O.A. No. 39/2020 with MA No.40/2020,  
O.A. No. 40/2020 with MA No.41/2020,  
O.A. No. 41/2020 with MA No.42/2020,  
O.A. No. 42/2020 with MA No.43/2020,  
O.A. No. 43/2020 with MA No.44/2020,  
O.A. No. 52/2020 with MA No.54/2020,  
O.A. No. 53/2020 with MA No.55/2020,  
O.A. No. 54/2020 with MA No.56/2020,  
O.A. No. 55/2020 with MA No.57/2020,  
O.A. No. 56/2020 with MA No.58/2020,  
O.A. No. 57/2020 with MA No.59/2020,  
O.A. No. 60/2020 with MA No.63/2020,  
O.A. No. 61/2020 with MA No.64/2020,  
O.A. No. 62/2020 with MA No.65/2020,  
O.A. No. 63/2020 with MA No.66/2020,  
O.A. No. 68/2020 with MA No.70/2020 &  
O.A. No. 69/2020 with MA No.71/2020.

This the 12<sup>th</sup> day of February, 2020

**(i) OA No.39/2020**

Shri Uttambhai Narsinhbhai Patel

DOB 10.05.1959 Age 61 years

Son of Shri Narsinhbhai Manabhai Patel

Postal Assistant (Rtd.)

Nanapura Head Post Office

Surat – 395 001.

Residing at : 1, Damadnagar, Darji Street,

Adajan Gam, Surat–395009. ....Applicant

**(By Advocate : Shri A.D.Vankar )**

**VERSUS**

1. Union of India,  
Notice to be served through  
The Secretary, Ministry of Communication & IT  
Department of Posts, Dak Bhavan, Sansad Marg,  
New Delhi 110 001.
  2. The Chief Postmaster General  
Gujarat Circle, Khanpur,  
Ahmedabad 380 001.
  3. The Postmaster General  
Vadodara Region, Vadodara 390 002.
  4. Sr.Suptd of Post Office  
Surat Division, Surat -395001.....Respondents
- (By Advocate Ms. R.R.Patel )**

**(ii) OA No.40/2020**

Shri Kiritkumar Pravinchandra Sukhadia  
DOB 06.07.1959 Age 61 years  
Son of Shri Pravinchandra Nagindas Sukhadia  
Postal Assistant (Rtd.)  
Surat Head Post Office  
Surat – 395 003.  
Residing at : 201/A, Swagat Appartment  
Opp. Kavi Kalapi Garden, Nr. Gujarat Gas Co.,  
Adajan Gam, Surat-395009. ....**Applicant**  
**(By Advocate : Shri A.D.Vankar )**

**VERSUS**

1. Union of India,  
Notice to be served through  
The Secretary, Ministry of Communication & IT  
Department of Posts, Dak Bhavan, Sansad Marg,  
New Delhi 110 001.
2. The Chief Postmaster General  
Gujarat Circle, Khanpur,  
Ahmedabad 380 001.
3. The Postmaster General  
Vadodara Region, Vadodara 390 002.
4. Sr.Suptd of Post Office  
Surat Division, Surat-395001. ....**Respondents**  
**(By Advocate : Ms. R.R.Patel )**

**(iii) OA No.41/2020**

Shri Abdulsalam Gulabmiya Behlim  
DOB 04.02.1959 Age 61 years  
Son of Shri Gulabmiya Vazirmiya Behlim  
Postal Assistant (Rtd.)  
Kapura Sub Post Office 394 655.  
Via Vyara, District- Tapi  
Residing at : Malivad, Maratha Street  
P.O. Vyara- 394 650.  
District – Tapi ....**Applicant**  
**(By Advocate : Shri A.D.Vankar )**

**VERSUS**

1. Union of India,  
Notice to be served through  
The Secretary, Ministry of Communication & IT  
Department of Posts, Dak Bhavan, Sansad Marg,  
New Delhi 110 001.
2. The Chief Postmaster General  
Gujarat Circle, Khanpur,  
Ahmedabad 380 001.
3. The Postmaster General  
Vadodara Region, Vadodara 390 002.

**OA Nos.39,40,41,42,43,52,53,54,55,56,57,60,61,62,63,68,69/2020**  
**CAT, Ahmedabad Bench**

4. Supdt of Post Office  
Bardoli Division, Bardoli-394 601. ....**Respondents**  
**(By Advocate : Ms. R.R.Patel )**

**(iv) OA No.42/2020**

Shri Vijaykumar Tukaram Savant  
DOB 04.01.1950 Age 70 years  
Son of Shri Tukaram Atmaram Savant  
Sub Postmaster (Rtd.)  
Bhatha Sub Post Office - 395 265.  
District- Surat.  
Residing at : C/21, Auronil Society  
Nr. Umabhavan, Bhatar Road,  
Surat- 395 001. ....**Applicant**  
**(By Advocate : Shri A.D.Vankar )**

**VERSUS**

1. Union of India,  
Notice to be served through  
The Secretary, Ministry of Communication & IT  
Department of Posts, Dak Bhavan, Sansad Marg,  
New Delhi 110 001.
2. The Chief Postmaster General  
Gujarat Circle, Khanpur,  
Ahmedabad 380 001.
3. The Postmaster General  
Vadodara Region, Vadodara 390 002.
4. Director of Accounts (Postal)  
First Floor, Ahmedabad GPO Building, Ahmedabad-380001
5. Sr.Supdt of Post Office  
Surat Division, Surat-395 001. ....**Respondents**  
**(By Advocate : Ms. R.R.Patel )**

**(v) OA No.43/2020**

Shri Mohammad Ilyaskhan Basirkhan Pathan  
DOB 26.12.1963 Age 57 years  
Son of Shri Basirkhan Aminkhan Pathan  
Postal Assistant  
Ahmedabad GPO, Ahmedabad – 380 001.  
Residing at : 2362/A/3, Reva Building, Opp. Shitalnath Flats  
Khanpur, Ahmedabad - 380 001. ....**Applicant**  
**(By Advocate : Shri A.D.Vankar )**

**VERSUS**

1. Union of India,  
Notice to be served through  
The Secretary, Ministry of Communication & IT  
Department of Posts, Dak Bhavan, Sansad Marg,  
New Delhi 110 001.

**OA Nos.39,40,41,42,43,52,53,54,55,56,57,60,61,62,63,68,69/2020**  
**CAT, Ahmedabad Bench**

2. The Chief Postmaster General  
Gujarat Circle, Khanpur,  
Ahmedabad 380 001.
  3. The Postmaster General  
Ahmedabad HQ Region, Speed Post Bhavan  
Shahibaug, Ahmedabad 380 004.
  4. Chief Postmaster,  
Ahmedabad GPO,  
Ahmedabad- 380 001.....**Respondents**
- (By Advocate : Ms. R.R.Patel )**

**(vi) OA No.52/2020**

Shri Chandubhai Ranchhodbhai Bhoi  
DOB 12.04.1963 Age 57 years  
Son of Shri Ranchhodbhai Magalbhai Bhoi  
L.S.G. Postal Assistant, Naranpura Vistar Post Office,  
Ahmedabad – 380 013.  
Residing at : K-12/134, Shivshakti Apartment  
Nr. Akhbarnagar Circle, Nava Vadaj,  
Ahmedabad - 380 013. ....**Applicant**

**(By Advocate : Shri A.D.Vankar )**

**VERSUS**

1. Union of India,  
Notice to be served through  
The Secretary, Ministry of Communication & IT  
Department of Posts, Dak Bhavan, Sansad Marg,  
New Delhi 110 001.
  2. The Chief Postmaster General  
Gujarat Circle, Khanpur,  
Ahmedabad 380 001.
  3. The Postmaster General  
Ahmedabad HQ Region, Speed Post Bhavan  
Shahibaug, Ahmedabad 380 004.
  4. Sr. Supdt of Post Office,  
Ahmedabad City Division,  
Ahmedabad- 380 009.....**Respondents**
- (By Advocate : Ms. R.R.Patel )**

**(vii) OA No.53/2020**

Shri Kanubhai Maganbhai Prajapati  
DOB 01.11.1962 Age 58 years  
Son of Shri Maganbhai Somabhai Prajapati  
Postal Assistant (Rtd.), Navrangpura Head Post Office  
Ahmedabad – 380 009.  
Residing at : 837/B/1, Naranpura Gam,  
Chotho Vas, Opp. Radha Krishna Temple,  
Naranpura, Ahmedabad - 380 013. ....**Applicant**

**(By Advocate : Shri A.D.Vankar )**

**VERSUS**

1. Union of India,  
Notice to be served through  
The Secretary, Ministry of Communication & IT  
Department of Posts, Dak Bhavan, Sansad Marg,  
New Delhi 110 001.
2. The Chief Postmaster General  
Gujarat Circle, Khanpur,  
Ahmedabad 380 001.
3. The Postmaster General  
Ahmedabad HQ Region, Speed Post Bhavan  
Shahibaug, Ahmedabad 380 004.
4. Sr. Supdt of Post Office,  
Ahmedabad City Division,  
Ahmedabad- 380 009.....**Respondents**

**(By Advocate : Ms. R.R.Patel )**

**(viii) OA No.54/2020**

Shri Tanujkumar Manubhai Vaghela  
DOB 16.02.1963 Age 57 years  
Son of Shri Manubhai Popatlal Vaghela  
Sub Postmaster,  
Daxini Society Sub Post Office,  
Maninagar, Ahmedabad – 380 008.  
Residing at : 2FF, Indralok Apartment  
Kalyan Bag, Amrakunj Char Rasta,  
Kankaria Road, Ahmedabad 380 028. ....**Applicant**

**(By Advocate : Shri A.D.Vankar )**

**VERSUS**

1. Union of India,  
Notice to be served through  
The Secretary, Ministry of Communication & IT  
Department of Posts, Dak Bhavan, Sansad Marg,  
New Delhi 110 001.
2. The Chief Postmaster General  
Gujarat Circle, Khanpur,  
Ahmedabad 380 001.
3. The Postmaster General  
Ahmedabad HQ Region, Speed Post Bhavan  
Shahibaug, Ahmedabad 380 004.
4. Sr. Supdt of Post Office,  
Ahmedabad City Division,  
Ahmedabad- 380 009.....**Respondents**

**(By Advocate : Ms. R.R.Patel )**

**OA Nos.39,40,41,42,43,52,53,54,55,56,57,60,61,62,63,68,69/2020**  
**CAT, Ahmedabad Bench**

**(ix) OA No.55/2020**

Shri Bhanubhai Nathabhai Parmar  
DOB 02.08.1963 Age 56 years  
Son of Shri Nathabhai Khushaldas Parmar  
Postal Assistant,  
Navrangpura Head Post Office,  
Ahmedabad – 380 009.  
Residing at : A-17, Krupasagar Society  
Nr.Mansarovar, IOC Road  
Chandkheda, Ahmedabad 382 424. ....Applicant  
**(By Advocate : Shri A.D.Vankar )**

**VERSUS**

1. Union of India,  
Notice to be served through  
The Secretary, Ministry of Communication & IT  
Department of Posts, Dak Bhavan, Sansad Marg,  
New Delhi 110 001.
2. The Chief Postmaster General  
Gujarat Circle, Khanpur,  
Ahmedabad 380 001.
3. The Postmaster General  
Ahmedabad HQ Region, Speed Post Bhavan  
Shahibaug, Ahmedabad 380 004.
4. Sr. Supdt of Post Office,  
Ahmedabad City Division,  
Ahmedabad- 380 009.....Respondents  
**(By Advocate : Ms. R.R.Patel )**

**(x) OA No.56/2020**

Shri Natvarbhai Ramjibhai Sutaria  
DOB 22.01.1955 Age 66 years  
Son of Shri Ramjibhai Maganbhai Sutaria  
Postal Assistant (Rtd.),  
Kathwada M.P. Sub Post Office,  
Ahmedabad – 382 430.  
Residing at : 21, Ratnaraj Homes  
B/h. Suryan Hopetown,  
Sarathi Bungalow Road,  
Chandkheda, Ahmedabad 382 424. ....Applicant  
**(By Advocate : Shri A.D.Vankar )**

**VERSUS**

1. Union of India,  
Notice to be served through  
The Secretary, Ministry of Communication & IT

**OA Nos.39,40,41,42,43,52,53,54,55,56,57,60,61,62,63,68,69/2020**  
**CAT, Ahmedabad Bench**

- Department of Posts, Dak Bhavan, Sansad Marg,  
New Delhi 110 001.
2. The Chief Postmaster General  
Gujarat Circle, Khanpur,  
Ahmedabad 380 001.
  3. The Postmaster General  
Ahmedabad HQ Region, Speed Post Bhavan  
Shahibaug, Ahmedabad 380 004.
  4. Sr. Supdt of Post Office,  
Ahmedabad City Division,  
Ahmedabad- 380 009.
  5. Sr. Supdt. of Post Office  
Gandhinagar Division, Gandhinagar- 382 010.....**Respondents**  
**(By Advocate : Ms. R.R.Patel )**

**(xi) OA No.57/2020**

Shri Maheshkumar Bipinbhai Roy  
DOB 20.09.1960 Age 59 years  
Son of Shri Bipinbhai Khodidas Roy  
Sub Postmaster  
Uvasrad Sub Post Office,  
District – Gandhinagar – 382 422.  
Residing at : E/403, Devnandan Sumit  
Nr.Pramukhnagar, Sargasan, Gandhinagar-382421.....**Applicant**  
**(By Advocate : Shri A.D.Vankar )**

**VERSUS**

1. Union of India,  
Notice to be served through  
The Secretary, Ministry of Communication & IT  
Department of Posts, Dak Bhavan, Sansad Marg,  
New Delhi 110 001.
2. The Chief Postmaster General  
Gujarat Circle, Khanpur,  
Ahmedabad 380 001.
3. The Postmaster General  
Ahmedabad HQ Region, Speed Post Bhavan  
Shahibaug, Ahmedabad 380 004.
4. Sr. Supdt of Post Office,  
Gandhinagar Division,  
Gandhinagar- 380 010.....**Respondents**  
**(By Advocate : Ms. R.R.Patel )**

**(xii) OA No.60/2020**

Shri Prahladbhai Somabhai Sharma  
DOB 01.05.1955 Age 65 years  
Son of Shri Somabhai Trikambhai Sharma

Postal Assistant (Rtd.)  
Radhu Sub Post Office  
District - Kheda.  
Residing at : B 104, Pramukh Park Society  
Geratpur, P.O. Nandej-382 435.  
District : Ahmedabad .....**Applicant**  
**(By Advocate : Shri A.D.Vankar )**

**VERSUS**

1. Union of India,  
Notice to be served through  
The Secretary, Ministry of Communication & IT  
Department of Posts, Dak Bhavan, Sansad Marg,  
New Delhi 110 001.
  2. The Chief Postmaster General  
Gujarat Circle, Khanpur,  
Ahmedabad 380 001.
  3. The Postmaster General  
Vadodara Region, Vadodara 390 002.
  4. Sr.Suptd of Post Office  
Kheda Division, Nadiad-387001. ....**Respondents**
- (By Advocate : Ms. R.R.Patel )**

**(xiii) OA No.61/2020**

Shri Jayantibhai Bhikhabhai Valand  
DOB 04.10.1950 Age 70 years  
Son of Shri Bhikhabhai Chhitabhai Valand  
Public Relation Inspector (Post)  
Paldi Post Office (Rtd.)  
Ahmedabad – 380 007.  
Residing at : 25, Shrinath Bunglow,  
Nr. Royal Park, Geratpur-382 425.  
Taq. Daskroi, District – Ahmedabad ..... Applicant.  
**(By Advocate : Shri A.D.Vankar )**

**VERSUS**

1. Union of India,  
Notice to be served through  
The Secretary, Ministry of Communication & IT  
Department of Posts, Dak Bhavan, Sansad Marg,  
New Delhi 110 001.
2. The Chief Postmaster General  
Gujarat Circle, Khanpur,  
Ahmedabad 380 001.
3. The Postmaster General  
Ahmedabad HQ Region, Speed Post Bhavan  
Shahibaug, Ahmedabad 380 004.
4. Sr. Suptd of Post Office,  
Ahmedabad City Division,



**OA Nos.39,40,41,42,43,52,53,54,55,56,57,60,61,62,63,68,69/2020**  
**CAT, Ahmedabad Bench**

Ahmedabad- 380 009.....**Respondents**  
**(By Advocate : Ms. R.R.Patel )**

**(xiv) OA No.62/2020**

Shri Jaswantbhai Kanjibhai Parmar  
DOB 13.03.1953 Age 67 years  
Son of Shri Kanjibhai Ambaram Parmar  
Sorting Assistant (Rtd.),  
Head Record Office, RMS 'AM' Division  
Ahmedabad – 380 002.  
Residing at : B-168, Dharnidhar Bunglows  
Nr.Canal, Nava Naroda, Krishnanagar,  
Ahmedabad 382 345. ....**Applicant**  
**(By Advocate : Shri A.D.Vankar )**

**VERSUS**

1. Union of India,  
Notice to be served through  
The Secretary, Ministry of Communication & IT  
Department of Posts, Dak Bhavan, Sansad Marg,  
New Delhi 110 001.
2. The Chief Postmaster General  
Gujarat Circle, Khanpur,  
Ahmedabad 380 001.
3. The Postmaster General  
Ahmedabad HQ Region, Speed Post Bhavan  
Shahibaug, Ahmedabad 380 004.
4. Sr. Supdt of RMS,  
'AM' Division,  
Ahmedabad- 380 002.....**Respondents**

**(xiv) OA No.63/2020**

Shri Shabbirkhan Usman Khan Pathan  
DOB 13.02.1949 Age 71 years  
Son of Shri Usman Khan Ashraf Khan Pathan  
Sorting Assistant (Rtd.),  
Head Record Post Office, RMS 'AM' Division  
Ahmedabad – 380 002.  
Residing at : 2695/4, Sodagar Street,  
Chunarvada, Street No.3, Kalupur,  
Ahmedabad 380 001. ....**Applicant**  
**(By Advocate : Shri A.D.Vankar )**

**VERSUS**

1. Union of India,  
Notice to be served through

**OA Nos.39,40,41,42,43,52,53,54,55,56,57,60,61,62,63,68,69/2020**  
**CAT, Ahmedabad Bench**

The Secretary, Ministry of Communication & IT  
Department of Posts, Dak Bhavan, Sansad Marg,  
New Delhi 110 001.

2. The Chief Postmaster General  
Gujarat Circle, Khanpur,  
Ahmedabad 380 001.
3. The Postmaster General  
Ahmedabad HQ Region, Speed Post Bhavan  
Shahibaug, Ahmedabad 380 004.
4. Sr. Supdt of RMS,  
'AM' Division,  
Ahmedabad- 380 002.....**Respondents**

**(By Advocate : Ms. R.R.Patel )**

**(xvi) OA No.68/2020**

Shri Kantilal Nanjibhai Parmar  
DOB 01.08.1963 Age 57 years  
Son of Shri Nanjibhai Haribhai Parmar  
Sub Postmaster  
Soma Talav Post Office  
Vadodara – 390 025.  
Residing at : E-9, Saujanya Township  
Opp. Kamlanagar, Ajwa Road,  
Vadodara-390 019. ....**Applicant**

**(By Advocate : Shri A.D.Vankar )**

**VERSUS**

1. Union of India,  
Notice to be served through  
The Secretary, Ministry of Communication & IT  
Department of Posts, Dak Bhavan, Sansad Marg,  
New Delhi 110 001.
2. The Chief Postmaster General  
Gujarat Circle, Khanpur,  
Ahmedabad 380 001.
3. The Postmaster General  
Vadodara Region, Vadodara 390 002.
4. Sr.Supdt of Post Office  
Vadodara EAST Division,  
Vadodara-390001.....**Respondents**

**(By Advocate : Ms. R.R.Patel )**

**(xvii) OA No.69/2020**

Shri Sahebrao Ganesh Pol  
DOB 25.04.1958 Age 62 years  
Son of Shri Ganesh Janba Pol  
Postal Assistant (Rtd.)  
Wadi Swamynarayan Sub Post Office

Vadodara – 390 001.

Residing at : A/28, Saujanya Township

Opp. Kamlanagar, Ajwa Road,

Vadodara-390 019. ....Applicant

**(By Advocate : Shri A.D.Vankar )**

**VERSUS**

1. Union of India,  
Notice to be served through  
The Secretary, Ministry of Communication & IT  
Department of Posts, Dak Bhavan, Sansad Marg,  
New Delhi 110 001.
2. The Chief Postmaster General  
Gujarat Circle, Khanpur,  
Ahmedabad 380 001.
3. The Postmaster General  
Vadodara Region, Vadodara 390 002.
4. Sr.Suptd of Post Office  
Vadodara EAST Division,  
Vadodara-390001.....Respondents

**(By Advocate Ms. R.R.Patel )**

**ORDER (ORAL)**

**Per : Hon'ble Shri M.C.Verma, Judicial Member**

All above noted seventeen OAs are at the stage of motion hearing, applicant in all OAs is represented by same counsel and the grievance of the applicants is that treating the post of Postal Assistant as promotional post, they were denied the benefits of their due MACP. Learned counsel, Shri A.D.Vankar, who is appearing for applicant in all said OAs fairly submits that applicant of OA Nos.41/2020, 52/2020, 53/2020, 54/2020, 56/2020, 57/2020, 60/2020, 61/2020, 63/2020, 68/2020 & 69/2020 though has not preferred representations to the respondents for redressal of their grievances but representation of applicant of OA Nos.43/2020 and 62/2020 has been rejected by the respondents and representation of

applicant of OA Nos.39/2020, 40/2020, 42/2020, 55/2020 is still pending consideration.

2. Learned counsel Shri A.D.Vankar also submits that recently in batch matters of 52 OAs (*leading matter is OA No. 93/2019 in case of Natvarbhai S. Makwana v/s. Union of India*), this Bench of the Tribunal has passed final Order on 17.09.2019 and had held that post of Postal Assistant is not a promotional post for the post of Postman and while holding so directed the respondents to place the claim of applicants of said 52 OAs before Review Screening Committee for examination afresh, treating the date of entry into the cadre/ grade of the post of Postal Assistant to release necessary financial upgradation.

3. Learned counsel submits further that in view of the changed circumstances, particularly after decision of this Tribunal in OA No.93/2019 now wants to prefer the representation before the respondents department claiming parity with applicants of above said batch matter of 52 OAs, and reserving liberty to agitate the matter in case the final outcome of the decision on their representation comes against them, wants to withdraw their respective OA at this stage. He also submits that applicant would prefer the representation within two weeks and he made requests to allow the withdrawal of OA with direction to respondent to take decision on their representation within a month or within a time as this Tribunal deem fit and proper to fix.

4. Ms.R.R.Patel, Advocate who has appeared for respondents in batch matters of above 52 OAs (leading matter is OA No. 93/2019 in case of Natvarbhai S. Makwana v/s. Union of India) appeared for respondents and submits that she has received instructions from the Respondents' department to appear in these matters for respondents. She urged that when applicants wants to withdraw the OA, she is having no objection and added that Division Bench of this Tribunal vide Order dated 17.9.2019 passed in batch of 52 OA, with lead case OA No.93/2019 has held the post of Postal Assistant as not a promotional post for the post of Postman and that respondents has preferred Writ Petition to challenge said decision but no order has till yet been passed in the Writ Petition. She added that as and when Order dated 17.9.2019, passed in OA No.355/2018 & batch would attain finality, case of applicants if is similarly situated would be considered on same line.

5. Considered the submission. Taking note of submissions made at Bar withdrawal of all these seventeen OAs is allowed, with liberty to applicant of each said OA to prefer representation, if he wishes so, and if he prefers representation within two weeks, as has been prayed above, the respondents shall consider the same and to pass a order as per the decision in OA No.93/2019, if it is not reversed and attains finality in its present form or if it is set aside or modified, as per observation/ finding qua the issue "*whether the post of Postal Assistant is a promotional post or not for the post of Postman*" set at

rest in SCA/Writ/ SLP arising from decision in OA No.93/2019, as the case may be within a period of six weeks from the date of decision in OA No.93/2019 attains finality. Needless to say, whatever decision so taken shall be communicated to the applicant and in case the final outcome of decision by respondents comes against the applicants, they, if wish or is advised so, may file fresh OA or the MA for getting revived the present OAs. The withdrawal allowed today would not affect the fate of such OA or of MA, if is filed and same may be dealt with as per its own merits.

6. In result, all these seventeen OAs, with *ibid* stated observation and direction, stand disposed of as withdrawn. Pending MA, of each OA also stand disposed of.

7. Photocopy of this order be placed in batch of aforementioned OAs.

**(M.C.Verma)**  
**Member (J)**

nk